



Religious in Europe Networking
Against Trafficking and Exploitation

A Mapping Across Europe



*“Slaves no more,
But sisters and brothers”*

- Pope Francis

STOP GÁINNEÁIL AR DHAOINE
STOP TRAFICULUI DE PERSOANE

STOP PREKYBAI ZMONEMIS!
STOP Menschenhandel

USTAVIMO TRGOVINO Z LJUDMI
DICIAMO BASTA AL TRAFFICO
DI ESSERI UMANI

STOP HUMAN TRAFFICKING
ZAUSTAVIMO trgovanje ljudima!
STOP á la TRAITE des
ETRES HUMAINS

STOP TRAFIKIMIT NË NJERËZ
STOP mensenhandel
STOP OBCHODU S ĽUĎMI

STOP Menschenhandel

ZASTAVME OBCHOD
S ĽIDSKÝMI BYTOSTMI!

STOP HUMAN TRAFFICKING
INO A LA VENTA DE PERSONAS !
STOP HANDLOWI ĽUDŹMI

THE CONTEXT

RENATE undertook this Mapping Exercise in order to ascertain the extent of human trafficking in the countries where its members are working on anti-trafficking issues in areas of prevention and protection, from victim support through shelters, to education-awareness, policy and advocacy, recovery and reintegration as well as campaigning.

What RENATE did not know was the extent of that work, its impact, and the requirements for resources which could be shared across the Network so as to strengthen its impact in ending the culture of human trafficking.

It was in this spirit of enquiry - to be able to strengthen the contribution of women religious their congregations and associates, in the world-wide fight to resist human trafficking and to extend the hand of God in supporting victims of this terrible crime - that RENATE set out to understand what more needed to be done in planning strategically into the future.

Having 'put out a call' for RENATE members to undertake the task of finding out the situation in each country - through a series of conversations and interviews and aided by existing reports - that this Mapping Exercise took place.

Equipped with open hearts and minds, ready to listen and be surprised, the authors of these reports set forth across 13 European countries in 2014-2015.

What is contained in the pages of this document is rich, diverse, and in many cases inspiring. What the reader will find is not so much an academic professional assessment, but a quilted set of insights, observations, interviews and conversations, knit together around the wider setting of the most recent US TIP report, 2015 that sets each country within the international framework.

Our thanks go to the primary authors of each country for their valuable work. Thanks to all who supported them, who contributed to the findings, who offered time and hospitality to each whilst undertaking this Mapping Exercise. It is hoped that no one is left out of the acknowledgments list since every effort has been taken to list names.

Members of RENATE, not engaged in writing the reports, were invited to express their motivation for the work of anti-trafficking, to give their personal motivation for this work in the face of the relentless presence of human trafficking. These pieces are also included in this document.

Thanks to Dr Carrie Pemberton-Ford for drawing all the reports together and bringing some shape to what now makes an interesting tapestry.

Sr Patricia Mulhall, CSB

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTEXT.....	1
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	3
PREFACE FROM THE PRESIDENT.....	5
FOREWORD.....	8
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....	11
INTRODUCING RENATE.....	28
COUNTRY REPORTS:	
ALBANIA	30
BULGARIA	41
FRANCE	50
GERMANY	61
HUNGARY	71
IRELAND	82
ITALY	94
LATVIA	103
LITHUANIA	111
POLAND	119
ROMANIA	132
SPAIN	137
UNITED KINGDOM	153
PERSONAL REFLECTIONS FROM RENATE MEMBERS.....	173
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS & DISCLAIMER.....	178

PREFACE FROM THE PRESIDENT OF RENATE NETWORK

RENATE's Mapping Exercise aims to provide a general overview of trafficking in persons within the context of Europe and in particular in the several countries where RENATE is established and works in the field. The outcome of this work seeks to inform the reader about the relevant legislative framework and European guidance regarding human trafficking. It also outlines the work of the stakeholders in these countries, the purpose of the national referral mechanisms, and examples of good practice. It highlights the processes used for this exercise, including the questionnaire template. This document supported the key researcher in seeking best practice and in exposing the challenges faced in that place in identification and support of victims of the crime. The Mapping Exercise has also made an assessment of existing systems, country by country, and possible loopholes and risks of abuse and exploitation in these systems.

The original thinking behind this piece of work came from our main donors: Porticus, Europe. Their idea was to begin the Mapping Exercise by using some of the already researched materials produced by the Mary Ward Loreto Awareness Raising Project in Albania. This document was produced in 2013, as a brochure or guideline manual for those working in the field against trafficking. It clarifies the notions of forced labour, sex trafficking, and organ trafficking and gives a general understanding of this crime in its fullest context. With this document as a background it was suggested that the next step would be to frame the challenges and the scandal of such a crime in a European context.

To do this RENATE would need to provide the necessary data and within the socio-political context and history of Europe. 13 European countries out of the 24, where members of RENATE are working in the field, were researched to give a balanced understanding of the practice and issues in countries in East, Central and West Europe. The questions which Porticus raised and which needed to be addressed in this Mapping Exercise were:

- At what point in the cycle of the work against trafficking is it best to intervene? For example: to use direct action; prevention; awareness-raising; advocacy? This would need to be accomplished by giving weight and argument, with the support of known best practices and best known results.
- Who are the relevant and most promising persons, networks and partners to work with in the future?
- Where would RENATE need to focus into the future?

It was also suggested that this Mapping Exercise would offer conclusions and recommendations for making the greatest possible impact at the levels of:

- Individual lives;
- Communities;
- Institutions and policies;
- Values and norms (culture).

Finally, this Mapping Exercise would provide a story of RENATE, its impact in the field, individual stories illustrating best practice, reflections and new thinking.

Sister Patricia Mulhall, CSB (Brigidine Congregation), and Sister Marie Power, HFB (Congregation of the Holy Family of Bordeaux), both members of RENATE, in conjunction with academic researcher Dr Carrie Pemberton-Ford,¹ have steered this great work through to its final conclusion with the assistance of a voluntary team (listed in the acknowledgements).

1) Director of Research, Cambridge Centre for Applied Research in Human Trafficking. www.ccarht.org (see profile under Executive summary)

They are to be congratulated in achieving the goal with such success. We hope that this document will be valuable as a tool in guiding many others to take up this work against trafficking in human persons. The reader will understand that it is through creative networks that the best work can be achieved and that the more open we are to linking with the many, the greater will be the impact. We hope that this document will widen the circle of the protagonists in the field and that RENATE is made stronger, with more people working together in partnerships and networks, to combat this modern day slavery.

A slavery about which Pope Francis has highlighted in this New Year Peace Talk, 2015

“Today, as in the past, slavery is rooted in a notion of the human person which allows him or her to be treated as an object. Whenever sin corrupts the human heart and distances us from our Creator and our neighbours, the latter are no longer regarded as beings of equal dignity, as brothers or sisters sharing a common humanity, but rather as objects. Whether by coercion or deception, or by physical or psychological duress, human persons created in the image and likeness of God are deprived of their freedom, sold and reduced to being the property of others. They are treated as means to an end.

Alongside this deeper cause – the rejection of another person’s humanity – there are other causes which help to explain contemporary forms of slavery. Among these, I think in the first place of poverty, underdevelopment and exclusion, especially when combined with a lack of access to education or scarce, even non-existent, employment opportunities. Not infrequently, the victims of human trafficking and slavery are people who look for a way out of a situation of extreme poverty; taken in by false promises of employment, they often end up in the hands of criminal networks which organize human trafficking. These networks are skilled in using modern means of communication as a way of luring young men and women in various parts of the world.

Another cause of slavery is corruption on the part of people willing to do anything for financial gain. Slave labour and human trafficking often require the complicity of intermediaries, be they law enforcement personnel, state officials, or civil and military institutions. This occurs when money, and not the human person, is at the centre of an economic system. Yes, the person, made in the image of God and charged with dominion over all creation, must be at the centre of every social or economic system. When the person is replaced by mammon, a subversion of values occurs.

Further causes of slavery include armed conflicts, violence, criminal activity and terrorism. Many people are kidnapped in order to be sold, enlisted as combatants, or sexually exploited, while others are forced to emigrate, leaving everything behind: their country, home, property, and even members of their family. They are driven to seek an alternative to these terrible conditions even at the risk of their personal dignity and their very lives; they risk being drawn into that vicious circle which makes them prey to misery, corruption and their baneful consequences.”²

Sister Imelda Poole, IBVM

2) Message of His Holiness, Pope Francis, for the celebration of the world day of peace, 1 January, 2015: ‘NO LONGER SLAVES, BUT BROTHERS AND SISTERS.’ 8 Dec, 2014. Accessed from Vatican Website https://w2.vatican.va/.../papa-francesco_20141208_messaggio-xlvi-iii-giornata-mondiale-pace-2015.html

ABOUT THE PRESIDENT

Imelda Poole IBVM (Loreto) is a member of the English Province of Loreto sisters, based on mission in Albania since 2005. IBVM congregation was missioned by the Archbishop in Tirana to work in the field of anti-trafficking. This led Imelda to work in the field of prevention, awareness raising, advocacy and direct action.

Prior to her ministry in Albania, Imelda was a teacher and chaplain in secondary education throughout Britain. This time was followed by a ministry in formation, spiritual direction and counselling. Before moving to Albania, she worked for 16 years in 'grass roots' ministry on a council estate in the North East of England.



Empowering through Justice, Freedom and Sincerity

In 2011, the NGO, named, '**Mary Ward Loreto Foundation,**' was opened in Tirana. This foundation was to focus the work being developed against trafficking within the philosophy and charism of the IBVM foundress (1609), English woman, the Venerable Mary Ward. Imelda is the President of this foundation, (MWL).

The main values of the foundation are Freedom, Justice and Sincerity. In the field of prevention of trafficking, projects have been established which include a community centre for three 'Roma' communities. '**Mary Ward Loreto Women**' (MWL Women), is a project developed in 2011 in 18 rural and other ad hoc migrant communities on the edge of cities in Albania. This project involved 800 women for their human and economic empowerment. It was perceived that these two groups are the most vulnerable to being trafficked. MWL Youth project began in 2013 working with focus groups in 3 vulnerable regions and in awareness-raising against trafficking in 10 other regions of Albania.

Another group named **URAT Network** has been the advisory board for a MWL awareness raising project in 40 regions of Albania. The network is now with many stake holders including sisters, Peace Corps, Different and Equal, SHKEJ and MWL who work in the field of direct action, awareness raising, prevention and campaigning.

In 2011 an education centre for the victims of trafficking has been opened, in partnership with an NGO, '**Different and Equal**', dedicated to anti-trafficking work.

Imelda believes that the prevention work in Albania is possible only because of the commitment and passion of the MWL staff and its co-workers.

RENATE Network - *Religious in Europe Networking Against Trafficking and Exploitation* – of which Imelda is president - is a European network of religious and co-workers who work in all fields against trafficking in 24 countries of Europe.

www.albaniahope.com and www.renate-europe.net

FOREWORD

It is an honour to be asked to write a foreword to this project, enormous in scale, courageous in its determination to speak out and name the truth - the enormity of this criminal activity in so many European countries. Having been present at the Assembly in Trzebinia, Poland in September 2011, and keenly followed developments - especially the growing maturity of RENATE, it is a kairos³ time to reflect spiritually and theologically. I begin with the inspiring words with which Dr Carrie Pemberton-Ford ended which can form a basis for this theological quest:

“Steadiness, resolve, long term attention and the commitment of resources, aided by the attention to prayer, spirituality of resistance, resources to build communities’ networks to resist trafficking, to uphold respect and dignity for each individual, to assert gender equality, to resist all forms of inequality and violence against the person, to work collaboratively – these are the challenges faced by RENATE into the future.”

A new, hopeful Ecclesial context

Since the Vatican Seminar on Trafficking, Rome 2013, called by Pope Francis, we can speak of a more hopeful context in the Church. The Church is beginning to be seen facing the truth about the violence in women’s lives, the hypocrisy and failure to act. It can no longer turn a blind eye as to what men are doing to women, and the climate of fear in which trafficked women are often forced to live. This changed context – where trafficking is seen as sin - is also affected by Pope Francis, bringing The Theology of the Poor to the centre of Church commitment and his call to everyone to become ‘the Church of the poor and the vulnerable.’ There can hardly be a more vulnerable group of people than trafficked and abused children, women and men.⁴ RENATE is playing a key part in bringing this prophetic dimension of the Church to the fore.

A Theology steeped in faith in the God of Liberation and Justice

The uniqueness of RENATE – as contrasted with secular agencies - is that its prophetic action is sustained and inspired by deep Christian faith. Faith in holding on to the God who liberates from injustice and oppression; belief in the call of Jesus in his Nazareth ‘Manifesto’ announcing good news to all who suffer injustice in many forms (Luke 4.18-30) and Jesus’ promise in the Sermon on the Mount, of “Blessed are those who suffer persecution for justice’s sake” (Matthew 5) - words that light a blazing torch for non-violent action in the dangerous work of transforming the situation of victims of trafficking.

The God who liberates is also the God who created both women and men in his image, Imago Dei. This God calls all to just relationship and communion with the Divine Mystery. Faith in a Jesus who came to give fullness of life (John 10.10) must include liberation from victimhood in many sorts of oppression. A Christology against the violence and injustice of trafficking is inspired by a compassionate Jesus in solidarity with the victims, and at the same time, an empowering Jesus giving courage to break the cycles of violence and fear, through the strength of the liberating Spirit. Remember the words of Jesus, given specifically for a context of fear:

“Not a hair of your head shall be destroyed: through your unflinching endurance you will take possession of your lives.”(Luke 21.18-19)

3) 1 Kairos is a Greek sword, meaning choice, but also “significant, key moment “ in history.

4) I omit mention here of refugees and asylum seekers - many of whom are also victims of trafficking.

A Spirituality of Risk, Resistance, Cooperation and Steadfastness.

Such faith is essential for the spirituality of risk, resistance, a steadfastness essential for this work. Steadfastness or perseverance in hope (sumud in the Arabic spirituality practised in Palestine), is already a key element in working in so many countries in distressing circumstances. 'Steadfastness' - or perseverance - is not a concept plucked from the sky, but rooted in the hesed, ⁵the steadfastness of God, the compassion of God....and God's own vulnerability.

How to cope with the shocking truth of so much evil, the trauma of victims- especially children -requires a special kind of courage. It took courage for women to escape their kidnappers and steadfastness to stay with the process of recovery from trauma, towards new life and healing. It took courage for RENATE workers to go into situations of danger, to discover – for this mapping project- the truth of new forms of trafficking and the complex workings of criminal gangs; steadfastness to remain and live with risk and even failure, when women return to their abusers, for example.

Called to bring about a new reality, a healed creation.

RENATE'S maturity – and the evidence of the work already accomplished, for example, in Albania, summons us to live out of a new reality that does not yet exist – but can be embodied in every liberating act, in acts of kindness and love, in moments of joy and thanksgiving for small victories won, we share God's own hesed, steadfastness, and promise of a new reality:

*“Do not remember the former things, Or consider the things of old.
I am about to do a new thing...” (Isaiah 43.18-19).*

RENATE'S work in eradicating the roots of violence is now a task to be shared by all in authority - the Church, in the many agencies and government institutions with which RENATE cooperates. Now the task of re-education is beginning to be taken seriously in terms of men and women as equal partners in relationships of justice and mutuality. It remains urgent. Linked with this is the need to examine what models of power that are still operating in Church, society and in our relationships. The power of domination, power over is still accepted as the default model of power in many contexts.

RENATE'S Mapping Exercise uncovers so much evil faced by the groups in the countries visited. It requires not only a prophetic faith but a mystical one. Action, yes, but as the great mystics experienced, mystical prayer was necessary to come through the dark nights of despair. To pray is not to give way to despair.

This Mapping Exercise is permeated by an urgent cry for justice: As the great 19th century reformer, Josephine Butler, whose spirituality blazed with the desire for justice, cried:

*“Justice, justice is what we with them desire. Our hearts cry out for justice, our souls are a thirst for justice. Like the Hebrew prophet of old, we are sometimes constrained to exclaim
‘Justice has fallen in the streets.’”*

As RENATE moves forward in this quest for justice, in a new and deeper knowledge of what the mission entails, my prayer is that all will be empowered by a relational God, a vulnerable God, but a God who will bring about a transformed creation where traumatised people will experience the joys of healing and love.

Mary Grey

5) Meaning 'loyal love' in the Hebrew Scriptures, usually translated as 'kindness' or 'loving kindness' it is one of the key theological concepts in the story of Ruth, 1:8-20

About the Author

Professor Mary Grey was Visiting Professor at St Mary's University, Twickenham, London until 2013 and before that, D.J. James Professor of Pastoral theology at the University of Wales, Lampeter. She continues to be an Honorary Fellow of Sarum College, Salisbury.

With her husband, Dr Nicholas Grey, she is co-founder and co-President of Wells for India an NGO that is focused on water – harvesting and womens' well-being in Rajasthan, India.

Dr Grey is the author of many books on social justice and reconciliation, including 'The Outrageous Pursuit of Hope: Prophetic Dreams for the 21st Century.' (2000); 'Sacred Longings: Ecofeminist theology and Globalisation.' (2003); 'To Rwanda and Back: a Spirituality of Reconciliation.' (2007); 'Crying for Dignity: Caste-based Violence against Women.' (2010) and most recently 'The Advent of Peace: A Gospel Journey to Christmas.' (2010); 'The Resurrection of Peace: A Gospel Journey to Easter and Beyond.' (2012) with Rabbi Dan Cohn Sherbok, 'Debating Palestine-Israel.' (2014) and 'The Spirit of Peace- Pentecost and Affliction in the Middle East.' (2015).

Mary is Chair of 'Living Stones of the Holy Land Trust' and Patron of 'Holy Rood House - Theology for Health and Healing.'

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Trafficking in human persons has been a matter of concern for Pope Francis from his time in Argentina, and has emerged as a core preoccupation of his papacy. In 2015, he initiated the first ever “International Day of Prayer and Reflection against Human Trafficking,” to be held on the Feast day of Saint Bakhita, 8 February, the saint who was sold into slavery as a young child from the Sudan to Italy.⁶

In recent years, the Holy See, attentive to the pain of the victims of trafficking and the voice of the Religious Congregations which assist them on their path to freedom, has increased its appeals to the international community for cooperation and collaboration between different agencies in putting an end to this scourge.

President Obama calls human trafficking a debasement of our common humanity that tears at the social fabric of our communities, distorts markets, endangers public health, and fuels violence and organised crime.⁷

The Mid-term report for the European Union said:

Of the 30,146 victims registered in the 28 EU Member States in 2010-2012, 80% of them were women and girls. 69% of all victims are trafficked for sexual exploitation, and for female victims this is up to 95%. 71% of male victims are trafficked for labour.⁸

Trafficking – some definitions

Trafficking in persons, ‘human trafficking’ or, in the increasingly current language of presidential, papal and British rebranding, ‘modern day slavery,’ is a severe violation of fundamental human rights, a serious crime against both the person and the communities which it violates, through the insidious undermining of interpersonal respect, integrity, trust, citizen rights and trading procedures which we have come to understand as pertaining to the person and undergirding global business transactions across the globe.

The United Nations in a Protocol adopted in Palermo, Italy in 2000 defined the crime of human trafficking as involving three distinct parts: (1) an activity; (2) a means; and (3) a purpose. The activity of trafficking involves ‘*The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons,*’ and this must be via the means of ‘*the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person. This must be undertaken for the purpose of exploitation, which includes ‘at a minimum, the sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.*’⁹

Where the trafficked person is a child, the means does not have to be established, as it is assumed that children can never willingly consent to their own exploitation. Indeed, according to the Protocol, a child in prostitution or any other form of slavery ALWAYS indicates she/he is trafficked. Flowing from this definition, we recognise that human trafficking takes many forms, and is driven by diverse factors. The nature and root causes of trafficking carry certain commonalities and at the same time diverge in their execution from one country to the next.

6) Vatican News accessed September 2015

7) Speech to the UN General Assembly, 25 September 2012.

8) <http://www.europarl.europa.eu/news/en/news-room/content/20141203STO82703/html/Human-trafficking-80-of-victims-in-the-EU-are-women-and-girls>

9) www.ohchr.org › OHCHR November, 2000

We know that individuals in search of a better life are often taken advantage of, and are exploited in numerous and frequently horrific ways when they are taken beyond the care and protection of families, immediate communities and States (though some States have greater protective capacity than others). Extraordinarily (for those who live in more stable and secure environments), some of those trafficked are trafficked by family members, or members of their own immediate community.

The psychological, economic, anthropological and socio-political context of what stimulates or develops the degradation of human intercourse and interchange which is seen in human trafficking is yet to be fully extrapolated or understood. The inter-governmental, global community is only just waking up to the reality and ubiquity of trafficking across every border, within every country. This phenomenon, in a world where diminishing labour costs are as near zero as they can be rendered, adds to the capacity of 'middle men and women' to derive 'opportunity finance' from the unprotected dividend of others' 'super-exploitation.'

Vulnerability to trafficking can emerge from financial challenges, societal exclusion, deficits in education, poverty in health and social capital, ethnic and racial preclusion and asymmetric access to social goods and protection. It can also be triggered by ignorance of its 'lifecycle' and socialised propensity of risky behaviours, forced migration, age and gender impediments on the part of individuals, households and whole communities at risk. Although there are those who argue that trafficking is purely the creation of criminalised forces, the RISK of being trafficked is dependent on the above arenas of vulnerability.

As research reaches across into areas which have been previously the domain of development studies such as child safeguarding, international conflict, and peace studies, so our understanding of some of the dominant typologies of risk which pepper trafficking in human beings will be increasingly understood. However, at present, what is clear is that wherever there is a strong asymmetry between aspiration and achievement, and challenges to accessing financial resources, these 'economic goods' may be desired by either individual victims themselves, or those who procure, 'lease' or 'sell' them. However, wherever there is a significant lack of regular opportunities to mediate want and acquisition of desired goods, there traffickers are going to find opportunities to ply their particular business model. This 'business model' requires some element of risk taking, of trust placed in venturers who play poker with one's life, and opens up the opportunities of violence against the person to be perpetrated away from the 'protection' of family, immediate relationships, 'community arbitrators' or the State; a business model which relies on compliant, complicit or 'ignorant' clients, purchasers, protective services, and State actors alike – at all stages of collection, transportation, delivery and 'recycling' of 'wares.'

With disparities in wealth and access to capital growing within and between many States across the European Union (EU), and a renewed pressure of inward economic migration and refugees seeking asylum and the opportunity to settle in the EU, particularly from North Africa, the Sub Sahel, recently conflicted States in the Middle East, South Central and South Western Asia, human trafficking has powerful drivers supporting its business model and its characteristics of opportunism and flagrant human rights abuse. Human trafficking currently exploits the economic traction built from desperation and urgency to find alternative solutions to poverty, or access to 'living space' in the penumbra of domestic and international trade and business. Within the churn of international movements, some deploy legal routes throughout the European Economic Area;¹⁰ other traffickers feed off the smuggling routes into the soft underbelly of Europe, through the thousands of scattered Greek islands, Malta, Italy and Spain, trading in the desperation of refugees and economic migrants seeking a better and safer life in Europe.

10) Free movement of workers is a fundamental principle of the Treaty enshrined in Article 45 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union and developed by EU secondary legislation and the Case law of the Court of Justice (incorporating – and is also enjoyed by – countries in the European Economic Area: Iceland, Liechtenstein and Norway. There are currently 28 countries that are part of the EU, including Croatia, most recently acceded on 1 July 2013).

As pervasive corruption, failing States, crime and gendered violence make situations at home more precarious, individuals and small household groups press forward making ever riskier migration choices – with children separated from their parents, spouses and life partners from each other, adding to the traditional market of young males seeking to access work and a future in Europe, and so the wheel of oppression turns.

Numbers

The UNODC (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime), which has now begun to publish annual data on the detection of trafficking cases, which spans trafficking for sexual exploitation, child exploitation, labour trafficking and organ trafficking, stated in its 2014 report that the most common form of human trafficking (79%) globally is sexual exploitation. Furthermore, the most likely ‘reported’ victims of sexual exploitation are predominantly women and girls.¹¹

In 30% of the countries which brought data forward on the gender of traffickers, women were also seen to constitute the largest proportion of detected traffickers – with a presumption that their role may well be significant in the arena of procurement, as managers of brothels where sexual exploitation takes place and in child ‘fostering’ also. Further work needs to be done on this data, to fully understand what this data tells us about gendered asymmetries in recruitment patterns, and how exploitation can be interdicted. Particular attention needs to be paid to the roles of men and women in the high incidence of trafficking for sexual exploitation, which affects both genders in some measure, and involves adults and children, with the acknowledged role of women in the work of brothel managers and initial recruitment. Nevertheless, what is incontrovertible in the case of sex trafficking, however shadowy the networks which bring women and children into the trafficked marketplace, is that the vast majority of clients are male.

The second most common form of human trafficking is forced labour, which in 2014 was estimated globally at 18%. However, this was the UNODC measuring the data, and it was anxious to point out that many cases of forced labour are less recognised by the State, and therefore detection and reporting is significantly lower currently in its data gathering than trafficking for sexual exploitation.

Appallingly, according to figures accrued from a variety of data sources worldwide, almost 20% of all trafficking victims are ‘estimated’ to be children. Even worse, in some parts of Africa and the Mekong region, children are in the majority of those trafficked, whether into agricultural forced labour, into child units within armed insurgencies, or into sex trafficking and child sexual exploitation. In some parts of West Africa these figures climbed horrifyingly towards 100% of the cases of trafficking reported, although it is not clear what detection and protection strategies are in place for adults in these countries, and what attention is being given to monitor adult trafficking abuse.

In all, UNICEF estimated in 2011 that 150 million children aged 5-14 in developing countries were involved in child labour.¹² Furthermore, the numbers of children caught in the processes of trafficking include some 24 countries where children have been recruited into armed conflict by non-state actors, with estimates varying widely as to their number – as child soldiers, as sex slaves, domestic slaves and even into enforced child marriage.

Although the very word trafficking within ‘human trafficking’ seems to imply people moving across continents, most exploitation is now recognised as taking place much closer to home. As we shall see from the data for Europe, the vast weight of trafficking for both labour and sexual exploitation is occurring from either within the European Union, or ‘domestic trafficking’ within State borders. Notwithstanding this realisation, there is still a worryingly high percentage of ‘third country’ trafficking occurring in Europe.

11) UNODC Global Report. https://www.unodc.org/documents/data.../GLOTIP_2014_full_report.pdf

12) UNICEF report March 2011 http://www.unicef.org/protection/57929_58005.html

As the UNODC data for 2014 clearly shows, intra-regional and domestic trafficking are the major forms of trafficking in persons worldwide. Consequently efforts should be undertaken by organisations to substantially align their work to building regional resilience in line with the four Ps promoted through the United Nations Inter Agency Project on Human Trafficking.¹³

The four Ps are as follows: (i) Policy and Cooperation; (ii) Prevention; (iii) Prosecution; (iv) Protection, Recovery and Reintegration: The United Nations Protocol against Trafficking in Persons – the foremost international agreement in this area – entered into force in 2003. The Report shows that in the past few years the number of Member States seriously implementing the Protocol has more than doubled (from 54 to 125 out of the 155 States covered). However, there are still many countries that lack the necessary legal instruments or political will to really address human trafficking in all its forms, as the Executive Director of UNODC, Antonio Maria Costa, said at the launch of the 2014 UNODC report on human trafficking. His call to communities is worth reflecting on in the context of this report, saying as he called on governments, the private sector, and the public at large to step up the fight against trafficking in persons:

“Many governments are still in denial (so that) there is even neglect when it comes to either reporting on or prosecuting cases of human trafficking. More must be done to reduce the vulnerability of victims, increase the risks to traffickers, and lower demand for the goods and services of modern-day slaves.”¹⁴

UNODC figures

The UNODC 2014 report acknowledged just how tough measurement of the global business of human trafficking is, in the following terms:

“One of the key unanswered questions remains: Just how big is the human trafficking problem globally? Without a sense of the magnitude of the problem, it is impossible to prioritize human trafficking as an issue relative to other local or transnational threats, and it is difficult to assess whether any particular intervention is having effect. While coming to an estimation based on the present data would be premature, it is incumbent on the international community to gather the information necessary to fill this gap. Far more knowledge is needed before the true size of the market for human beings can be estimated, but this information could be gathered through a sustained programme of data sharing.”¹⁵

Alongside this appropriate act of humility in the face of the ‘dark unknown data’ on the actual numbers of those experiencing trafficking conditions at any one moment, various UN bodies – the United Nations Office for Drugs and Crime, the International Labour Organisation and the International Office on Migration – have hazarded some estimates, which are worth considering.

In the UNODC report of 2014 the actual number of victims who had been ‘identified’ across 111 countries was around 21,400. This number will have been an underestimate of even the cases which were pursued, but under legislation other than that of trafficking, a procedure which occurs either in countries with ‘under-articulated’ trafficking legislation or in countries where prosecution is considered to be easier, and more likely to be successful, under other legislation. With the increased presence of National Reporting Mechanisms (NRMs), which refer victims of potential trafficking cases to a national repository, this loss of key data will be steadily diminished, as this area of interdiction and prosecution matures across participating States.

13) http://www.no-trafficking.org/resources_background_response.html

14) UNODC Global Report on Trafficking in Persons 2014. Based on data gathered from 155 countries, the report offers the first global assessment of the scope of human trafficking and what is being done to fight it.

15) Ibid.

Faith Community lead and capacity raising

One of the first international gatherings convened by Pope Francis was a workshop on Trafficking in Human Beings at the Academy of Sciences, Vatican City, in November 2013. Academics from around the world along with grassroots organisations, including RENATE members, discussed ways in which the global phenomenon could be addressed through strategic planning and effective networking.¹⁶ A year later, a similar Youth Conference was held at which six young people representing RENATE from different European countries were present.¹⁷ In April 2014 the Santa Marta Group was formed.¹⁸ In December 2014, world faith leaders joined Pope Francis to sign a declaration to put an end to modern slavery by 2020.¹⁹

In his New Year message in 2015 (quoted by Sister Imelda Poole, president of RENATE, in the preface to this document), Pope Francis said:

“We ought to recognize that we are facing a global phenomenon which exceeds the competence of any one community or country. In order to eliminate it, we need a mobilisation comparable in size to that of the phenomenon itself. For this reason I urgently appeal to all men and women of good will, and all those near or far, including the highest levels of civil institutions, who witness the scourge of contemporary slavery, not to become accomplices to this evil, not to turn away from the sufferings of our brothers and sisters, our fellow human beings, who are deprived of their freedom and dignity. Instead, may we have the courage to touch the suffering flesh of Christ,²⁰ revealed in the faces of those countless persons whom he calls ‘the least of these my brethren.’” (Mt 25:40, 45).²¹

Pope Francis has given renewed energy to inspire communities around the world, by affirming work already undertaken, and encouraging the wider congregational networks, and interdenominational and interfaith networks being reached out to, to take forward meaningful anti-trafficking work. Crucially, trafficking is as dynamic and ever evolving as the efforts to thwart it. Our responses to trafficking consequently need to be adaptable, whilst we hold on to the core abuse which it represents. Our congregations and RENATE Network needs to be flexible to adapt priorities of action and intervention as we learn more about the diverse manifestation of this crime and the range of effective actions which can be undertaken to assist those who survive it into fuller recovery. The international community recognises that cooperation remains crucial to the success of interventions, and to sustaining the momentum of national responses. As can be seen from the following chapters, the context in which human trafficking arises and is prosecuted is constantly evolving and changing, as must the response be to these morphing methods and exploitative activities.

16) Statement of the Workshop on Trafficking in Human Beings www.casinapioiv.va/content/.../2013/trafficking/traffickingstatement.htm...

17) Academy of Sciences hosts trafficking symposium Vatican ...en.radiovaticana.va/.../2014/.../academy_of_sciences...trafficking.../1111...15 Nov 2014 - (Vatican Radio) Young men and women from around the world who are... The two-day meeting has been jointly organised by the Pontifical Academy of ...2014 - The estimates of prostitution and human trafficking are staggering. ... in neighbourhoods and schools in big cities like London, Madrid, Paris, etc.

18) The Santa Marta Group – whose name derives from the Holy Father’s residence, where the members stayed during their first conference held in the Vatican, April 2014 – is composed of High Commissioners of international police forces and bishops from around the world who, along with members of civil society, are working together to prevent and eradicate human trafficking, and to help victims. Sir Bernard Hogan-Howe, Commissioner of Police of the Metropolis, London, and Cardinal Nichols are the co-presidents of the group.

19) http://www.news.va/en/news/Vatican_City_2_December_2014

20) https://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/messages/peace/documents/papa-francesco_20141208_messaggio-xlviigiornata-mondiale-pace-2015.html#_ftn12

21) Message of his holiness Pope Francis for the celebration of the world day of peace, 1 January 2015: ‘NO LONGER SLAVES, BUT BROTHERS AND SISTERS.’ 8 Dec 2014. Accessed from Vatican Website, September 2015. https://w2.vatican.va/.../papa-francesco_20141208_messaggio-xlviigi-or..

The EU as a discrete community

In Europe, the EU itself recognises the urgent need to address this heinous activity and to constantly update responses to meet the evolving nature of trafficking itself. Critically, the EU readily accepts that Member States need to identify individuals who have been trafficked and to offer them assistance, support and protection. Member States have been called to address the crime, and to improve their capacity to identify trafficked persons, with particular attention being paid to changes in the context of policy. Trafficked persons, including both adults and minors, may now apply for protection across the EU. Children have been increasingly understood to be a particularly vulnerable category of persons caught within the trafficking nexus.

Currently, two Directives set out procedures at EU level for protecting trafficked persons: Directive 2011/36/EU and Council Directive 2004/81/EC of 29 April 2004. Council Directive 2004/81/EC provides for residence permits for third-country nationals who were trafficked or were the subject of an action to facilitate illegal immigration and then are willing to co-operate with authorities regarding the investigation and prosecution of the crime of trafficking in human beings or smuggling. Meanwhile, Directive 2011/36/EU calls for action to identify, support, assist and protect trafficked persons, without prejudice to Directive 2004/81/EC. Importantly, this European framework provides for a common definition of trafficking, to facilitate an approach for national authorities to establish procedures enabling access to assistance, support and protection.

Directive 2011/36/EU requires Member States to ‘adopt a gender perspective and a child-rights approach.’ This requires Member States to develop knowledge on the ‘gender dimension’ and develop responses which appropriately take into account the impacts of both trafficking and responses to children’s rights for protection from trafficking risks. This implicitly requires Member States to enhance their ability to protect children from trafficking in the first place, their capacity for early identification of victims, and to develop child-appropriate, recovery processes that are sensitive to child rights, for those subjected to trafficking, as soon as they are identified as victims of this crime.

The Unravelling of the Soviet Union and Trafficking and Religious Impacts

The RENATE Network in Europe follows the ancient configuration of the Holy Roman Empire with its extensive cultural and performative allegiance to Catholicism, which still abides in many places despite 70 years of Soviet denial and attrition of its organisational reach and faith allegiance. Here within the borders of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS), the network of former Soviet countries during their progression towards independence in the 1990s, there are commonalities to be re-engaged. The impact of the different configurations of the compact between the Roman Catholic Church and the Soviet authorities across the era of Sovietisation can be clearly seen. The authority and long-term integration of Latin-based Catholicism is evident in Poland, with 92.2% of Poland’s population still announcing themselves as Catholic, making Poland the country with the largest share of Catholics in its population in the world. Meanwhile, in Latvia, although within the census 79% declared some form of Christian affiliation, only 7% of the population attended religious services regularly when recorded in 2006. Furthermore, Catholicism is the second dominant denomination, squeezed between the dominant Lutheranism imported from the days of German and Swedish occupation in the West of the country, and the Latvian Orthodoxy which is a subset of the Russian Orthodox Church.

However, not all countries experienced the ‘soviet-style’ communism. Some were subjected to a ‘Chinese’ model which was ‘atheistic’ and cruel. Borders closed and the ‘silence’ of poverty was deafening. The collapse of communism across Europe led to mass migration, a flood of corruption and a weakening of the law. Out of endemic poverty; breakdown of law and lack of implementation, the trafficker was ‘born’. The market for trafficked victims came out of a profit-making ‘business’ particularly from the ‘sale’ of young beautiful women for the growing sex industry. Even today, the Law is not implemented and countries are ruled by an ‘Oligarchy elite’.

The difference in configuration, and the differential influence that the Catholic Church can wield at the political and civic level, married with the variant capacity of its Religious Congregations, do not simply stop with a deeper understanding of the heterogeneous history of the CIS. It is important to understand that in the initial stages of liberalisation, and the opening up of potential training and vocational formation which occurred as the Berlin Wall started to be culturally dismantled, had different impacts and different strength of current. Initially there was a swell of interest and vocations experienced by many of the traditional and suppressed congregations across most of the CIS. However, at the same time there was an opening up to other denominational presence across the CIS, which realised new churches being established from Pentecostal and Evangelical. The impact of all of this has yet to be fully scoped or comprehended. What is clear is that religious affiliation is now becoming something a great deal more fluid than previously possible. Within this range of fluidity the Roman Catholic Congregations have an opportunity to reach across and galvanise the contribution of other emergent and traditional religious partners. This is important to see realised, so that the full potential of the faith communities as enablers of civil society to resist and demolish the conditions which encourage trafficking networks can be manifested with real impact as an interdenominational project, or at the very least a vital inter-agency co-operation.

Across the Union - Pre and Post Vatican II

It is worth a brief paragraph within this overall summary to consider the different perspectives, capacity and environment in which the Religious Congregations across the expanded European Union have managed the changes within Catholicism itself over the last century. This is not an avenue which has been explored in detail within the country reports contained in this review. However, the background to how the regionally distributed impact of the Second Vatican Council (Vatican II), which when Pope John XXIII announced its creation in January 1959 shocked the world, is still, 55 years later, deeply significant. There hadn't been an Ecumenical Council — an assembly of Roman Catholic religious leaders meant to settle doctrinal issues — in nearly 100 years. For those Religious Congregations beyond the 'Iron Curtain' the effects have been deep and long lasting. Not only were habits and wimples divested in the 'western' churches as a result of Vatican II, there was a renewed attention to the social justice vocation of the church's mission, with all worshippers being sent the message that they were to become active agents of change.

The liturgy was transformed from elite medievalism purveyed by the Latin Mass, into the everyday language of the region's people. A spirit of interdenominational conversation and co-operation was fostered, and the Church became a part of the wider movement of the societal currents of liberal change washing through the 1960s. This was a decade of challenging past mores, with its associated protests against racism, war, gendered exclusion, sexual constraints, and the status quo as the *modus vivendi*. Everything and anything smelling of hierarchical rigidity was challenged. All these movements for liberalisation and social transformation were resisted in the Soviet Union, which before the advent of the Internet could organise the control of information and the seepage of Western movements through its iron curtain, with a modicum of success.

The Presence of the Wall

With the collapse of the Berlin Wall in 1989, not only were 28 years of damaging separation of East and West Germany over, but the wider separation of former Soviet occupied nations from Western Europe brought to an end — a fissure stretching back to before the Second World War in many cases. The impact of the collapse of the Soviet-managed State economies in the late 1980s, with the social contract with millions of Soviet citizens in tatters, was profound. Millions of citizens had endured near starvation and many thousands death in the Gulag economy which during the years of Stalinist rule saw 14 million people pass through this 'chain of islands' in the Soviet forced labour economy. Between 1929 and 1953, 6 to 7 million were deported and exiled to remote areas of the USSR, with 4 to 5 million passing through other labour colonies, plus 3.5 million already in, or sent to, 'labour settlements.'

With the revelations of the horrors of the Stalinist era starting to impact the consciousness of the Soviet people and undermine the legitimacy of the Soviet experiment within its own borders, the wider collapse of the social contract ‘cradle to grave’ provision of health, education and housing requirements began to unravel. The political legitimacy of Soviet rule was fatally broken and the opportunity arose for the traditional churches in the emergent CIS countries to manifest community and articulate personal liberty alongside rearticulating societal goals around commonality. However, the energy for change has flowed dramatically in the direction of individual freedom. This together with the excitement and possibility to travel beyond the local, and the opportunity to experience the ‘golden lifestyle’ of the Western world, filtering through the wall via a variety of forms of media, exchange of news and new opportunities arising through first-wave entrepreneurs bridging the East-West divide, has had a massive effect on the former Soviet political and economic space. Suddenly ‘the West’ was the place to access to achieve success, and the renewal from within, which many had been hoping for, failed to materialise.

The Role of Corruption

In the wake of the Wall being collapsed, there was a sharp ascent in trafficking of all descriptions, with females, both adult and children, being recruited into the sex industries of Western Europe, frequently through the Balkans or via Russia.²²

However, as indicted by one German member of RENATE, “The role of the fall of the Berlin wall in the expansion of prostitution and trafficking is tricky. The origin of the big business started during the Vietnam war when American soldiers were brought to Thailand for amusement and recovery. The Philippines had the American headquarters Subic Bay and Clark on their doorsteps. That is why this prostitution pest could develop to the extent it has reached nowadays. Before the fall of the Berlin wall women from Thailand and the Philippines were brought to Germany and to many other European countries. Nowadays the short distances between Eastern and Western Europe have made Asian women ‘superfluous.’”²³

The deals previously made by the Soviet authorities with organised criminality morphed seamlessly into a sub-structure of criminality which would now foster the growth of trafficking in people, drugs, armaments, artefacts and, finally, endangered species into the West, as the markets opened up for the trade in goods across the former East-West divide. Furthermore, the injection of substantial numbers of United Nations and NATO forces into the Balkans provided ‘early adopter’ customers for the newly available ‘female products’ of the liberalising Eastern bloc. This was an era characterised by ‘demagogues, secret police, and thugs profited from sanctions busting, and the smuggling of people, arms, cigarettes and drugs’ – a part of the transition which is now being addressed by more open borders, though widespread and enduring collusion between politics, business, and organised crime is seen as an ongoing challenge.

To break this nexus, the number one priority suggested by the UNODC is to fight corruption wherever it presents itself. This is because it has been understood that the presence of corruption undermines the rule of law, diminishes the integrity of public institutions, and undermines the development of a healthy business environment – all of which are seen as goods of neo-liberal societies, and the democratically accountable institutions which support them.²⁴ The global trade in human lives trafficked at any given time is estimated by the International Labour Organization (ILO) in 2005 to be around 2.4 million, which generates annual profits of about US\$32 billion, whilst disrupting potential growth, national production and State capacities to serve the interests of civil society in equal measure. The scale of that which is being addressed is staggering, and the importance of building resilience of States and

22) Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery. Siddharth Kara Columbia University Press 2009

23) Sr Dagmar Plum, MMS Germany. RENATE Core Group

24) Crime and its Impact on the Balkans (UNODC 2006)

their public servants to resist any pressures to collude, and become the line of least resistance to the monetary opportunities held out to them, are immense. However, the need for explicit attention to the place of corruption in public life is one area to which none of our reports has paid particular attention, and one on which the international community has only recently started to shine a light.²⁵ This area requires further reflection from the perspective of the role of the Church in mediating enhanced ethical behaviour, transparency and accountability on the part of public officials, politicians, business leaders and citizens in developed, developing and underdeveloped nations. Transparency International has been seeking to weave into policy makers' prioritisation specific attention to corruption as a global challenge with profound inter-sectoral impacts – costing the productive and accountable economies of the world billions of pounds every year.

The Global Corruption Index is one of the tools which Transparency International now furnishes policy makers worldwide, to assess the challenges which different countries and regions face. When looking at the index for 2014, one can clearly note countries of high risk of 'trafficking extraction' though the exploitation destinations – particularly for sex trafficking – are fairly ubiquitous, and are not clearly aligned to corruption indices; something else is clearly operating in this mix.

In moving forwards, and making the connections which combine extreme poverty, international economic asymmetries, alongside the manifestation of ethnic, localised and household inequalities in political, legal and economic spheres, it is important to pause and calibrate the impact of corruption within an already unequal distribution of power. Illicit financial flows, including corruption, bribery, theft and tax evasion, according to the World Bank and the analysis to which Oxfam subjected the figures, cost developing countries US\$1.26 per year. This is equivalent to the economies of Switzerland, South Africa and Belgium combined, a budget which could lift the 1.4 billion people living on less than US\$1.25 a day (one of the indicators of absolute poverty) above this threshold for at least six years.²⁶ And doubtless a figure which, if addressed, could do a great deal to address the fiscal challenges which drive millions of people each year to undertake 'risky' journeys in search of a better life.

The Vatican has started to draw together some excellent resources and set the initiative for RENATE members on which to build. Pope Francis, during his tour of South America in 2015, commented on the 'gangrene of corruption' which 'plagues societies across the world.' This then is an important theme for the Congregations to consider how to realise and strengthen initiatives which address this systemically weakening aspect of public life, present in businesses, organisations and public sectors across the world.²⁷ It is a theme which requires addressing within one's own organisation at the same time to ensure integrity, and to foster trust, a fact which has not passed Pope Francis by, in recent changes to the internal financial challenges of the Vatican.

Commonalities and Differences

Across the countries under review are a range of commonalities which are present in both source and destination countries, with every one of those countries under review having their own realisation of 'domestic' or internal trafficking. Whether we are looking at sex trafficking, labour trafficking, child trafficking or domestic servitude or other forms of forced labour, each country where reports have been commissioned announces the noxious presence of trafficking with associated human rights abuses, criminal exploitation and the 'unwitting' complicity of civil society in one form or another.

25) Issue Paper The Role of Corruption in Trafficking in Persons

UNODC Vienna 2011 https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/2011/Issue_Paper_-_The_Role_of_Corruption_in_Trafficking_in_Persons.pdf

26) *Global Financial Integrity, 'Illicit Financial Flows from Developing Countries over the Decade Ending 2009' (2011) pg. i; World Bank, 'World Bank Indicators Database' (2011); Oxfam, Discussion papers, 'A safe and just space for humanity' (2012), pg. 5*

27) <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/jul/12/pope-laments-gangrene-of-corruption-plaguing-all-peoples-of-the-world> accessed 27 August 2015

Thankfully the legal infrastructure required to enable States to prosecute traffickers, and support systems to interdict and pursue trafficking abuse, and protect the victims of such abuse, is starting to be regularised across Europe; however some countries seem to be nearer this goal than others. For many the legal infrastructures are clearly in place but the ability to log the abuse in a coherent and meaningful manner is absent. Others may have both of these requirements in place but because of a lack of training for front-facing services, first responders, criminal justice personnel from street policeman to high court judge, the legal tool kit is not able to be deployed in any meaningful manner.

In Europe the percentage of trafficking understood to be sex trafficking is currently estimated to be 80% of the trade in bodies, work and lives, with the European revenues being counted in billions in this trade, and the trafficking of mostly women and children for sexual exploitation at US\$3 billion annually, which involves 140,000 victims at any one time, and an estimated inward annual flow of 70,000 victims within Europe alone.

The trafficking for sexual exploitation and prostitution are part of a worldwide and constantly growing sex industry where trafficking has been described as a more or less organised 'importation of women from poor regions to the rich western world.' Meanwhile in the other direction, the rich areas of the world export cash-rich males, demanding paid sex, to poor regions.²⁸ This reverse flow is operating within Europe through stag parties and the growing mainstreamed leisure trade of the 'male procurement of sex,' marketed under a number of guises but amounting to the same reality.

Training

Training of personnel across the public sector, from health care professionals, educators, welfare providers, safeguarding for children, police, immigration personnel, employment regulatory officers, housing officers, to local priests, deacons and parish catechists is vital, for all have their role to play in building a more resilient civic nexus to resist the impacts of trafficking. Whether building the competency of the State or encouraging the development of resilient communities at a local level, all need to address trafficking proactively and with purpose.

Furthermore, training is required for those charged with taking care of victims of trafficking, whether survivors of sexual exploitation, children who have been forced to endure trafficking, or those caught in labour exploitation of one form or another. It is imperative that the care afforded is aligned for psycho-social recovery, legal restitution and the potential for long-term sustainable reintegration, resilient to the cycle of re-trafficking.

Multi Agency collaboration

In order to be able to deliver the injunction to 'take care of the survivors,' multi-agency collaboration is essential. Its importance has been underlined by numerous reports emerging from the UNODC, the Council of Europe, and the United States State Department, to name but a few. Across the country reports which follow, it is clear that the mandate to undertake multi agency co-operation and appropriate skills transfer, co-training, trust building and knowledge sharing has been acquired at different speeds across the European Union. The reports note varied levels of commitment and resourcing from their national governments, and consequently it is vital that each country's context is appropriately understood, before a blanket 'one size fits all' approach is run out by external funders and supporters of efforts of the RENATE Network to contribute to making its networked countries more counter-trafficking resilient. Although initiatives to develop multi-agency co-operation do require leadership and perseverance to be realised, this does not necessarily have to emerge from the centre. With our increasing understanding of how organisations and whole systems change, more attention is now being paid to the interconnectedness and the complexity of society, and the ability for change to be introduced at a number of different levels with considerable effectiveness.

28 (Månsson 2005)

The destiny of individuals is intricately caught between long-term strategies operating at a macro level, and immediate effective response at a micro level, which is frequently realised by independent civil society actors, faith communities, and NGOs anxious to cut through policy and see people directly assisted. The macro and the micro are connected with a myriad of intervening cogs which make up our experience of modernity lived globally and locally, in one and the same personal experience of the virtual and the 'off-line' felt 'now.' Consequently, thinking around interventions needs to be broad-ranging, and encompass the huge variety of actors incorporated in the processes of trafficking and its interdiction, with the vast panoply of communication channels open to being utilised, in this third millennium task.

“A system is an interconnected and interdependent series of entities, where decisions and actions in one entity are consequential to other neighbouring entities.”²⁹

Trafficking in human beings is part of a global system of exploitation of people, adults and children, male and female, able and disabled, of all creeds, colours and ethnicities, which requires the whole system of public sector provisioning and civic relationships locally, nationally and internationally to address. It is an immense challenge. Nothing less than the systematic erasure of personal dignity, empathetic inter-personal relationships, modern business ethics, humane employment practices and the capacity of the State to protect its borders from criminal disruption is the price of doing nothing. Human trafficking invades and undermines every area in public and civil society, and thus threatens to erode many of the gains of the long road of liberal ethics founded on a concept of equality, justice and freedom which have accompanied the rise of capitalism, as people are de-graded and absorbed into the category of mere commodities. So whether working in policing, the judiciary, businesses, travel and logistics contractors, border and immigration officers, child safeguarding practitioners, faith communities, health providers, and/or the academy, it is critical that all are appropriately informed, linked up and skilled to address this challenge to the ongoing health and flourishing of societies in an era of globalisation.

A Virus in the Body Politique

Human trafficking is a particular form of pernicious virus which has locked into processes within the international organism, feeding off the severe and endemic asymmetries in wealth, access to resources, and quality of life within and across countries, and is exploited by those who have no respect for human rights and the sanctity of each individual life. Wherever RENATE can assist in building connection and co-operation across communities this will make a dent in the ability of traffickers to exploit indifference and ignorance. Whether this work is undertaken interdenominationally, interfaith or within education, health, or capacity development across civil society to recognise the challenges of human trafficking, all engagement is important. Where a more mindful engagement with longer-term strategic 'whole system change' and 'vaccination' is considered, the four Ps of Prevention, Prosecution, Protection, and Policy response continue to be necessary in the day-to-day delivery of counter-trafficking medicine for the societies which have been 'infected.'

All country reports are showing RENATE Network members' ability to reach out and participate in wider initiatives instigated by faith partners, other NGOs or policing and enforcement agendas. However, all reports show that further reflection on the four Ps – Policy, Prevention, Prosecution and Protection – would be beneficial. Such a process would assist in revealing the particular opportunity presented by Congregations within their countries, and the potential match of Charisms to be taken forward by individual Congregations. The gap in provision might be in awareness training, in strengthening gender equality and strategies against violence against women and girls in education, health care provision, and social welfare outreach. Or there could emerge a fresh realisation of the potential of their significant network of trusted international relationships that could provide enhanced capacity to improve the outcomes for returned 'survivors of human trafficking.'

29) www.scie-socialcareonline.org.uk/search?...terms%3A%22systems

It is important for each of the countries which have submitted reports to look steadily at the evidence of current intervention and TIP (Trafficking in Persons Report, 2015) report stated needs, to see where the gaps in provision lie. This will then furnish them with further opportunities to respond, or a consolidation of the approach currently being undertaken, with authenticity and confidence derived from their Congregational and RENATE resources, knowing that they are responding to the most appropriate identified gaps, with their aligned strengths or with an invitation to open up currently untapped capacities.

Victim Pathways to Survival and Restitution

The discussion on assistance for returned survivors, whose logistical work is frequently taken forward by the International Organisation of Migration, is somewhat muted across these reports. It is an area which is full of potential, quite independent of any individual returnee, and needs to be thought about in terms of what real-time reception and reintegration might require, from the challenges of the border agencies, local policing, and social support, to that of the wider cultural challenges which will need to be addressed – with clarity and determination by all those with a role to play in transforming attitudes of ostracism and punishment, let alone the ongoing risk of secondary trafficking on return.

It is vital that (outside of the policing discourse) RENATE-based congregations begin the conversation within their respective communities, localities, and countries about the impact around inequalities of any sort. There are the particular risks pertaining to women and adolescent girls as well as boys of being recruited into the sex industry, which will require building an openness to reporting of sexual grooming and sexual harassment, addressing the sexualisation of the wider media and commercial world, and confronting the ongoing risks and impacts of being involved in any form in prostitution with all its heightened negative impacts on health and well-being. Moreover, it is essential that when tackling the phenomenon of prostitution, the power dynamics of this business are appropriately understood. Patriarchal-formulated responses to prostitution can see young women, and some of the men who are caught in this ‘business,’ ‘criminalised’ in countries of destination, or ‘vilified’ on return – blaming ubiquitously the ‘woman’ and disappearing the male purchaser in the process.

The presence of male abuse of positions of trust and power in Church, families and educational establishments, and the onward recruitment of youngsters into the sex trade, primed by their experience of abuse at school, home or faith community, is a sad legacy of centuries of abuse, which now needs to be openly confronted and addressed. Pope Francis has vowed to root out such abuse. On his recent visit to the USA, September 2015, he said:

“The crimes and sins of the sexual abuse of children must no longer be held in secret. I pledge the zealous vigilance of the church to protect children and the promise of accountability for all.”³⁰

The Nordic Model

The ‘Nordic model’ has two main goals: to curb the demand for commercial sex that fuels sex trafficking, and promote equality between men and women. It is based on an approach first adopted in Sweden in 1999, and followed by Norway and Iceland, which criminalises the purchase of sex. RENATE needs to take a clear position on the value of this Nordic model as a way to manage its response to the challenge of the ongoing exploitation of women within the sex industry, and in the most violent and unprotected ‘super exploitation’ environments of trafficking. Each country has reported the presence of people working in prostitution and ‘recognised’ sex trafficking in the reports which have been submitted. This is a challenging area to try and step up the response beyond that of offering succour and recovery options.

30) www.theguardian.com › World › Pope Francis, 27 September 2015, “I remain overwhelmed with shame that men entrusted with the tender care of children violated these little ones and caused grievous harm. I am profoundly sorry. God weeps.” Accessed 28 September, 2015

However, it is one which RENATE has some particular advantages in seeking to address as a network of Women Religious Congregations, working in alliance with other NGOs seeking to break down the opportunities of trafficking in their countries. With gender bias manifesting itself in women and female children embroiled in sex trafficking abuses across Europe, it makes sense that the Women Religious Congregations champion in particular the welfare and protection of women and children in this arena. There is an incipient vision in development in the network which RENATE is building of creating a Europe in which women and children are clearly protected from the ravages of human trafficking, and its wider penumbra of sexual exploitation in general, which are perceived to flow from the presence of the 'sex for sale' industry.

The Nordic model is built on the *Kvinnofrid* law, premised on the undergirding position in Swedish law which seeks the removal of violence against women in all its forms. The Swedish law was controversial when it was enacted in 1999, because it challenges and criminalises an age-old male sense of entitlement to look at women's bodies as if they were goods to be bought and sold. In fact the law cannot be understood without understanding Sweden's equal opportunity policy which has been strengthening across the last decades of the twentieth century. Many years of discussions and work for women's rights within Sweden became the basis for the current legislation. In a gender-equal society, it makes no sense for men to regard women as merchandise. So the legislation is gender neutral, which is important as it also captures the illegality of attempting to purchase men and boys' bodies. Furthermore, the buyers as well as the sellers can be men or women. Practically speaking, the focus lands on the demand for women and children who are exploited sexually. The law criminalises the sex buyers, who in the vast majority of cases are men.

Meanwhile the sale of sexual services is not punishable by law, which importantly protects the autonomy and agency of the seller. So the foundation of the 'Swedish example' ('Nordic model') is to break down the business processes, and the social asymmetry of power, between the buyers and the sellers of sex. This law prohibiting the purchase of sexual services has constituted a central component of Sweden's strategy to combat both prostitution and human trafficking. In the Swedish view, prostitution and human trafficking are linked by the sex buyers, whose money finances organised crime. In the perspective of the Nordic model, it is sex buyers who make human trafficking in the sex industry both possible and lucrative. The law was controversial when it was enacted in 1999, within and outside Sweden – but within Sweden itself it has shown the power to transform male attitudes around the purchasing of sex, with year-on-year evidence of articulated male aspirations and opinions around the 'right' to purchase bodies for sex. Internationally it has raised the ire of both those working within the sex industry who claim that it has forced prostitution 'underground' in Sweden, and also led to increased sex tourism practiced by Swedish males no longer able to purchase sex freely within their domicile.³¹

According to a research report in 2008 from the Nordic Gender Institute, the number of sex buyers in Sweden has declined since the introduction of the sex purchase law. A poll was taken to determine whether the law had influenced individual patterns of behaviour. The results, compared with those of a similar poll taken in 1996, revealed that the number of male sex buyers in Sweden had decreased from 13.6% to 7.9%. Each poll questioned individuals between 18 and 76 years of age. The effectiveness of the legislation in terms of 'explicit' attitudinal and behavioural change, and the substantial decline in the numbers of active brothels and those 'caught in prostitution' across the country has won the Nordic model a number of supporters, beyond its immediate area of influence in the Baltic States. Many activists in this arena have started to be convinced by the business model which is being raised in the attention on addressing 'demand' and ³² seeking to turn off one of the drivers for the presence of the 'sex trade' within a modern society's social and 'leisure' economy in the first place.

31) Targeting the Sex Buyer: The Swedish Example, stopping prostitution and trafficking where it all begins (Kajsa Claude 2010)

32) Ibid.

In February 2014 the European Parliament formally adopted the Nordic model as the preferred mode of addressing prostitution across its 27 countries. The Nordic model steps up from the Swedish legislation in prosecuting the purchase of sex by nationals when out of the country, thus moving into addressing the growing market in the international travel industry of sex tourism in countries which adopt this particular model of intervention. The European parliament has voted in favour of a non-binding resolution, as has the Council of Europe – encouraging Member States to consider the benefits of the Nordic model and see it steadily realised into Member State national legislation. The resolution recommends the adoption of the Nordic model of prostitution that criminalises buying it, and legalises selling it, whilst providing substantial support for ‘exit’ strategies for those ‘caught within prostitution’ and stepping up appropriately resourced proactive input across educational providers, addressing the ‘gendered inequalities’ which put females substantially in the category of ‘goods’ to be purchased for the temporary access to sex, by males.

It would seem, as history moves on, that countries in Europe are beginning to seriously examine the Nordic model as a way forward for adoption, whilst some in The Netherlands and Germany question their present legislation. In some country reports, this will be evident where the debate has moved, or is in the process of moving towards adopting the Nordic model of legislation. It is significant to witness the Vatican engage in a serious dialogue with the ‘Nordic model.’

Having this internal debate thoroughly engaged in, transparently discussed, and honestly worked through, would in and of itself have the potential of powerfully affecting, some 1.4 billion Catholics globally, of whom 40% of that number – around 600 million people – are in Latin America.³³ Furthermore, there is still a significant presence of self-identified Catholics in Europe, alongside Catholicism’s strong presence in Africa. This represents a powerful reach into the global community. If counter-trafficking measures, messages and comportment can be embedded into mainstream Catholic teaching, formation and congregational behaviours, as has been suggested above in counter corruption, addressing global inequities in the access to wealth production and its distribution, and gendered inequality with particularly the Nordic model in mind, there could be significant changes in the contours of human trafficking which we are currently experiencing, and a serious interdiction of its spread.³⁴

The RENATE network could hold a flame for ensuring advocacy for appropriate resource allocation and thinking much wider about what causes human trafficking. As this summary has intimated and which will emerge in the country reports, there are numerous drivers which lie behind human trafficking’s apparent ubiquity – asymmetry in access to resources, gender inequities, the closure of life opportunities, corruption, desperation, State instability, clients refusal of empathy, civic passivity in the face of exploitation, to name a few significant features – and through RENATE’s unique network of praying congregations assist in holding the importance of cutting the Gordian knot of human trafficking wherever it surfaces, while seeking the wider and more stable good of society alongside supporting the immediate needs of individuals affected.

Children

It is important to note that most of the country reports did not deal directly with the support of children involved in child trafficking. There are a range of reasons behind this, not least the particular protections and protocols which are in place around the provision of services to children. However the work of RENATE members in influencing the curricula and the access to education for boys and girls across Europe continues to be significant, not least in the resistance to inter-ethnic exclusion and widespread discrimination to ‘Roma’ children across a number of European countries. Moreover, the worldwide Congregation of the Sisters of Mercy is addressing this issue of child trafficking in its anti-trafficking campaign, which is an area to be explored in a subsequent report.³⁵ Meanwhile, RENATE supports the efforts of the Mercy Sisters in focusing on child victims.

33) Vatican figures

34) Ibid

35) MECPATHS Campaign - Congregation of the Sisters of Mercy ...www.sistersofmercy.ie/vision/mecpath_campaign.cfm Accessed Sept 2015

Initial Recommendations

- a) A clear strategy to be developed looking at the Network as a whole and to see its various strengths and capabilities, which can be shared across both its European members and wider affiliates. This will also benefit the Network through enabling it to understand its various areas of excellence, or areas which some of its colleagues within multi-agency affiliations have developed which can be shared. There is also an opportunity to undertake a brief and honest audit on areas which are not so effective and the reasons for this (lack of resources, training, or inappropriate to the talents and charisma of the Congregation).
 - b) The development of a network to enable the better reintegration of those who are returned after being trafficked. Within this mix there will also be those who have undertaken migration and encountered a number of exceedingly demeaning experiences, or failed in their attempts to 'access a better life' and need to save face. There needs to be clear strategies developed and training put in place to protect survivors from having to 'rehearse' the abuse which was experienced when under the control of their traffickers as they return to their 'source' country. Some of this work is currently being undertaken in 'one-off' co-operative efforts – however this is worth exploring further to try and build in some 'kite-marked' best practice in this sphere.
 - c) Development of capacity, competency and networks (both in countries of source and countries of exploitation) which are able to work with the post trauma impacts of trafficking.
 - This will in turn need to inform some of the 'spiritual' or 'religious' impacts of isolation (from faith/ family community) and the somewhat 'perverse' but abundantly evidenced internal generation of false guilt.
 - Opportunities to develop niche partnerships (in country, bilateral or multi-lateral) with experts or bespoke organisations already involved with enabling recovery from sexual exploitation – as a particularly sensitive space where guilt is generated.
 - d) Awareness-raising and training in countries of source around the network – in churches and all networks where Religious Congregations reach – of the early risk factors pertaining to abuse of women, and child sexual exploitation. This can feed into training and interventions in this area to build political representation of women, and cultural shifts in the appropriate protection of women through real-time gender equality expressed through legislation and all the manifestations of the Church's teaching and presence in the countries where RENATE members are active.
 - e) Support and development of early warning – help line, support, information distribution via media, sermons, pastoral letters, education procedures, safeguarding around violence against women, sexual exploitation and violence within the home – with multi-agency and inter-denominational engagement.
 - f) Safeguarding procedures – best practice to be shared across the communities, and qualifications for safeguarding training cascaded across the Network. This is particularly important for all Congregations working in the educational sector, and for all Church leaders, priests, deacons and those working in the wider organisation of the churches.
 - g) The further preparation and development of resources which can equip all congregational members on the challenge of human trafficking in all its forms. Materials designed to raise individuals' sense of responsibility to 'take action' to stop trafficking, whether as a potential consumer, friend, teacher, neighbour of someone at trafficking risk, family member of someone involved in the recruiting trafficking 'nexus', giver of succour or support to someone who has survived
-

trafficking, or very simply as a citizen participating in a 'global chain of interconnected worlds' and interceding with their lives for change.

- h) Support for Pope Francis' initiative on counter corruption – supporting this as part of a wider mandate to develop State resources across the European Union to resist the negative impacts of corruption on the resilience of public bodies to resist human trafficking forces.
- i) Facilitating conversation across the RENATE membership and the possible development of a RENATE workbook on the issues which are raised in the Nordic model, so that RENATE membership is well sighted on the challenges and the potential paradigm shift which this legislation could represent in the specific fight against trafficking for sexual exploitation.

Steadiness, resolve, long-term attention and the commitment of resources, aided by the attention to prayer, spirituality of resistance, resources to build communities' networks to resist trafficking, to uphold respect and dignity for each individual, to assert gender equality, to resist all forms of inequality and violence against the person, to work collaboratively – these are the challenges faced by RENATE Network into the future – and which each country report bears testimony to in its own unique way.

Dr Carrie Pemberton-Ford

Director of the Cambridge Centre for Applied Research in Human Trafficking
Cambridge, UK, October 2015

About the Author:

Revd Dr Carrie Pemberton-Ford is an ordained Anglican Priest, and academic theologian and international political theorist with specialist knowledge and active engagement in the arena of global migration (particularly the formation of new diasporas in the 21st century) and human trafficking. The founder director of the European Churches Alert to Sex Trafficking across Europe (CHASTE), which established the network of faith-based safe house provision in the UK, Dr Pemberton Ford has been involved in developing the capacity of the Churches in Europe to respond to the crisis of human trafficking through membership of COATNET (Churches Against Trafficking NET) and CCME (Churches Commission on Migration in Europe), leading workshops, seminars and participating in European Union funded projects for over 15 years. In 2014 she presented the Executive report for the European Federation of Street Children Toolkit on identification of Human Trafficking risk amongst Children.

She is author of a number of reports and research projects, including the influential report on the London 2012 Olympics Human Trafficking, Sporting Mega-Events, and the London Olympics of 2012. Dr Pemberton Ford is widely sought after for analysis, research, think tank germination and the development of context-sensitive analyses of human trafficking challenges. The CCARHT network has global presence, with members participating from across seven continents – with especial strength in Asia and Africa. She was a board member of the UK Human Trafficking Centre leading on Education and Research, and is a member of the UK's College of Policing, where she assesses for senior police selection and talent management.

Retaining her expertise in the interface of faith and political structures she has co-authored two liturgical contributions to raising the ability of the churches to respond to human trafficking by the incorporation of the abuse of human trafficking into their liturgical life. 'It is essential,' she notes, 'for each one, sitting in the pew, attending mass, lighting a candle for a loved one, to be able to make their unique contribution in building a world resilient to the degradation of human trafficking.' This commitment to assist congregations to ethically interrogate their own and their societies' contribution to the collapse in relational accountability which human trafficking represents inspired the creation by Dr Pemberton Ford of the 'Not for Sale Sunday' movement in 2006. Dr Pemberton Ford resourced this movement with the supporting books – 'Not for Sale: Raising Awareness Ending Exploitation', and 'The Real Scandal of Sex Trafficking'. She is currently preparing a volume of Homilies for Priests for exposition during the weekly Mass as part of this wider work of raising the liturgical grammar of social justice and prayerful mindfulness.

Revd Dr Carrie Pemberton Ford

Director of the Cambridge Centre for Applied Research on Human Trafficking (www.CCARHT.org)
Research Associate at the Department of Criminal and Medical Law, University of the Free State, RSA

Cambridge

UK

www.ccarht.org

Carrie@ccarht.org

INTRODUCING RENATE

“It is not possible to remain indifferent before the knowledge that human beings are bought and sold like goods!”³⁶

RENATE was established in 2009 by a group of women religious representing several different congregations working against human trafficking in Europe. In 2007 USMI (Union of Major Religious Superiors in Italy) invited religious from all over the world to come together to discuss the phenomena of trafficking and to adopt a way forward for religious in combating this evil. This group, named INRATIP,³⁷ made the choice to work together to form another international body under the umbrella of UISG (Union of International Female Superiors General). In 2009 this dream was realised and the international group of religious called TALITHA KUM³⁸ was established. At this gathering some European members of TALITHA KUM realised that there was no network of religious for Europe. A decision was taken to call together sisters from congregations working in Europe who would be interested in establishing such a network. The first gathering of sisters from Europe took place in The Netherlands at the administration base of SRTV,³⁹ courtesy of the Dutch religious who founded this organisation.

At this meeting, **RENATE** was conceived and named (Religious in Europe Networking Against Trafficking and Exploitation). RENATE is grateful to SRTV for enabling these first meetings to be realised. This first group, of fifteen sisters and a core group of six sisters, plus the two workers employed by SRTV, established RENATE on a legal footing in 2010, with financial support. The mandate for this initial group was to call a conference to launch RENATE, and to invite religious from Eastern, Central and Western Europe to participate at it. This conference was realised in Trzebinia/Poland in September 2011, at which RENATE was launched as a Network.⁴⁰

Vision of RENATE: RENATE believes that:

- *All people are created in the image of God (Imago Dei);*
- *Every person has a right to human dignity, and human dignity cannot be compromised;*
- *No person should be enslaved since freedom is the God-given gift of every created human person.*



Mission of RENATE - underpinned and inspired by its vision - to:

- *Free the world from trafficking and exploitation;*
- *Support and commit to the European Network in order to work against human trafficking and exploitation;*
- *Share responsibility for various aspects of its ministry;*
- *Empower those whose voices are not being heard, particularly those trafficked and exploited;*
- *Exercise its prophetic role in the struggle for human rights for all people, applying the values of the Gospel and the social teaching of the Church in working for the freedom and dignity of all people.*

36) Pope Francis, Rome, March 2014

37) International Network of Religious Against Trafficking in Persons, Catholic sisters from 26 countries and all continents, representing 800 congregations worldwide and over one million sisters. Rome, October 2007

38) www.talithakum.info/ International Network of Consecrated Life Against Trafficking in Persons.

39) www.srtv.info/engels/srtv/index_uk.html Dutch Foundation of Religious Against Trafficking in Women

40) Adapted from RENATE Annual Report, 2014

In one of its many objectives, RENATE commits to being informed; to ongoing research – mapping of countries to ascertain the scale, type and level of human trafficking – so as to plan its work strategically, with purpose and effect, across the Network.⁴¹

MAPPING

In 2014, RENATE undertook to do a Mapping Exercise across 13 countries in Europe where members of the Network are engaged in anti-trafficking work. Those members of RENATE and others – listed in the acknowledgements – undertook the Mapping Exercise using a variety of methods, from personal visits and interviews to document sifting and reading of reports. The result is this document, by no means conclusive, which will seek to inform members in the ongoing work of anti-trafficking and exploitation and enable RENATE to plan into the future. In his New Year message of peace to the world, 1 January 2015, Pope Francis spoke of the necessity of freeing those enslaved by human trafficking and exploitation. His slogan ‘No Longer Slaves but Brothers and Sisters’ was a call to the world and a reminder of each one’s responsibility to the other, particularly the poorest and weakest members of society. He added:

“This immense task (freeing the slaves), which calls for courage, patience and perseverance, deserves the appreciation of the whole Church and society. Yet, of itself, it is not sufficient to end the scourge of the exploitation of human persons. There is also need for a threefold commitment on the institutional level:

- *for prevention,*
- *for victim protection and*
- *for the prosecution of perpetrators.*

Moreover, since criminal organisations employ global networks to achieve their goals, efforts to eliminate this phenomenon also demands a common and, indeed, a global effort on the part of various sectors of society.”⁴²

RENATE members are aware that the ‘trade’ in human beings has become a global criminal activity, making huge profits for the exploiters across countries and continents. Combating this global criminality can only be done through collaborative effort. No faith group, no government, no NGO, no institution or organisation can work on its own to put an end to exploitation and sale of human lives. RENATE believes that working collaboratively, combining its efforts with other networks and groups, taking inspiration from the leadership of Pope Francis, it is possible to put an end to this slavery.

The ‘call of the Gospel’ to set free the downtrodden; announce the ‘Good News’ to the poor; bring release to the captive; create the circumstances where each person enjoys ‘life in all its fullness’ – as promised by Jesus in the words of John 10:10 – is at the heart of religious life. Indeed, this call is both vision and mission, the *raison d’être*, of Religious Congregations. At present, RENATE membership comprises many Religious Congregations across 24 European countries, with an outreach to thousands more working in the fields of protection and prevention, caring for victims, education awareness, advocacy and campaigning.⁴³

In undertaking this Mapping Exercise, RENATE is presented with many challenges. The findings of this piece of work across the European network, however limited as it is, will serve to strengthen the RENATE network between and within countries as it seeks to share information, assist victims, promote education awareness and best practice, advocate and campaign effectively so as to combat human trafficking and exploitation in the 21st century. Thereby fulfilling its vision to ‘liberate the captives, set free those who are bound in slavery and bring the good news of God-given freedom’ to all.⁴⁴

Patricia Mulhall, CSB

41) Adapted from RENATE Web www.renate-europe.net

42) Pope Francis, New Year Message 1 January, 2015

43) www.renate-europe.net

44) Adaptation of Gospel of Luke 4:16-21

ALBANIA

US TIP Report Rating: Tier 2

“Albania is a source and destination country for men, women, and children subjected to sex trafficking and forced labour. Albanian women and children are primarily subjected to sex trafficking within Albania, in neighbouring countries (Kosovo, Macedonia, Montenegro, and Greece), and in other European countries. Albanian and some foreign victims are subjected to forced labour in Albania, particularly in the tourism industry. An increasing number of Albanian children, often of Romani or Balkan Egyptian ethnicity, are subjected to forced begging and other forms of compelled labor in Albania and neighbouring countries (Greece, Kosovo, Macedonia, and Montenegro). Some Albanian girls are subjected to sex trafficking or forced labour following arranged marriages. Some foreign women from European countries, including Ukraine, Russia, the United Kingdom, and Norway, are subjected to sex trafficking in Albania. An increasing number of Middle Eastern and African irregular migrants, particularly Syrians, transit Albania to reach Western Europe and are vulnerable to trafficking, though police have yet to identify any as trafficking victims. Corruption and high rates of turnover within the police force inhibit law enforcement action to address trafficking. Official complicity in trafficking crimes remains a significant concern. A sitting member of Parliament had prior convictions for trafficking-related crimes.



The Government of Albania does not fully comply with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking; however, it is making significant efforts to do so. The Government significantly improved law enforcement efforts by prosecuting and convicting more traffickers than in 2013, including some traffickers who forced children to beg. The Government and NGOs identified more victims, and the Government increased funding to the state-run shelter for trafficking victims. Nevertheless, psychological, medical, and reintegration services at the state-run shelter were inadequate. Government funding to NGO shelters was insufficient, and the only shelter providing specialized services for child trafficking victims closed for several months due to a lack of funds; however, in March 2015, the Government allocated funding for staff salaries at two NGO shelters. The Government continued to investigate and punish victims for unlawful acts committed as a result of their exploitation.”⁴⁵

Albania, with a population of 2.27 million, is one of the poorest countries in Europe. Because of its recent history and the fall of Communism in 1990, currently Albania struggles with many social, economic and political problems. With a GDP of 12.9 billion USD in 2014, (estimated to rise to 14.52 in 2015) Albania represents 0.02% of the world economy. Since the 1990s Albania has achieved a yearly growth of 5-6% despite international difficult times economically. This steady growth is the reason the UN granted Albania an above-average human development index of 0.749 in 2013. However, this economic growth did not benefit everyone and there are significant discrepancies between rural and urban areas. Albania was the last central and eastern European country to adopt free-market reforms. Even though the country’s economy has improved during the last few years, Albania still remains one of the poorest countries in Europe. In 2014, one in seven inhabitant still lives below the poverty threshold and nearly 50% of the GDP is made up by the informal economy, a fact which has hindered the current economic reform programme.⁴⁶

45) Trafficking in Persons Report, US Department of State - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243558.pdf> Accessed 8 August 2015.

46) The Federation of International Trade Associations, January 2015 http://fita.org/countries/albania.html?ma_rubrique=economic_and_political_outline

Victims' Profiles and Recruitment Methods

Albania is regarded as a source country for labour and sex trafficking into Western Europe, with substantial numbers of Albanian victims found in Germany, Switzerland and the UK. Its geographical location and porous borders make it a transit country also and recently it has been classified as a destination country. It comes under pressure from trafficking networks from multiple regions, including North Africa and Afghanistan. Albanian women and child victims are primarily subjected to sex trafficking within Albania as well as in Greece, Italy, Macedonia, Kosovo, Belgium, Netherlands, Germany, Switzerland, Ireland, and the UK. Criminal groups recruit women fraudulently with offers of 'employment' in waitressing, bartending, dancing, or singing in neighbouring countries, specifically in Kosovo, Greece, and Macedonia. The 'employment' often turns into sex trafficking. Forced labour can be internal as well as external as victims from the Philippines are subjected to forced labour in Albania. There is an increasing problem of Albanian children, often from Roma ethnicity, who are subjected to begging or other forms of forced labour in Greece, Kosovo, as well as within Albania. Some Albanian girls are subjected to sex trafficking or forced labour through arranged marriages.⁴⁷

Internal trafficking is recognised as an offence and is being detected particularly among children. The number of male victims identified is rising. Corruption within the country has made building a resilient infrastructure against trafficking problematic. Promised funds to NGOs for 'shelters' (safe accommodation) for victims along with funds for other key strategic interventions frequently do not arrive where they are most needed and can be put to good use. Mental health provision for those in the shelters is inadequate according to the TIP report, 2014.

Identification and Protection of Child Victims

Children comprise 45% of those reported as victims of trafficking. Yet, currently, there is no national children's shelter or provision for the protection or identification of trafficked children. All of which poses a massive challenge to the country. Combined with these challenges is an internal racism of the 'Roma' and migrant Egyptian population in the country. Other factors include long-term gender inequalities making women particularly at risk to traffickers, along with gender-based violence against women, especially in the rural communities.

Legislation and Policies

As stated in the TIP Report, the Albanian Government does not comply fully with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking at present. However, it is making significant efforts in this matter. In October 2013, the Government appointed a national anti-trafficking coordinator, who in December, 2013 initiated the development of a special taskforce to improve coordination with police, prosecutors, and judges. Albanian law enforcement improved its understanding of a victim-centred approach to human trafficking, though further training is still needed to improve the operating effectiveness in identifying cases and leading through with prosecution. The Government increased the number of victims identified, but prosecuted and convicted just a small few. However, NGO shelters that provide services to victims of trafficking say that they receive no funds. They doubt that victims receive adequate mental health services at the state-run shelter, and reports indicate that often times medical care staff require training in dealing with victims.

National Referral Mechanism

The National Referral Mechanism (NRM) is a collaborative mechanism through which government and civil society organisations coordinate the identification, protection, referral, and rehabilitation of trafficking victims. In April 2012, the Government amended the NRM to increase cooperation between government agencies and civil society in identifying, assisting, and reintegrating trafficking victims. However, the new NRM did not first meet until March 2013, and some ministries did not send representatives. It remains to be seen if these new changes are indeed increasing cooperation.⁴⁸

47) Country report on Albania, Trafficking in Persons Report, U.S. Department of State, 2014.

48) U.S. Embassy - Tirana. Reporting, January 29, 2013

Albania has compliant legislation in line with the United Nations Trafficking Protocol – with a dedicated NRM in place, drawing in the co-operation of 13 agencies established in 2005.⁴⁹ National anti-trafficking strategies and action plans are renewed every three years. The National Anti-trafficking Strategy with its Action Plan focuses on four main areas:

- (i) Protection (ii) Persecution (iii) Prevention (iv) Coordination

The Standard Operating Procedures for the Identification and Referral of Victims and Potential Victims which came into place in June 2011 sets the operating standards for state-wide intervention and enforcement practices. The main agencies accountable to the NRM received training from the Government on their implementation, with precise instructions for identification and protection of victims. Albanian law has provision to criminalise pimping and the ownership of brothels. However, implementation of the law presents an enormous challenge for the authorities and has so far not seen a galvanised political will behind it.

Key data

- Albania has recently been recognised as a destination country but it is not yet possible to monitor accurately the nationality of the victims. However, the profile of trafficked victims who received care in the country has remained unchanged over the past years, being either migrant Philippine or Albanian nationals.
- Albanian victims are marginally more likely to come from rural areas but data from the NGO, 'Different & Equal'⁵⁰ (D&E) annual reports show that this ratio is slowly levelling out to include urban areas as contenders for vulnerability.
- Traditionally, girls can be forced by their families into arranged marriages at very young ages, even as young as 12 years, which means being easily coerced into sex work or labour by their husbands. Many girls experience sustained gender discrimination and endure physical and psychological abuse in their homes. Many find difficulty accessing equal job opportunities, due to ongoing societal, familial and cultural pressures
- Traffickers exploit these situations by promising a better life. Marriage or work proposals are the most common ways of recruiting girls. There are a few cases reported of kidnapping, especially at a young age.
- Social media is being extensively used by traffickers to entice and recruit women, especially young girls.
- Provision for boys must be put in place as a surprisingly large proportion of victims are males; D&E has admitted males into its reintegration programme since 2012 and an average of 16% of all beneficiaries are male.
- In 2013, the proportion of adult to child victims offered post-trafficking assistance was 55% adult, 45% children. There is no national shelter available for trafficked children.

Although Albania does have state-run shelters for victims, there are concerns about the standard of care provided in these shelters according to the TIP report, 2015:

“The only shelter providing specialized services for child trafficking victims, run by an NGO, closed for several months due to lack of funds, though the government gave 1 million lek (\$10,000) in January 2015 to enable the shelter to reopen for three months.

49) Ministry of the Internal Affairs; Ministry of Education; Ministry of Social Welfare and Youth; Ministry of Foreign Affairs; Ministry of Health; Prosecution Office; International Organization for Migration; NGO Different & Equal; Psychosocial Center Vatra; Another Vision; National Reception Center for Victims of Trafficking; World Vision; ARSIS (social organisation for support of Youth)

50) 'Different & Equal' [D&E], an Albanian non-for-profit organisation established in May 2004, provides reintegration services for Albanian Victims of Trafficking. D&E is a partner agency with RENATE.

In March 2015, the government appropriated funds to pay for several staff member salaries at two NGO shelters. Observers noted the state-run shelter needed renovation and its staff provided inadequate psychological, medical, and reintegration services.⁵¹

Church and NGO Response

The Catholic Church provides a vital support network that is crucial to anti human trafficking efforts in Albania as churches enjoy a uniquely intimate connection with Albanian citizens. Religious Congregations are concerned mainly with the referral of potential victims of trafficking to appropriate organisations. Women Religious are in a unique position to recognise the signs of abuse among youth with whom they are in constant contact. They also hear concerns raised by members of the parish regarding the well-being and safety of parishioners. It would appear that where there are strong ties with the local community within a congregation this is helpful to anti-trafficking organisations, particularly when providing rent-free rooms or offers of other assistance to victims. The NGO Mary Ward Loreto (MWL) gains access to rent-free rooms from congregations in some areas of Albania – namely Kalmet. Strong bonds exist between anti human trafficking groups and the ‘Mother Teresa’ congregation of sisters. This relationship is maintained by mutual trust and respect and manifests itself in many forms supporting women in need.

The Conference of Religious plus the Bishops’ Conference – a combined group in Albania – support the work of anti-trafficking. Recently this conference invited the network of Religious URAT⁵² to address the issue of human trafficking at their annual conference. An employee of Mary Ward Loreto (MWL), a Good Shepherd sister, addressed the conference on behalf of URAT. The Religious Congregations befriend the Filipino community in Tirana where, for example, girls and a few men have been rescued from either labour exploitation or trafficking situations. A number of these girls were accepted into the shelter run by D&E. Some are accompanied by social workers from the agency. During 2012, two Filipino men were assisted by male social workers in a secret housing complex. They were successfully reintegrated back to their country after a short time.

Sister Imelda Poole, IBVM, President of RENATE, has been responsible for extensive outreach to young people from Albania and also to Catholic networks in Europe. Recently, she recommended delegates for the Youth Anti-trafficking Vatican Conference, November 2014, at which they presented papers. Included in this group were Olivia Conroy, a young student from Oxford University, UK and author of this report, and Irena Kraja, social psychologist with MWL and key worker at D&E agency.

RENATE and Partners

RENATE has a particularly strong presence in Albania as the Network’s main office is based in the capital, Tirana. Seven members of RENATE live in the country. They provide training, experience, compassion and advocacy in their anti-trafficking work in Albania. Partnerships with NGOs, working in neighbouring countries, are formed to enable RENATE to expand its outreach. In order to combat the organised criminal gangs working together across porous borders, NGOs must outclass this dexterity if they are to tackle trafficking effectively. RENATE’s Network links together 19 European countries in order to work effectively against trafficking in persons.⁵³

51) Trafficking in Persons Report, US Department of State - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243558.pdf> page 66. Accessed Sept 2015.

52) URAT – United Religious Against Trafficking in Albania.

53) RENATE web for countries: www.renate-europe.net

Caritas Albania ⁵⁴ supports anti-trafficking efforts by focusing on preventative measures. Its activities include:

- raising awareness among the general public;
- organising workshops for families;
- working with the 'Roma' communities;
- organising summer camps for Albanian children.

Empowerment of vulnerable groups in Albania is one of the main goals of Caritas Albania. It supports efforts to empower women through income-generating projects. Its outreach into 'Roma' communities, through meetings with community leaders, has a particular focus on promoting school attendance for 'Roma' children. It also develops actions and attitudes to prohibit child labour. It is a lobbying voice against exploitation and trafficking in Albania.

Mary Ward Loreto (MWL) - an NGO working in anti-trafficking. Its primary focus is on devising and implementing preventative measures through direct action. Some of this work is done through personal contact and online counselling for victims who are cared for in a number of 'shelters' (safe houses) in the UK. It is funded by various private funding bodies. One of its aims is to help reduce poverty in the more vulnerable communities of Albania, thereby reducing the risk of 'exposure' to traffickers, which is often due to poverty-related and socio-economic conditions. The work includes empowering women through income-generating projects. Furthermore, awareness-raising is undertaken in anti-trafficking in 40 regions of Albania with a newly developed youth project targeting those most susceptible to being trafficked. MWL also supports prisoners with spiritual guidance, some of whom are victims of trafficking or may be highly vulnerable to traffickers.

Different & Equal (D&E) - is a non-governmental-organisation partly funded by Mary Ward Loreto. It provides an education centre dedicated to rescued trafficked victims, with ongoing care for men, women and girls of all ages. It promotes empowerment and independence by increasing the skills of young people so as to help them gain access to employment. With three stages of care over a period of five years, D&E is regarded as a leader in the process of victim rehabilitation in Albania.⁵⁵

'Little Angels' co-founded by NGO (SHKEJ),⁵⁶ Education for Life and Sister Imelda Poole, IBVM. It is funded (MWL). The centre is open to children from disadvantaged backgrounds from ages 6-14 years old. From age 14, children can join the MWL youth group (Youth Education for Prosperity (YEP) project, an initiative of MWL, supporting the integration of youth in social life.) The centre provides a safe environment for children for daytime and help with homework after school. The children also benefit from counselling sessions designed to promote their social and economic well-being.

Most of the children attending are of 'Roma/Egyptian' extraction. They live in poor conditions, often in makeshift camps without water or electricity. They lack access to medical care and often experience prejudice in society and school. Thus, the centre provides a safe haven for them as it strives to equip them with the social skills that will enable them to integrate into wider Albanian society. As the goal of Little Angels seeks to enable children to attend school, an intended consequence is keeping them off the streets while providing them with a safe environment.

54) www.caritasalbania.org

55) Web address: www.differentandequal.org

56) www.shkej.org founded 2003. An Albanian non profit association, promoting the human rights and the social integration of human beings in the spirit of the International Conventions and National Legislation. Overall objective is to address poverty and social exclusion by building effective models to support families in need, especially those of the Roma and Egyptian community in Tirana

In this way, they can feel valued and it lessens their exposure to exploitation. Should further funding be found to continue and expand the work of Little Angels, it would be of enormous benefit as it receives no State funding, but relies on charitable donations. Mr Erion Prendi, manager of the centre, says, “‘Little Angels’ is a safe haven where the well-being of the children can be supported.” The UN Annual Progress Report 2014 estimates that 30% of children in Albania are anaemic. By comparison, according to epidemiological data collected by the World Health Organisation, the prevalence of anaemia among children living in the United States and Europe is between 7 and 12%.⁵⁷

By supporting children with meals and clothing, the centre hopes to reduce the need for parents to send children onto the streets to beg. ‘Roma/Egyptian’ children are extremely vulnerable to domestic or internal trafficking. Families are often not aware that their child is being exploited by someone they know in the community. The traffickers force the children to beg or ‘work’ on the streets, only giving a small percentage of the money they make for their families. Most ‘Roma/Egyptian’ children work in the informal sector, by collecting rubbish from the city and selling it to recycling companies. Without the support from Little Angels, these children are ‘prey’ to traffickers.

Children – Safe Housing – Child Trafficking: When interviewed by RENATE, social workers shared how arduous it is to find businesses willing to employ ‘Roma/Egyptian’ young people due to widespread prejudices against their communities. As is common in other European countries, Albania has an inadequate infrastructure to deal with child victims of trafficking. There is one 24-hour service to help children who are victims of abuse. However, there is no ‘shelter’ provision specifically for child victims of trafficking.

As is also the case in many other European countries, the State has no provision for child victims once they are brought to the attention of the police. Consequently, the odds are that this can lead to the child being forced back into abusive relationships or exploitative work. Recently, the Government in Albania drafted an Anti-trafficking Response Operational Framework for 2014-2016, which clearly states procedures and correct implementation methods to help trafficked children.⁵⁸ Mr Erion Prendi, Manager of Little Angels, welcomed these guidelines, commenting that they are well done and set in a good time frame. However, he has concerns that there is neither the infrastructure nor the funding in place to apply them in any meaningful way at present.

The Peace Corps has a special unit in Albania, associated with the project URAT, managed by MWL, and it contributes to many aspects of ‘Albania Hope’.⁵⁹ It has a strong presence and is involved in a number of anti-trafficking initiatives, most notably providing materials and coordination capability to groups receiving awareness training. In collaboration with the NGO, D&E the Peace Corps supports awareness-raising work covering every region of Albania. It is effective in its work against human trafficking, and a welcome presence among the anti-trafficking networks and partners in the country.

RENATE – Best Practice and Training – with Partners outside the Country

Albania’s history, with its unique brand of ‘home-grown communism,’ has left a residue of resistance to any form of volunteering. Such residue discourages participation in voluntary groups, simply because during the communist regime, citizens were forced to ‘volunteer’ for the State. This has left a legacy resulting in negative connotations for the term ‘volunteering.’ Consequently, there are no indigenous anti-human trafficking volunteer groups currently. However, RENATE is seeking to change this cultural bias as it is in an advantageous position to be able to assist so as to change the ‘culture’ of volunteering, to share best practice and to offer training showing the positive effects of volunteer groups, using the experience of other European countries as a model.

57) UN Annual Progress Report, 2014

58) Albania - Anti-trafficking Response Operational Framework for 2014-2016

59) Web address: www.albaniahope.com A mission against trafficking in human persons.

Training and sharing best practice might begin through the Network. Collaboration and capacity building might begin with offering pan-European membership of RENATE or NGOs affiliated to the Network to include 'sister' houses and Religious Congregations. Examples of such good practice can be seen in support for victims who have survived some of the worst excesses of human trafficking through collaboration with NGOs abroad, including Medaille Trust in the UK.⁶⁰

Support for victims

Opportunities have opened up across the collaborative network of RENATE with MWL that are effective and exciting. Building on its strong ties with the Medaille Trust in the UK, this collaborative partnership, formally agreed in May 2014, has proved fruitful for both charities.

Benefits include:

- *sharing training materials;*
- *exchange visits between Albania and the UK ;*
- *the direct involvement of psychologists from MWL with Albanian beneficiaries in the UK;*
- *online counselling sessions via Skype.*

Forging this partnership is not only crucial for Albanian victims of trafficking into the UK with little or no English language skills, but it is essential for the Medaille Trust, which provides 'shelter' for a large percentage of trafficked victims from Albania.

Prevention

Recently, connections between MWL and Macedonia have been strengthened due to MWL's response to a call for assistance from sisters in Macedonia regarding a so-called 'matchmaking' service offered by Macedonian men to Albanian women. Albanian women, who struggle to find a husband, are often left in a desperate situation where they feel they are a burden to their families by staying in the family home. As it is unusual for a woman to live on her own in Albania, there are cases where women buy the services of a 'matchmaker' to find a husband. These women can find themselves in dangerous situations as the 'matchmaker' can easily morph into a trafficker who sells the women to men in neighbouring countries.

The Executive Director of D&E explained that the most hopeful stage of intervention is through preventative measures and the development of human rights. She also noted that the identification and protection of victims is an extremely important aspect of anti human trafficking work. Current attitudes and discrimination against women in Albanian society need to change if women are to become valued and reduce their vulnerability to trafficking. As Albania is well known to be a country of origin, preventative measures to reduce the vulnerability of certain groups through empowerment cannot be understated, particularly among young girls who are often deprived of all freedom by society and families. RENATE Network plays a role in this prevention work.

Effectiveness of Efforts

One of the main aspects of the National Action Plan focuses on the monitoring of the relevant anti human trafficking organisations. NGOs are visited by social services every six months, where they are evaluated on the effectiveness of their work. Some NGOs, such as D&E, choose to create alternative reports for different aspects of their work. D&E release clear, informative annual progress reports. State institutions have their own systems in place for annual reports which are not assessed independently. Social workers at D&E suggested that all organisations should be independently assessed to maximise improvements, a practice which does not happen very often.

60) Medaille Trust - a charity founded by Catholic Religious Congregations to work for the eradication of human trafficking and to offer support to those who have been trafficked. www.medaille.co.uk

Partnership

The most relevant, most promising persons, networks and partners to work with into the future:

1) Media

Imelda Poole, President of RENATE and MWL, spoke of the media as an important future ally with which RENATE can expand its networks. She holds that the effectiveness of the media, particularly social media, in combating the crime of trafficking is paramount.

As she sees it, the media has the unique opportunity to:

- change attitudes of entire populations ;
- reduce the demand for prostitution and instil a nationwide 'watch for signs' on trafficking.

Through this tool, traffickers can be isolated and discouraged from operating so 'openly and boldly' on the streets. Social media, particularly among younger generations, is a powerful tool with which to share messages; build systems of advocacy and campaigning; and raise awareness of the dangers of trafficking and the pernicious practice of slavery through its criminal gangs. This push for a social media network requires much stronger promotion. Open source research was carried out regarding the use of social media by traffickers – the results were both enlightening and devastating for anyone working in anti-trafficking. Traffickers use the Internet extensively as a route through to vulnerable people. This is how they ply their trade. NGOs have access to the same tools! Therefore they need to deploy them efficiently to combat the recruiting and grooming employed by traffickers. Social media can be used to promote awareness, to provide an easily accessible channel to be used in the fight against trafficking. Research on best practice in deploying social media as an awareness-raising and prevention tool is currently underway as part of an EU-wide initiative sponsored by the Director General's office.

2) 'Task Force' network (13 agencies working together)

This group attends meetings periodically to discuss the implementation of these guidelines which act as an official mandate on the mechanisms to identify correctly victims and ways in which to refer them to the appropriate organisations. The Deputy Minister of the Interior's expressed opinion is that the National Referral Mechanisms are not functioning well, and efforts are needed to revitalise them. Albania's National Coordination Office, based in the Ministry of Internal Affairs, aims to identify synergies between projects run by different anti human trafficking NGOs, and link the organisations together for helpful collaboration.

3) Cross-Border collaboration

The National Coordination Office, which monitors all anti human trafficking activities, recently signed memorandums with neighbouring countries to promote anti human trafficking ties and strengthen Albania's internal network. Mrs Elona Gjebrea, head of the Anti Human Trafficking unit in Albania, explained that implementation of these memorandums can be challenging, and great diplomacy is required, particularly where there are long and sometimes antagonistic histories. Nevertheless, such collaboration needs to be improved in Albania.

4) Mary Ward Loreto (MWL)

Examples of best practice include the MWL projects in the rural regions of Albania addressing some of the causes of human trafficking such as poverty, unemployment and gender inequalities. One of these projects, named Mary Ward Women (MWW), is a women's project covering eight regions of Albania. The project manager, Mrs Ana Stakaj, supports seven staff from five Mary Ward centres in Albania. In the North of the country, in Hot I Ri district, MWW works with four groups of Albanian women, facilitated by social workers trained by MWW. The work consists in establishing social income generating businesses:

- Small hand-embroidered cards, employing six women, with outlets in Tirana and England.
- Supplying an international medicinal company with their cultivation of sage for the pharmaceutical market.
- Young women and girls aged 13-20 making hand-woven bracelets.

Mrs Irena Kraja, the key psychologist social worker and coordinator of MWW in Northern Albania, sees the younger group as particularly successful, bringing their bracelets to sell at a local tourist venue – one of the many churches in the area. This work is hard, and requires endurance; especially when rural Albanian communities have not been highly motivated in the past to bring about change, believing they are powerless to do so.

In the South similar income-generating businesses include:

- Growing of fresh flowers for the Albanian market;
- Alfalfa preparation;
- Card-making, jewellery and pyrography.

The added-value of the social business groups not only provides women with some income, but also aims to enable them to be self-confident and independent. Through their work, they are taught key business skills and the collaborative aptitudes of participating in teams. As is the 'cultural norm', many young girls are not allowed to leave their home environment or socialise readily, MWW provides a safe place where they can make friends as they learn valuable skills. By increasing the confidence of women in rural Albania, MWW hopes to reduce the vulnerability of young women and girls as 'prey' to traffickers by providing them with an independent source of income and making them business savvy. However, this project work is currently on a micro scale, with just over 80 involved. It could be expanded with further funding. Inevitably, there are challenges which these projects face daily. Mrs Irena Kraja, the described that one of the biggest obstacles she faces is the attitudes of older women towards the work of running businesses. It is arduous to change these attitudes, built up over a lifetime in a very restrictive environment.

These groups have the final aim of providing the women with the hope for independent economic stability through taking initiative, and, for the younger women, to pursue careers in their desired fields. Plans for the future involve expanding the space available to the women, as well as opening up a bakery and planting crops of a higher value. Through this work, MWW is tackling unemployment and gender inequalities in rural areas while reducing poverty and the susceptibility of young women to traffickers.

5) MWL awareness training (URAT)

Alongside training to develop and market products, MWW works at:

- Training in health care, parenting skills.
- General accounting and business development.
- Promoting awareness of human trafficking amongst children in schools – for example, teaching young boys that trafficking of humans is unacceptable and in an attempt to reduce the demand for trafficked women, girls are taught the dangers of being lured into 'jobs' that may be in sexual services.
- Early marriage and its impacts, particularly regarding the susceptibility to being trafficked by boy-friends or husbands.

Through the Anti Human Trafficking network URAT,⁶¹ In partnership together, MWL and the Peace Corps, D&E produced an effective photonovello on the work currently being undertaken. EUF, a Roma NGO vital to the outreach into Roma communities, is also incorporated in this work. Sister Mirjam Beike, Good Shepherd sister, employed by MWL and an active member of RENATE, represents both MWL and RENATE on the EU Civil Society Platform Against Trafficking. Sister Mirjam is the coordinator of the MWL project for awareness raising against trafficking. In the short space of six months, the team visited 24 out of 40 regions, and reached 587 people through their outreach programme – quite a success rate in a country of 2.27 million people. Sister Mirjam works across communities to change attitudes and enhance life opportunities so that the source for trafficked girls, women and men is reduced.

⁶¹ A network of Religious and partners work on training and awareness raising, managed by Mary Ward Loreto.

The work also seeks to reduce the stigma towards returned victims of trafficking, who can experience severe exclusion from their communities. Prior to the current phase of awareness talks, most communities appear to have little information on the dangers of human trafficking in Albania. One of the key messages of these talks is to unpack the different types of trafficking – begging, labour trafficking, sexual exploitation. She is clear that males are often victims too, and is eager for her audiences to be thoroughly informed. These awareness trainings target ‘Roma’ communities, Albanian secondary schools and universities.

6) *The ‘Roma’ Community*

Special attention needs to be given to this community as there is much inspirational work undertaken. This work is done through talks and information cards distributed to the community, including helpline phone numbers. Across the age groups the importance of strong family guidance for youth is stressed. Many ‘Roma’ live in conditions of poverty and destitution, a legacy of the Communist era when ‘Roma’ people were ‘herded’ into residential ghettos. A ‘Roma’ volunteer working with URAT expressed to RENATE how she managed to complete her education against all the odds – abject poverty and ‘exclusion’ from mainstream life – among others. She stressed the importance of education as key towards the progress of the ‘Roma’ people. RENATE members in Albania are involved in lobbying the Government to attend particularly to the human rights contraventions which cluster around human trafficking. One of the aims of the ‘Task Force’ is to advocate on behalf of the Roma community and seek action from Government on their behalf.

Recommendations of TIP Report 2015

- Increase funding to NGO-run shelters for trafficking victims and provide funding on a regular basis.
- Provide victims free medical and mental health care per the 2014 law and ministerial decision.
- Improve services provided at the state-run shelter.
- Do not punish victims for unlawful acts committed as a direct result of being subjected to trafficking.
- Continue to investigate, prosecute, and convict traffickers, including complicit officials.
- Fund mobile units operated by civil society groups and law enforcement to identify victims.
- Further train police, labour inspectors, and other frontline officials on proactive identification of victims.
- Encourage victims to assist in the prosecution of their traffickers by facilitating participation in the witness protection program and expanding training for prosecutors dealing with victim witnesses.
- Improve the capacity of border and migration police to screen irregular migrants for trafficking indicators.
- Continue efforts to screen street children for signs of trafficking.⁶²

Children in Albania are engaged in the worst forms of child labour, particularly in forced begging. Adults exploit children, some reportedly as young as ages 4 and 5, forcing them to beg and requiring them to be on the streets and go door-to-door. Reportedly, children in Albania who beg may work long hours, often late into the night. In addition, these children may be physically beaten and are at risk of sexual exploitation. The Government has identified street work as the worst form of child labour. Children work on the streets, including as drug runners. Although evidence is limited, there are reports that children in Albania work in the textile, garment, and footwear sectors. Some are reportedly employed directly in factories, in which they are exposed to heavy machinery and chemicals; however, the majority work long hours in home-based operations.⁶³ A recommendation for RENATE may take the form of prevention work with a special focus on children.

⁶² US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243558.pdf> Accessed August 8th 2015.

⁶³ US states department of labour’s bureau of international labour affair – Albania. Data from 2011, published by UNESCO Institute for Statistics, 2013.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS - In appreciation of:

Author: Ms Olivia Conroy, undergraduate biochemistry student at Oxford University, UK

CONTRIBUTORS:

Sr. Imelda Poole, IBVM, President of Mary Ward Loreto - Albania
Mrs. Elona Gjebrea, (Minster of the Interior, Albania),
Mr. Erion Prendi (Manager of Little Angels Roma Project ,SHKEJ),
Mrs. Ana Stakaj, (Manager of MWL Women Project)
Mrs. Mariana Meshi (Director of Different and Equal)
Mrs. Aferdita Gjoni – (Social psychologist MWL)
Ms Irena Kraja – (Assistant Manager MWL Women’s Project)

BULGARIA

US TIP Report: Tier 2 Watch List

“Bulgaria is a source and, to a lesser extent, a transit and destination country for men, women, and children subjected to sex trafficking and forced labour. Bulgaria remains one of the primary source countries of human trafficking in the EU. Bulgarian women and children are subjected to sex trafficking within the country, as well as in Europe, Russia, the Middle East, and the United States. Several NGOs assert internal trafficking is increasing. Bulgarian men, women, and children are subjected to forced labour in Belgium, Cyprus, the Czech Republic, Germany, Greece, Israel, Italy, Lithuania, the Netherlands, Norway, Spain, Sweden, the UK, and Zambia, predominantly in agriculture, construction, and the service sector. Bulgarian children and adults with disabilities are forced into street begging and petty theft within Bulgaria and also in Austria, Greece, Italy, Sweden, and the UK. Romanian girls are subjected to sex trafficking in Bulgaria. Government corruption creates an environment enabling some trafficking crimes.



The Government of Bulgaria does not fully comply with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking; however, it is making significant efforts to do so. Despite these measures, the Government did not demonstrate overall increasing anti-trafficking efforts compared to the previous reporting period; therefore, Bulgaria is placed on Tier 2 Watch List. During the reporting period, governmental anti-trafficking efforts in prosecution, protection, prevention, and coordination all declined. Bulgaria remained one of the largest source countries of trafficking victims in the EU, yet the Government did not fund specialized trafficking victim services. Two state-owned trafficking shelters for women ceased to operate. While a municipality opened one apartment for post-shelter accommodation in November 2014, the country’s overall capacity to shelter and provide services was minimal relative to the number of victims identified. Specialized services for child and adult male victims of trafficking were non-existent. National coordination was marked by inactivity due to the absence of a key leader, staff turnover, structural changes, and overall political instability. Authorities prosecuted and convicted considerably fewer traffickers and issued suspended sentences for the majority of those convicted. Law enforcement action against public officials and police officers complicit in trafficking offences increased significantly.”⁶⁴

Geography

Bulgaria is located in Eastern Europe, bordering many countries North, South and West, with additional access through the Black Sea (see map).⁶⁵ It is a Member State of the European Union since 2007. Due to its EU membership, Bulgarian citizens can travel freely within EU countries where no visas are requested. This facilitates the process of free movement and, correspondingly, also facilitates trafficking in human beings. Prostitution in Bulgaria is not regulated. There are many examples of arbitrariness against persons in prostitution. There are many cases of internal trafficking that remain hidden. A possible reason for this is police arbitrariness – persons in prostitution are often treated as criminals.

64) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243558.pdf> Accessed 8 August 2015.

65) <http://www.lonelyplanet.com/maps/europe/bulgaria>

Internal trafficking is mainly for sexual purposes and is directed from small cities or villages (with high levels of unemployment and poverty) to big cities, border cities and especially to summer/winter resorts on the Black Sea. In relation to trans-border trafficking, Bulgaria is mainly a country of origin. Trans-border trafficking is for both sexual and labour exploitation. Trafficking of Bulgarian women for sexual exploitation is in the main to Austria, Belgium, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Italy, Macedonia, the Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Slovakia, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, Turkey and the UK – in short, practically all the countries of Europe.

In 2010 and 2011 the local government of Bordeaux, France alerted that there were a number of young females in prostitution from a small town in Bulgaria, Peshtera, who were possible victims of human trafficking (Caritas France and Caritas Ruse, Bulgaria compiled a report about a number of meetings with representatives from Bulgarian and French government, to no effect).

Victims' Profiles and Recruitment Methods

Most commonly, men become victims of trafficking for labour exploitation. The main countries of destination are Belgium, Cyprus, the Czech Republic, Germany, Greece, Israel, the Netherlands, Norway, Spain, Sweden and the UK. Men are prone to be exploited in the agricultural and construction sectors. Women trafficked for labour exploitation are also found in the agricultural sector, but more especially in domestic work. There are cases where pregnant women are trafficked for the sale of their babies. Greece is the most common destination for this kind of trafficking.

In addition, children become victims of trafficking for labour exploitation, either begging or pickpocketing on the streets or transport networks in Greece, Italy, Sweden and the UK. The 'Roma' community is one of the vulnerable groups for trafficking due to their marginalisation and discrimination. Another group includes Bulgarian women and girls who have mental disabilities or learning difficulties and who become victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation in the brothels of the Netherlands, where prostitution is legal.

The most common way to recruit women and girl victims of trafficking is through the 'loverboy' method. There are also false promises for work abroad (as waitresses, dancers, hairdressers) that lure both sexes, and coercion is another recruitment method. In addition, a growing number of young girls leaving foster care enter into a relationship with a trafficker without being aware of what they may be asked to do. As the relationship develops, the trafficker talks them into prostitution so as to make money from them, collects their money and forces them to prostitute even more, with the purpose of making greater profits.

Children are the most vulnerable in internal trafficking. The rights of child victims are violated frequently, due to the old legislation that still operates. Since 1958 there has been a special law in Bulgaria – the Law for Combating Delinquency and Bad Behaviour of Minors. According to this Law, prostitute children, children who pickpocket, street children, or children who escape from their homes are treated as offenders. The Law covers children aged 14 to 16 and 16 to 18 (there are different educational measures for both groups). The law implements so-called 'educational' measures, 14 of them in total; two are placements in boarding schools. Most of the other 12 measures are not implemented as there are no agencies or structures to implement them.

Although there are special shelters for children in Bulgaria, in these shelters child victims could be placed alongside children who have committed crimes. The Court for Human Rights in Strasbourg pronounced these shelters as equal to prisons and obligated the Bulgarian Government to reform them. The annual budget for the Law for Delinquency and Bad Behavior of Minors is 8 million Bulgarian leva. The annual budget for the Law for combating human trafficking – prevention, care for victims and the two shelters – is less than 1 million leva.

National Commission for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings

The government body responsible for combating human trafficking in Bulgaria is the **National Commission for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings (NCCTHB)** – established by virtue of the Combating Trafficking in Human Beings Act – and its belonging Local Commissions (LCCTHB). There is a National Plan for Combating Trafficking and Protection of the Victims of Trafficking. It was elaborated on and adopted by the NCCTHB in January 2013. The plan foresees the establishment of Local Commissions for Combating Trafficking. The NCCTHB has also set up a ‘shelter’ (safe house accommodation) in Sofia for victims of trafficking, supporting and developing the activities of the existing Local Commissions. In addition, it is developing a volunteer network for supporting activities of the NCCTHB(national) and the LCCTHB (local). The National Plan also works to prevent trafficking by raising awareness among society and vulnerable groups (women, children, ethnic minorities, and unemployed people) on the issues related to trafficking in human beings. More information on the National Plan can be found on the website of the NCCTHB ⁶⁶

In July 2013, a comprehensive study by Natasha Dobрева, attorney-at-law, was published, entitled “Promotion of the Rights of Trafficked Persons in Bulgaria: a Human Rights Based Approach”.⁶⁷ Government-funded child centres provided shelter assistance to 79 child victims of trafficking in 2010, a significant increase from the 44 children who were provided with shelter assistance in 2009, established by virtue of the Combating Trafficking in Human Beings Act.

By 2013 NCCTHB had opened nine Local Commissions in nine cities with a high risk of trafficking (Bourgas, Blagoevgrad, Varna, Montana, Pazardjik, Plovdiv, Rouse, Sliven and Veliko Tarnovo). The Local Commission’s staff could be just one person – a secretary. There are no special budgets for the work of the commissions, usually located in small municipality rooms. However, NCCTHB, together with civil society, makes continuous efforts to develop policies against trafficking and for the protection of victims of trafficking (VoT). NCCTHB runs two ‘shelters’ for trafficked persons which are operated by NGOs in the towns of Bourgas and Varna. Currently, the NCCTHB is preparing a database system for trafficked persons as well as a monitoring system for the implementation of anti-trafficking regulations. Both systems are drafted by experts from **Animus Association Foundation (AAF)**, founded by women professionals in the helping professions – psychologists, psychotherapists and social workers. It was established in 1994. In 2001, it acquired the status of a public benefit organisation. The mission of AAF is to promote healthy communication between people on gender issues in Bulgarian society. This is achieved by working to implement the following objectives:

- Developing affordable psychotherapeutic and psychoanalytic services and programmes;
- Offering professional and competent help;
- Creating public attitudes of tolerance towards diversity, respect for the suffering and rejection of violence;
- Promoting the values of dynamic and psychoanalytic psychotherapy and psychoanalysis to promote democratic change in the Bulgarian family and society;
- Developing and implementing projects and programmes to support people who need help;

The main directions of the work are to promote understanding in society, to encourage respect for women, to act as an intermediary between the Government and NGOs, and to coordinate activities on violence against women and children.

⁶⁶) *ibid.*

⁶⁷) http://www.animusassociation.org/?page_id=1316&lang=en

Government and NGO Collaboration

The NCCTHB monitors the implementation of the **National Mechanism for Referral (NRM)** and Support of Trafficked Persons in Bulgaria. The NRM was developed by AAF and La Strada NGO, assisted by a cross-sectoral working group of governmental and non-governmental experts. Its aim is to provide state institutions and NGOs with a framework of action in the identification, assistance and social re-integration of victims of trafficking in human beings. It was adopted by the NCCTHB in 2010. NCCTHB is also active in the training of specialists from different sectors (police, justice, social services, education) for identification of trafficked persons.

This year the project *“Bulgarian-Swiss joint efforts for providing immediate and unconditional protection of trafficked persons and preventing trafficking in human beings”*⁶⁸ was approved by the Swiss organization, fighting trafficking in women and other forms of exploitation and violence against migrant women. FIZ⁶⁹ Within this project are partners from Bulgaria’s AAF⁷⁰ NCCTHB and IOM (International Organisation for Migration). The project will run for three years and foresees a systematic prevention campaign. In addition, within this project evaluation of the impact of information and prevention campaigns will be assessed along with evaluation of the NRM and the effectiveness of its implementation.

Partners are participant parties in the NRM, including: NCCTHB, Ministry of Interior, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Labour and Social Policy, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Education and Science, the State Agency for National Security, State Agency for Child Protection, State Agency for Refugees, Supreme Cassation Public Prosecutor’s Office, IOM, UNHCR, NGOs. All NGOs – service providers to victims of trafficking – are listed in the NRM pp. 17-19.⁷¹

In relation to the victims’ identification, there is close collaboration with Border Police, who after identifying a victim refer the victim to our Crisis Centre in Sofia. However, much more desirable and more effective is to intervene at the beginning, the recruitment stage, before the victim has entered a situation of trafficking.

Evaluation of Current Practices

In AAF’s experience, intervention happens after the victim has left the trafficking situation and then it’s almost too late to rehabilitate her. Currently, trafficking for labour exploitation is becoming an increasing problem in Bulgaria. Efforts are being made, trying to establish contact with the business sector and especially with recruitment agencies in order to:

- Prevent exploitation in labour trafficking;
- Exchange good practices;
- Develop a common strategy for awareness raising among Bulgarian workers against the hazards of labour migration and exploitation;

Training

For the last year, AAF has conducted the following training under the project Promotion of the Rights of Trafficked Persons in Bulgaria, Romania and Slovakia with Emphasis on Legal Support – A Human Rights-Based Approach, implemented with the financial support of the programme Prevention of and Fight against Crime (ISEC) of the European Commission.

68) Factsheet-activities_Romania_Bulgaria_SIB_2011-2018_08.pdf. www.dcaf.ch (DCAF, a centre for security, development and the rule of law)

69) <http://www.fiz-info.ch/en/About-Us> FIZ fights trafficking in women and other forms of exploitation and violence against migrant women.

70) www.animusassociation.org

71) <http://lastradainternational.org/doc-center/2584/bulgarian-national-referral-mechanism-for-support-of-trafficked-persons>

Three areas of training include:

- 6-8 November 2013: training on ‘legal procedures-protection for victims of trafficking.’ Twenty-nine social workers from all over the country took part in this training. There were representatives of the NCCTHB and IOM.
- April 2014: training for social workers from AAF on ‘Work with victims of trafficking and domestic violence: a strength-based approach’.
- 21-23 October 2014: training for lawyers on “Legal procedures-protection of victims of trafficking.” Twenty lawyers from all over the country, interested to defend victims of trafficking, took part in the training. The training was held jointly with the Netherlands Helsinki Committee. The lawyers who have undergone this training will be included in a network of pro-bono defenders of victims of trafficking.

The NCCTHB also organises various trainings for its experts; volunteers; officers; prosecutors; judges; social workers; experts from concerned government institutions and magistrates.

Laws of the Country: enforcement, consequences, results

The Criminal Code (CC) in Bulgaria criminalises trafficking as a separate crime. It was criminalised in 2002 with the adoption of the new Chapter IX ‘Human Trafficking.’ The main provision is Article 159a, paragraph 1, stating that:

“The person who recruits, transports, harbours or receives an individual or groups of persons with the purpose of using them for lechery practices, for forced labour, for removal of organs or for servitude, regardless of their consent, shall be punished with 2 to 8 years imprisonment and BGN 3000 to 12 000 fine.”⁷²

Under this provision, a trafficker can be punished even if she or he did not use the particular means – coercion, force, deceit – which are provided as particular elements of the crime and which carry a greater punishment. Under Article 159a, the trafficker is criminally responsible even in cases where the victim was clearly aware of the activity she or he would be involved in and consented to it, which is often the case with prostitution and also with selling babies or the removal of organs and cells. In this aspect, the crime of trafficking resembles very much the crime of ‘recruitment for prostitution’ set forth in Article 155 of the CC.⁷³

The provisions of the CC aim to protect individuals from inhuman and degrading treatment and suggest that everyone has the freedom to choose their sexual partners. However, the formulation of article 159a of CC deviates from the definition of trafficking in the EU Directive and UN Protocol, which take the use of coercion, deceit or abuse of power as a core element, and not the fact that some victims consent to the forms of exploitation. In addition, the CC does not include slavery, begging and removal of tissues and cells. However, there is a draft law that provides for their inclusion within the trafficking definition.

GRETA (Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings) makes a number of recommendations and invites the Bulgarian government to be more effective in its anti-trafficking work. as well as issuing an invitation.⁷⁴

72) www.legislationline.org/documents/section/criminal-codes... Code of the Republic of *Bulgaria* (2006, amended 2011) (English version).

73) CC, Art. 155 “The person who persuades someone to prostitute or procures towards intercourse, shall be punished ...”. CC; Art. 156 “The person who kidnaps another person with the purpose to use her/him for lechery practices shall be punished ...”

74) GRETA Report on Bulgaria pdf www.coe.int/t/dghl/.../trafficking/.../GRETA_2011_19_FGR_BGR_en.pdf..

GRETA considers that the Bulgarian authorities should take further steps to ensure that the National Action Plan to combat trafficking in human beings is comprehensive, and in particular:

- Pay increased attention to preventive measures among vulnerable groups, such as the Roma community, children and disabled persons;
- Include in the national policy measures to identify the scale of trafficking of foreign nationals and to provide such victims of human trafficking with assistance in accordance with the Convention;
- Ensure that gender mainstreaming is reflected in the national anti-trafficking policy;
- Include in the National Action Plan measures to address trafficking in human beings for the purpose of organ removal;
- Provide for increased measures to assist the reintegration of victims of human trafficking and prevent re-trafficking;
- Allocate the necessary resources to the NCCTHB to enable it to fulfil its mandate;
- Include action against trafficking in human beings as a priority issue in the programmes and projects proposed for financing through EU Structural Funds.

Further, GRETA invites the Bulgarian authorities to introduce an independent evaluation of the annual National Programme as a tool for assessing the impact of the activities and for planning future policies and measures to combat trafficking in human beings.⁷⁵

Recovery and Reflection Period

The reflection period for adult victims of trafficking is 30 days (1 month); it applies for victims of both internal and external trafficking. For child victims of trafficking the reflection period is double that period (2 months).

Article 25 of the Anti-trafficking Act stipulates that foreign victims of trafficking, undocumented and migrant victims have the right to a temporary residence permit during criminal proceedings, provided they decide to cooperate with the authorities. In the last two years there have been no such cases. who consent to cooperate with authorities, receive a special protection status for the duration of the criminal proceedings. This includes a long-term permit for staying in the country. However, there is no information on how often this rule is applied or if it is applied at all. The Assistance and Compensation Act applies to citizens of EU and non-EU countries, when the crime is committed on the territory of Bulgaria. Despite the fact that the Aliens Act restricts the temporary residence permit to one year, foreign victims of trafficking can reside in Bulgaria for more than one year if the duration of the criminal proceedings is longer. In addition, for the period of their stay in the country, foreign victims shall enjoy the rights of the aliens who have a permanent residence permit. If repatriation would compromise the life and safety of foreign victims, they have the right to apply for asylum or a residence permit on humanitarian grounds.

Prosecution and Identification Statistics⁷⁶

In 2011, the Prosecution Office opened 138 investigation cases of human trafficking and brought to court 83 indictments, involving 115 accused.⁷⁷ The same year, the courts ruled on 131 cases of human trafficking (including reviewed cases that had been before the courts in previous years. 119 defendants were sentenced and 3 were acquitted, with final decisions (thus, 9 sentences were appealed). Of these, 57 defendants began serving their prison sentences and 61 received postponed sentences.⁷⁸

⁷⁵ GRETA (2011) Report concerning the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by Bulgaria. Strasbourg December 2011, p. 51

⁷⁶ Statistics cited from "Promotion of the Rights of Trafficked Persons in Bulgaria – a Human Rights Based Approach" by Natasha Dobrova http://www.animusassociation.org/?page_id=1316&lang=en.

⁷⁷ Report for the application of the law and the work of the prosecution and the investigation authorities in 2011, http://www.prb.bg/uploads/documents/docs_2914.pdf

⁷⁸ Annual report of the National Commission on Action against Human Trafficking for 2011,

In 2011, the Supreme Court of Cassation opened 5 cassation cases of human trafficking.⁷⁹ A new department at the Supreme Prosecution Office was established – department No. 11 – specialising in working on cases of crimes committed by children or where there are child victims.⁸⁰ The Prosecution Office also reported that in 2011, 70 children became victims of trafficking (57 aged between 14 and 18; 13 under 14 years), of which:

Type	Number	Girls	Boys
Sexual exploitation	59	47 (<i>under 18</i>) 2 (<i>under 14</i>)	10 (<i>under 14</i>)
Forced labour	4	3 (<i>under 18</i>) 1 (<i>under 14</i>)	--
Domestic servitude	2	2 (<i>under 18</i>)	--

In 2011, in the office of the National Commission on Action against Human Trafficking there were 56 reports of trafficking, involving 144 victims.⁸¹

The total number of identified victims of trafficking for 2011:

- 541 – 448 women and 93 men (the number of victims of labour exploitation and male victims increased from 2010);
- Of the 541, the majority – 404 – concerned trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation;
- In addition, 91 of the identified victims reported forced labour (no information on the particular type of work or the industries involved);
- 17 for domestic servitude;
- 29 for the sale of their babies.;

There were no cases for taking of body organs.

In 2012, the Prosecution Office opened 143 investigation cases in trafficking and identified 579 victims (a significant increase on the previous year). The National Commission on Action against Human Trafficking identified more victims – it received complaints of human trafficking involving 684 victims.

Of these:

- 574 were victims of sexual exploitation;
- 71 were victims of labour exploitation;
- 1 was a victim of domestic servitude;
- 38 were pregnant women selling their babies;

There were no cases for taking of body organs.⁸² The numbers of the Supreme Cassation Prosecution Office and the National Commission differ because not all of the complaints received at the National Commission were also reported to the Prosecution Office or investigated. The National Commission counts identified victims and the Prosecution counts victim-witnesses in the opened investigation cases.

http://antitrafic.government.bg/images/documents/Polezna_informacia/Statistics_new/statistics_thb-2011.pdf

79) Report for the work of the criminal department of the Supreme Court of Cassation in 2011, http://www.vks.bg/Docs/VKS_Doklad_2011.pdf

80) The Prosecution's 2011 report.

81) The National Commission's 2011 report.

82) Annual report of the National Commission on Action against Human Trafficking for 2012, <http://antitrafic.government.bg/bg/2011-12-09-16-18-15/statistika>.

In 2012, the courts sentenced 110 persons accused of human trafficking:

- 89 sentences entered into force;
- 21 defendants appealed;
- 53 defendants began serving their imprisonment sentences;
- 57 sentences were postponed;⁸³

In 2012, the Supreme Court of Cassation opened two cases of human trafficking.⁸⁴

Recommendations of TIP Report 2015

- Enhance efforts to investigate, prosecute, and convict traffickers, particularly for labour trafficking, and hold convicted traffickers accountable with prison sentences.
- Provide for specialised assistance, including shelter care, to men, women, and children subjected to trafficking.
- Enhance national coordination through an active national commission and secretariat and development of a current national action plan.
- Proactively target, investigate, prosecute, and convict government officials complicit in trafficking, and hold convicted officials accountable with prison sentences.
- Provide all male victims with services, including reintegration assistance and legal services.
- Provide sensitivity training to prosecutors and judges working with sex trafficking victims.
- Implement a comprehensive database of trafficking crimes and victims identified, referred, and assisted.
- Allocate government funding for awareness campaigns, including outreach activities to Roma communities.⁸⁵

Some of the problems related to the protection of victims are identified:

- Victims under questioning during investigation and court proceedings – sometimes this can be with traffickers present at hearings.
- Protection for the victim and family may not always be available at the time of investigations and/or trial.
- Due care needs to be taken to protect the identity and personal data of the victim.
- Special premises need to be used for court hearings of child victims.
- There are few well-trained legal experts and lawyers to protect the victim, particularly specialists for children. In observation from 2014 and 2015 in 12 monitored cases one victim was represented by a lawyer.
- Difficulties obtaining free legal aid.
- Lack of trained juridical staff and police officers working with child victims.
- Government social departments unaware of the special rights of the victims.
- Better training needed for social workers, particularly working with child victims.

Clearly, there is a role for RENATE members in Bulgaria, in conjunction with NGOs and other bodies working in anti-trafficking fields, roles such as prevention through education awareness, advocacy and campaigning; capacity-building; sharing best practices; providing shelters for victims; working with children; and ensuring that policies and procedures are implemented in relation to victims, particularly in protection, prevention and prosecution.

83) Annual report of the National Commission on Action against Human Trafficking for 2012

84) Report for the work of the criminal department of the Supreme Court of Cassation in 2012, http://www.vks.bg/Docs/VKS_Doklad_2012.pdf.

85) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243558.pdf> Accessed 8 August 2015

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS – In appreciation of:

Authors: Sr Marie Power, HFB, Sisters of the Holy Family of Bordeaux
Sr Adina Balan, CJ, Congregatio Jesu

Contributors:

Ms Joana Terzieva - Consultant Psychotherapy and Social services for children and families & Children's Rights
Caritas Bulgaria

FRANCE

US TIP Report Rating: Tier 1

“France is a destination, transit, and a limited source country for men, women, and children subjected to forced labour and sex trafficking. Foreign victims from Eastern Europe, West Africa, and Asia, as well as North Africa and South America, are subjected to sex trafficking and forced labour. Sex trafficking networks controlled by Bulgarians, Nigerians, Romanians, Chinese, and French citizens force women into prostitution through debt bondage, physical force, and psychological coercion, including the invocation of voodoo. The number of children subjected to prostitution, including students and foreigners, has increased in recent years. Reports indicate children, primarily from Romania, West Africa, and North Africa, are victims of sex trafficking in France. The Government of France estimates the majority of the 20,000 people in France’s commercial sex trade, about 90 per cent of whom are foreign, are likely trafficking victims. Source countries include Romania, Nigeria, China, Brazil, and Bulgaria. Online-advertised prostitution organized by Russians and Bulgarians has increased along with classified ads posted by organized networks controlled by Romanians, Bulgarians, Nigerians, and Brazilians; trafficking victims are likely involved in activities described in these ads.



Women and children from Suriname are victims of sex trafficking in French Guyana. Roma and unaccompanied minors in France are vulnerable to forced begging and forced theft. Women and children are subjected to domestic servitude, mostly in cases in which families exploit relatives brought from Africa to work in their households. Trafficking networks have expanded to operate in large towns outside of Paris, including Lille and Nice. In 2014, the French Government launched an investigation into allegations that approximately 14 French soldiers stationed in the Central African Republic forced boy refugees to perform sex acts for money and food.”⁸⁶

France, with a population of 63.1 million, is a founding member of the European Union since 1952. According to police sources, it has 20,000 prostituted persons in the country. It is a destination country in relation to trafficking for sexual exploitation, but it is also, because of its geographical position, an important transit country. Regarding data, the most important regions of origin are Eastern and South-eastern Europe (32%), Western Africa (19%), South America (11%) and Asia (8%, mainly ethnically Chinese).⁸⁷

The law enforcement agencies dismantle approximately 45 criminal groups each year engaged in trafficking-related crimes.⁸⁸ They organise the protection of victims of human trafficking with NGO co-operation. During investigations, when a police officer identifies a victim of trafficking, one of the NGOs is contacted to organise assistance and protection by way of the National Referral Mechanism. If the person is in ‘irregular migration’ and does not have EU status, the prefecture is informed on the status of the person. This information is critical for the victim to obtain legal status for the initial period of consequent investigation.⁸⁹

86) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report , 2015 <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243559.pdf> Accessed 8 August 2015

87) “Exploitation sexuelle. Prostitution et crime organisé”. Sous la direction d’Yves Charpenel. Fondation Scelles. Economica 2012, p. 169

88) National Plan of Action Against Trafficking in Human Beings (2014-2016).

89) The residence permit currently runs for 6 months.

France has a national coordinator set up through the French Government, who works closely with all stakeholders, in particular with a number of NGOs working in the field of human trafficking, e.g. ALC-Nice, French Committee against Modern Slavery (CCEM), Caritas France, les amis du Bus des femmes, l'Amicale du Nid. The national legal framework in the field of action against human trafficking has evolved in the light of the country's international commitments. An offence of trafficking in human beings was introduced into the criminal code in 2003, together with adequate sanctions. That said, GRETA considers that this offence should also include forced labour or services, slavery or similar practices, servitude, as well as organ removal.⁹⁰

Regarding NGOs, the situation of ALC-Nice is very interesting because this NGO is the coordinator of a system to accommodate the victims of human trafficking in case they are threatened. Consequently, ALC-Nice is funded by the Ministry of Social Affairs to coordinate the 'Safe and Secure Victims Accommodation Network' in France.

According to Mr. Eric Panloup, Coordinator of MIPROF (Mission against Violation against Women):

"We are currently trialling a system of cooperation with Ac Sé network to facilitate the access to their rights for victims of THB who are identified by Ac Sé. It's very important for us to organise this close cooperation with NGOs and Ac Sé because we don't have a Witness/Victim Protection Program as defined by International instruments. BUT, it doesn't mean that the Witness/Victim is not protected of course. This mechanism is implemented by Ac Sé mainly."⁹¹

Victims

Although a destination country, the GRETA report of 2013 claims that France has also become a major transit country owing to its geographical location. It is believed that there could be several thousand trafficked victims each year in France.⁹²

For the 2014 report, the French Authorities provided GRETA's commissioners with the following 'current data', obtained from 2008 to 2012, of victims of trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation and victims of pimping.

Year	No. of victims	Female	Male	Children
2012	751	no data available	nda	nda
2011	654	nda	nda	nda
2010	726	672	14	40
2009	799	723	56	20
2008	822	788	11	23

Eurostat Working Paper 2014

Figures do not seem to be obtainable for more recent years. For domestic trafficking victims there were 189 victims identified in 2010 and 149 in 2011, who were designated as victims of pimping. The countries from which the majority of victims are trafficked into the sex industry.

90) GRETA (2013) *The Council of Europe's Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings. Report on Trafficking in France.*

91) Mr Eric Panloup. "Discours soeurs du Bon Pasteur" Versailles, March 2014.

92) GRETA (2013).

EUROPEAN COUNTRIES	AFRICAN COUNTRIES
Bulgaria	Cameroon
France	Democratic Republic of Congo
Romania	Guinea
	Ivory Coast
	Kenya
	Mali
	Niger
	Nigeria
	Senegal
	Zimbabwe

It is worth noting that more than 70% are Africans, of which 31% are from Nigeria.⁹³ Nigerians are not exclusively from Edo state (Benin City), though this of course is a key state from where many Nigerian minors and women are trafficked into Europe. There is also representation from other states of Nigeria such as Delta, Ondo, and from the metropolis of Lagos. There is also a significant percentage of Romanians, which is in part linked to the judiciary procedures that have been in process since 2011. These are persons who need immediate accommodation during the procedure.⁹⁴

Traffickers

As in most other countries, traffickers use a wide range of methods to move their victims around France. The GRETA review of France's efforts in counter trafficking revealed that the majority of trafficking was involved in supplying prostitution networks, originating from Eastern Europe, sub-Saharan Africa (particularly from Nigeria), Brazil, North Africa and China. Where the other types of trafficking are concerned, notably servitude and forced labour, it would appear from the information supplied by specialised NGOs that the victims trafficked for the purpose of domestic work originate chiefly from sub-Saharan Africa and the Philippines and are serviced by organised crime groups associated with these nationalities.⁹⁵ As a country of destination, the traffickers ply routes from Italy and Spain, since the economy of France is currently in better shape than that of Italy and Spain.

Protection issues noted by Religious Communities

A number of instances were recounted to the author in the process of compiling this report, among them requirements to offer protection to survivors once they had been 'surfaced' by a police raid, or had 'self-disclosed', having received assistance to do so. Part of the safety which is offered is the ability to house women safely across France, facilitated by the 50 shelters of the Association of National Agency for Social Cohesion and Equal Opportunities (ACSE). These centres can be contacted with ease by the authorities and the survivor placed out of danger by avoiding any accidental contact with traffickers or clients as they consider the possibility of prosecution, and start to put into place their own long journey to recovery.⁹⁶

93) "Exploitation sexuelle. Prostitution et crime organisé". Sous la direction d'Yves Charpenel. Fondation Scelles. Economica 2012, p. 169

94) Jorbalan Annual Report 2013, p. 17. www.solipam.fr/Association-du-Foyer-Jorbalan-AFJ

95) GRETA (2013). Greta Report on Trafficking in France.

96) Sister Marie Hélène Halligon, Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd, Interview with a social worker in Foyer Jorbalan. Author of this report.

Responses to Human Trafficking across the Country

The Government set up a Centralised Office for the Suppression of Trafficking in Human Beings, with a range of specialised services ready to be deployed in combating human trafficking. The development of police and judicial cooperation at the European and international level is on-going. However a truly coordinated policy against trafficking in human beings has yet to be framed. The most involved associations, united in the fight against trafficking for several years challenged public powers and emphasises the need for anti-trafficking to have its own policies, organisation and resources.

Many argue that the level of International cooperation should be further intensified to reinforce the geographical coverage of the country with its many neighbouring border countries. Strengthening further legislation is called for so as to ensure effective protection for victims against the networks that operate in France. There is also an important role to play in improving operational cooperation within the federalised policing and legislative structuring of France, to mirror the strong coordination evidenced amongst the traffickers themselves, unhampered by bureaucratic processes, in order to dismantle them. The priority in France appears to be diplomacy – however in order to disrupt and put out of business traffickers willing to sell men, women, and children (particularly girls) to make money, there is an urgency to drive through changes in practice at national and federalised government level.

Some of this criticism might well be being addressed by the decision on 30 November 2012 to create a national coordinating structure in charge of protection and prosecution of human trafficking, which at the same time is closely aligned to the Violence against Women agenda. The Inter-ministerial Mission for the protection of women against violence and the fight against trafficking in human beings (**MIPROF**), aligned to the Ministry of Women's Rights, the City, Youth and Sports, is promoted widely as a solution to the coordinating of responses to human trafficking within the French Central Government.

MIPROF (*Mission interministérielle pour la protection des femmes victimes de violences et la lutte contre la traite des êtres humains*) has prepared a national action plan for France. MIPROF relies heavily on associations, including NGOs which have been involved in this area over many years, including the collective **Together against Trafficking in Human Beings**, which has been tireless in its pursuit of this agenda over the last two decades.⁹⁷

The Government acknowledges the NGOs' accumulated expertise, relying on their personnel and established networks for the implementation of its plan. The Ministry of Women's Rights, the city, Youth and sports listened appreciatively to NGO's message regarding the need to build an integrated policy with real and effective means for prosecution and for protection. It will give its feedback regularly. This action plan presents for the first time the foundations of a genuine public policy on the fight against trafficking in human beings in all forms of exploitation, pimping, enslavement, domestic servitude, submission to work or forced services, organ trafficking, forced begging, and coercion into committing crimes.⁹⁸

The French commitment towards human trafficking

The first National Plan of Action to combat trafficking of human beings includes a variety of 23 measures developed through inter-ministerial planning, which lays the foundation of a compelling public policy that aims to fight against all forms of exploitation. The National Action Plan is put in place through co-operation with the associations that have supported for many years the victims of the crimes of slavery and domestic servitude, through pimping, forced labour, organ trafficking, forced begging and coercion for crime. All these crimes are mentioned as areas for enforcement attention and protection of their victims.

97) www.femmes.gouv.fr/.../miprof...des-femmes-victimes-de-violences Collectif ensemble contre la traite des êtres humains

98) Plan d'action national contre la traite des êtres humains (2014-2016), p. 4.

There are three principal priorities in the plan of action:

1. Identify and support victims of trafficking;
2. Prosecute and dismantle trafficking networks;
3. Make the fight against this crime a real public policy – through the creation of a dedicated fund to be established in the 2015 financial law.

Among the main measures are:

- Increase the training of professionals in contact with the crime, to better identify and protect victims;
- Ensure that the victim has a place to live;
- Build a way out of prostitution;
- Ensure that there is someone to accompany children for their protection;
- Support technical assistance in countries of origin, transit and destination ;
- Build a policy that will be assessed by an independent authority.⁹⁹

Conference of Religious

Religious Congregations in France are contributing to public education awareness, sensitisation and the need for public alertness around the crime of human trafficking in France. Among the many Religious Congregations are Sisters Marie Hélène Halligon, Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd (author of this report), Cristina Ramos, Religiosas Adoratrices Spain, and Sister Clotilde Wanki, Soeurs Servantes Du Sacré-Coer De Jésus,¹⁰⁰ members of RENATE representing their respective congregations. All three sisters work in the Foyer Jorbalan, AFJ – Paris, a ‘shelter’ which provides for some of the victims (survivors of trafficking).¹⁰¹

The Collective Together Against Trafficking in Human Beings was created to enhance the capacity to fight effectively against all forms of trafficking. Founded in May 2008, the Collective comprises 23 French associations which are engaged directly or indirectly with victims of trafficking in France or in other countries of transit and return.

Member Associations of the Collective

Action Catholique des Femmes, Agir Ensemble pour les Droits de l’Homme, Amicale du Nid, Armée du Salut, Association Contre la Prostitution des Enfants, Association du Foyer Jorbalan, Association Jeunes Errants, Association pour la Réadaptation Sociale, Comité Contre l’Esclavage Moderne, Comité Protestant évangélique pour la Dignité Humaine, Congrégation des Sœurs SNC du Bon Pasteur, Conseil Français des Associations pour les Droits de l’Enfant, ECPAT France, Fédération de l’Entraide Protestante, Fondation Scelles, Hors la rue, Justice et Paix France, Les Champs de Booz, Mouvement du Nid, Organisation Internationale Contre l’Esclavage Moderne, Orphelins Sans Frontières, Planète Enfants, Secours Catholique – Caritas France.¹⁰² Each of the above-mentioned members of the Collective is actively working against trafficking of human beings. Members have a dual focus:

- To raise public awareness of this complex issue;
- To persuade political policymakers – French and European – to engage energetically against this crime;

99) <http://www.gouvernement.fr>

100) Sister Clotilde Wanki, Soeurs Servantes Du Sacré-Coer De Jésus. Versailles. Contributor to this report.

101) *Foyer Jorbalan* – set up and run by Sisters of Religiosas Adoratrices Spain

102) (Coordination: Geneviève COLAS genevieve.colas@secours-catholique.org / 06 71 00 69 90) http://www.Collectif_ensemble_contre_la_traite

It is worth noting at this point that it can be very difficult to measure the effectiveness of the job done by the Collective members individually. Unquestionably the Collective has worked tirelessly to get the National Plan of Action launched. Enthusiastic trained members are ready to do everything in the Collective's power to achieve its aims and goals.¹⁰³ The Collective is eager to see measures taken to facilitate access for survivors to the full extent of their human rights and the necessary items which will accompany their journey to full recovery. These include:

- Assistance in addressing all the impacts on their sexual, psychological, dental and bodily health;
- Appropriate medical treatment routinely in place;
- Access to safe housing, counselling, legal advice and long-term residence permits.¹⁰⁴

Key People and Partners

Key people in this struggle are Mr. Eric Panloup, Mrs. Genevieve Colas, and Sister Anne Bayart. Networks and partners to work with in the future are: Jorbalan Shelter for women, Les Champs de Booz for asylum seekers, Congregation of the Sisters of Good Shepherd (Congrégation des Soeurs NDC du Bon Pasteur), Secours Catholique (Caritas France).

The Collectif Ensemble Contre la Traite work together to develop programmes and services which are effective in assisting in the full recovery of survivors of La Traite. Madame Geneviève Colas (Head of Caritas-Europe of the French Secours-Catholique) is the key co-ordinator of this project. Secours Catholique¹⁰⁵ develops and coordinates, at the French, European and international level, the work of the Collectif. Each member of the Collective has its own training programme.

Case Study: AFJ ('Jorbalan Shelter' for women)

The AFJ is an association involved in hosting, supporting and protecting women victims of sexual exploitation. The shelter can host up to twelve persons. It was originally created by the Institute of Worshippers in 1967, and is run today by the Amaranta Solidarity Foundation – Religiosas Adoratrices, Spain – who took over the running of the centre in 2012.¹⁰⁶ The centre (shelter) has an international reputation and now with over a decade of experience in Paris with survivors in France there has been considerable refinement and development of skills. The specifics of AFJ include:

- Identification, counselling, protection, and home support through comprehensive and appropriate care for women survivors of trafficking for sexual exploitation, including housing, educational support, medical, social, legal, psychological and financial assistance.
- Awareness and guidance, through listening – training partners and government ministries.

The centre receives approximately 40 victims every year as well as accompanying 50 non-resident women.¹⁰⁷ The effectiveness of this work can be judged against the baseline set by the 'mission' and objectives of the association, which declares that it will:

- Welcome and shelter women who are victims of human trafficking and others who are in danger or who find themselves in situations of prostitution and determined to break or abandon the network of sexual exploitation.
- Promote in a space of psycho-social stability the necessary conditions to address victims' suffering.
- Re-establish lost self-esteem, by securing safe lodging and an enriching collective life with others.
- Provide bespoke personal assistance according to the duration of time the victim lives in the

103) www.contrelatraite.org Collectif ensemble contre la traite des êtres humains

104) Material taken from 'propos recueillis' par Marina Bellot.

105) www.secours-catholique.org (CARITAS France)

106) <http://www.fundacionamaranta.org> - Religiosas Adoratrices Spain

107) Material taken from AFJ website: <http://www.foyer-afj.fr/AFJ> is an association involved in hosting, supporting and protecting women victims of sexual exploitation.

- centre, and assist in the rebuilding of an empowered autonomy.
- Sensitise the public and various stakeholders, especially those who are in contact with the survivors, on human trafficking through information and education formation.¹⁰⁸

This work is based on core values:

- Respect of the person, her rights, private life, belief and culture;
- Assisting and providing individual treatment;
- Acknowledgement of the different stages experienced by the women of exploitation, trauma and recovery – moving forwards to empowered autonomy;
- Commitment against human trafficking at the national and international level;
- Solidarity with all projects in play dedicated to help women and minors.¹⁰⁹

Effectiveness of the interventions

a) Interventions include:

- Access to treatment;
- Psychological help and therapeutic workshops;
- Accompanying on a social level;
- Educative accompaniment (literacy autonomous workshops);
- Accommodation and collective life;
- Juridical support (regularisation and judiciary procedure);
- Material support (food, finance, clothes, transport);¹¹⁰

b) Their means of intervention towards the Government and civil society include:

- Training and awareness;
- Orientation or guidance and counselling;
- Active participation in the mechanisms and working groups at the national and international levels fighting against human trafficking;
- Identification of potential victims.;¹¹¹

Global and European partnerships seem to be a key solution to any interventions, which is the *raison d'être* of the RENATE Network. Jorbalan has developed national and international partnerships with 32 partners, across Europe (Spain, Italy, Romania) and with African states (Morocco, Algeria, Nigeria and Mali amongst the representatives).¹¹²

Evaluation – Assessing Impact

Intervention takes place when the victim is sent to a shelter. There is a need to trace the places where the victim has passed through on arrival in France. The intervention of the police is necessary. There is a need to trace back and know the exact period from the victim being recruited in her country to the time she arrived France. LE NID¹¹³ rejects any idea of a separation between 'free or consensual' prostitution and forced prostitution, and is at the forefront of resistance to trafficking in human beings. Deeply engaged in a global action, LE NID has worked since its foundation in 1996 on the causes and consequences of prostitution. It currently works with a particular focus on youth prevention, especially to prevent the pathway of girls and boys being recruited as prostitutes, customers or pimps. LE NID is part of an international network both in prevention and rehabilitation.¹¹⁴

108) Jorbalan, Rapport Annual 2013, p. 3.

109) *ibid.* p.3.

110) *ibid.*, p.7.

111) Jorbalan, Rapport Annuel 2013, p. 7.

112) *ibid.*, pp.12-13.

113) <http://www.mouvementdunid.org/>

114) [http:// www. Collectif ensemble contre la traite des êtres humains](http://www.Collectifensemblecontre.la.traitedesetreshumains.org/) – Accessed 20 April 2015

The directive of 2011/36 / EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 April 2011 on the prevention of and fight against human trafficking, alongside the protection of victims stipulates that Member States shall take the necessary measures to implement a National Rapporteur or put in place equivalent mechanisms. These should:

- Identify the tendencies of human trafficking;
- Evaluate the results of actions taken to fight against this phenomenon, including the collection of statistics in close collaboration with relevant organisations of civil society which are active in this domain or area;
- Develop reports and standard reporting mechanisms.

France has adopted this recommendation through the creation of the National Consultative Commission on Human Rights (CNCDH), an independent administrative authority which will also evaluate the public policy put in place.¹¹⁵

The Obstacles

Most of the time, victims of sexual exploitation refuse to cooperate with the police services when their trafficker is arrested, because they don't consider themselves as victims of trafficking. This is a real problem for police and judicial services, and requires an increased number of preventative measures for potential victims of trafficking. In fact, the victims are often reluctant to accept NGOs' assistance, and, because of the psychological trauma they suffered, and the ongoing socio-economic stress in which they find themselves, there is a substantial risk perceived amongst NGOs that regression to the risks of prostitution will occur, even after the arrest of the initial pimp.

At the opening of the second decade of this millennium the Government took the decision to build a national strategy based on a comprehensive approach on human trafficking to strengthen the actions against criminal networks mainly involved in sexual exploitation. France has signed and ratified the EU conventions on trafficking. The decree of 3 January 2013 gave MIPROF the lead for coordination of combating trafficking in human beings, in accordance with international commitments of France (Convention of the Council of Europe on 15 May 2005). This implemented the Provisions of the EU Directive 2011/36 in French law.¹¹⁶

France has kept in step with most of the other UN protocols and conventions, ratifying the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child and its Optional Protocol on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography, as well as the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women and its Optional Protocol. France is party to the International Labour Organization (ILO) Conventions on Forced Labor (Nos. 29 and 105) and on the Worst Forms of Child Labour (No. 182). France is also party to the Convention on Mutual Assistance in Criminal Matters between Member States of the European Union. Finally, France has acceded to several other Council of Europe conventions in the criminal law field which are relevant to action against trafficking.¹¹⁷ Where minors – trafficking victims under 18 years of age of foreign origin – are involved, it is for the police or gendarmerie to notify the public prosecutor so that the latter may decide on appropriate protection measures, in accordance with Article R316-10 of the CESEDA.¹¹⁸

115) *Plan d'action nationale contre la traite des êtres humains (2014-2016)*, p. 26, n 23. Implementation: Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Women's Rights, the City of Youth and Sports • Instrument: Legislative Changes.

116) *The above materials have been drawn from the Discours Soeurs du Bon Pasteur, by Eric Panloup. RENATE meeting Versailles 2014-03-03.*

117) *In particular: the Council of Europe Convention on the protection of children against sexual exploitation and sexual abuse, the Convention on mutual assistance in criminal matters and its additional protocols, the European Convention on extradition, the Convention on the transfer of sentenced persons and its additional protocol, the European Convention on the compensation of victims of violent crimes and the Council of Europe Convention on cybercrime. The following information has been taken from The Council of Europe, GRETA Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, 2012, p. 11*

118) *ibid.*, p.12

National Action Plan

France set up a National Action Plan to combat trafficking in human beings, launched in May 2014. A draft action plan was drawn up between December 2008 and July 2010 by a working group on the protection and care of victims of trafficking in human beings, established on the joint initiative of the Minister of the Interior and the Minister of Justice. The group brought together representatives of the ministries concerned (justice, interior, foreign affairs, immigration, labour and social affairs), representatives of civil society and also a representative of the International Organisation for Migration (IOM). The draft action plan, originally intended to cover the period 2011-2013, was configured around seven priorities (co-ordination of efforts to combat trafficking in human beings; prevention of the offence of trafficking in human beings; identification of victims; protection of victims; criminal sanctions against perpetrators; international co-operation; and monitoring and evaluation of actions carried out).¹¹⁹

Reflection and recovery period for victims

As victims of trafficking are extremely vulnerable after the trauma they have experienced, Article 13 of the Convention introduces the obligation for Parties to provide in their internal law for a recovery and reflection period of at least 30 days. The minimum 30-day period constitutes an important guarantee for victims and potential victims and it serves a number of purposes, including allowing them to recover and escape the influence of traffickers and/or to take a decision on cooperating with the competent authorities. However, The Collectif Ensemble Contre la Traite advocated strongly for 90 days recovery period, during negotiation time, as 30 days was too short, but this was not granted by the Government. When a victim is granted a reflection period, she/he may not be removed from the territory and the execution of any expulsion measures is suspended.¹²⁰

Prevention Measures

To reduce the number of trafficked people worldwide, governments, NGOs and faith-based organisations such as RENATE are tackling some of the root causes that encourage the practice. Causes such as poverty, unemployment, lack of education or access to resources are the forces driving people to take risks so as to improve their living conditions. By way of example, the Committee against Modern Slavery (CCEM) has organised several poster campaigns in recent years in the Paris underground with the help of an advertising agency providing its services free of charge. GRETA also takes this opportunity to underline the benefit of targeted campaigns in risk sectors and for vulnerable groups.¹²¹

Preventive measures aimed at girls and boys during their school education focusing on gender discrimination and every individual's right to dignity have been implemented under an agreement between eight ministries. In addition, initiatives to raise awareness of the issue of prostitution are now being organised in lower and upper secondary schools across France through NGOs funded by the authorities.¹²²

STATISTICS Prosecutions/ Convictions

The only official statistics supplied by the French authorities in their reply to the GRETA questionnaire regarding the number of victims of human trafficking relate not only to victims of trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation but also include victims of pimping. (Figures on page 3) The difference in definition between those who are subject to the crime of pimping, and those who are seen as having been subjected to human trafficking is one of the ongoing discussions which needs to take place across Europe and the global community, as at present the data which is being collected, and the principles of intervention being deployed, are extremely uneven.

119) Ibid., p.12

120) GRETA Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, p.43, nos. 155-156

121) Ibid., p. 30, nos. 102-103.

122) Ibid., p. 31, nos. 106-107; 110.

Prosecution of Traffickers

- In 2013, French law enforcement teams reportedly dismantled 45 sex trafficking networks, mostly from Eastern Europe.
- In the same year, French authorities formally questioned 824 individuals suspected of trafficking or pimping offences, but did not disaggregate the number of trafficking investigations within that figure.
- In 2012, the most recent year for which data is available for convictions, French authorities prosecuted and convicted 17 offenders under article 225-4-2, the same number as in 2011.
- The Government also convicted 19 offenders for the prostitution of children in 2012, compared with 22 in 2011.
- In addition, in 2012, the Government obtained convictions against 19 offenders for the exploitation of begging, compared with 15 in 2011.

Furthermore, France cooperated with international and intergovernmental law enforcement agencies in 208 cases in 2013, as well as several cases with Bulgaria, China, Romania and Spain to investigate human trafficking cases.¹²³

Recommendations of TIP Report 2015

- Implement the national action plan and establish a national rapporteur as stated in the plan.
- Amplify training on and enforcement of labour trafficking laws.
- Strengthen victim protection for child victims of forced begging and theft
- Improve victims' access to restitution.
- Continue to increase investigations, prosecutions, and convictions under the trafficking statute, ensuring convicted offenders are sentenced to jail terms.
- Standardise residence permit issuance policies and consider waiving permit fees for trafficking victims.
- Screen women and children arrested for soliciting or theft for trafficking indicators.
- Provide care for all victims regardless of cooperation with law enforcement.
- Continue to enhance the collection of law enforcement and victim assistance data.¹²⁴

The ROLE of RENATE members in France

The role of RENATE members in France is to work in close collaboration with the 23 Collective members against human trafficking, in collaboration with the association Foyer Jorbalan, where some victims are assisted. Members educate and create awareness so that people understand the issue of human trafficking and are encouraged to take action in order to prevent it. RENATE members also work with the association Les Champs de Booz to prevent isolated women asylum seekers from falling prey to traffickers.

Capacity building

There are significant areas where RENATE is being strengthened already, in relation to MIPROF Religious Congregations and faith-groups mentioned earlier under the heading key people and partners. There are further opportunities for capacity building, given funding and resources, including working with:

- Collectif contre la Traite;
- EMN (European Migration Network);
- Public Policy Exchange;

¹²³) TIP Report 2014, p.178.

¹²⁴) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243559.pdf> Accessed 8 August 2015

It is only with the commitment and the combined skills, resources and strength of the collective network that anti-trafficking work will make some 'inroads' into breaking the cycle of the international crime of human trafficking, not only in France, but throughout Europe and beyond its borders.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS –in appreciation of:

Author: Sister Marie Hélène Halligon, Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd, France. Member of RENATE working board.

CONTRIBUTORS:

Sister Clotilde Wanki, Soeurs Servantes Du Sacré-Coer De Jésus. Versailles

Mrs. Genevieve Colas, Head of Caritas-Europe of the French Secours-Catholique

Sister Anne Bayart. Conference for Religious, France

Mr Eric Panloup. Coordinator of MIPROF (Mission against Violation against Women)

Sister Cristina Ramos, Religiosas Adoratrices Spain

Foyer Jorbalan, AFJ

Germany

US TIP Report Rating: Tier 1

“Germany is a source, transit, and destination country for women, children, and men subjected to sex and labour trafficking. Most identified sex trafficking victims in Germany (86 per cent in 2013) are European nationals, primarily Bulgarians, Romanians, and Germans. Nationals of Nigeria, other parts of Africa, Asia, and the Western Hemisphere are also subjected to sex trafficking in Germany. Most sex trafficking victims are exploited in bars, brothels, and apartments. A substantial number of identified sex trafficking victims (22 per cent in 2013) reported they had initially agreed to engage in prostitution. Approximately half of identified victims are under the age of 21. Asylum seekers are increasingly vulnerable to sex and labour trafficking in Germany and traffickers use asylum shelters to find victims.



Labour trafficking victims are predominantly European nationals, including Bulgarians, Poles, and Romanians, but also include nationals from Afghanistan and Pakistan. Identified and suspected victims of forced labour are exploited in agriculture, hotels, construction sites, meat processing plants, seasonal industries, restaurants, and diplomatic households. Roma and foreign unaccompanied minors are particularly vulnerable to trafficking, including forced begging and coerced criminal behaviour. Various governments reported German citizens engaged in sex tourism abroad.”¹²⁵

Germany (map)¹²⁶ is the 4th largest economy in the world by nominal GDP. The country is a member of the Schengen area, the United Nations, European Union, the G7 and the G20. Although identified as a country of origin, transit and destination for trafficked people, it is predominantly a major destination country, receiving victims of trafficking from about 50 countries. Of these, the largest group of people trafficked come from Romania and Bulgaria, with roughly 20% from both countries.

With the widespread knowledge of trafficking in Germany the Federal Working Group in Trafficking in Women was established by the German Government in 1997. This group continues to meet regularly and is structured in an interdisciplinary and interdepartmental way with representatives from many federal and State levels. Their areas of responsibility include obtaining an overview of the various initiatives against trafficking in women. The group also identifies practical problems relating to the fight against trafficking in women and its implementation of responsible victim protection.

In 2000 the Palermo protocol of the United Nations expanded the definition of trafficking in human beings to include labour exploitation, defining the term ‘trafficking in human beings’ as follows:

“The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons by means of threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at the minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others, or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services. Slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.”¹²⁷

125) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report, July 2015 - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243559.pdf> Accessed 8 September 2015.

126) <http://www.lonelyplanet.com/maps/europe/germany/>

127) [PDF] Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in persons, Palermo, Italy, December 2000

As a consequence German law was amended to take this into consideration. Thus the definition of trafficking in human beings in German law includes the three essential components of an action (“the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons”), the use of certain means (“threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve consent of a person having control over another”) and the purpose of exploitation (“at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs”). In the case of children, it is irrelevant where the means referred to above have been used.¹²⁸

The offence of trafficking in human beings is defined in three sections in German Criminal Code.

Section 232 on human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation says:

1. “Whoever exploits another person’s predicament, or vulnerability arising from being in a foreign country, in order to induce them to engage in prostitution, to engage in exploitative sexual activity with or in the presence of the offender or a third person or to suffer sexual acts on his own person by the offender or a third person shall be liable to imprisonment from six months to ten years. Whosoever induces a person under twenty-one years of age to engage in prostitution or any sexual activity shall incur the same penalty.
2. The attempt shall be punishable.
3. The penalty shall be imprisonment from one to ten years if:
 - a) the victim is a child;
 - b) the offender through the act seriously physically abuses the victim or places the victim in danger of death;
 - c) the offender commits the offence on a commercial basis or as a member of a gang whose purpose is the continued commission of such offences.
4. The penalty under subsection (3) above shall be imposed on any person who:
 1. induces another person by force, threat of serious harm or by deception to engage in or continue to engage in prostitution or any sexual activity mentioned above.
 2. gains physical control of another person by force, threat of harm or deception.

In less serious cases the penalty shall be imprisonment from three months to five years.”¹²⁹

Trafficking for the purposes of labour exploitation.

The law states that, “whosoever exploits another person’s predicament, or vulnerability arising from being in a foreign country, to subject them to slavery, servitude or bonded labour, or makes him/her work from them or a third person under working conditions that are in clear discrepancy to those of other workers doing the same or similar activity, shall be liable to imprisonment from six months to ten years. Whosoever subjects a person under twenty-one years to slavery or bonded labour shall incur the same penalty.”¹³⁰

Government organisation.

Germany has 16 federal states. The tiers of Government are the Bundestag and Bundesrat. Laws passed in the Bundestag require the Federal States to implement them in the way they see fit their context. However, when the higher Chamber, the Bundesrat, passes a law, it automatically is mandatory across Germany. The 2002 Act legalising prostitution was passed in the Bundestag, which meant that Federal States implemented this in their own way. The States in the south of Germany, which are more Catholic and conservative, have fewer organised prostitution ‘rings’ and identifying trafficked women has proved easier.

...www.osce.org/odihr/19223?download=true

128) The Council of Europe’s Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA)
www.coe.int/trafficking

129 http://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/englisch_stgb/englisch_stgb.html. Section 12 (2) German Criminal Code
130 Article 233 from the Criminal Code on Trafficking in Human Beings for the purposes of Labour Exploitation.

In 2002, the Prostitution Act came into effect in Germany, legalising the 'voluntary sale of sex'. Because of the Federal mode of government in Germany it is not used universally but is different in 16 different States. Before then, it was regarded as an immoral act and brothel operators could be prosecuted for promoting prostitution. However, today, brothels are regular, widespread, legal and taxable businesses. Sex workers pay taxes to the State, and have access to health insurance and social security benefits. Germany sought to make prostitution subject to the same controls and benefits as any other form of employment across the Federal States.

Women were encouraged to register as 'sex workers', thus bringing prostitution into the 'regulated space' and incorporating this 'business' into the wider life of the public economy. Sex workers could potentially bring cases against brothel owners, have their sexual health and wider health requirements taken care of openly by the State, and even enter into pension plans. The desire to regulate and thus chase out of Germany the potential for 'hidden' exploitative trafficking, however, has not been as successful as desired. Opponents of the legislation point to the regularisation of sex work as building both the national demand and the leisure opportunity for sex tourism from outside of the federal borders.

Moreover, as non-EU nationals are not permitted to undertake work as 'sex workers' as it would breach their residency rules, numerous brothels, massage parlours, and hotel-room-based outlets became involved in the provision of sexual entertainment and prostituted services with females from non-EU countries. Here all the intended protection of sexual health, control over the selection of clients, rates of payment, violence against women safeguarding, age control on those working and the longer-term protection of the State (through taxation, health care plans and pensions) were systematically compromised across the cities of Germany through trafficked females brought in from 'third world' countries as well as from the newly extended European Union.

There is widespread debate as to whether the legalisation of prostitution has given women greater protection, safer working conditions and diminished trafficking for sexual exploitation. Horror stories from women who have exited 'formalised' prostitution in Germany cast doubt on the ubiquity of State protection and 'safer' working conditions. At best, the jury is 'out' on the issue, at worst, the discussion is polarised, with feelings running high on both sides of the debate. What is known is that there are between 3,000 and 3,500 red-light establishments across Germany, according to estimates by the industry association Erotik Gewerbe Deutschland (UEGD).

The lucrative purse which the sex industry offers the State exchequer and potentially the Gross National Product, is according to the public services union Ver.di, is high and estimates that prostitution in the registered centres accounts for about 14.5 billion EUR in annual revenues.¹³¹

There are an estimated 500 brothels in Berlin, 70 in the smaller north-western city of Osnabrück, and 270 in the small south-western state of Saarland, on the French border. Frenchmen are targeted to boost customer numbers at the brothels of Saarland. Meanwhile, Berlin's Sauna Club Artemis, located near the city's airport hub, attracts many punters from Britain and Italy. Aid organisations and experts estimate that there are up to 200,000 working in prostitution across Germany. Travel agencies offer special eight-day tours to German brothels. The outings are marketed as both 'legal' and 'safe.' Prospective customers are promised up to 100 'totally nude women' with nothing but heels to clothe them. Customers are treated as celebrities, collected at the airport in BMW 5 Series and brought through the streets of the city, doubtless accompanied by champagne, to the doors of the brothels during this deluxe tour, where males bond in their purchase of females for their sexual pleasure and fulfilment of fantasy. The customer base is almost 100% male. Those at the sexual coalface are principally female, though undoubtedly there are places where young males are presented as fare.¹³²

131) [www.europarl.europa.eu/.../IPOL-FEMM_ET\(2014\)493040_EN.pdf](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/.../IPOL-FEMM_ET(2014)493040_EN.pdf)

132) <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=UAJhUphv6PM> Newsnight report, 21 February 2014

The Traffickers

According to police reports for 2012-2013, the largest group of traffickers are German at 31% – a feature noted internationally where the purchasing country is the source of the largest numbers of traffickers. Second and third come the countries where the majority of female victims are sourced, Bulgaria with 22.6% and Romania at 13.7%. Traffickers come from all over Europe. Traffickers from Africa represent 2.6% of those detected, with those from Asia at 1% and Americas 0.3%.

The nationality of the disclosed victims in the same year were Bulgarian 25.3%, Romanian 20.9% German 20.8%, African 5.1%, American 1.6% and Asian at 2%. These of course are the cases known to the police – with the exact extent of trafficking in Germany still something of a mystery. The German Federal Criminal Police publish an annual report on trafficking in Germany, describing law enforcement efforts, victim trends, and challenges in addressing the crime.¹³³

TIP Report 2015 remains critical of some of Germany's performance, noting the lack of a national rapporteur to provide independent, self-critical analysis of the Government's efforts to address trafficking. Furthermore, TIP was critical that the Federal Government did not make efforts to reduce the demand for either commercial sex or forced labour. However, there is a government-funded hotline for women affected by violence, including female trafficking victims, which enables the reporting of this crime, though its effectiveness is difficult to assess.¹³⁴

RENATE visits Germany

At the special unit on trafficking in human beings of the police in Koblenz, I learned that the situation has changed for the police in Germany over the last decade. Since the legalisation of prostitution in Germany in 2002 it appears that it has become more difficult for the police to find victims of trafficking. Under German law women from outside the EU do not automatically have visas to work in Germany. They can be self-employed but this is not the same as German women who work in the sex business as sex workers. The rights to register with the State, pay taxes and obtain pension plans are denied to migrants. This puts the provision of an organised and trafficking-free sex industry into serious jeopardy, with international women being denied incorporation into the security of State provision, and furthermore at risk of being caught below the radar of police enforcement in trafficked situations. The super-profit to be made in trafficking is shown with statistics emerging from 'Roma' women, who constitute a sizeable proportion of the women available in German brothels, who when trafficked can receive as little as 200 EUR a week – still a significant income for some women from Romania, with slim opportunity in their home countries to earn the equivalent sum, whilst the brothel owner can be generating upwards of 5,000 EUR for her services.

Undoubtedly trafficking in women forms part of organised crime's grip on Germany's grey economy and is a seriously lucrative business. Until October 2012 it was a well-policed area of work. There were dedicated police teams devoted to fighting its outcomes and spread. However, with finite resources to hand, the focus has moved to policing 'terrorism'. Police teams in Koblenz, where once they had a specific team to look at trafficking, now have other duties as well, with only one person designated to trafficking where previously there were nine. The main strategy of raiding brothels and inspecting the papers of those working in them, and inspecting their working conditions, has been the traditional conduit to disclose victims of trafficking. There have been some attempts to work more closely internationally with other police authorities, but co-operation has proved difficult to effect, due to frequent changes of personnel, and the challenges of information sharing across country borders and national police forces. This has been steadily worked on by Europol, with a number of information-sharing strategies and protocols now in place.

133) www.bka.de/.../Publications/PoliceCrimeStatistics/policeCrimeStatistics...

134) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report, July 2015 - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243559.pdf> p. 167. Accessed 8 September 2015.

The author ventured to ask whether the ‘Nordic model’ of decriminalising the immediate seller of the service (mainly female) and criminalising the ‘clients’ (substantially male) would be a good way forward in Germany; the response was a categorical ‘no’ by the police. It would be impossible, they declared, because since 2002, the sex industry as a well-organised and oiled ‘marketplace’ has established itself as a recognised and ‘necessary’ part of Germany’s Gross Domestic Product. The police the author met in Koblenz thought the only way to deal with any abuse or trafficking was to insist that the women have health checks at least once a month, which might make possible the ‘uncovering’ of those coerced or trafficked into the business.¹³⁵

There are several counselling centres where trafficking victims are referred once they have been ‘discovered’ and identified as victims. The agreements between the police and counselling services differ from area to area. Many of the victims are referred by hospitals or other social care agencies as they come to their attention – although it wasn’t clear from my interview what the percentage of referrals from health, social care and the police service are across Germany as a whole.

National Referral Mechanism

“According to Art.11(4) Directive 2011/36/EU, Germany has procedures for facilitating co-operation between involved agencies that contribute to the improved recognition, referral and protection of victims of human trafficking. ... the referral process refers to the transfer of potential victims of human trafficking recognised during the asylum procedure or forced return, to criminal proceedings against the perpetrators. However there is no nationwide, formalised national referral mechanism specifically for victims of human trafficking as provided by the European Commission in its EU strategy towards the Eradication of Trafficking in Human Beings 2012-2016. This is due to the federal organisation of the law enforcement authorities.”¹³⁶

There are no national guidelines for the identification of victims of trafficking. The responsibility to formally identify trafficking victims lies with the law enforcement authorities. In most Länder, an agreement clarifies their co-operation with NGOs in the identification process. GRETA urges the German authorities to strengthen the multi-agency approach in the identification process by involving more frontline actors (such as the Financial Monitoring Unit to Combat Illicit Employment and labour inspectors). They should also adopt a more proactive approach and increase their outreach work to identify possible victims of all forms of trafficking. Furthermore, GRETA calls on the German authorities to set up a procedure for the identification and referral of child victims. The identification of victims of trafficking among asylum seekers and irregular migrants in detention facilities should also be improved.¹³⁷

Detection and identification of victims is vested in local authorities. The identification process can happen in a number of ways. The victims themselves or someone known to them may contact the local counselling centre, they could be picked up by the police in red-light areas during a search or brothel visit, outreach work by the counselling centres could reveal those at risk, or hospitals dealing with obstetric issues of accident and emergency situations, or shelters could be the place of referral and detection.

The change in investigative impact in Germany since 2012 is revealed in the data assembled for the US TIP Report of 2015. Here the figures for 2013 (the most recent year for which comprehensive statistics are available) show that State and Federal authorities completed 425 sex-trafficking investigations, compared with 491 in 2012.

135) Sister Marie Power, HF, Holy Family congregation, UK, author of report. Interview with police persons, December 2014

136) European Migration Network (Federal Office for Migrants and Refugees 2013)

137) http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/Docs/Reports/GRETA_2015_10_FGR_DEU_w_cmnts_en.pdf p. 8

The authorities prosecuted 118 defendants for sex trafficking in 2013, compared with 142 in 2012. Courts convicted 77 sex traffickers in 2013, compared with 115 in 2012, and suspended prison sentences for the vast majority of convicted traffickers. Most convicted traffickers received lenient prison sentences, that were suspended due to a provision in the criminal code allowing the suspension of assigned prison terms of less than two years, particularly for first-time offenders.

Of the 77 sex traffickers convicted, only 17 were sentenced to prison, receiving sentences between two and 10 years. On the other hand, Government investigated 53 labour-trafficking cases in 2013, compared with 11 in 2012. Authorities prosecuted 15 alleged labour traffickers in 2013, compared with 16 in 2012. Fourteen of these offenders were convicted, compared with 10 in 2012. However, none of the 14 convicted labour traffickers were imprisoned. This was accounted for by the fact that whereas sex trafficking cases were frequently led by prosecutors with experience leading victims through trial processes, labour trafficking cases were mostly assigned to financial or economic crime sections with less experience with trafficking or victim-centred prosecutions.¹³⁸

NGOs and officials reported mixed experiences with the judiciary; while some judges were sensitive to victims' trauma, others apparently subjected victims to undertaking repeated testimonies or made insensitive statements in court about their experiences. Judges were not required to undertake training of any kind, including on trafficking crimes and victim-centred procedures. This is a clear failing which needs to be addressed. Both the Federal Criminal Police and state-level police collaborated with EU-ROPOL and several foreign governments, including Romania, Bulgaria, and Nigeria, to investigate trafficking cases. The German Judicial Academy offered anti-trafficking training to prosecutors and judges. The Federal Criminal Police organised several specialised seminars to educate investigating officers and prosecutors on trafficking topics. The Government did not report any investigations, prosecutions, or convictions of government officials complicit in human trafficking offences.

According to GRETA,

“At Land Level, co-operation between the police, counselling centres and other relevant actors is based on the standard co-operation concept drafted by the Federal Working Group on trafficking which provides that when an investigating authority suspects a person to be a victim of human trafficking, that person has to be informed of the possibility of receiving support from an independent counselling service.”

Also the counselling centre must be given the right to be present at all interviews by the police, the public prosecutor and the court if the victim agrees. If a victim of trafficking is unwilling to testify against the trafficker then she has to leave the country. If, however, she wants to return to her home then she can testify first and then return. If the victim is willing to testify and her evidence is strong and important then she can be given limited residency and enter a police protection programme. However, this is rarely used.

If the victim is willing to testify then she is given three months' reflection time. According to the Convention of the Council of Europe this is described as:

“Such a period shall be sufficient for the person concerned to recover and escape the influence of the traffickers, and/or to take an informed decision on co-operation with the competent authorities. During this period it shall not be possible to enforce any expulsion against him/her.”¹³⁹

138) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report, July 2015 - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243559.pdf> page 166, Accessed 8 September 2015.

139) GRETA Report concerning the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by Germany, published June 2015

Residence for victims of human trafficking in Germany is regulated by the Residence Act. During the period of reflection the victims of human trafficking have time to 'acquaint themselves with their current situation, their rights and the consequences of testifying against their perpetrators.'¹⁴⁰ Residence Permits are issued on a three-monthly basis and can be extended if necessary. Victims who do not want to testify are obliged to leave the country but an exception to this is if there is evidence that the victim runs the risk of torture or inhumane or degrading treatment or punishment in their home country. From evidence gathered by the author, it is clear that Germany follows a clear pattern of intervention with people who are trafficked. Counselling is a right given to victims and the co-operation between these centres and the police is vital for the rescue of victims but also to bring the traffickers to account for their crimes.

However, GRETA in its report in June 2015 states:

"GRETA stresses the importance of ensuring that all victims of trafficking are identified as such and can benefit from the assistance and protection measure provided for in German law and the Convention. Efforts to proactively identify victims of human trafficking need to be significantly increased. The public funding for victim assistance measures by NGOs should be given a more sustainable basis."

GRETA also particularly highlighted the need to improve the victim identification of trafficking for labour exploitation as well as child trafficking by co-operation between child protection services, NGOs and law enforcement agencies. The identification of victims among asylum seekers must also be improved. GRETA had several other recommendations, including the review of the reflection period to ensure that the victims are informed of the benefits of this time as well as being informed of the advantage of the right to a temporary residence permit, especially before and after criminal proceedings.

All relevant professionals who may come into contact with victims of human trafficking need to be constantly trained on the need to apply a human right based approach to action against human trafficking on the basis of the Convention and the case law of the European Court of Human Rights. What was also evident is that the Federal System in Germany makes it difficult to have a national strategy as each Federal State implements its laws differently and there is no uniform way of tackling issues.

Partnership – NGOs and the Congregations.

NGOs working with partial funding by the Government operate counselling centres in 45 cities, providing or facilitating shelter, medical and psychological care, legal assistance, vocational support, and other services, in the main for adult female sex trafficking victims.

KOK¹⁴¹ is a network of 37 organisations providing support and services to victims of human trafficking. It offers a country-wide networking structure for NGOs involved in the fight against trafficking in women and violence against women, in the process of migration. The objective of the network is to keep human rights violations against women on the national and federal political agenda, and to demand comprehensive concepts against trafficking in women and other forms of violence which can be experienced by women in migration. In 2008 KOK produced a report on "Trafficking in women in Germany."¹⁴² This report sought to lay bare some of the complex reasons as to why human trafficking exists in Germany. Its focus on women was because at the time of writing 95% of trafficked people identified in Germany were female.

140) European Migration Network (2013)

141) www.kok-gegen-menschenhandel.de/en/home.html

142) [PDF]Trafficking in Human Beings - KOK

www.kok-gegen-menschenhandel.de/...KOK/KOK_Brochure_Traffickin... German NGO Network against. Trafficking in ... available to trafficked persons in Germany, presenting ... academic studies* or reports have been published.

Solwodi 143 (solidarity with women in distress) is an organisation founded in Kenya in 1985 as a re-integration programme for women in prostitution. In 1988 it was established in Germany as a counselling centre for women and girls who had become victims of trafficking, exploitation, violence and abuse, particularly within the African Diaspora. At present it has 15 counselling centres and 7 'shelters' in Germany.

97% of the clientele in the Solwodi shelter in Berlin are Nigerian. Their main source of referral is word of mouth. Working with African women has particular challenges, mainly because of the way the women are recruited and controlled. The practice of 'JuJu' is one of the important ways of keeping the women enslaved. This involves a commitment frequently involving body parts such as hair, blood, fingernails, which keep the 'victim' in the control of those to whom they are being 'sold'. It is a culturally accepted form of ritual 'bond making' or deal sealing, which involves local shaman style priests. Workers are tied to their 'masters', or debts are underwritten to those undertaking loans, or, in the case of human trafficking, traffickers seal the deal with families, individuals, or prior 'owners'. The collaboration that Solwodi enjoys with the police is excellent as the organisation provides counselling and support to victims, often working with them on legal issues, reassuring survivors through the long process of recovery, and accompanying victims seeking justice to court during the prosecution of their cases.

In Via¹⁴⁴ is an organisation of the Catholic Church founded 1997, initially to greet women from the rural parts of Germany who travelled to the cities to find work. Today it has many branches. The office in Berlin undertakes outreach with women working on the streets and especially those deployed near the Polish border. Counselling is fundamental to working with trafficked people. Where counselling agencies can work alongside the police, women can frequently find the confidence to take forward their case. Fear of the police is pervasive in those coming from outside Germany, and so multi-agency co-operation to alleviate this fear and accompany survivors through the process to seeking justice and finding a measure of recovery is vital.

Recent refugee pressure: In the final days of compilation of this report, Germany undertook to receive more than 800,000 asylum seekers, four times the 2014 figure, with new countries coming into the field of German migrant Diaspora, especially those from Syria.¹⁴⁵

Though the demography of Germany favours the absorbing of a vital migrant population, there will doubtless be places where the stable integration into regulated work is surrendered to economic exploitation and trafficking opportunity. There is clearly the risk that there are trafficking cases already amongst the 'supply' chain of desperate and uprooted people, and new opportunities to recruit to an ever-expanding and poorly regulated sex market by in-country traffickers, as well as the fresh opportunity for exploitation into other regular labour markets, as cheap, desperate migrants look for employment. This issue need to be clearly on the agenda of NGOs, enforcement and immigration personnel as the recent surge in the population is integrated into Germany's social and political economy.

143) SOLWODI is an association that helps women in distress. SOLWODI is a contact point for migrant women who have come to Germany through sex tourism, human trafficking or arranged marriage.

144) In Via is part of the International Catholic Society for Girls which engages in social policy and focuses on providing girls and young women with effective help for achieving fairer living conditions. Founded 1997.

145) UN's refugee agency, UNHCR, says a record 7,000 Syrian migrants arrived in Macedonia alone on Monday (7 September) and 30,000 were on Greek islands. <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-europe-34185353> 8 September 2015

Recommendations

TIP Report, 2015 suggests some of the following recommendations for Germany:

- Increase efforts to address labour trafficking, including by revising Section 233 of the criminal code to ensure proof required under the law does not unduly restrict investigations and prosecutions of labour trafficking offences;
- Increase proactive identification of labour trafficking victims and vigorous investigation and prosecution of labour trafficking crimes, convicting and punishing offenders with sentences commensurate with the severity of the crime;
- Fully integrate labour trafficking into cooperation agreements and provide more consistent and stable funding of sex and labour trafficking victim assistance at the State level;
- Standardise victim assistance measures and government-civil society cooperation across the 16 Federal States, and increase the number of victims provided services through counselling centres;
- Expand longer term residence permit eligibility for victims that is not reliant on victims' willingness to testify at trial;
- Establish policies to encourage victims to self-identify and work with law enforcement, including by addressing the requirement that officials report migrants' undocumented status; encourage prosecutors' offices to assign specialized prosecutors to trafficking cases;
- Establish an independent national anti-trafficking rapporteur to produce assessments of the Government's anti-trafficking efforts;
- Strengthen awareness campaigns targeting beneficiaries of forced labour and clients of the sex trade, particularly in the most frequented red light districts; and include all convictions for human trafficking in reported conviction data.¹⁴⁶

GRETA also points out that:

- The lack of a national rapporteur to provide independent, self-critical analysis of the Government's efforts to address trafficking needs to be addressed, to bring focus and energy to the fight against trafficking.
- There is no real effort undertaken by the Government to reduce the demand for commercial sex or forced labour.
- The need to improve the victim identification of trafficking for labour exploitation as well as child trafficking, deepening co-operation between child protection services across the country.
- The requirement to develop fit-for-purpose protection and recovery services for those affected by labour exploitation.

146) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report, July 2015 - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243559.pdf> page 166, Accessed 8 September 2015.

RENATE Network

Judges and the Criminal Justice System requirement for training on trafficking and the issues pertaining to appropriate victim care are high on its agenda. If RENATE can assist in the provisioning of such training this would be all to the good.

There is an urgent need for further information and training regarding the identification and care of those exploited and recruited for slave labour, to build on the wider advocacy and campaigning work which is associated with this area.

As already mentioned above, a sudden swell in the overall population will have consequences for the country and invariably there may be trafficking cases among the 'supply' to an ever-expanding sex market as well as many exploited for labour among its number.

To quote from the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women (CATW), a non-governmental organisation that promotes women's human rights and combats sexual exploitation in all its forms:

“We must work to ensure that commercial sexual exploitation is actionable, both when it happens to women who have been trafficked into a country and when it happens to women within a country.”¹⁴⁷

Similarly, there is the need for further information and training regarding the identification and care of those exploited and recruited for slave labour, so that advocacy and campaigning will be effective.

RENATE may be well placed to work alongside NGOs and voluntary groups, faith-based and civil society organisations to take forward some of the recommendations of the TIP Report, 2015, to keep counter trafficking clearly on the radar for enforcement, the Criminal Justice System and civil society.

RENATE also has a substantial challenge in Germany to think through how to develop an understanding of sex work being a violation, and not an enabler of women's empowerment and, as the Swedish legislation articulated, an aspect of violence against women which should not be tolerated by the State. Meanwhile, with the State legislation being the way it is, and the social economy normalising sex work, in hundreds of State-registered brothels across the Federal area, the challenge is thinking through what this business does to the relationship of men and women, and cash-rich men, and cash-strapped females, wealth-creating Germany and wealth-seeking Romania, Bulgaria, and Nigeria. The asymmetry is striking, and the ethical negligence of how this business is set up and continues is deeply challenging. This may be the challenge for member-congregations represented in RENATE as well as the wider Network.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS – in appreciation of:

Author: Sr Marie Power, HFB, Sisters of the Holy Family of Bordeaux

Contributors:

Sr Dagmar Plum, MMS, Medical Mission Sisters

Solwodi Berlin (Srs Mabel and Margitte)

In Via Berlin (Barbara Eritt and Christina)

Anti- trafficking unit of Police in Koblenz

KOK Report on “Trafficking in Women in Germany” 2008

¹⁴⁷) www.catwinternational.org/

HUNGARY

US TIP Report Rating Tier 2

“Hungary is a source, transit, and destination country for men, women, and children subjected to forced labour and sex trafficking. Vulnerable groups include Hungarians in extreme poverty, Roma unaccompanied asylum seekers, and homeless men. Women and children, particularly Roma, are subjected to sex trafficking within the country and abroad, mostly within Europe—with particularly high numbers estimated in the Netherlands and Switzerland. A large number of Hungarian sex trafficking victims exploited within the country and abroad, especially Roma, come from state-provided childcare institutions and correctional facilities; many of them are underage and recruited by traffickers while living in such facilities or soon after leaving. Hungarian women lured into sham marriages to third-country nationals within Europe are reportedly subjected to forced prostitution. Hungarian men and women are subjected to forced labour domestically and abroad, including in the United Kingdom (UK), the Netherlands, other European countries, and North America. There are strong indicators labour trafficking of Hungarian men in Western Europe has intensified in sectors such as agriculture, construction, and in factories. Hungarians constituted 18 per cent of total victims identified in trafficking investigations by EUROPOL between 2009 and 2013. Trafficking victims from Eastern European countries transit Hungary en route to Western Europe. During the year, the Government identified six Chinese women as trafficking victims. Within the country, Hungarian Romani children are exploited in forced begging, child sex trafficking, and forced petty crime; experts report Hungary is a destination country for foreign children, mainly from Romania, exploited in these forms of trafficking.”¹⁴⁸



Hungary is a landlocked country in Central Europe (see map).¹⁴⁹ The country has a long, rich history, and its culture reflects Roman, Turkish, Slavic and Magyar influences. The capital, Budapest, with a population of 1.737 million, is bisected by the Danube River, which drains through Hungary’s fertile, rolling plain. By 14 B.C., western Hungary was part of the Roman Empire’s provinces of Pannonia and Dacia. The area east of the Danube, however, was never part of the Roman Empire and was largely occupied by various Germanic and Asiatic peoples.

In 1948, the Communist Party, with the support of Soviet troops, seized control of Hungary soon after the closure of World War II. Hungary was proclaimed a People’s Republic and a one-party state in 1949. Industry was nationalised, the land collectivised into state farms, any organisation opposed to ‘party’ policies was shut down. Soviet troops left Hungary in 1991, which ended almost 47 years of military presence. The transition to a market economy has proved difficult, with many challenges in creating a buoyant GDP. In April 1999, Hungary became part of NATO, and in May 2004, it joined the EU. The major language spoken – by 84.6% of the population – is Magyar (Hungarian). The racial and ethnic mix is significantly dominated by the Magyar Hungarians, with 92.3% Hungarian, 1.9% Roma, and only 5.8% registered with an unknown ethnicity. The religious mix of Hungary is overwhelmingly Christian, with 37.2% Roman Catholic, 11.6% Calvinist, 2.2% Lutheran, 1.8% Greek Catholic, 1.9% other, 18.2% none and 27.2% unspecified (2011 est.).

148) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243559.pdf> Accessed 10 August 2015.

149) <http://www.lonelyplanet.com/maps/europe/hungary/>

The population of the country is over ten million, of whom 52.5% are women. Just under 10% of the population is unemployed. Prostitution was made legal in 1999, with an estimated population of 10,000 women in prostitution, of whom an estimated 25% are migrant women.

Background

The author of this report, Sister Marie H el ene Halligon,¹⁵⁰ was in Budapest for one week (September 2014) to meet with people working in anti-trafficking in her quest to find out more about human trafficking in Hungary and how RENATE might support the efforts of those working in anti-trafficking.

In her report, she says: “With the great help of our OLCGS (Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd) sisters in Hungary, I had the great opportunity to go for the first time to Hungary to lead the Mapping Exercise (ME) about this beautiful country. I feel so grateful to OLCGS sisters Maria Dutra and Zsuzsa Horvath, who organised the meetings, and to Sister Gloria, who found a perfect translator from Hungarian into French. Before my visit, I tried to collect data and articles to have an idea of the overall phenomena of trafficking in Hungary.

The itinerary that I followed during the week of investigation was as follows:

1. Monday 15th: there was an ecumenical sharing and prayer with a group of 10 women gathered by Ms Ilona  ekes, former MP, ERGO Chair. Having introduced ourselves, I explained the purpose of my visit to Hungary and the RENATE Mapping Exercise. In turn, each spoke about her own commitment to women in difficult situations: working in a ‘shelter’ and two days a week welcoming women who were on the street. This meeting was a first contact with this group – introduction and translation was made by Luiza, former secretary of the Bishops Conference.
2. Tuesday 16th meant visiting the buildings and meeting with the staff of the two OLCGS shelters in Budapest. A professional translator, Sophie was with us. I began with the question about those working in anti-trafficking in Hungary, but it was too broad a question for the personnel. They said they know a few NGOs, Baptist Church and Red Cross working in that area and that Baptist Church was opened a house for refugees. Migration was increasing, so there were more and more camps created, but there is high unemployment, so Hungary is more of a transit country into Austria, Germany and France. One of the staff read an article on isolated minors in Hungary. When asked what the country is doing about this problem, the answer is that they are in refugee camps, where they are welcomed by specialised social workers.

For women who leave the shelter, a process is followed, linked with associations, such as Esster Ambulancia;¹⁵¹ NANE¹⁵² (Women’s Rights Association) based on the principles voiced in the international human rights and women’s rights treaties, such as the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), the New York Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others, the Beijing Platform of Action and the 1993 UN General Assembly Resolution on the Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women; and PATENT, for the juridical aspect and access to their rights. When staff explains their work in the shelter, they speak about basic family needs, mainly with young mothers, helping with documents, searching for a job. Their main work is to ensure security for the women. Entering the shelter is a shock for the women, because it means that they are not able to bring up their children on their own.

150) Sister Marie H el ene Halligon, Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd, France. Member of RENATE working board.

151) <http://eszteralapitvany.hu/?lang=en>

152) www.nane.hu/english/ “Important Charity Organization for the Public Good” acquired legal status, 1999

Staff describe two main problems for the women:

- 1) Uprooting from home, because they have no parents, no friends, and their only contact is with their children, so there is a lack of hope for a future.
- 2) Lack of formal education: having spent 8 years at school, in large class sizes. They cannot go on studying at night school because of their children, and even if it were possible, classes are expensive and there is no guarantee of securing a job at the end of the course.

At the root of being vulnerable to trafficking in human beings is poverty, but also uprooting, lack of love, lack of hope and the skills-capacity to get a job. They turn to prostitution. Prostituted people say that they earn in one night the same equivalent of a month's salary from an ordinary job. For the staff, mothers had been psychologically damaged which makes 'restoration' so difficult. Social workers try to enable mothers to value their own dignity and worth, so that they can be personally empowered.

3) Wednesday 17th, morning: a meeting was organised by Ilona Ékes, with Dr. Krisztina Berta from the Ministry of Interior, Deputy State Secretary for EU and International Relations and two of her staff, Gál Eszter (expert) and Kövəri Franciska, a female police officer. Also Emma Csapó, a former Good Shepherd Associate, who gathers a group of street women; Médea Wilssek (press) and three OLCGS sisters: Gloria Baptista, Zsuzsa Horvath and Ildiko Rojko, Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd.

Dr. Krisztina Berta explained she has been Secretary of State for many years, and national coordinator of combating trafficking in human beings.

The policewoman, Kövəri Franciska, spoke of the complexity of the work on several levels, for example:

- Information: for the concerned population, and colleagues, so that they are able to discern real human trafficking situations.
- Education: trained colleagues can become mentors for others.
- Prevention work: colleagues are able to go to kindergartens and high schools to teach children how to say 'no' when it is appropriate and when they are placed in compromising or dangerous situations.

She was very happy because a Bishop called for a police conference to be organised in a Retreat House together with a panel of specialist speakers. In this way, communication has already begun as women are found to listen to other women and in each department, there is a special room set up to listen to children.

4) Wednesday 17th, afternoon: lunch and meeting with Emma's group of street women, 'Női Csoport,' who prepared the meal and waited for us to have lunch together and share their problems as women in Hungary (illness, death of a child, prostitution, loneliness). They also shared how Emma's presence and compassion is a big help for them all, and how strongly they feel the support of each other. They have a few activities during the afternoons, teaching their 'know-how' to the group. On Tuesdays and Wednesdays, they gather with Emma in a Centre where other activities and groups are meeting.

5) Thursday 18th: meeting at 5:00 pm with 12 women religious for whom human trafficking is a very important issue, and one of which the Hungarian Conference of Religious has to be conscious. After a short introduction of each of us, it became obvious that some felt very strongly about combatting trafficking in their home country. One sister has been working against trafficking in another country, and was very aware of the problem and willing to begin this same work in her home country.

They decided to ask for a presentation to the Conference of Women Religious at their next meeting (5th December, 2014). This was an interesting meeting for me, and a big opportunity for the group to meet and organise how they might work together.

6) Friday 19th: Visit to Gyöngyösoroszi, a village one hour's drive far from Budapest, where Our Lady of Charity Good Shepherd Sisters have a community, and are missioned to the Romani population, trying to help women and children towards a better life. 'Roma' women are vulnerable to trafficking, so prevention work and awareness-raising are most important. Sisters have after-school activities with Roma children and workshops with women. The sister in charge teaches them how to do handcrafting, and she is able to sell their work in her own country (Germany). They also help to improve their housing as houses are in very poor condition. Last year, one was drawn out from the over-flowing of the river."

What is happening in relation to human trafficking in the country?

According to its geographic landlocked position in the Carpathian Basin, Hungary is a transit (for Bulgaria and Romania) and origin country, with men, women and children victims of forced labour and sexual exploitation in several western European countries: Austria, Belgium, Greece, Italy, Spain, Switzerland, Netherlands, Sweden, the United Kingdom and the United States. It is a destination country also. Victims are from Bulgaria, Ukraine, Romania and Vietnam. There is a large 'Roma' community of women and girls among the prostitution population. Prostitution is legal since 1999. Human trafficking appears to be 'easier' for traffickers since 2004, when Hungary joined the EU.

National Plan of Action in Hungary Against Human Trafficking

There is a second National Plan of Action Against Human Trafficking for the period 2013-2017 (first one: 2008-2012).

"From the point of view of human trafficking, Hungary is primarily a source or transit country, but for some regions it is a destination country as well. The events of the latest period show that it is its source country nature and the internal human trafficking that pose the greatest problems. Considering these, fostering international relations and developing cooperation are indispensable, in addition to national coordination. Accordingly, Hungary has developed increasingly close relations with Austria, Belgium, the Netherlands, Germany and Switzerland, which are considered the destination countries. The cooperation of national coordinators and cooperation in law enforcement have undergone considerable development. A potential direction of future development is to work out a Transnational Referral Mechanism for victims, between countries considered as countries of destination from the Hungarian point of view.

Trafficking in human beings poses a problem in source countries, transit countries and destination countries alike, but it is most overtly present in destination countries. In the case of Hungary, the presence of human trafficking is less obvious for society than other violent criminal acts or offences against property that affect the personal sense of safety to a great extent. Due to the legal definition of the concept in the Criminal Code currently in force, human trafficking within Hungary is not measurable statistically. Thus, even though those involved with the field are familiar with the trends related to the manifestation of human trafficking in Hungary, well-targeted and effective action requires more intensive cooperation, exchange of information and action by all cooperating organisations. On the basis of the domestic and international data available, the great majority of victims of human trafficking in Hungary are victims of sexual exploitation, in addition to which a growing number of cases of labour exploitation have also been revealed, while trafficking in human organs is insignificant in the country."

Migrants crisis:

Since this report was compiled, the situation in Hungary has changed considerably on account of the many desperate peoples entering the country from war-torn and poverty-stricken countries, desperate to make their way into Europe, seeking a better life. One of the ways in which Hungary has responded to this issue is to erect a razor-wire fence along its more than 100-mile border with Serbia. A focal point has been the Hungarian border with Serbia and Romania, where thousands have crossed in recent weeks (August 2015). UNHCR estimates the number of migrants arriving in Hungary – increasing each day – and in the past months alone, July/August 2015, almost 50,000 have crossed into Hungary.

Victims

Clearly, it is difficult to estimate how many trafficked victims are among those ‘smuggled’ into Europe. “Trafficking in human beings in Hungary is a very serious problem, as everywhere in Europe. For prostitution, women are ‘sent’ to Western countries: the UK, Belgium and Germany. Their numbers grew after the 2008 crisis. Coming from the poorest areas, women thought it was the ‘solution’ to their money problems. A major proportion are very young women coming from the eastern part of the country, among them high numbers of ‘Roma.’ When Hungary joined the EU, human trafficking increased, because there visas were not required needed!”¹⁵³ It is highly likely the same will happen following this present crisis, 2015, with the large movement of population.

Traffickers – most common ‘methods’ used

- Offer of a job: dancing, cosmetology, etc;
- ‘Chance’ meeting: somebody offers a job to a victim, traffickers explain how great it is to find this opportunity;
- Job recommendation from a person known to the victim;
- Newspaper advertisement for babysitting, au-pair, photo model, waiter;
- Kidnapping;

Traffickers ply their trade in massage parlours and nail bars when not ‘working’ on the streets or along the forested areas of the country.

Responses to human trafficking within the country

Dr Krisztina Berta, Deputy State Secretary for EU and International Affairs at the Ministry of Interior and National Anti-trafficking Coordinator, coordinates action against trafficking in Hungary. Human trafficking is one of the gravest violations of human rights, in the prevention of which international cooperation plays a key role, she says. The coordinator ensures cooperation between the various government and non-governmental organisations and is responsible for the action Hungary takes against human trafficking at the national, European and international levels.

“The global number of people who fall victim to human trafficking each year is estimated at 30 million, of whom the number of Hungarians is perhaps a few hundred,” Dr. Berta stated at a press conference at the Sziget Festival in Budapest.

153) Interview with Dr Krisztina Berta, interview Deputy State Secretary for EU and International Affairs of the Ministry of Interior.

“Most Hungarians fall victim to human trafficking in Austria, Belgium, the Netherlands, Switzerland and the United Kingdom, and the embassies of these countries have joined the campaign,” she said. “Representatives of the embassies stressed the importance of cooperation in efforts aimed at fighting human trafficking, which they called a global problem, and praised their countries’ cooperation with Hungary as excellent.”

Dr. Berta said the Sziget Festival was an excellent venue that enabled the organisers to talk to large numbers of young Europeans so they can recognise the dangers of human trafficking and find out about what they can do and what the government is doing to prevent it.”¹⁵⁴ On 18 October, 2014, the European Day of Combating Trafficking in Human Beings, the Ministry of the Interior launched a special website in support of the fight against human trafficking. It aims to provide the public with information about what government is doing, as well as the anti-trafficking coordinator and staff contacts working in this field.¹⁵⁵

Dr. Berta stressed: Hungary is not just a target and transit country, but is also a country of origin from the respect of human trafficking. Ms Coleen Bell, Ambassador of the United States to Budapest said, that human trafficking is a horrible form of modern-day slavery which the United States, in cooperation with its partners, including Hungary, seeks to uproot.

The US Ambassador highlighted that due to the increase in the number of migrants and asylum-seekers, Hungary is compelled to face serious challenges, and this also results in increased responsibility in the fight against human trafficking. The Ambassador specifically remarked that this work is an especially important priority for her, given that she was formerly a member of organisations to help women and children who fall victim to human trafficking.

The Ambassador praised the Ministry of Interior for contributing to the prevention of human trafficking – among other measures – with its activities which are aimed to draw attention to and prevent human trafficking, in a tent set up at the Sziget Festival. At the same time, the Ambassador drew attention to the fact that the Hungarian authorities should reinforce their cooperation with NGOs, victim support groups and journalists uncovering stories of human trafficking in the interest of the effective management of the problem.¹⁵⁶

Non Government Organisations

Kiut Veled Egyesület:¹⁵⁷ works with programmes in efforts to support persons in prostitution in the areas of education, dialogue, religion, and food.

ERGO:¹⁵⁸ is an organisation with its objective mainly as the protection of children. It holds conferences, makes documentaries and videos to raise awareness of violence against children in addition to making programmes for young girls living in institutions. Topics include mainly violence against children, a woman’s role in life, gender issue, child protection. It has four working groups in the areas of:

- (i) Employment;
- (ii) Juridical, administration;
- (iii) Child protection;
- (iv) St Stephen’s Plan;

154) http://www.xpatloop.com/news/hungarian_ministry_of_interior_launches_campaign_to_combat_human_trafficking

155) <http://emberkereskedelem.kormany.hu/>

156) <http://www.kormany.hu/en/ministry-of-interior/news/human-trafficking-is-one-of-the-gravest-violations-of-human-rights>. 14 August, 2015

157) <http://www.kiutveled.info/>

158) <http://www.ergo-net.hu/index.php/en/letoltheto-kiadvanyok>

In November 2013, ERGO organised an international conference: For Youth Protection with Open Eyes – Children’s Rights, Child and Youth Protection in V4 Countries. During this conference ERGO created the award of the Silver Lily Prize. This had been given to experts of V4 (Hungary, Czech Republic, Poland and Slovakia) that were active in child protection. In 2013, ERGO organised several workshops on child protection. In 2014, ERGO began an awareness-raising campaign for child protection and in November 2014 planned an international conference around child protection.

Sex Educatio Kiemelt Közhasznú Alapítvány: ¹⁵⁹

- Provides information, education, training and care concerning sexuality – school teaching;
- Cooperates with graduate and postgraduate education for health teachers, school nurses, school doctors and social workers;
- Changes risky behaviour, negative attitudes towards HIV people; evaluation of the Hungarian sex and AIDS programmes;
- Coordination of the umbrella network in sex and AIDS, trafficking human beings, NGOs in Hungary site.

NANE Nők a Nőkért Együtt az Erőszak

Ellen Egyesület says, “Domestic violence is not only a private, but also a global problem. Several international conferences have stated that domestic violence against women and children is a form of discrimination against women and therefore its elimination is the responsibility of the State; a social problem of such scope cannot be solved by an NGO alone. What we at NANE can and do offer is to listen to the victims, understand them without making judgements and raise public awareness of domestic violence through publications and training sessions.

NANE is still the only NGO running a ‘hotline’ for battered women and children in Hungary. Since our beginnings in 1994 the range of our activities has grown considerably. We have initiated amendments to laws and public administration reforms in areas where the current regulations do not guarantee equal protection under the law for victims of domestic violence. We petitioned the Constitutional Court to declare that marital rape is a crime and therefore should be included in Hungarian criminal law. Our efforts, which turned into a vocal public movement, succeeded in 1997 when the Hungarian Parliament outlawed marital rape. As well as a crisis hotline, we also voice our views through several media channels, including making use of written and electronic.”¹⁶⁰

Cooperation and Capacity-building

The NGOs listed are concentrated more on prostitution and violence against women but, whilst they work with national and civic platforms, they don’t organise common conferences or a common meeting because of their different identities. Many of the NGOs have foreign partnerships. For these NGOs, there are national formations and they themselves organise several workshops for sharing experiences, good practices, changes, and new elements. Although the meeting with women religious on 18 September, 2014 was poorly attended, those who came were highly motivated. One has been working against human trafficking in another country, and was very aware of the problem and willing to begin the same work at home in Hungary. It was decided to ask for a presentation to the Conference of Women Religious at their meeting in December 2014. Two OLCGS sisters (Zsuzsanna and Ildiko) who attended this conference were disappointed because human trafficking was not on the agenda for the meeting.

159) <http://www.sexeducatio.hu/index.php?subpage>

160) <http://www.nane.hu/english/index.html>

However, since the meeting, RENATE has responded to a call for help. RENATE members Sister Dagmar Plum (Medical Mission Sister, Germany); Marie Hélène Halligon (Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd France, author of this report) and Ms Anne Kelleher, RENATE communications person, are planning a training conference in Advocacy and Campaigning for March 2016, in conjunction with Sister Gabriella Legradi, new member of RENATE.¹⁶¹

Laws of country/enforcement/consequences/results

“At the level of legislation, Hungary has complied with its implementation obligations following from the directive. In Act C of 2012 on the Criminal Code, which entered into force on July 1st 2013 (hereinafter the New Criminal Code), the formulation of the new legal definition of the crime of human trafficking complies with the expectations of international conventions and of the EU directive. Since, through the transposition of the directive, legal obstacles were lifted, Act XVIII of 2013 on the Convention of the Council of Europe against Trafficking in Human Beings could be proclaimed.

Under Article 192 of the New Criminal Code, the particular legal definition of trafficking in human beings rules, by keeping the provisions formerly in force and at the same time complementing them, on trafficking with the purpose of exploitation as a new element. While the specific feature of the phenomenon of trafficking in humans was kept in view, the exploitation nature of the criminal act was given sufficient emphasis in addition to its transaction feature. Under the New Criminal Code, trafficking in human beings with the purpose of exploitation is punishable by one to five years’ imprisonment. In the case of perpetration through a criminal organization, the ceiling of punishment has risen to ten years’ imprisonment.

Under the New Criminal Code, the central conceptual element of exploitation is the attempt to benefit from misusing the position of a victim brought into or kept in a vulnerable position. Thus, actually obtaining a purchase price by selling a victim or depriving a victim of their earnings or income are not essential criteria for an act to qualify as exploitation. Benefit does not only mean financial benefit; it means any other benefit, advantage or advantageous position that is gained by misusing the position of the victim. Vulnerable position may refer to a single factor or factors that make the victim vulnerable to the perpetrator. The vulnerable position may arise through the perpetrator’s behaviour or action, or irrespective of these. In the latter case, misuse is implemented by perpetrators through maintaining the existing vulnerable position (e.g. homelessness or financial plight) or by preventing the victims from recovering from it. The legal definition of human trafficking remains to be complemented in the system of the New Criminal Code by provisions on what are referred to as parasite crimes, related to prostitution, on sexual crimes and provisions serving the protection of children.”

“As regards sexual exploitation it must be noted that the question of prostitution is not settled legally; a social, legal or political consensus is lacking for a solution to be found for this phenomenon and the application of the legislation in force is inappropriate.” As regards the legislative environment, the amendment of Act CXXXV of 2005 on Crime Victim Support and State Compensation and the Government Decree on the identification system of the victims of human trafficking have appeared as new elements. The relevant provisions of the Act have been amended in a way guaranteeing that the victims of trafficking in humans could be provided the specific support available to the victims of human trafficking, irrespective of whether or not they cooperated in the criminal procedure. The referral system of victims has recently been regulated on in a Government Decree, which specifies the range of responsible authorities and their system of cooperation in a general manner.”

¹⁶¹) Sister Gabriella Legradi (SCSC) - Congregation of the Sisters of the Holy Cross, with other women Religious, established SARA , a group that cooperates in the areas of prevention, advocacy, education as well as offering protection to victims of human trafficking.

Setting up a Transnational Referral Mechanism with the Netherlands and Belgium as a first step.

Action 1 of Priority A of Directive 2011/36/EU calls upon Member States to establish victim referral mechanisms, which serve the identification, treatment, protection and support of victims. The identification and support of human trafficking victims can be efficiently implemented with the help of a cooperation matrix, i.e. the Transnational Referral Mechanism, which includes all involved parties both in the source country and the destination country.

A Transnational Referral Mechanism would be worked out for experts involved in the combat against human trafficking (the police, the consular service, the alien policing authority, refugee authority, the prosecutor service and courts), which would foster communication and cooperation between experts and contribute to the safe referral of victims. Within the framework of professional consultations organised for experts participating in victim referral and support, the EU handbook on the referral of human trafficking victims could be processed, whereby all experts would have precise information on the process of victim referral.

With the above in mind, it is necessary to continuously monitor EU tenders and maintain close relations with institutions in the destination countries. Numerous Hungarian citizens are victimised by human trafficking in countries other than Belgium, the Netherlands or Switzerland, because of which there is reason to extend the Transnational Referral Mechanism and introduce it in other destination countries as well. The above three countries are significant from the point of view of Hungarian victims but there are other countries beyond these where there is a need to set up a victim referral mechanism.

Rights of Victims

There is only one shelter, capable of housing 6 people for 90 days, after which point there is the option to extend. There is no comprehensive reintegration programme for victims of trafficking.

Prevention

GRETA ¹⁶² reports that due to Hungary being considered primarily as a country of origin, little attention has been paid to date to foreign victims of trafficking who may be exploited in Hungary or transiting through the country (par 127, page 31)GRETA notes that insufficient steps have been taken to detect victims of trafficking for the purpose of labour exploitation, in particular when it comes to internal trafficking (par 131). GRETA urges the Hungarian authorities to ensure that all victims of trafficking are properly identified and can benefit from the assistance and protection measures contained in the Convention, in particular by:

- Not requiring written consent from trafficked persons for them to be identified as victims;
- Strengthening the identification of victims of internal trafficking, including for forced labour, servitude and slavery, in particular by reinforcing the role of labour inspectors through adequate resources and training and ensuring that domestic work in private homes is covered by labour inspections;
- Adopting a framework for the identification of victims of trafficking in human beings among third-country nationals without legal residence;
- Improving the identification of victims of trafficking in human beings among asylum seekers and irregular migrants, in particular by increasing efforts to train staff of the Office of Immigration and Nationality on identification and the use of common indicators for identification;
- Increasing efforts to identify child victims of trafficking in human beings, including amongst

162) Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings https://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/Docs/Reports/GRETA_2015_11_FGR_HUN_en_w_cmnts.pdf (127) page 31

unaccompanied minors, and setting up child-specific identification procedures, which take into account the special circumstances and needs of child victims of trafficking, involves child specialists, child protection services, trained police and prosecutors, and ensures that the best interests of the child are the primary consideration;

- Developing age assessment tools and effectively implementing the presumption and the measures foreseen in Article 10, paragraph 3, of the Convention when the age of the victim is uncertain and the measures foreseen in Article 10, paragraph 4, of the Convention if an unaccompanied child is identified as a victim of trafficking.

Assistance to victims.

The Convention requires Parties to take measures to assist victims in their physical, psychological and social recovery, taking account of the victim's safety and protection needs, in cooperation with NGOs and other organisations engaged in assistance to victims. This assistance must be provided on a consensual and informed basis, taking account of the special needs of persons in a vulnerable position, as well as children, and it must not be made conditional on the victim's willingness to act as a witness (Article 12). The need to take account of victims' needs is also referred to in the Convention's provisions concerning temporary residence permits (Article 14) and the rights of child victims of trafficking (Article 12(7)). The Convention also establishes that the assistance to victims of trafficking in human beings must include appropriate and secure accommodation.¹⁶³

Recommendations of TIP Report 2015

- Increase funding for and provision of specialised victim services and provide consistent funding to NGOs to offer victim care.
- Address the vulnerability of children residing in state-run child institutions and individuals who leave these institutions.
- Bring the anti-trafficking law in line with international law by more precisely defining exploitation and requiring fraud, force, or coercion as elements of the core offence of adult trafficking.
- Increase proactive identification of and assistance for child victims exploited within Hungary.
- Strengthen law enforcement efforts against all forms of trafficking.
- Bolster protection for victims who face serious harm and retribution from their traffickers, including by developing longer-term care options to improve reintegration.
- Enhance the collection and reporting of reliable law enforcement and victim protection data.
- Increase victim-centred training of law enforcement, prosecutors, and social workers.¹⁶⁴

RENATE role and capacity building

Having met with women religious in the country, eager to do something together in anti-trafficking work, it is hoped that the forthcoming RENATE training conference in March 2016 will bring about the change that is necessary and the cooperation required to work in prevention, protection, advocacy and education awareness of the growing global problem of human trafficking and its impact on Hungary. A first step is Sister Gabriella Legradi (SCSC) with the support of her Congregation of the Sisters of the Holy Cross, joining RENATE working board, who has worked with SOLWODI in Germany. Undoubtedly, there is a gap between the needs, government political will and work at the 'grassroots' level in combating human trafficking in the country. Much work is required in this field of anti-trafficking. Gathering the efforts of interested parties and, with the assistance of Dr. Krisztina Berta, to include other groups, may be the challenge for the RENATE Network.

163) https://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/Docs/Reports/GRETA_2015_11_FGR_HUN_en_w_cmnts.pdf. published 29 May 2015, pages 31- 33 (127/133/136)

164) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243559.pdf> Accessed 10 August 2015

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS – In appreciation of:

Author: Sr. Marie Hélène Halligon, Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd, France

CONTRIBUTORS:

Srs Maria Dutra, Zsuzsa Horvath, Gloria Baptista, Ildiko Rojko, Sisters of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd (OLCGS)

Luiza, former secretary of the Bishops Conférence

Staff of the 2 OLCGS shelters in Budapest

Sophie (Professional translator)

Ms Ilona Ékes, former MP, ERGO Chair

Dr. Krisztina Berta from the Ministry of Interior, Deputy State Secretary for EU and International Relations and two of her staff: Gál Eszter (expert) and Kövéri Franciska,

Ms László Oláh-Paulon, a female police officer

Ms Emma Csapó, former Good Shepherd Associate

Médea Wilssek (Press)

Ellen Egyesület of NANE NGO (against domestic violence)

Sister Gabriella Legradi (SCSC) - Congregation of the Sisters of the Holy Cross

Sr Bohdana Bezakova, CJ Congregatio Jesu, Slovakia, who met with...

Sr Erika Masco, SDS - Salvatorian sisters

Sr Judit Knáb, CJ - Congregatio Jesu

Sr Monika Kistebier - Little sisters of Jesus

Sr Gariella Kószán - Sisters of the Holy Cross

REPUBLIC OF IRELAND

US TIP Report Rating: Tier 1

Ireland¹⁶⁵ is a destination and source country for women, men, and children subjected to sex trafficking and forced labour – including forced criminal activity. Foreign trafficking victims identified in Ireland are from Africa, Asia, Eastern Europe, and the Middle East. During the reporting period, Irish law enforcement reported an increase in suspected victims of forced labour, forced criminal activity, and forced begging from Eastern Europe, particularly Romania, as well as an increase in potential sex trafficking victims from Brazil. Authorities reported a decrease in suspected victims from Nigeria. Irish children are subjected to sex trafficking within the country. Victims of forced labour have been identified in domestic service, the restaurant industry, and car washing services. NGOs and press reports indicate Vietnamese and Chinese men prosecuted and sentenced for cannabis cultivation report indicators of forced labour, such as document retention, restriction of movement, and non-payment of wages. Some domestic workers, primarily women, employed by foreign diplomats on assignment in Ireland work under poor conditions and are at risk of labour trafficking. The Government of Ireland fully complies with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking.¹⁶⁶



General Overview

Ireland is the most westerly republic, European Union and euro zone island country in Europe, with a population of 4.6 million (UN 2012), of which 87.4% are indigenous Irish and 88% Catholic. Traditionally, it was known as the island of emigration. Following Ireland's entry into the EU in the 1970s and a few decades of prosperity, and investment in education that produced a well-educated population, especially in the high-tech industries, there is currently a time of prevailing poverty following the banking crisis of 2008. Emigration is once more on the rise, with a population of 4.595 million in 2013. Poverty is evident, especially among the unemployed working class. This has been exacerbated by the rise in an immigrant population from various other EU countries, particularly Poland, Lithuania, Latvia and Estonia. The free movement of labour within the EU Member States means that Ireland has seen an increase in its population. This increase comes mainly from nationals within the EU, but has also given rise to illegal entry into the country or through traffickers using false documentation.

Strict immigration laws are in place which should lead to the discovery of trafficking activity. The Illegal Immigrants (Trafficking) Act 2000 makes it an offence to organise or knowingly facilitate the entry into Ireland of another person whom one knows or has reasonable cause to believe is an illegal immigrant. The Criminal Law (Human Trafficking) Act 2008 was the first comprehensive piece of anti-trafficking legislation in Ireland, incorporating a definition modelled closely on the 'Palermo' Protocol on human trafficking of the United Nations.¹⁶⁷

Prostitution is not legal in Ireland but it is widespread. The current recession affects the activity and more women are forced to engage in prostitution to supplement their benefits. In 2013 the GDP of the country was 232 billion. The economy of the country has shrunk over recent years and job opportunities are fewer.

165) <http://www.dublintontourist.com/maps/ireland/> Accessed September 2015

166) US TIP Report, 2015 <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243559.pdf> page 192

167) Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Trafficking, November 2000... www.ohchr.org › OHCHR › English ›

A National Action Plan (NAP) 2009-12 for the prevention and prosecution of human trafficking and the protection of victims was established in June 2009 by the Anti-Human Trafficking Unit (AHTU) to deal with perpetrators as well as the development of awareness campaigns and the collection of data. A second NAP is currently being developed to incorporate the expanded definition of forced labour and to develop safeguarding guidance material. The Government is now considering taking on the Nordic Model as an approach to eradicating this heinous crime.¹⁶⁸

Victims

According to the NGO Ruhama,¹⁶⁹ the earliest presumed victims of human trafficking came to Ireland from Central and South America. This soon changed, with many coming from Eastern Europe and Africa (notably Nigeria). These remain, at present, the main source countries and victims are numbered along with those Irish trafficked internally throughout the country.

It has not been possible to interview any victims but their stories are recorded in reports which tell very graphically of their plight. Quotes from 'Breaking the Silence', a publication with testimonies from victims of trafficking, compiled by the Religious Sisters of Charity:

Anna recalls a time when she “felt so isolated that she thought she would die and no-one would know about her.” Tamara shared, “What has happened to me is right there almost every time I close my eyes.” Yvonne stated, “Drugs worked better to keep me disconnected from the horrible reality of prostitution and the pain of my life in general.”

Since the change in legislation in 2008, Reception Centres have now been set up around the country to accommodate trafficked victims while their immigration status is established and some form of rehabilitation is offered. Many Religious Congregations have opened their doors to victims, offering sanctuary through the difficult early days of freedom from traffickers. Many offer other services such as mentoring, counselling and various therapies as well as educational opportunities – all of which are offered by the Ruhama NGO. The legal aspects are dealt with by the Immigration Council of Ireland (ICI). Information has been gathered from representatives of the above agencies and Spirasi.¹⁷⁰

Traffickers

The nationalities of the traffickers in Ireland for the most part have been noted as African, Eastern European and Irish. They ply their trade using a multitude of different methods and disguises. These are reported to be through the use of hotel chains, brothels, beauty and massage parlours, lap dancing clubs and, in more recent times, through the 'stag night' scene. The trend is to move the victims around, often into more rural areas, so as to avoid detection. Internal trafficking is also on the rise. The situation of young girls and boys within the country, groomed by their pimps (so-called boyfriends) at the school gates, through social media, chat services on the Internet, all of this has become more apparent according to operation 'Blue Blindfold' reports.¹⁷¹ It is operated by the Anti Human Trafficking Unit in the Department of Justice and Equality with An Garda Síochána to educate the public. According to its reports:

Traffickers use a range of methods to maintain control over their victims, including beatings, rape, verbal abuse, threats to the victim and their family. Traffickers also utilise a range of other strategies, such as debt-bondage and isolation to establish control over their victims.

168) *National Action Plan to Prevent and Combat Trafficking of human beings...www.justice.ie/.../Final%20National%20Action%20Plan2.../Final%20Nati*

169) *www.ruhama.ie 'Ruhama' is a Dublin-based NGO which works on a national level with women affected by prostitution and other forms of commercial sexual exploitation.*

170) *www.spirasi.ie/ Working with asylum seekers, refugees and other disadvantaged migrant groups*

171) *www.blueblindfold.gov.ie/ The concept of the 'Blue Blindfold' is 'Don't Close Your Eyes' to Human Trafficking.*

A victim of trafficking may be told that she/he is required to pay the costs of travel, accommodation and setting up a job. The sum required is usually vastly inflated. Victims are told that they must work to pay off their debt. When a victim of trafficking is re-trafficked, re-sold to another trafficker, the victim is often told to work to pay off another purchase price.¹⁷²

45% of buyers of sex are over 45 years of age; 40% are in the 25 to 44 age group and 15% are under 25 years of age.

Responses to human trafficking within the country

The response to human trafficking has been widespread throughout Ireland and in the last decades, many organisations have been set up to deal with the issue, working in conjunction with each other, collaborating on prevention, protection and prosecution, from government institutions to voluntary faith groups, NGOs and civil-society groups.

- The first National Action Plan to Prevent and Combat Trafficking of Human Beings in Ireland 2009-2012, which was published by the Minister for Justice and Equality in June 2009, provided a blueprint for Ireland's efforts to tackle trafficking in human beings and support and protect the human rights of victims. It followed on from a public consultation process which took place in late 2007 and involved some 30 submissions from interested groups (e.g. NGOs, trade unions) and members of the general public.¹⁷³
- The Irish Government is complying with European Union legislation through changes in law (Criminal Law (Human Trafficking) Act 2008) and the establishment of the AHTU set up in the Department of Justice and Equality in 2008 to co-ordinate the Government's response to human trafficking. The Minister for Justice, Frances Fitzgerald, announced at the end of 2014 that 4,000 Gardai had received training in anti-trafficking work.
- International Organisation for Migration (IOM) provides training which is recognised by the State.¹⁷⁴
- Garda National Immigration Bureau (GNIB) carries out deportations, border control and investigations relating to illegal immigration and human trafficking.
- Religious Congregations work collaboratively and in partnership with NGOs, especially Ruhama and The Immigrant Council of Ireland, in efforts to protect victims and prevent trafficking through education, advocacy and campaigning.

Representatives of 19 Religious Congregations formed the Act to Prevent Trafficking (APT) group.¹⁷⁵ APT is an active member of the 'Turn Off the Red Light'¹⁷⁶ campaign, advocating and supporting the introduction of the Nordic Model into Ireland. APT has invited the contemplative religious communities in Ireland to join with them in prayerful support of the campaign against trafficking. This year, APT sponsored the staging of a drama on human trafficking entitled 'Diablo' in university colleges to raise the issue of human trafficking:

- The Catholic Church with APT and Trócaire approached the Bishops' Conference requesting that a programme of education be set up in each diocese of the country, to carry forward a plan of action that will raise awareness of the issues around trafficking.
- Ruhama is a frontline service for women affected by prostitution and trafficking.

172) Ibid

173) Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform, Executive Summary to the National Action Plan to Prevent and Combat Trafficking in Human Beings in Ireland 2009-2012

174) International Organisation for Migration www.ireland.iom.int

175) www.aptireland.org/

176) www.turnofftheredlight.ie/ Turn Off the Red Light (TORL) is a campaign to end prostitution and sex trafficking in Ireland now. It is campaigning to criminalise the purchase of sex.

- The Immigrant Council of Ireland (ICI) is an independent law centre under the Solicitors Acts, 1954-2002. Their legal team provide assistance and legal representation to individuals regarding their immigration status.
- Migrant Rights Council of Ireland (MRCI) is a national organisation working to promote justice, empowerment and equality for migrant workers and their families.
- Cois Tine (By the Fireside) runs a centre for immigrants in Cork, helping them to integrate into Irish society.
- Sophia Housing provides housing to people in poverty, including immigrants. It works alongside Ruhama in providing accommodation for women who have been trafficked.
- Spirasi is a centre set up under the auspices of the men's Spiritan Congregation (formerly known as the 'Holy Ghost Fathers') for the treatment and rehabilitation of victims of torture and trauma.

Various campaigns are operated by NGOs, charities and civil society groups, for example:

- MECPATH¹⁷⁷ is a campaign to protect young people from sexual exploitation in the hospitality sector. This organisation is set up and run by the congregation of the Sisters of Mercy and operates from Mercy International Centre, Baggot Street, Dublin.
- Tirzah¹⁷⁸ is a group from the Evangelical Alliance Ireland who, animated by Gospel values, strive to combat trafficking by raising awareness and campaigning using among other methods, poetry, art and theological reflection.
- 'Turn Off the Red Light' (TORL),¹⁷⁹ initiated by ICI in partnership with Ruhama and 96 other agencies.
- 'Blue Blindfold', set up jointly by the Department of Justice and Equality and An Garda Síochána along with the Irish Congress of Trade Unions (ICTU), supports the 'TORL' campaign. ICTU believes that the best way to end the human rights abuses taking place in every county in Ireland is to target the demand by making it illegal to pay for sex. ICTU co-sponsored with Ruhama an awareness-raising evening which included the showing of three short films followed by facilitated discussion, presented by 'Unchosen' – an anti-trafficking charity from the UK.

The effectiveness of the work of these groups may be measured in the number of people rehabilitated; the high level of networking between the groups; the impact of TORL shown in the rapid response to its message in the line of lobbying for change in legislation; and letters to the press from high-profile academics calling on the Government and the Minister for Justice and Equality to target reducing the demand for prostitution as a priority and adopt the Nordic Model into Irish law. Awareness raising has resulted in a number of documentaries on national TV stations. Members of Young Social Innovators, a movement established by ICI for senior secondary school students, undertake projects on the topic of human trafficking, some of which are presented at national competitions.

While much of the education awareness is conducted at the adult and adolescent level, it is considered most important to educate younger children when they are still at the primary-school level as more and more of this age group are open to 'grooming' for internal trafficking. The relevant and most promising networks, partners and groups with which to collaborate include:

- Educators – teachers in primary, post-primary and tertiary colleges;
- An Garda Síochána;
- Prison governors and chaplains;
- Sports clubs and organisations: Gaelic Athletic Association (GAA), rugby, soccer and other sports groups;

177) www.sistersofmercy.ie/vision/mecpath_campaign.cfm. **MECPATHS** (Mercy Efforts to Counter **Child Prostitution** and Trafficking in the Hospitality Sector) is a campaign to raise awareness among hotel staff of the reality of child sex trafficking in Ireland.

178) www.tirzah.ie/

179) www.turnofftheredlight.ie

- Ethnic groups such as ‘Vietnamese Peoples Association’;
- Church groups, including the Evangelical churches, whose majority are from African countries;

Liaison and collaboration with and between groups is vital in anti-trafficking work if it is to be eliminated from society. Training for groups is paramount in the initial and ongoing stages of the work. This includes interpersonal relationships; lobbying skills; social media training; mentoring; audio visual presentations; input from experts and related topics, even testimonies from victims, should they be able to tell their story.

Assessing Impact

At present there are no statistics available to evaluate the effectiveness of anti-trafficking work in Ireland. However, there is increased cooperation and collaboration among anti-trafficking groups and an increase in requests for information from organisations such as The Irish Countrywomen’s Association and businessmen’s associations.

Every effort is made to prevent trafficking occurring by raising awareness among the general population. As soon as a case of trafficking is brought to the attention of the group involved, appropriate action is taken e.g. supporting the victim through the subsequent interviews with various authorities.

Most of the groups and organisations working together are resolute in the determination to lessen demand. The evidence shows in the TORL campaign comprising over 90 organisations. In preparation for the adoption of the Nordic Model of legislation adequate education will be vital. Recommended reading on the issue of demand is the publication by The Immigrant Council of Ireland in partnership with other agencies, ‘Tackling demand for sexual services of women and girls’ 27 March 2014.¹⁸⁰

A report launched in Norway, 11 August 2014¹⁸¹ has shown that sex buyer laws are an effective measure in reducing demand for prostitution and sex trafficking.

“The ban on purchasing sexual services has reduced demand for (paid) sex and thus contributed to reduce the extent of prostitution in Norway. The enforcement of the law, in combination with the laws against trafficking and pimping, makes Norway a less attractive country for prostitution based trafficking than if the law had not been adopted.”

Over 90 organisations that make up the Turn Off the Red Light campaign urge the Irish Government to take urgent action to adopt the ‘Nordic’ law, so as to put an end to sexual exploitation and follow the lead given by the Northern Ireland Assembly. This is a bill that means Northern Ireland is the first part of the UK to make paying for sex a criminal offence; it has become effective after receiving Royal Assent.¹⁸²

Some of the obstacles, challenges and difficulties related to anti-trafficking work in Ireland are notably:

- Shortage of personnel, finances and resources;
- Decreased visibility of Gardai in the public arena and an increase in other crimes;
- Pressures in schools and educational institutions, where academic work, preparation for examinations or skills for the workplace are given priority over social education;
- Advanced age of the Religious Congregations involved in this work where no remuneration is available to attract younger people requiring paid employment.

180) <http://immigrantcouncil.ie/pages/publications>

181) Stop Traffick www.stoptraffick.ie

182) <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-northern-ireland-30805990> 14 January 2015

Laws of the country

While Ireland has ratified the EU directives and has enacted some laws – The Illegal Immigrants (Trafficking) Act 2000; The Criminal Law (Human Trafficking) Act 2008; The Criminal Law (Human Trafficking) (Amendment) Act 2013 – efforts are being made to fulfil Victims' Directive 2012/29/EU, which speaks of the opportunity to address the rights of victims. The Directive gives minimum rights, supports and protection to all victims of crime. In particular it requires that certain information be provided to victims on their first contact with the Gardaí.

It is also compliant with the European directives regarding asylum, temporary visas, and work permits granted to victims as seen in the amended Criminal Law (Human Trafficking) Act 2013. This law expanded the definition of human trafficking to include forcing a person to engage in an activity that constitutes an offence and as such acknowledges that victims may be exploited through criminal activities.

GRETA (The Council of Europe's Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings) considers that the Irish authorities should take further steps to ensure that national action to combat trafficking in human beings is comprehensive, and in particular to:

- Further involve NGOs and other members of civil society in the development and implementation of anti-trafficking policy, including evaluation of anti-trafficking efforts.
 - Strengthen action to combat trafficking in human beings for the purpose of labour exploitation, in particular in the sectors of domestic service, construction, entertainment, hotels and restaurants, care homes and agriculture.
 - Pay increased attention to prevention and protection measures addressing the particular vulnerability of children to trafficking and ensure that the best interests of the child are fully taken into account.¹⁸³
- Recommendations by GRETA to be submitted by 7 October 2015.

Rights of Victims

The reflection and recovery period for victims is 60 days. This time is given to allow victims' recovery and escape from the influences of alleged perpetrators so that the person can make an informed decision to co-operate with Gardaí and other relevant authorities. This can progress to six months and can be renewed as deemed necessary. The Government of Ireland fully complies with the minimum standards for the elimination of human trafficking according to the TIP report.¹⁸⁴

Prevention

An Garda Síochána in their Annual Policing Plan 2015 identify trafficking in human beings as one of their priorities, with increased priority given to prevention and detection of human trafficking. It has been identified as a policing priority since 2009.¹⁸⁵

According to Eurostat figures, 58.3 % of Ireland's population lives in semi-detached housing, one of the highest in the 28 Member States along with Netherlands and the UK, yet a major root cause for trafficking is poverty in all its guises. There are 756,591 people living in relative poverty in Ireland. Since the 2008 recession, the proportion of people in consistent poverty has risen by 83%. One in ten people is living in food poverty, relying on charitable food banks.¹⁸⁶

183) http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/Docs/CommitteeParties/Recommendations/CP_2013_9_IRL_en.pdf

184) US TIP Report, 2015 <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243559.pdf> page 192

185) <http://www.blueblindfold.gov.ie/website/bbf/bbfweb.nsf/page/irelandsresponse-criminaljusticere-sponse-en>

186) <http://www.independent.ie/irish-news/one-in-ten-irish-living-in-poverty-29839806.html>

The Combat Poverty Agency¹⁸⁷ – part of the Department of Social Protection - is working for a poverty-free Ireland. The unemployment rate in Ireland in April 2014 was 11.70%. It showed a decrease on the previous year (13.9% in 2013) according to the Statistics Year book for 2014 released by the Central Statistics Office.¹⁸⁸ The 2014 Action Plan for Jobs – set up by the government Department of Jobs, Enterprise and Innovation – aims to build on the significant progress which has occurred in job creation since the first Action Plan was launched in February 2012.

The latest official statistics on employment and unemployment in Ireland (from CSO QNHS Quarter 4 2014) show that total employment increased by 29,100 in 2014, bringing total employment to 1.938 million (seasonally adjusted 1.927 million). There was an increase in full-time employment of 39,600 in the year (2014) and a decrease in part-time employment of 10,500. This points to a significant strengthening of the labour market and increased confidence on the part of employers in their recruitment. Over the period since the launch of the Action Plan for Jobs at the beginning of 2012, 90,000 net additional jobs have been created in the Irish economy. The rate of unemployment (using the CSO Standardised Unemployment Rate) was 10.0% in March 2015, down from a high of 15.1% in February, 2015. According to the Live Register figures, the unemployment rate has declined for 19 consecutive months.¹⁸⁹ Agencies such as Irish Development Association (IDA), Enterprise Ireland and the new Local Enterprise Offices together support the creation of new jobs throughout the country.

Prosecutions and Convictions

The Bill to establish the Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission was passed on 21 March 2014. Under the equality legislation, discrimination, based on any one of nine distinct grounds, is unlawful. These grounds are: gender; civil status; family status; sexual orientation; religion; age; disability; race; the indigenous Traveller community.

‘Operation Quest’¹⁹⁰ was launched with the aim of identifying potential victims of human trafficking. The focus is on securing convictions against individuals involved in organising prostitution, brothel keeping and associated offences, including money laundering. The operation so far resulted in the search of over 100 premises (mainly apartments, flats and houses) in the Republic of Ireland. The Garda operation, which involves over 200 Gardaí, was led by members of the Organised Crime Unit based at the National Bureau of Criminal Investigation, supported by officers from all Garda regions.

The investigation team liaise with Europol, Interpol, the PSNI, the Human Trafficking Central Investigations Bureau, Warsaw, and the Serious Organised Crime Agency (SOCA) in the UK. A confidential phone line enables members of the public to give information to the Gardaí. RTE News reported on 26 September 2013 that “Ireland may be underestimating the number of people who are being illegally trafficked into the country, according to the first review of the State’s compliance with an anti-trafficking convention.”

The following information was submitted by the Anti Human Trafficking Unit, Dublin¹⁹¹ – data in the 2013 report.¹⁹² The key information set out in the report is that of the 44 victims:

187) www.combatpoverty.ie/

188) <http://www.cso.ie/en/releasesandpublications/ep/p-syi/statisticalyearbookofireland2014/>

189) <https://www.djei.ie/en/Publications/Publication-files/Action-Plan-for-Jobs-First-Progress-Report.pdf>

190) www.garda.ie/Controller.aspx?Page=9344 a co-ordinated operation of An Garda Síochána and the Police Service of Northern Ireland set up to carry out a large number of searches across both jurisdictions, 29 May 2012.

191) [http://www.blueblindfold.gov.ie/website/bbf/bbfweb.nsf/page/RADN-9YMDQE10585921-en/\\$File/Report%202013.pdf](http://www.blueblindfold.gov.ie/website/bbf/bbfweb.nsf/page/RADN-9YMDQE10585921-en/$File/Report%202013.pdf)

192) <http://www.blueblindfold.gov.ie/website/bbf/bbfweb.nsf/page/keystats-en>

Types of human trafficking:	29 cases of sexual exploitation 11 cases of labour exploitation 3 uncategorised / 1 case of labour and sexual exploitation / 3 cases of other exploitation
Gender	33 females / 11 males
Age profile:	28 adults 16 minors
Origin (Nationality)	Ireland 12 (<i>11 minors of sexual exploitation and 1 adult of labour</i>) 11 Western Africa / 9 from EU / 12 from other regions.

Figures for 2014 were released by the Government for the TIP Report 2015.

Authorities initiated investigations of 79 new trafficking-related cases in 2014 (an increase from 56 in 2013). 40 investigations did not result in the identification of trafficking victims, while the other 39 cases involved a total of 46 suspected victims. The majority of suspected victims in these cases were identified in sexual exploitation.

Authorities investigated cases involving:

- 7 suspected victims of labour trafficking;
- 4 suspected victims of forced criminality;
- 1 suspected victim of forced begging, and
- 1 Irish suspected victim of both sex and labour trafficking.

Authorities identified 45 suspected trafficking victims in 2014, compared with 44 in 2013. Of the 45 suspected victims 13 were children. Countries of Origin:

- 15 suspected victims were from Romania;
- 8 from Brazil;
- 8 from Ireland;
- and the rest –14 – from Eastern Europe, Africa, and South Asia.

While the majority of individuals – 32 – were potential victims of sexual exploitation,

- 7 were potentially exploited in labour trafficking;
- 4 in forced criminal activity;
- 1 in forced begging;
- 1 in both sex and labour trafficking.

Authorities did not report how many suspected victims were ultimately confirmed to be trafficking victims.¹⁹³ An examination of data between 2009 and 2013 reveals that the yearly decline in the number of alleged victims from outside of the EU, noted in previous Reports, appears to have ceased, with a slight, though statistically insignificant, rise in 2013. Given the limitations of the available data on human trafficking it is difficult to say to what extent this decline is associated with more general Irish migration trends or some other phenomenon, including the clandestine nature of the activity.

193) <http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/countries/2015/243459.htm> Ireland. Accessed August 2015

Brian Killoran, Chief Executive of the Immigrant Council, said:

“This is a key moment for Ireland in its battle to combat human trafficking as the Government is about to make crucial policy and legislative decisions. The 2015 TIP Report must feed into that process, together with reports by the OSCE and the Council of Europe, which have all been critical of Ireland for failing to provide safe accommodation and supports for victims.

As a frontline organisation and Independent Law Centre which in the past year supported and represented 19 women who were trafficked here to be sexually exploited we know at first hand that this is a trade which thrives on misery. It is important that Ireland has robust measures in place to protect the vulnerable while at the same time wrecking the business model which has made our country attractive to pimps and traffickers.”¹⁹⁴

GRETA visited Ireland in May 2015 to assess the State’s efforts to combat human trafficking. This report has not yet been published. In 2013, a GRETA report found flaws in Ireland’s identification of trafficking victims, noted the lack of prosecutions for trafficking, and recommended that the Irish authorities strengthen efforts to tackle trafficking for labour exploitation.

The Migrant Rights Centre Ireland (MRCI), which supports victims of trafficking and campaigns for stronger identification and protection of victims, has welcomed the visit as an opportunity to highlight ongoing problems.¹⁹⁵

The TIP Report 2015 recommends:

- Implement the trafficking law to ensure sex and labour traffickers are held accountable through convictions and dissuasive sentences;
- Increase efforts to identify and protect victims of labour trafficking and forced criminality, ensuring victims are not penalised for crimes committed as a result of being subjected to trafficking;
- Establish multi-stakeholder case reviews during the victim identification process, involving service providers and anti-trafficking law enforcement units;
- Increase funding for and provision of specialised victim services in partnership with NGOs;
- Offer specialised emergency accommodation and use of apartments and houses with outreach support to victims; publish the second national action plan;
- Enable and encourage all trafficking victims to access available legal services;
- Amend the law to authorise asylum seekers who are also identified victims to obtain work permits.¹⁹⁶

RENATE Network

Through the inter-congregation group APT, 20 Religious Congregations are affiliated to RENATE. Possibilities for training, sharing best practice, capacity building – some of which are already in place – could be extended through the Conference of Religious of Ireland (CORI) to include membership of other congregations. Recommendations from the 2015 US TIP report set out some of the challenges for both APT and RENATE.

194) <http://immigrantcouncil.ie/pages/articles/2015> Accessed September 2015

195) <http://www.mrci.ie> Accessed September 2015

196) <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243559.pdf> page 192. Assessed September 2015

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS – in appreciation of:

Authors: Sr Pat Kenny, Religious Sister of Charity, Sr Eilis Coe, RSC

CONTRIBUTORS

Sr Mary Mangan, SJM, Sisters of the Sacred Hearts of Jesus and Mary,
Members of Ruhama and APT Ireland.

Barra O’Duill, Dept of Justice and Equality, Ireland. The compilation of the report was aided by current report and websites available online as well as contact with those involved directly with women, men and children who have been trafficked into, within and out of the Republic of Ireland.

Immigrant Council of Ireland 2011 – LIVING IN LIMBO: Migrants’ Experiences of Applying for Naturalisation in Ireland

Immigrant Council of Ireland 2014 – STOP TRAFFIK: Tackling Demand for Sexual Services of Trafficked Women and Girls

Anti-Human Trafficking Unit 2012 – Services for Victims of Child Trafficking

The Religious Sisters of Charity – ‘Breaking the Silence’ report 2012

Act to Prevent Trafficking www.aptireland.org

Anti-Human Trafficking Unit www.blueblindfold.gov.ie

Immigrant Council of Ireland www.immigrantcouncil.ie

Migrant Rights Centre, Ireland www.mrci.ie

Ruhama www.ruhama.ie

Stop Traffick www.stoptraffick.ie



Working Board Versailles



Versailles 2014



RENATE members on a outing in Albania March 2015



Renate Core Group Planning the Action in The Netherlands



Renate field work in the Roma Camp



Renate Croatia Board Meeting 2013



RENATE Board Meeting Albania



Versailles Working Board



Training in Social Teaching of the Church Slovakia 2013



Sr Stanka with Pope Francis at The Youth Symposium at The Vatican 2014



Romania Labour Training 2014



Vatican Conference November 2013



Romania RENATE Training Labour Trafficking 2014



Members working in the RENATE Tent Katholikentag Regensburg



RENATE Presence at the EU Civil Society Anti Trafficking Platform 2



Sr Iva in process of RENATE Film Making 2015

ITALY

US TIP Report Rating: Tier 1

“Italy is a destination, transit, and source country for women, children, and men subjected to sex trafficking and forced labour. Victims originate from Nigeria, Romania, Morocco, China, and other countries. Female victims are often subjected to sex trafficking in Italy after accepting promises of employment as waitresses, dancers, singers, models, or caregivers. Eastern European women and girls are forced into prostitution by Romanian and Albanian criminal groups. Nigerian women and girls are subjected to sex and labour trafficking through debt bondage and coercion through voodoo rituals. Experts estimate approximately 2,500 children are exploited in street prostitution. Men from Africa, Asia, and Eastern Europe are subjected to forced labour through debt bondage in agriculture in southern Italy and in construction, house cleaning, hotels, and restaurants in the north. Chinese men and women are forced to work in textile factories in Milan, Prato, and Naples. Children subjected to sex trafficking, forced begging, and forced criminal activities are from Romania, Nigeria, Brazil, Morocco, and Italy, particularly Romani and Sinti boys who may have been born in Italy. Transgender individuals from Brazil and Argentina are forced into prostitution in Italy. Unaccompanied children are at risk of trafficking, particularly boys from Somalia, Eritrea, Bangladesh, Egypt, and Afghanistan, who often work in shops, bars, restaurants, and bakeries to repay smuggling debts or send money to their families. Official complicity in human trafficking crimes occurs at the local level.”¹⁹⁷



Italy (map),¹⁹⁸ a long boot-shaped peninsula, located in southern Europe, comprises the southern side of the Alps and the large plain of the Po Valley. Several islands form part of Italy, including the larger islands of Sicily and Sardinia. The 7,600 km coastline on the Adriatic Sea, Ionian Sea, Tyrrhenian Sea, Ligurian Sea, Sea of Sardinia and Strait of Sicily make it open to pirate boats and give many access points into the country. Corsica, although belonging to the Italian geographical region, has been a part of France since 1769. Italy is bound by France, Switzerland, Austria, and Slovenia to the north. In 1949 Italy became one of the 12 founding countries of NATO. It is also a member of the EU and adopted the Euro as its currency in January 1999.

From its geographical location, surrounded by many seas, its porous ‘open’ borders enable relatively ‘easy’ entry into the country, which in turn facilitates and fuels illegal migration on a large scale. This also gives ‘easy access’ to those who seize opportunities to ply their ‘trade’ in the sale of people – the phenomenon of human trafficking – as traffickers make use of the many routeways into the country to carry out the sale of human persons.

Since compiling this report, the crisis in the Mediterranean has increased the numbers of those reaching Italy, among those smuggled are suspected trafficked victims. Frontex¹⁹⁹ has been documenting the movements of migrants, as outlined in its first quarterly report, January – March, 2015

197) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243559.pdf> - Accessed 10 August 2015

198) <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook>

199) European Agency for the Management of Operational cooperation at the External Borders of the Member States of the EU

However, there is no certainty, no data as to numbers trafficked for either labour or sexual exploitation. In the first seven months of 2014, more than 87,000 people arrived in Italy by sea, mainly from Eritrea and the Syrian Arab Republic (Syria). More than 300,000 migrants have risked their lives trying to cross the Mediterranean to Europe so far this year (2015), according to the UN. This compares with 219,000 for the whole of 2014. Nearly 200,000 people have landed in Greece since January this year (2015), while another 110,000 made it to Italy.²⁰⁰

Four people were arrested on suspicion of facilitating the trafficking of two minors into the European Union as part of the first phase of Joint Operation VEGA Children 2015 carried out by Frontex. During the operation that took place at nine EU airports from 12 June to 8 July, teams including border guards and experts from five international organisations and NGOs worked together to help combat the plight of child trafficking.²⁰¹

The author of this report, Sister Monica Chikwe-som, Suore Ospedaliere della Misericordia, (Hospitaler Sisters of Mercy), cites an example of a victim's journey from Nigeria as follows:

“The majority of the victims who come from Nigeria leave their homeland and at first they trek through the desert to get to Libya. Here in Libya they stay for a number of months. Often, at this stage, traffickers use them for prostitution and/or ‘slave’ labour. In some cases, traffickers will then pay for them to be transported via boat to Italy. Traffickers will give their victims instructions as to how to claim asylum on arriving to Italy. When victims have been granted asylum, traffickers will put them to ‘work’ on the streets again and this time without any fear of arrest from the police.”²⁰²

According to data provided by Italy's Ministry of the Interior, arrivals by sea for the months January through April 2015 were 26,228, a trend generally in line with arrivals for the same period in 2014, when 26,644 migrants were registered. In May 2015, the International Organisation for Migration (IOM) estimated that arrivals had reached approximately 8,270, bringing the total number of arriving migrants as of 7 May to approximately 34,570. What is striking about the data IOM has gathered is the growing number of lives lost at sea. While last year the number of migrants perishing in all Mediterranean crossings during the period January through April was 96, this year's tally is an estimated 1,770 drownings through 30 April 2015.

IOM estimates that the total migrant deaths from Mediterranean crossings stand at 1,829, compared with 207 through 7 May 2014. This year, 2015, the smugglers' modus operandi also seems to have changed: migrants are now arriving in larger numbers in a considerably shorter time frame. The main countries of origin this year, 2015, are Eritrea (5,388), Somalia (3,717), Nigeria (2,789), Gambia (2,099) and Syria (2,091).²⁰³ Italy registered 153,075 migrants that entered the country by sea, of which 16,839 were women. They are mainly from Syria (36,351), Eritrea (33,872), Mali (8,899) Nigeria (8,031), Gambia (6,787), Palestine (5,044), and Somalia (4,965).

According to OSCE (Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe) Italy is a destination, transit, and source country for women, children, and men who are subjected to sex trafficking, forced labour and other forms of exploitation. Victims come from many countries, though migration from the southern rim of the Mediterranean region is a major and long-standing phenomenon.²⁰⁴ The country does not have enough job opportunities for its inhabitants as 678,000 currently are unemployed, among them a high proportion of young people. At the time of this mapping, Italy had not adopted any National Action Plan against human trafficking.

200) <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-europe-24583286> accessed August 2015

201) <http://frontex.europa.eu/news/>accessed August 2015

202) From the International Organisation for Migration (IOM) statistic from January to 31 of October 2014.

203) <https://www.iom.int/news/iom-call-international-investigation-mediterranean-shipwreck-deaths>

204) OSCE July 2014

Victims

In Italy, IOM has established two anti-trafficking teams in order to identify victims of human trafficking to rescue them. The aim is to inform them of their rights and to seek their cooperation in holding traffickers to account so as to bring a case for prosecution. IOM is also engaged in repatriation of victims. From the investigation carried out in Italy, trafficked victims are mainly engaged in:

- Prostitution (brothels, street, clubs);
- Agriculture;
- Begging;
- Domestic servitude/Violence;
- Illegal adoption;
- Working in factories;
- Drug transactions;
- Organ harvesting.

Although there are laws on migration and the protection of victims and also for prosecution of traffickers, there are many instances where the law is neither implemented nor enforced.

Case Studies - Interviews with Victims ²⁰⁵

The following stories were told to the author of this report. ²⁰⁶

EM, a Nigerian woman who was brought to Italy at the age of 14, was sold by an uncle to a human trafficker. She was forced into street prostitution, but eventually was rescued by police and placed in a facility for minors. When she was trafficked to Italy, Mercy lost contact with her family for six years. Sisters in Nigeria were able to reunite her with her mother over the phone. A year later she was assisted with a visit to her family to celebrate Christmas.

YJ, 19 years old, the first of eight children, left her home in Nigeria with the aim of earning enough money to send her brothers to school. During her journey to Italy, she was raped and became pregnant. For six months she was forced to work on the streets to pay a debt bond of 40,000 EUR, contracted without her knowledge by criminal organisations. She hid her pregnancy, and it was only due to the consistent intervention of an 'Outreach Unit' of lay people and women religious that she was helped to leave the street. She was welcomed in one of the many 'shelters', where she was given care and refuge. She gave birth to a baby girl.

AG, 22 years old, was working 'on the streets' in Italy to pay off a large debt bond. In Nigeria, one of the ways in which traffickers maintain 'control' of their victims is through performing 'voodoo rituals' which have a very powerful hold over them. In this way, victims can inadvertently 'swear allegiance' to their trafficker. Gloria met a 38-year-old Italian man who 'fell in love with her' and wanted to take her to his home. She refused him and his advances. As punishment for turning him down, he threw her from a bridge and her lifeless young body was found the next day.

YM 23 years old with a seven-month-old child, was forced by a trafficker to 'swallow' drugs and to deliver them to the trafficker's client. She refused at first but was threatened to do this or face the prospect of her child being killed. With such a difficult choice, she swallowed the drugs. On her way to deliver the package, she was detained by the police and eventually sent to prison. Despite offering to cooperate with the police, no action was taken by them to arrest and imprison the perpetrators. ²⁰⁷

205) Real names are changed to protect the victims

206) Sister Monica Chikwe-som, Member of RENATE, working with victims of human trafficking in conjunction with USMI (Italian Union of Major Superiors) and UCESM (Union of the European Conferences of Major Superiors).

207) Sister Monica Chikwe-som. Interviews, 2014

Traffickers

Traffickers 'supply' a growing 'demand' from users and clients of sexual services and cheap labour. They use every possible strategy and method to meet that demand with a constant supply. In Italy the age of users and clients of sexual services ranges from 18 to 70 and they come from all walks of life. In short, there is no one typical profile! Seventy per cent of the users and clients (men mainly) are either married or live with a partner. When a 'supply' is not available in the country, foreigners are targeted with 'offers' of good jobs. One of the methods used by traffickers is to pose as a 'saviour' or 'philanthropist' wanting to help young women to have a future in a new country. Often the trafficker is a close relative – and even a mother wanting to earn money will unwittingly 'sell' her daughter into a better life without being aware of the consequences.

Some examples of deceptions are as follows:

- In Nigeria traffickers will promise favourable job opportunities abroad, the possibility to go to university. Before taking them overseas, they will take their victim to the 'voodoo' shrine and ask them to swear allegiance. These become known as the 'voodoo' women. In this way, traffickers can keep them enslaved.
- In some countries of Eastern Europe, for example Romania, a common ploy is through false marriages.
- In China, some are offered job opportunities in factories; they work a full 24 hours. They are poorly paid. To supplement their income, some are engaged in prostitution.

Responses to human trafficking in Italy

This research took into consideration samples of some interventions that various actors in Italy are doing at different levels to prevent, protect and denounce this scourge. Sister Monica Chikwe-com, author of this report, visited shelters and interviewed some victims present there.

This is one account of a Chinese woman who came to work in Italy:

"My name is Yen. I come from the province of Zhejiang, eastern China. My family consists of my elderly parents, my two brothers who are unmarried and myself. I decided to come to Italy because I was not earning enough to support my family. I heard from my Chinese friends, already in Italy, that they are looking for workers in the factories and they are paying well.

So I borrowed some money and booked my air tickets and landed in Milano. From there I took a train and arrived in Prato. There I met my friends, who quickly introduced me to the owner of a big garment factory in Prato. He gave me a job, told me what my salary would be and the conditions of work. I was to work 7 days a week, with no days off. In one part of the factory, I was given a bed and a cupboard to store my personal things. I was with the other women working in the factory. I was told that the owner would provide food for us and other personal needs but we were not free to go out as and when we liked. After 3 months, my tourist visa expired, which meant I became an illegal migrant in Italy. From then on I could not go out without the fear of being caught by the police, so I stayed mostly in the factory. My work was 8am till 8pm.

I stopped for my meals and sometimes for a little chit chat with my fellow workers. Sometimes when there were urgent orders for our factory's products, we had to work even later into the night, on night shifts. I helped to sew different garments, and sometimes my hands bled with so much sewing with the machine. But I still went on because I needed to have enough money to send back to China to my family. Gradually, I saved quite a bit and sometimes I manage to sneak out later in the evening, to buy something nice for myself, like clothing, shoes or accessories. Occasionally, the police would come to check the factory. My boss would inform us beforehand (maybe after bribing the police), and we would all hide in one section of the building so that the police could not find us.

However, we were also aware that our Italian neighbours around the factory might notice us, so we avoided going out in big groups, always in twos or at most three of us. Because we didn't speak Italian, we were unable to communicate with anyone except with our Chinese friends. Sometimes when we fell ill, we just rested on our beds, took Chinese medicine and, hopefully, recovered. We dared not go to the Italian doctor or hospital unless for an emergency.

One day the police came without warning. I was one of those arrested, together with three other men, and taken to Ponte Galeria. I did not have proper documents. I could only bring with me my cell phone and some money. I had little else, not even an extra piece of clothing. Then I heard that the three Chinese men were released after a few days, but I was to stay in Ponte Galeria for as long as 6 months. During this time, I was unable to send any money home to China. I was very worried, especially because my mother was not well. I called her on my cell phone but I dared not tell my family that I was being locked up in Ponte Galeria prison. I lied that my boss was having some problem with money, and had not been giving me my pay but I would send money the moment I got some. Sometimes I was so anxious I got headaches and even heart pain, but I could not do anything.

I didn't understand why I was treated like a criminal and locked up for so long when I did not do anything wrong except enter the country without a proper document. My Chinese boss was not willing to apply for proper visas for all his workers because it would mean that he had to pay the 'normal' wages to all of us according to Italian law, in addition to holidays and other benefits. Instead he paid us at a lower rate minus the holidays and benefits and hoped to maintain a lower cost, to sell his products more cheaply.

When we are arrested, the boss will be fined by the police and the factory will stop for a while. But when he pays the fine (maybe bribing the police to restart his factory), he will continue to employ other workers. While I know that I am working illegally in Italy, I am still willing to do so because the money I earn here in Euro is much more than money I can earn back in China. My only worry about getting caught is being sent back to China when I have not yet paid back the loan I had taken to make the trip to Italy. Even though life is harsh for me in Italy, I still feel that it is my only chance to earn enough to feed my family.”²⁰⁸

Church, faith groups, ngos responding to human trafficking

Human trafficking in Italy is a massive problem, engaging a wide range of church and faith networks – Caritas and Migrantes, Religious Congregations, lay associations, foundations, NGOs, GDP, IOM and Government – all intervening at different levels. The Church through its organisation has contributed much to the rescue, rehabilitation and reintegration of victims as well as condemning the inhuman acts of the traffickers. Associations such as Papa Giovanni XXIII, parishes and some religious groups go onto the streets to rescue the victims. Pope Francis has called this a 'crime against humanity.' On the 2 December 2014 leaders of different faith denominations came together in the Vatican to sign a declaration calling for an end to this modern day slavery.

“Inspired by our confessions of faith, we are gathered here today for an historical initiative and to take concrete action: to declare that we will work together to eradicate the terrible scourge of modern slavery in all its forms. The physical, economic, sexual and psychological exploitation of men, women and children that is currently inflicted on tens of millions of people constitutes a form of dehumanisation and humiliation. Every human being, man, woman, boy and girl, is made in God's image. God is the love and freedom that is given in interpersonal relationships and every human being is a free person destined to live for the good of others in equality and fraternity. Every person, and all people, are equal and must be accorded the same freedom and the same dignity. Any discriminatory relationship that does not respect the fundamental conviction that others are equal is a crime, and frequently an aberrant crime ...”²⁰⁹

208) Interview with Sister Monica Chikwe-som, 2014

209) <http://www.news.va/en/news/religious-leaders-gathered-in-the-vatican-for-the-eradication-of-modern-slavery>

Casa Rut in Caserta²¹⁰ (Ruth's House) is run by Italian sisters as a cooperative where girls are sheltered and empowered through the acquisition of skills which lead them to financial autonomy.

Association UnAnima Onlus.²¹¹

This organisation deals with social reintegration through education, learning the Italian language, helping to get jobs, renting houses, enabling victims to live as independently as possible, and to be responsible and capable of managing their lives. The Association has its shelter in Via Merulana in Rome. It provides for the victims through a personalised project, legal, medical, psychological, educational, guidance, job placement through training, job search and, finally, the house in which to live. It also runs a home for semi-autonomy, accompanying women towards independence and full autonomy. Since its foundation in 2009 the Association have helped, empowered and reintegrated about 25 women, many non-Italian.

The Association has about a dozen volunteers, including nuns from different congregations. The Association is funded by donations and small projects targeted to assist the women gain their independence, particularly through employment. autonomy of the women, such as job placement. It welcomes 6 women at any one time. Association 'Slaves no More'²¹² is an Italian association created in 2012 and involved in combating human trafficking for sexual exploitation, and all forms of violence, abuse and discrimination suffered by women.

'Slaves no More' works in the field of information and prevention, liberation and empowerment of women marginalised and deprived of their dignity and legality. More importantly, it is committed to social-professional reintegration, through specific projects, both in Italy and in the countries of migrant women. The association works with other groups, organisations and associations both in Italy and in countries of origin, transit and destination of trafficked women. Its aim is to give a future to young women who have been deprived of their dignity, freedom and any prospect of a decent life. It is engaged in voluntary repatriation and social reintegration of victims who willingly agree to go back to their country of origin in a dignified way. The association has a personal project for each victim depending on what is opted for and the association pays airfare, sponsors the project, and rents a house for the victim for a period of two years until she is capable of taking care of herself. This is done in collaboration with a congregation of sisters in the country of origin – sisters who are engaged in combating human trafficking. This project is sponsored by Caritas Italy.

The social cooperative be free²¹³

It works through its professional lawyers to help the victims of trafficking procure legal documents and prepare them for possible denouncement of their traffickers.

Law enforcement

The Government enforces article 18 for the protection of victims and the Criminal Code for sanctioning, confiscation of property, prosecution and imprisonment of traffickers.

210) <http://www.globalsistersreport.org/news/trafficking/italian-convents-act-safe-houses-trafficking-portal>

211) The Association UnANIMA Onlus is a non-profit organization founded in 2009 to address the problems of women victims of violence and abuse. The ultimate goal is to accompany them towards a renewed autonomy of life.

212) <http://www.slavesnomore.it/english>

213) The anti-violence service SOS DONNA H 24 of Rome Capital, run by social cooperative *Be free* since January 2010, is a service that welcomes women victims of domestic violence, including rape, and supports them to escape from violence done to them by traffickers.

Intervention of religious congregations

Women Religious in Italy were the first to sense this issue of human trafficking as a problem in the early 1980s and immediately started to put into action ‘the creativity of charity’ by welcoming victims into their convents in an effort to help them regain their freedom and dignity, and to reintegrate them into society. Their first response was primarily for women victims of prostitution, domestic servitude and violence. Human trafficking victims were among them.

At the time of this research there are over 250 Religious Congregations in Italy involved in this rescue and anti-trafficking, with approximately 110 ‘shelters’ or safe houses where rescued women and children are welcomed and helped to restore their lives following great traumas.

Women Religious in Italy, in collaboration with other women’s congregations in countries of origin and transit, have responded to trafficking in human beings by networking and collaborating together. RENATE Network is an example of such a network, making links with different congregational groups as well as collaborating with NGOs.

Below is an overview of the main intervention work done in support of women who have been trafficked into Italy:

- Outreach Units – serving as a ‘first contact’ with the victims on the streets.
- Drop-In Centres to assist women who may need help and/or to identify the problems of women in search of assistance.
- Restoring Legal Status – assisting victims in the acquisition of documents for legal purposes.
- Safe Communities or Shelters for programmes of social reintegration.
- Professional/Vocational Preparation through language teaching and job training and acquiring skills which will enable the women to secure employment.
- Psychological and Spiritual Assistance to help victims rediscover their ‘cultural roots’ and faith, regaining their self-respect and confidence, and above all assisting them in healing the deep wounds of their traumatic experiences.
- Weekly visits to the centre of identification and expulsion (in Rome), by a group of sisters from different congregations and nationalities. In total approximately 60 women Religious from 27 congregations and 28 different countries make visits for the pastoral care of immigrant women who have no legal documents to stay in Italy and often are awaiting deportation.
- Reacquiring of Identification Documents: Often a trafficker’s first violation against a victim is the theft of her legal documents – instantly making her ‘illegal’ and helpless in the country in which she has been trafficked.
- Educational Materials – to mark the 10-year anniversary of the USMI Counter-Trafficking Office 2000, a dossier and a DVD highlighting the many steps taken to assist several thousand victims regain their freedom, their identity, their legality and their dignity as women with a role and a mission to accomplish in their family, in society and in the Church was launched.²¹⁴
- Educational Seminars – UISG/IOM Congresses were held in 2008, 2009, and 2011 for representatives of different networks of women Religious with the aim of creating a stronger international network involving and connecting national religious conferences and congregations dealing with this ministry.
- A world day of prayer and reflection against all forms of slavery and trafficking in humans was established for 8 February 2015, the feast day of Saint Bakhita, patron of trafficked women, who herself was sold into slavery in the Sudan and brought to Italy as a young woman, where eventually she regained her freedom and entered a women’s congregation. The aim of such a programme is to involve all Christian organisations worldwide in giving proper attention and consideration to this ‘vile trade’ in human persons.

214) <http://www.catholic-ew.org.uk/.../file/sr-eugenia-trafficking-rome-2012>

- Professional formation programmes organised from 2004 to 2011 in several countries for religious sisters dealing with counter trafficking in collaboration with UISG, IOM, and ICMC.
- Anti-trafficking educational kit for religious communities, seminaries, schools, parishes and youth groups, available in seven languages – English, Italian, Spanish, French, Portuguese, Polish, and Romanian – prepared by a working group on Counter-Trafficking in Women and Children of the JPIC Commission of the International Union of Superiors General (UISG/USG).
- An international training seminar, conducted in October 2007 in Rome by USMI, in collaboration with the U.S. Embassy to the Holy See, and financed by the U.S. Department of State's Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons (G/TIP), for 33 sisters from 26 different countries.²¹⁵

In the effort to fight this international crime of exploitation, women Religious have rescued more than 6,000 girls and young women from trafficking situations, from 2000 to 2014.

NETWORKS with European countries and outside Europe – mainly countries of origin:

Shelters in Benin City and Lagos: In 2007, as a result of direct cooperation between Italy and Nigeria, a Resource Centre for Women was officially opened – the first such shelter to be built in Nigeria and run by women Religious. It was fully funded by the Italian Bishops Conference (CEI) and run by the Nigerian Conference of Women Religious. The shelter is set up to benefit Nigerian victims of human trafficking who are either forcibly repatriated, or have simply chosen to return home for several reasons, including physical and/or mental illness. A new office, Lagos Bakitha Villa, was opened in 2009, while in 2011 a new shelter was started in Lagos, mainly to welcome, assist and reintegrate repatriated victims.²¹⁶

RENATE – (Religious in Europe Networking Against Trafficking and Exploitation)²¹⁷ is a network across Europe, established in March 2009, comprising women religious and co-workers, including EU and non-EU countries. Its first major conference was launched in Poland, September 2011, when approximately 100 participants from countries where women religious are involved in anti-trafficking work met to map together a plan of action that would effectively put an end to human trafficking.

Talitha Kum²¹⁸ is an international network of women religious from all over the world who are dealing with anti-trafficking as well as caring for victims and/or assisting in the rehabilitation and repatriation of victims. It was launched officially in June 2010 in Rome, during a seminar for sisters from different countries and congregations coming from all the five continents.

The interventions of the church, different associations, women religious, NGOs and governments are yielding some results as young women and girls are rescued from trafficking situations. Some are given legal status and/or reintegrated into society. However, there is still a long way to go and allowing for the high numbers of trafficked victims – often an underestimated figure – there are few who manage to be freed from a life of slavery. Those who return to any kind of normality are said to be few although there seems to be little data available.

While some traffickers are imprisoned, RENATE sees the importance of intervention, with the focus on

- Measures of prevention;
- Adequate migration laws;
- Signing of a memorandum of understanding on migration between the countries of origin, transit and destination to control and regulate unsafe migrations.

215) <https://humanchain.wordpress.com/2007/10/>

216) <http://www.cosudowlagos.org/home/index.php/component/content/.../79-history>

217) <http://www.renate-europe.net>

218) <http://www.talithakum.info>

Recommendations of TIP Report 2015:

- Increase convictions of traffickers, resulting in dissuasive sanctions.
- Improve efforts to screen irregular migrants and asylum seekers to identify possible trafficking victims, particularly in migrant reception and expulsion centres.
- Increase efforts to identify victims of domestic trafficking, specifically among children from minority populations forced into prostitution, begging, or crime.
- Provide appropriate services for labour trafficking victims and discourage demand for forced labour by increasing thorough labour inspections.
- Formalise victim identification and referral procedures and consistently train law enforcement and other officials on their proactive application; provide adequate long-term funding to NGOs assisting victims.
- Develop specialised services for child trafficking victims and expand accommodation for male victims.
- Establish a national coordination structure that involves all relevant public bodies and civil society organisations.
- Finalise and implement a national action plan.

Implement nationwide awareness-raising activities on all forms of trafficking.²¹⁹

RENATE Network believes that providing job opportunities in countries of origin empowers women to be self-sufficient and to follow through on their education; it equips them to earn an income that will sustain them and their families, and fight corruption and injustice while working for equal rights and equal opportunities for women and girls - all of which will go towards stemming the tide of those who seek opportunities beyond their own countries, believing 'success' lies in this direction while often falling prey to the deception of the trafficker.

Finally, teaching about respect for each person is crucial, especially for young people in countries where the majority of victims are found. While good international laws and the co-operation of international police forces are of paramount importance, without the will to implement such laws and penalise the perpetrators, the 'sale' of human beings will continue.

RENATE continues to raise awareness in the public sphere as well as co-operate within and across borders to bring about change such that an end to trafficking and modern slavery can be achieved.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS – In appreciation of:

Author: Sr. Monica Chikwe-som, Suore Ospedaliere della Misericordia (HOSPITALIER SISTERS OF MERCY)

CONTRIBUTORS

Sr. Monica Owunali, OLA Congregation of Our Lady of the Apostle, who accompanied the author to interviews and to get information from organisations and Associations.

Sr. Rita Giaret in charge of 'Casa Ruth' for her prompt collaboration
Blessing and Magdalene for sharing their life experience.

Mr. Rodolfo Notaro, president of the Association UnAnima Onlus, and for enriching the research with ideas and action for victims.

Sr. Eugenia Bonetti, MC. Coordinator, Counter-Trafficking Office, Italian Union of Major Superiors (USMI) for her support. Sr Eugenia moved to Rome in 2000 to work with the Italian Union of Major Superiors (USMI), and to set up an anti-trafficking office there. In doing that work she connected, networked, and helped over 250 people working already in over 70 congregations around the country to provide victim support and services. Her position is primarily meant for the trafficking of women and minors, mostly for sex trafficking.

²¹⁹) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243559.pdf> - Accessed 10 August 2015

LATVIA

US TIP Report Rating: Tier 2

“Latvia is a source and destination country for women and children subjected to sex trafficking and a source and destination country for women, men, and children subjected to forced labour. Latvian women and girls are subjected to sex trafficking within Latvia as well as in other parts of Europe. Latvian men, women, and children are subjected to forced labour within Latvia, as well as in other parts of Europe, particularly in construction and agricultural sectors. Latvian women recruited for brokered marriages in Western Europe, particularly Ireland, are vulnerable to sex trafficking, domestic servitude, and forced labour.



The Government of Latvia does not fully comply with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking; however, it is making significant efforts to do so. The Government significantly increased the budget for victim assistance and certified more victims, particularly men. It demonstrated strong prevention efforts through sponsoring awareness-raising activities and launched a working group to facilitate inter-ministerial and public-private coordination. Latvia continued to be a regional leader in identifying and preventing sham marriages that put women in highly vulnerable situations, including some cases of trafficking. However, these robust efforts were not matched in the Government’s fight against certain forms of trafficking, particularly Latvians subjected to labour trafficking abroad, as well as trafficking occurring within Latvia. Authorities have not initiated a labour trafficking investigation since 2009, and a Latvian court has never convicted a criminal defendant of labour trafficking. In 2013 and 2014, authorities identified no Latvian or foreign victims exploited within the country. The Supreme Court upheld a conviction and the trafficker was sentenced to prison; however, the number of prosecutions and convictions under the trafficking statute remained low, relative to the number of victims identified.”²²⁰

Territory and population

Latvia (map)²²¹ is situated on the eastern shore of the Baltic sea, sharing borders with Lithuania to the south, Estonia to the north, Russia to the east and Belarus to the southeast.

The area of Latvia totals 64,000 square kilometres, with 500 kilometres of coastline. The population is a little less than 2.5 million people, of which 58% are Latvian, 29% are Russian, and 4% Byelorussian. Ukrainians, Poles, Lithuanians, Jews and others reside in Latvia in few numbers. Population density rates within Latvia are low, with nearly half the country living in Riga or its environs. Riga is the largest city of the Baltic States, and represents an important financial, cultural, industrial, business and political centre for the region. Riga’s population totals about 1 million inhabitants, with the next largest towns being Daugavpils (112,000), Liepāja (86,000) and Jelgava (66,000).

The population is heavily weighted towards its younger population, with 69.6% between the ages of 15 and 64 and a mere 16.4% who are 65 years or older. This has encouraged a substantial movement of the population seeking opportunities beyond the borders. They intend to work hard, save what they can and send home wages to the household members who remain in Latvia.

220) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243560.pdf> - Accessed 14 August 2015

221) <http://eng.meeting.lv/latvia/latvia.php>) Map with appreciation to <https://www.google.co.uk/maps/place/Latvia/@56.8801729,24.6057484> accessed 12 March 2015

Languages

Latvian is the official language of the Republic of Latvia but the majority of the population over 20 were schooled in Russian. Both English and German are spoken to some degree, with English becoming increasingly common, and in places starting to find a place within the school curricula. However, more than a quarter of the population is Russian speaking, and up until independence in 1991 Russian was the dominant language of instruction in Latvia. The rights of Russian immigrants have become a highly contested issue since independence was secured from the USSR in 1991. Reforms in 2004 which now restrict the use of the Russian language in schools remain controversial and contested, and the country is now in a considerable state of transition in the languages which are spoken, which are notably generationally as well as ethnically diverse. With the advent of the Internet, English language skills have increased, however these are not yet fully established across the population. Latvian is now the official language for education, political discourse and the legislature.

Under tighter citizenship rules adopted in 2006, candidates who fail a Latvian language test three times will be denied citizenship; such people who are 'without citizenship', are neither entitled to vote nor to obtain an EU passport.

Religion

Latvia has no official State religion. Most of the population is Lutheran (37%), which acknowledges Latvia's close relationship with German-speaking populations in the past, with a Roman Catholic affiliation (at 33%), and Russian Orthodox (17%). Catholicism is practiced mostly in the eastern section of the country. In general Latvian society sees itself as tolerant of diversity across the Christian denominations and seems to be open to new religious ideas emerging from the Western Christian traditions. Although most people do not attend church, there is a widespread spirituality informing the opinion and the rites of passage followed by the population, although Christianity was suppressed during three-quarters of a century of Soviet rule.

Political system

According to the Constitution (Satversme), Latvia is a parliamentary republic in which the sovereign power belongs to the people, represented through a unicameral parliament (Saeima), with 100 members elected in general, equal, direct, secret and proportional elections for a four-year period. The United States established diplomatic relations with Latvia in 1922 following its independence in the years after World War I.

Latvia was annexed by the Soviet Union in 1940 during World War II. During the Soviet period Latvia underwent heavy industrialisation, and experienced a big influx of immigrants from other parts of the USSR, mainly Russia. Many ethnic Latvians maintain that this wave of immigration was part of a deliberate Soviet policy to dilute Baltic culture and destroy local national identity.

In 1991, Latvia claimed de facto independence, and international recognition followed with a swift and determined move to full incorporation into the European Union in May 2004. Since regaining its independence, Latvia has embraced democracy and the principles of a neo-liberal capitalist market as its way of developing a full participation into the global polity.

The Economy

The most important sectors of Latvia's economy in 2012 were wholesale and retail trade, transport, accommodation and food services (30.0%), industry (19.5%) and public administration, defence, education, human health and social work activities (14.0 %).

Latvia's main export partners are Russia, Lithuania and Estonia, while its main import partners are Lithuania, Germany and Russia. The significance of Russia in Latvia's economy also opens up opportunities for Russian organised crime groups to become involved in trafficking of human beings, where there is a pool of people seeking to improve their life opportunities through accessing work opportunities in the cities and fields of the European Union.

Large portions of the Latvian population have successfully taken advantage of the free movement of labour across the European Union which commenced in 2004, but was staggered across the Union with France and Germany delaying full labour movement incorporation under the Schengen agreement, implemented by Latvia in 2007. Liberalism in the sense of celebration of the free market, found in most of the post-socialist countries, emphasised individual success as the measure of social worth. There has been fast GDP growth, fuelled by consumption and mortgage loans rather than investment in longer-term industrial or technologically based enterprises. Hence Latvians' search for employment abroad as a means to repay mortgage loans at home which became unfeasible under the conditions which followed economic recession in the early 2000s and the second wave of recession from 2008 onwards.

Conditions which for many resident workers could appear unacceptable, with benefits and long-term contracts unavailable, are still for many Latvian 'guest workers' acceptable. To migrate for work for a short period of time, reach the target of cash they wanted to earn, and then return to Latvia to fulfil their dream in terms of buying a property or some other expensive purchases previously only dreamt of was what the goal of migration was designed to achieve. This high aspiration and low job security vector is precisely an opportunity which traffickers can exploit for a small but significant section of the populations in migration.

Some of this substantial outward migration of Latvians has been exploited by those who have trafficking networks in Europe, despite the legitimate entitlement of all Latvians to access the employment markets and opportunities of the wider economic union. In 2007 it was assessed that around 86,000 Latvians were working abroad in 2006. (Other studies showed that the relationship with the UK is surprisingly powerful, with an estimated 76,000 Latvians having worked in the UK between the four-year period of 2004 – 2008.)²²²

Furthermore, data from the Bank of Latvia (2010) on remittances being invested back into the country showed that around 50% of all migrant remittances (on average 244 million GBP per annum) came from the UK (131.5 million GBP, respectively). It is assumed that on average half of the British minimum wage is sent back to Latvia, and the other half is spent on the migrant worker's own daily expenses. The sheer volume of those involved in this migratory work schedule opens up the opportunity for trafficking exploitation for those inadequately protected at the recruitment stage of the process.

Migrant remittances in Latvia could amount to at the very minimum 1-2% of Latvia's GDP – a fact not lost on Latvian politicians and financiers alike.²²³ The cost of traffickers exploiting some of those in migration is expensive across the board. In fiscal terms there are the economic costs of investigation, of prosecution, of recovery of victims and the reintegration and resettlement of survivors, the lost remittances of those held in debt bondage swindled out of their earnings, and the as yet underestimated human cost of the physical and psychological exploitation Latvian citizens endure when trafficked; trauma and lost opportunities for their lives which can take a lifetime to resolve. It is not clear what percentage of those migrating have been trafficked. The continuation of trafficking exploitation after full incorporation of Latvia into the Schengen zone took some pundits by surprise. Both men and women can find themselves at risk of being sucked into debt bondage, sub-standard housing, and exploitative work arrangements which clearly move them into areas of high trafficking risk.

222) Hazans and Kaia, 2009

223) Ibid.

Efforts to educate the population as to the inherent risks of trafficking within this circulation have met with only limited success – although the fact that human trafficking exists in labour and sexual exploitation is increasingly understood by both public agencies and the wider population as public awareness campaigns are undertaken in relation to checking the credentials of recruitment agencies and the offers of work proffered by online and off-line contacts. Because of the lack of statistical data, it is difficult to assess the number of Latvians returned to the country or indeed to know the numbers that are trafficked.

GRETA considers that the Latvian authorities should continue their efforts to develop and maintain a comprehensive and coherent information system on trafficking in human beings by compiling reliable statistical data from all main actors and allowing disaggregation (concerning sex, age, type of exploitation, country of origin and/or destination, etc.). In this context, GRETA encourages the Latvian authorities to include statistical information on human trafficking victims collected by NGOs in the annual reports concerning THB. No research in the area of human trafficking has been commissioned by the Latvian authorities since 2007. GRETA notes that the National Programme for 2009-2013 does not envisage any research on trends, or on the scope and nature of THB in Latvia.

GRETA also considers that the Latvian authorities should conduct and support research on trafficking-related issues as an important source of information for future policy measures and for identifying areas where priority action is needed to prevent and combat human trafficking.²²⁴ GRETA considers that the Latvian authorities should step up their efforts to inform the general public about the problem of human trafficking in its various forms. On the common forms of human trafficking is through ‘sham marriages’

In January 2011 the NGO ‘Shelter Safe House’²²⁵ initiated a campaign entitled “Sham marriage - a trap!” which was supported by the Ministry of the Interior, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Riga City Council. The campaign emphasised possible risks related to marriages which do not serve the purpose of developing a family relationship and included a survey which assessed the awareness of society on this issue. The campaign activities concentrated on Latvia’s main travel hubs, such as Riga international airport.

According to the Ministry of Interior of the Republic of Latvia, the typical victim of human trafficking is 18-35 years old, female, with little or no education, constrained opportunities to access regular employment because of limited educational qualifications, and yet with a sustained motivation to improve their lives and those of their households. This makes them inured to considerable risks in seeking to improve their life quality, a quest which many pursue with grit and determination.

Structural factors are emphasised as a significant determinant for the presence of human trafficking in the Latvian economy and population with the general unemployment level of 22.3% in 2010, in the immediate wake of the global economic crash in 2008, which has only deepened with the loss of confidence in the Eurozone in the subsequent years. Latvia’s domestic economy is troubled by endemically low wages, irregular and unprotected employment patterns, and poor social and health care structures for those who find themselves without work. Thus, the number of potential victims of human trafficking has remained troublingly high, with the demography of those at risk capturing men and women of different ages, ethnicities and urban and rural areas. Now the issue of forced labour has come to the forefront.

224) GRETA - *Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings*, Report 2013 concerning the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by Latvia. 74
225) <http://www.patverums-dm.lv/en/about-us> established 2007 with the aim to develop support services to victims of human trafficking, legal immigrants, refugees...

According to GRETA report, the NGO “Shelter Safe House” has produced awareness-raising materials on the prevention of THB which are distributed in schools, professional education establishments, social care institutions and orphanages in Riga, Ikšķile, Lipupe and Jelgava. However, GRETA was informed by NGOs and representatives of public authorities that there is still insufficient knowledge of the nature of trafficking and the various forms of exploitation that it may involve. GRETA notes that the chapter on prevention of THB in the National Programme for 2009-2013 does not contain reference to any specific awareness-raising campaigns. GRETA considers that the Latvian authorities should step up their efforts to inform the general public about the problem of THB in its various forms.²²⁶

State Compliance with the Palermo Protocol

The Government of Latvia is seen by the US TIP report (2015) as not fully compliant with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking. However, it is seen as making some significant steps towards improving its performance. The Latvian Government does identify and provide care for victims exploited in labour and sex trafficking abroad. Latvian authorities have provided some victims with compensation and witness protection, which is to its credit as not many countries do the same. However, it has not identified any trafficking victims within Latvia for enrolment in the State assistance programme.

The Government demonstrated strong prevention efforts through:

- Sponsoring awareness-raising activities;
- Developing a comprehensive seven-year national action plan to combat trafficking;
- Applying new legal provisions targeting unscrupulous recruiters who arrange fraudulent marriages.

Regardless of the improved anti-trafficking response by Latvia’s State Police, other law enforcement and judiciary efforts have remained the Government’s weakest area, as officials prosecuted and convicted very few cases under the anti-trafficking statute.

Marta Association (NGO)²²⁷

One of RENATE’S potential partners in Latvia is the NGO the Marta Association. Mrs. Iluta Lace, the manager of Marta and Mrs. Annele Tetere, the policy coordinator, met with the RENATE research team to discuss the various opportunities and challenges currently presenting themselves in Latvia with regard to human trafficking. Established in 2000, the mission of ‘Marta’ is to promote women’s rights and the improvement of the socio-economic situation of Latvian women. The project’s objective is to identify and share good practice amongst European NGOs providing psychological and counselling services to women and children affected by a range of domestic abuse and exploitation. Marta Association has provided assistance, including legal and psychological support, to some 70 victims of trafficking over the last nine years.²²⁸ Women who find their way to Marta are typically referred to it by embassies abroad, NGOs and police.

However the organisation does not have enough resources to undertake outreach work, and thus are left guessing at the number of women within Latvia who remain trapped in the cycle of sexual exploitation and abuse, either having returned to Latvia from being trafficked abroad, or caught within domestic trafficking situations, or in locations where they are at risk of experiencing domestic abuse and exploitation, or other forms of gender-based violence. Marta Association conducts policy advocacy and monitors efforts to improve legislation and legal frameworks on issues of equality and violence against women, with work being undertaken in It has mounted awareness-raising campaigns to educate the public, law enforcement and social service providers on issues of concern to women.

226) GRETA - *Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings*, Report 2013 concerning the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by Latvia.

227) <http://www.annalindhfoundation.org/.../association-resource-centre-women-marta> Marta Association Resource Centre for Women “Marta”.

228) *Conversation with Mrs Tetere, policy coordinator of the Marta Association, Spring 2014.*

The main directions of the work:

- 1) To provide social services (lawyer, psychologist, psychotherapist, social worker, coaching specialist) for women in difficult life situations (domestic violence, sex trafficking, and prostitution);
- 2) To promote equality between women and men by making campaigns and providing policy advocacy;
- 3) Education (language studies – English, Latvian, as well as work with young boys and girls in the groups).²²⁹

According to Mrs. Iluta Lace:

“To be a woman or a girl in Latvia is to have limited choices. We are expected to be either ‘girlish women,’ women that never grow up and can’t make their own independent decisions, or ‘mothers/maidservants,’ women who cook and iron for their men, take care of children and men, bring home the money and are great lovers. Girls and women are viewed as sexual objects with low value placed on their lives. They tend to have low-paying jobs and every day many of them are recruited into prostitution for sexual exploitation. In Latvia, killing a woman or a girl is viewed as nothing special; their personal integrity is not considered an asset to society.”²³⁰

The Marta Association sets itself clearly against prostitution, with support for those who are caught within sexual exploitation and looking for alternatives to escape from this life of trauma, exploitation and societal ostracisation. The Marta Association advocates for the ‘Nordic’ model, profiling the client as the subject of attention to see their behaviour and practice change, and is actively looking for NGO partners in Latvia who might join their efforts to advocate for legislative change and leadership in the Government in this area in the future.

The local Bishop of Riga is Archbishop Zbignevs Stankevičs is supportive. Sister Hannah, congregation of the Dominican Sisters of Bethany, and RENATE member, now offers three rooms for women in crisis situations. Sometimes these are used by trafficked women, sometimes for women seeking to be re-integrated into their communities, and finding employment the other side of imprisonment. Another sister of the congregation finished her social work studies recently and it is hoped that she will be able to take a more active part role in anti-trafficking work.

Sister Hannah has made personal contact with the leader of a project called ‘safe house’, where one part of the work is to inform the youth about the risks of trafficking. Presently they concentrate on the so-called ‘Visa marriages.’²³¹ They have worked together when ‘safe house’ sends women to Sister Hannah when they are unable to provide shelter because of a range of complicated and difficult circumstances. Until now the congregation has been in a position to provide shelter to these women, but the hope is that when the sister who has qualified as a social worker is integrated into the team, more involvement in the work of anti-trafficking linked with RENATE will be possible.

One of the constraints identified by Sister Hannah is the difficulty with the English language – which currently operates as the ‘official’ language of RENATE for meetings, trainings and communications. Funding for English-language courses and additional training is seen as a way to enhance further involvement with RENATE Network, and to improve the interoperability of the network across Europe and beyond.

229) <http://www.annalindhfoundation.org/members/association-resource-centre-women-marta>

230) http://www.equalitynow.org/partner/iluta_lace

231) Visa marriages are marriages undertaken to secure EU citizenship and thus insert the marriage partner into the free movement of labour available in the Schengen zone.

Trafficking victims in Latvia

Very few cases of trafficking have been detected within Latvia – 3 in 2008, none in 2009. This is because there is a lack of any data or statistical information. There appears to be a lack of proactive identification of victims of trafficking in Latvia, especially when it comes to trafficking for exploitation other than sexual. In large cities like Riga, Liepaja and Daugavpils the police are making attempts to gather intelligence that would lead to criminal cases relating to the organisation of sexual services, but their main objective is to combat the organisation of prostitution, rather than to identify victims of trafficking.²³²

Consequently there is a serious lack of operational skills and practices concerning the protection, assistance and social inclusion of trafficked persons. So far, the law still remains scarcely used at the practical level. Studies on the social inclusion of migrants (not specifically on victims of human trafficking) prove that the immigration policy in Latvia is inflexible and non-supportive. Moreover, scarce information is available on the services offered to migrants and whether the return to the countries of origin takes place in conformity with the existing legislation. According to the NGOs, the assisted return procedures for trafficked persons are unclear both to service providers and victims. However, cases of good collaboration between public institutions and NGOs exist, even though they are not based on formal agreements.

At present there is no formally established national referral mechanism for victims of trafficking in the country. Further, no active outreach work is carried out by relevant public bodies for the purpose of detecting victims of trafficking. As a result, a number of victims risk remaining outside the current identification and assistance arrangements, in particular if no criminal investigations are carried out due to the lack of information.

Currently there are no special procedures for the identification of child victims of trafficking. This is an area of particular concern. GRETA considers that the Latvian authorities should pay particular attention to preventing child trafficking in the field of modelling notably by making all modelling agencies bound by the regulations concerning children and by ensuring that they comply with these regulations.

It draws special attention to the situation of children without registration who represent a category particularly vulnerable to trafficking.

Therefore, it urges the Latvian authorities to ensure the registration of all children at birth as a prevention measure against trafficking. GRETA urges the Latvian authorities to take steps to secure the registration of all persons from vulnerable groups for social services, both as a prevention measure and in order to avoid re-trafficking.²³³ GRETA urges the Latvian authorities to review the current victim identification procedure and in particular to:

- Set up a formalised national referral mechanism for the identification of victims of THB and ensure that all actors involved in it are adequately trained and have full knowledge of their respective roles;
- Pursue a proactive approach to the identification of victims of trafficking, in particular victims of trafficking for labour exploitation and provide frontline staff with operational indicators, guidance and toolkits for the identification of victims;
- Pay particular attention to identification of victims of trafficking among children;
- Ensure that the identification of victims of trafficking, whether by the police or by the multi-disciplinary commission of specialists, is not solely aimed at enabling criminal investigation, but primarily at referring victims to appropriate assistance and protection.²³⁴

232) GRETA report, 2013

233) Ibid

234) Ibid. (126) Assessed September, 2015

Recommendations of TIP Report 2015

The United States Department for State has a number of clear recommendations for Latvia within the TIP report 2015 which focus on a substantial improvement in enforcement activities in this area to improve performance in identification of trafficking victims, and pursuit of trafficking gangs and networks. Furthermore, there is a call to develop greater awareness of the risks of the various dimensions of trafficking to which the population as a whole is still considerably susceptible – with further efforts being called for in promoting trafficking education in schools, the inclusion of NGOs in all areas of cultural intervention and enhanced provision of support for victims of trafficking, including state-funded repatriation efforts.

- Increase efforts to investigate and prosecute trafficking cases under the trafficking statute (Section 154-1 of the Latvian Criminal Law).
- Increase efforts to proactively identify victims, particularly Latvian and foreign victims exploited within the country.
- Increase training for police, prosecutors, and judges on trafficking, including forced labour and domestic trafficking cases.
- Impose criminal penalties on convicted traffickers, including public officials, that are commensurate with the severity of the crime committed.
- Encourage more victims to assist law enforcement by training officials on how to provide appropriate protections to all victims, such as witness protection, and how to minimise the trauma victims face when testifying against their traffickers in courtrooms.
- Provide police investigators with sufficient resources to conduct investigations.
- Improve collaboration between the State Labour Inspectorate and the police to ensure credible referrals result in police investigations.
- Provide prosecutors and judges with clarity on the use of Section 154-1 versus Section 164 and consider amending Section 164 if too much overlap exists.
- Provide more victims with compensation from their traffickers and from the State Agency for Judicial Assistance.
- Review and improve the efficiency of trial procedures to ensure a victim-centered approach and to expedite prosecutions.
- Fully fund and implement the 2014-2020 National Anti-Trafficking in Persons Program (national action plan).²³⁵

RENATE has no formal representation in Latvia at present. Establishing links with individuals, Religious Congregations and NGOs has possibilities for working collaboratively, assisting with language-training – as identified by Sr Hannah - and sharing best practice. All of which presents challenges as well as opportunities for capacity-building and partnership into the future.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS – in appreciation of:

Author Sr Adina Balan, CJ Congregatio Jesu

CONTRIBUTORS:

Mrs Iluta Lace, Manager of the Marta Association NGO.
Mrs Annele Tetere

²³⁵) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243560.pdf> - Accessed 14 August 2015

LITHUANIA

US TIP Report Rating: Tier 2

“Lithuania is a source, transit, and destination country for women and girls subjected to sex trafficking, as well as a source and destination country for men subjected to labour trafficking. Observers estimate 40% of identified Lithuanian trafficking victims are women and girls subjected to sex trafficking within the country. Lithuanian women are also trafficking victims in Western Europe and Sweden. Lithuanian children and adults are increasingly forced to engage in criminal activities, such as shoplifting, theft, and drug selling, in Nordic countries and Western Europe. Some Lithuanian men are subjected to forced labour in the United Kingdom and the United States, including in agriculture. Men from Bulgaria may be subjected to labour trafficking in Lithuania. The approximately 4,000 boys and girls institutionalized in state-run orphanages are especially vulnerable. Officials of several orphanages are allegedly complicit or wilfully negligent to the sex trafficking of girls and boys under their care.



The Government of Lithuania does not fully comply with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking; however, it is making significant efforts to do so. During the reporting period, the legislature strengthened its criminal code, and the Supreme Court intervened to protect victims and advocate for appropriate punishments for convicted traffickers. Authorities initiated more prosecutions and convicted more traffickers than in the previous year. Authorities launched investigations into child sex trafficking rings operating in state-run orphanages, amid reports of children subjected to trafficking or vulnerable to trafficking by complicit officials in the orphanages. Investigators, police, prosecutors, and judges did not receive sufficient training to more consistently apply the anti-trafficking statute or to treat victims appropriately. Victim protection lagged, as public funding for care providers did not sufficiently cover victim assistance costs. Authorities did not proactively identify victims among vulnerable populations or consistently refer them to care. The Government lacked a formal inter-ministerial body to coordinate whole-of-government efforts and a methodical system to deliver specialized care to child victims.”²³⁶

Geography

Lithuania is one of three Baltic countries, sharing borders with Latvia, Byelorussia, Poland and Russia (Kaliningrad). On 11 March 1990, Lithuania became the first of the Soviet republics to declare its independence. Lithuania subsequently restructured its economy for integration into Western European institutions. It joined both NATO and the EU in the spring of 2004. Free movement of labour across Europe commenced with incorporation into the EU, with some countries accepting the new Accession countries without staggered limits, including the United Kingdom. In January 2014, Lithuania assumed a non-permanent seat on the UN Security Council for the 2014-15 term. However, the lack of civil society after the Fall of Communism and the demand for sexual services in Western Europe gave rise to human trafficking on an unprecedented scale.

Lithuania shares a long history with Russia, Ukraine, Germany, Poland and other neighbours. It once covered a large area between the Baltic Sea and the Black Sea in Ukraine. It was the last country in Europe to be converted to Christianity.

²³⁶) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243560.pdf> Accessed 14 August 2015

The remnants of its pre-Christian popular religion alongside other religious traditions helped the population to retain its identity during the long periods of occupation and particularly during Soviet oppression. Stalin tried to exterminate the whole Lithuanian population and deported many people to Siberia. In 1991 (era of Gorbachev) 13 civilians were killed in the aftermath of the Act of the Re-Establishment of the State of Lithuania.

Due to the present conflict in Ukraine, Lithuania is preparing for a military intervention and is trying to motivate the EU and NATO to put greater pressure on Russia. The people are convinced that neither the European institutions nor the North Atlantic Treaty Organization will fight for Lithuania's territorial integrity in case it is attacked by Russia. Lithuania's military budget is increasing. In new houses the installation of cellars that can be used as air-raid shelters has recently become obligatory. This means that a lot of resources are now being designated to protect the population.

Population

The last population census counted more than three million people, but that number is decreasing. One-quarter of the population have left Lithuania since the early 1990s. 67% of the population is urbanised, with a rate of urbanisation increasing by 0.5% per annum. The capital Vilnius has just short of one-quarter of the population, with the median age for the population being 38 years for men and 42 for women. Literacy rates are high due to as many of the population spend 15 years in full time education. However youth unemployment is high, with youths aged 15-24 experiencing just short of 30% unemployment (males 29.9% and females 21.8% in 2012). This leads to this group being more vulnerable to being 'trafficked' both internally and externally. It gives rise to situations of exploitation where there is money to be made from the 'sale' of people, particularly the selling of young women into Western countries for sexual exploitation and 'brides' creating a 'marriage agency' market.

The Lithuanian Government is very active in trying to prevent emigration and tries to attract Lithuanians from all over the world to return home. The Government offers special services to these returnees for a new start in their home country. Regarding other nationalities or ethnic groups, there is no immigration policy. Russians and Poles form small minorities. The number of refugees and illegal immigrants is low due to the fact that there are strict border controls in Belarus where immigrants are sent home immediately, irrespective of their needs and rights of protection. Because of the Euro crisis in 2008-2009 Lithuania's economic rise and the high standard of education received by the population was brought to a standstill. In the meantime, economic development has reached pre-2008 standards. On 1 January 2015, the country became a member of the Euro zone as it adopted the Euro as its currency.

Political system

The Lithuanian Republic is a parliamentary democracy. The Head of State is the President. Executive authority lies with the Prime Minister and the cabinet, and legislative power is in the hands of Seimas (the parliament).

GRETA REPORT²³⁷ on Lithuania

GRETA's first evaluation visit to Lithuania, Strasbourg, 26 May 2014 - A delegation of the Council of Europe's Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA) carried out an evaluation visit to Lithuania from 19 to 22 May 2014. The visit was organised in the context of the first round of evaluation of the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings.

237) GRETA is responsible for monitoring implementation of the *Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings* by the Parties. GRETA regularly publishes reports evaluating the measures taken by the Parties and those Parties which do not fully respect the measures contained in the Convention will be required to step up their action. www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/default_en.asp

The US Trafficking in Persons Report, 2015

Lithuania is marked as a Tier 2 country in the US TIP report. It is seen as a source, transit, and destination country for women and girls subjected to sex trafficking, as well as a source and destination country for men subjected to labour trafficking. Lithuanian children and adults are increasingly forced to engage in criminal activities, primarily shoplifting, in Nordic countries, France, the Netherlands, Spain, and the United Kingdom (UK). Disrupting organised criminal networks of child traffickers is seen as a real challenge in the country. In the TIP report observers estimate that 40% of identified Lithuanian trafficking victims are women and girls subjected to sex trafficking within the country itself – and victims of domestic trafficking.

Lithuanian women are also trafficking victims in France, Germany, Italy, Ireland, the Netherlands, Spain, Sweden, and the UK. Lithuanian women and girls from orphanages and state-run foster homes, as well as women with mental or psychological disabilities, are especially vulnerable. A small number of women from Russia and Belarus are transported through Lithuania en route to Western Europe, where they are forced into prostitution. Some Lithuanian men are subjected to forced labour in the Netherlands, the UK, and the United States, including in agriculture. Men from Bulgaria may be subjected to labour trafficking in Lithuania.

Gaps identified in the TIP report for Lithuania

The Government of Lithuania was not seen by the TIP report as fully complying with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking when the report was submitted in 2015. However, it was seen as making significant efforts to do so. During the reporting period, the legislature strengthened its criminal code, and the Supreme Court intervened to protect victims and advocate for appropriate punishments for convicted traffickers. More prosecutions were initiated and convictions brought against traffickers than in the previous year. Authorities launched investigations into child sex trafficking rings operating in state-run orphanages, amid reports of children subjected to trafficking or vulnerable to trafficking by complicit officials in the orphanages. Investigators, police, prosecutors, and judges did not receive sufficient training to more consistently apply the anti-trafficking statute or to treat victims appropriately.

Victim protection lagged, as public funding for care providers did not sufficiently cover victim assistance costs. Authorities did not proactively identify victims among vulnerable populations or consistently refer them to care. The Government lacked a formal inter-ministerial body to coordinate whole-of-government efforts and a methodical system to deliver specialised care to child victims.²³⁸

Recommendations by the US Government for Lithuania

- Overall the recommendations from the TIP report for Lithuania from the US Government targeted the following areas for particular attention:
 - Training police officers on the identification, referral, and appropriate treatment of victims, including the integration of an anti-trafficking module into the basic training of the police; ensure effective training of investigators and prosecutors on building trafficking cases and working with victim witnesses;
- Improve judicial understanding of trafficking and sensitivity towards child victims of sex trafficking; consider amending the criminal code to remove the inconsistencies between Articles 307(3) and 308(2) and Articles 147 and 157;
- Vigorously investigate and prosecute trafficking offences, including labour trafficking offences in the remit of work to be undertaken;
- Sustainably fund NGOs to provide victim protection;

²³⁸) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243560.pdf> Accessed 14 August 2015

In 2013-2014 the central and municipal governments provided NGOs with the equivalent of approximately \$114,600 for victim assistance programmes, the same amount as the previous year. However, NGOs reported to the TIP observers that they needed to resort to private funding to prevent a reduction in their victim care activities. Government-funded NGOs provided support to 129 trafficked victims and at-risk individuals in 2013, compared with approximately 150 individuals in 2012. However, attention needs to be paid to:

- Ensuring access to shelters: it was noted that there were some deficits in the way that victims were offered access to shelter and trafficking-specific assistance. This was seen as a particular challenge for adult male and child victims. Observers reported that authorities did not consistently refer identified victims to care facilities for assistance – something which will need to be attended to and altered so that procedures in this area are supported through training and monitoring.
- Intensifying efforts to identify victims proactively, particularly victims of labour trafficking and children in prostitution; Lithuanian courts officially identified 15 trafficking victims in 2013 within Lithuania itself, compared with 17 in 2012 and 29 in 2011.
- Cultural awareness and education: intensify efforts to increase public understanding of human trafficking.

Although the Government had official procedures to identify trafficking victims among vulnerable populations – such as women in prostitution, street children, and undocumented migrants – observers reported that these procedures were not effective in practice.

Police Response

In Lithuania the majority of the population is Catholic. Its ethical doctrine still considers prostitutes as ‘sinful women’ whether they prostitute themselves voluntarily or whether they are trafficked and sold into prostitution. As the majority of victims of trafficking for sexual purposes are women and under-aged girls, Caritas Lithuania²³⁹ concentrates on these target groups. Prostitution is officially prohibited but tolerated. This means that if people feel ‘molested’ by those engaged in street prostitution the police will intervene and restore public order. Usually the women are fined while the clients go free. Buying and selling of sex is transacted in private apartments. Clubs or brothels are invisible. To a large extent arrangements are made via the Internet. Similar to many other areas and countries in the world, more attention has to be paid to cyber prostitution and many more specialists are needed to detect the criminal side of it. Caritas is part of the COATNET²⁴⁰ network which fights against human trafficking.

Caritas Kaunas

On 4 September 2014 RENATE travelled from the capital city Vilnius to Kaunas, to meet with Mrs Kristina Misiniene, the Coordinator of Caritas (department of human trafficking and prostitution and victim support) An interview was also conducted with one of her colleagues. In 2006, Kristina was chosen as one of ten heroes that fight against Modern Day Slavery by the American Ministry of Foreign Affairs (TIP Report). With the support of Renovabis,²⁴¹ Caritas started its anti-trafficking activities in 2001 and is present in six of the seven Lithuanian dioceses. The Caritas Lithuania project is called Pagalba Prostitucios Ir Prekibus Zmonemis Aukoms²⁴², and is managed by Kristina.

239) <http://www.caritas.org/lithuania/Caritas> is committed to the fight against the sale of children, women and men into slavery as beggars, prostitutes and forced labourers. It is part of the COATNET network which fights against human trafficking.

240) www.caritas.org/resources/Coatnet/Coatnet.html COATNET is a Christian network that combats human trafficking.

241) Renovabis is a charitable organisation of the Roman Catholic Church in Germany, established in 1993 to help people in Eastern and Central Europe. <https://www.renovabis.de/ueber-uns>

242) www.anti-trafficking.lt/

Through this project, victims are given:

- Aid in crisis situations;
- Psychosocial rehabilitation (safe shelter, material assistance, assistance of a social worker, psychotherapist, healer, a lawyer, counselling, work skills acquisition);
- Maintenance service for those who have completed the programme.

The project intervention principles include:

- Confidentiality for victims;
- Flexibility and continuity in the organisation of services for the 'shelter' and the community;
- Rapid response in crisis situations;
- Teamwork;
- Collaboration with various agencies in the community, in order to ensure full integration in the long term.

The present Archbishop of Kaunas shows some interest in this work. But in general the hierarchy shows little interest in helping women who survive trafficking for prostitution, rather they restrict their work to traditional charitable services. Caritas Lithuania is a member of an active Nordic Baltic Network comprising Latvia, Estonia, Denmark, Sweden, Iceland, Finland and Norway.²⁴³ Caritas also uses the RENATE website in a creative way.²⁴⁴ Caritas is the largest NGO in Lithuania fighting human trafficking for sexual exploitation. It receives the largest part of its financial aid from Government. It employs fourteen social workers, five psychologists and three lawyers, spread over the areas where Caritas is involved.

Assistance/Care and Protection of Victims

Prevention is one of Caritas's main activities through raising awareness of the reality of the problem internally as well as in countries of destination in Western Europe. There is no shelter or accommodation for women who need protection except through RENOVABIS financing the rent of a few flats. When the anti-trafficking project began some religious communities had been willing to accept survivors in their convents without separating them from the living quarters of the sisters. However, RENATE members visited one convent (Sv. Elzbieta) where some women stayed for a limited period of time. Here they discovered that the 'bad behaviour' of the women (blocking incoming calls by holding long telephone conversations with friends; adding to telephone bills; disturbing the 'peace' of convent life; stealing; using bad language; lack of cleanliness) contributed to the sisters being enforced to stop this cooperation with Caritas.

In the beginning one young sister had good contact and rapport with the women, helping them to adapt to the new situation. But she was transferred to another convent and that altered the situation. One of the main reasons was because there was no assistance for the three elderly sisters who were left and who felt overburdened. The presumption was that the women were expected to respond with gratitude for the assistance of the sisters and when that did not happen, there was an inevitable breakdown between the two groups.

RENATE also visited a house for homeless people, where Caritas is allocated one room. One woman – a victim of domestic violence – and her five children were accommodated in this one room. Usually one room is kept free for victims of prostitution or domestic violence. Since most victims or homeless people are 'singles' no provisions had been made for women with children. The basic needs of all the inhabitants of this place are taken care of by the municipality. About the future prospects of the mother with her five children little was related. The older children went to school. Impressions were that although there was great willingness on the part of the helpers to ease the lot of the victims, professional skills were inadequate.

243) <http://nordicbaltic-assistwomen.net/spip.php?rubrique13>; CBSS = Council of Baltic Sea States

244) www.renate-europe.net/help-in-Lithuania

During this visit RENATE was told by a committed social worker that some trafficked women live in a house for ex-criminals (visits were not allowed here) and quite a few are involved in criminal activities such as selling drugs and/or prostitution. The observation was that the police appear to be more at ease with dealing with male ex-criminals than with trafficked women. Moreover, they did not know how to deal with the situation of victims 'disturbing' other victims. The latest statistics available were that in 2012, there were 44 court cases carried out. Of these, only 14 women were recognised as victims of trafficking. Out of 25 defendants only 7 were convicted and fined.

One recommendation of Caritas is the organisation of an international event in Lithuania in order to draw public attention to this dire situation and stimulate international cooperation along with the co-ordination of already existing activities in Lithuania. Ideally, the international aspect of such an event would be carried out with the main destination countries where 50% of Lithuanian women are sold. These include Germany, the UK and Spain as the main countries, with lesser involvement in the Netherlands and Ireland.

Caritas Prabade

On 10 September 2014 RENATE travelled to Prabade, a small town with about 9,700 inhabitants, to meet two co-workers from Caritas and the Vicar General Eugenijus Styra. The bishop of this diocese would have liked to meet with RENATE but he was not in Lithuania at the time. From observation, the people and the buildings in the streets gave the impression of a poor place (compared with Vilnius and Kaunas). In the town of Prabade, youth emigration is both high and endemic. Caritas Prabade counts 30 new victims of trafficking each year; 60% are trafficked to Western Europe. The cooperation between Caritas and the police is very good.

The two social workers had many questions about Germany, for example: the legalisation of prostitution; juridical procedures; assistance for victims of trafficking; and the silent fading away of human rights for the sake of the permanent enrichment of the rich in the country. Since there are almost 50 NGOs in Germany taking care of trafficked women, RENATE could only answer for SOLWODI²⁴⁵ and its own work in a detention centre near the Polish border. Until recently there were trafficked people, women and men exploited for sex, labour, and criminal activities such as drug smuggling. A ploy used for stealing is to tell elderly people with some means that they have a 'grandson' or 'nephew' in Lithuania in urgent need of assistance and needing cash for treatment to avoid death (this is also common in other Eastern European countries). People are tricked into giving financial help in this way. Since some of the 'grandfathers' were soldiers in World War II they would not dismiss the existence of unknown offspring.

According to RENATE member Sister Dagmar Plum – co-author of this report – the complexity of the problem regarding human trafficking is still beyond the perception and recognition of many, even beyond the judiciary. Biased attitudes, prejudices and cultural 'norms' often add to the complexity, including towards giving concrete aid to combat the practice. Often this is hampered by the responses of national governments, the EU and other institutions, either through lack of political will or being taken up with many other criminal activities; and there are not the resources to bring about the systemic change that is required to put an end to human trafficking.

Lithuania - Missing Persons' Families Support Centre (MPFSC)²⁴⁶

Mrs. Natalija Kurcinskaja is the Director and the founder of Missing Persons' Families Support Centre (MPFSC) in Lithuania, which is a non-governmental association, established in 1996 by relatives

245) SOLWODI is an association that helps women in distress. SOLWODI is a contact point for migrant women who have come to Germany through sex tourism. <http://www.solwodi.de>

246) WWW.MISSING.LI

and parents of missing people. She was delighted to meet with RENATE members, Religious who were interested in supporting her organisation's work against human trafficking. The MPFSC established the first shelter for trafficked victims in Lithuania in 2001, but they had been providing assistance to the victims since 1997. Unfortunately, because of a lack of funding this shelter was closed in the mid 2000s.

Currently its work is mainly in awareness raising, and some prevention initiatives seeking to decrease the number of missing and trafficked people, especially children, in Lithuania, and providing assistance to the victims and their families. Missing Children Europe provide some external support for the organisation and since February 2014 the MPFSC host the 'hotline' for missing children in Lithuania. The free hotline, with a memorable number, is operational 24/7 and can be used by parents, adoptive parents, foster parents, and social workers faced with the problem of missing children to access help from the MPFSC specialists on social, psychological and legal issues.

RENATE observes that with a small staff, with only three specialists and a small band of volunteers, this centre does some impressive work. Mrs. Natalija Kurcinskaja is utterly dedicated to the work and an inspirational leader who has put into service her life and full energies in order to support the families of missing people. MPFSC seems to be a significant NGO for RENATE with whom to develop connections and generate further networks from this base within Lithuania.

Recommendations for Developing RENATE Network in Lithuania

These might include bilateral in-country support and repatriation and reintegration strategies. There seem to be some opportunities for developing bi-lateral work with Lithuania through the RENATE Network, particularly from the countries where Lithuanian trafficked persons are located across the Network's reach. France, Spain and the UK are key destination countries nominated by the TIP report, and we know from work undertaken by the Salvation Army that between 2011 and 2014 the SA was host to 141 trafficked victims across its National Referral Mechanism related support network. This number shows no real indication of the problem abating as in 2013 the number recorded was 64 trafficked persons from Lithuania through their services in the UK. According to the Salvation Army anti-human trafficking reports January – June, 2015 ²⁴⁷ 20 Lithuanian nationals were referred. Work on repatriation as well as some outreach work from Lithuania itself to those being given support in the UK and other destination countries, including Ireland, would appear to be worth further consideration.

Recommendations of TIP Report 2015

- Provide effective training for all police officers on the identification, referral, and appropriate treatment of victims, including by integrating an anti-trafficking module into the basic training for the police
- Sustainably fund NGOs to provide victim protection.
- Prevent the sex trafficking of children institutionalised in state-run orphanages, including through the prosecution of complicit or negligent orphanage authorities
- Improve training of investigators and prosecutors on building trafficking cases and working with victim witnesses.
- Improve judicial understanding of trafficking and sensitivity towards victims of sex trafficking.
- Vigorously investigate and prosecute trafficking offences, including labour trafficking offences.
- Provide all victims access to shelter and trafficking-specific assistance, particularly adult and male child victims.
- Intensify efforts to identify victims proactively, particularly victims of labour trafficking and children in prostitution.
- Convene a formal inter-ministerial committee to coordinate whole-of-government anti-trafficking efforts.

247) http://www.salvationarmy.org.uk/Anti_Human_Trafficking_Latest_Report. Figures released by the Salvation Army are likely to vary from the overall National Referral Mechanism. Accessed August 2015

Capacity building for RENATE

Given the religious affiliation of Lithuania, noted as strongly Catholic, with over three-quarters of the population aligning themselves as Roman Catholic, Lithuania offers the opportunity for RENATE to build relationships with the Catholic Religious Congregations located in the country.

This could be assistance with:

- Developing resilient and sustainable awareness campaigns – there is an urgent need for prevention and advocacy. Both Caritas and IOM urged nations to “treat this response as a life-saving protection activity.”
- Assisting with the early recognition of exploitative contracts which can easily lead into trafficking exploitation for the unwary.
- Education and training – raising the profile of human trafficking as a global phenomenon and an international crime that operates within and without borders.

Furthermore, recovery work with those who have experienced trafficking exploitation, both within the country and returnees from destination countries, can be undertaken usefully through a developed relationship with NGOs already in place, but in need of some extra assistance and resourcing. Other suggestions for effective action include the training of police forces, working with young people to prevent forced marriages, working with women so that they can secure income-generating projects, and teacher training to safeguard the most vulnerable from trafficking. The Lithuanian Government has been encouraged by the US State Department to undertake such prevention work. This may be an opportunity for the RENATE Network.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS – in appreciation of:

Authors: Sr Dagmar Plum, MMS, Medical Mission Sisters;
Ms Irma Maruskeviciute (and Interpreter);

CONTRIBUTORS

Mrs. Kristina Misiniene, Caritas;

Mrs. Natalija Kurcinskaja, Director and the founder of Missing Persons’ Families Support Centre (MPFSC) in Lithuania;

Sr. Adina Balan, CJ, Congregatio Jesu;

POLAND

US TIP Report Rating: Tier 1

“Poland is a source, transit, and destination country for men, women, and children subjected to forced labour and sex trafficking. Labour trafficking is increasing in Poland; forced labour victims originate from Europe, Asia, and Africa. Children, particularly Romani children, are recruited for forced begging in Poland. Men and women from Poland are subjected to forced labour in Europe, primarily Western and Northern Europe. Women and children from Poland are subjected to sex trafficking within the country and also in other European countries. Women and children from Eastern Europe, particularly Bulgaria, Romania, and Ukraine, are subjected to sex trafficking in Poland.”²⁴⁸



The geographical position of Poland (map)²⁴⁹ in the middle of Europe bordering former Soviet States means it stands at the crossroads of major migration routes. Poland regained its independence in 1918, only to be overrun by Germany and the Soviet Union in World War II. It became a Soviet satellite state following the war, but its government was comparatively tolerant and progressive. Labour turmoil in 1980 led to the formation of the independent trade union ‘Solidarity’ that over time became a political force with over 10 million members. Free elections in 1989 and 1990 won ‘Solidarity’ control of the parliament and the presidency, bringing the communist era to an end. A ‘shock therapy’ programme during the early 1990s enabled the country to transform its economy into one of the most robust in Central Europe. Poland joined NATO in 1999 and the European Union in 2004. With its transformation to a democratic, market-oriented country largely completed and with large investments in defence, energy, and other infrastructure, Poland is an increasingly active member of Euro-Atlantic organisations.²⁵⁰

Until the early 1990s, Poland was regarded as a country of emigration. This changed, particularly with its accession to the EU, to become a transit as well as a destination country for migrants. With numbers of Polish people emigrating to work in the UK, Germany, Scandinavia and Ireland, others from outside the country replaced them in Poland when there were ‘jobs’ to be done, especially in the agricultural sector. Few Polish people want to work in agriculture in their home country because the work is too hard and salaries too low. Yet, Polish people are prepared to do the same work in richer countries because they can earn more.

GRETA Report, 2013

The Polish authorities have taken a number of important steps to prevent and combat trafficking in human beings, but several important challenges remain, according to a report published in May 2013 by GRETA (the Council of Europe’s expert group on human trafficking).²⁵¹

248) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243561.pdf> Accessed 14 August 2015

249) <http://www.lonelyplanet.com/maps/europe/poland/>

250) <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/pl.html> Updated 21 April, 2015

251) GRETA. Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings https://www.coe.int/.../trafficking/.../Reports/GRETA_2013_6_FGR_POL

The report notes that the criminalisation of trafficking in human beings in Poland took effect in September 2010. There is still a significant gap between the number of identified victims of trafficking and the number of successful prosecutions and convictions. Despite efforts to provide training to relevant professionals, GRETA considers that there is a need to improve the knowledge and sensitivity of judges, prosecutors, investigators and other professionals about human trafficking and the rights of victims.

The Convention (Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings) requires Parties to take measures to assist victims in their physical, psychological and social recovery, taking account of the victim's safety and protection needs, in cooperation with NGOs and other organisations engaged in assistance to victims. This assistance must be provided on a consensual and informed basis, taking account of the special needs of persons in a vulnerable position, as well as children, and it must not be made conditional on the victim's willingness to act as a witness (Article 12).

The requirement to take account of victims' needs is also referred to in the Convention's provisions concerning temporary residence permits (Article 14) and the rights of children who are victims of trafficking, particularly providing access to education. (Article 12). The Convention also establishes that the assistance to victims of THB must include appropriate and secure accommodation.²⁵² It also underlines the multi-disciplinary approach to victim identification in Poland and the issuing of special instructions to the police and border guard on the identification of human trafficking victims. However, further steps are necessary to ensure that all victims of trafficking are properly identified. In particular, the report notes that more attention should be paid to the identification of cases of trafficking for labour exploitation, which has been on the rise in Poland. In addition, the report calls upon the authorities to introduce a nationwide procedure for the identification of child victims of trafficking and to improve the provision of assistance tailored to their needs.

GRETA also urges the Polish authorities to facilitate and guarantee access to compensation for victims of trafficking. Despite the existence of legal possibilities, very few (if any) victims of trafficking have received compensation. The Report is the first evaluation concerning the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, Strasbourg, 6 May 2013.²⁵³ The convention came into force in respect of Poland in March 2009. RENATE members²⁵⁴ met with the Ministry of the Interior, the Chief of Border Police, La Strada NGO, Professor of Human Rights, University of Warsaw, Catholic sisters providing 'shelter' for women and children, and a lawyer working pro-bono with sisters assisting women 'on the streets' of Warsaw to exit prostitution.

As a transit country it is difficult to disclose the extent of the problems in relation to migrants coming to Poland looking for jobs, as it is also a source and a destination country. It is a source country (origin) for the wealthier Western countries of Europe, particularly for labour trafficking as well as for prostitution. In the second quarter of 2011 the number of Polish-born people aged 16 plus working in the UK was 449,888, an increase of around 60,000 on the previous quarter. In the same quarter, an estimated 84.6% of Poles aged 16 to 64 were in employment, compared with a rate of 70.4% for the UK as a whole.²⁵⁵

In recent years, Poland has been a destination country for foreign victims from Asian and Eastern countries: Ukraine, Vietnam, Philippines, Bangladesh, China, Belarus and Sri Lanka, and these are mainly migrant labour workers, though how many settle in Poland long term is not known. Many may see the country as a 'stepping-stone' to the more wealthy EU states. Few in number come from Africa.

252) https://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/Docs/Reports/GRETA_2013_6_FGR_POL_with_comments_en.pdf (149)

253) Ibid

254) Ms Aneta Grabowska- secretary of RENATE Network and Patricia Mulhall, csb – RENATE Working Board.

255) Office for National Statistics UK

Falling into all three categories – origin, transit and destination - presents many challenges and difficulties for State and civil society. While more and more NGOs and faith-based networks as well as government agencies are working in anti-trafficking, the statistics for prosecution remain low when compared with numbers of victims.

According to Professor Zbigniew Lasocik, there are two reasons why so little has been effective:

1. The majority of discussion takes place at the highest level, and doesn't go down to the lowest. In Poland many activities and most of the discussion is at a 'high level' at the national level – projects, publications, conferences. At the 'lower' and more local level, there are fewer people involved and fewer activities. These people at the 'lower' end, the local level, would be best placed to be responsible for identification, be alert to what is taking place (should there be unusual practices or activities in their local area) and be able to identify victims.
2. Our knowledge is lacking precision about the real scope of the issue and there are many gaps in the system. For example, officers doing anti-trafficking work for decades succeed in identifying very few traffickers – one or two – when the number should be much higher.²⁵⁶

Why is it so difficult to find and prosecute traffickers?

Although there are 30 officers and 8 divisions in the country – each with a coordinator and vice coordinator, depending on the size of the division – all trained to deal with the issue, to recognise the symptoms and signs of trafficked persons, there are still difficulties getting prosecutions. According to Mr Tomasz Nowak, Major of Border Guards in Poland, the main obstacles are:

- Identification by an officer. If there are drugs involved, it may be difficult to know if the person is a victim of human trafficking.
- Self-identifying as a victim is complex, with lengthy procedures.
- Victims themselves are slow to come forward – especially victims of sexual exploitation – as they do not want to cooperate for fear of exposure or reprisals from traffickers.
- When a victim is exploited for a lengthy period, she becomes 'connected' with her exploiter, can establish a relationship of dependence and becomes 'willing' in her exploitative situation, often relying on her trafficker²⁵⁷

According to Ms Joanna Garnier, Vice President, La Strada, Warsaw, founded in 1995: The biggest change and trend in human trafficking is recruitment through the Internet. There are offers of jobs through 'false' advertising. An exciting job abroad is proposed. The proposal can be through persona contact – or in a labour office. 'I have something for you.' Invitation can look like it is 'personal' or a friendly Internet service for relatives. Next, a meeting is organised by the person recruiting – usually someone working for the employer who is doing the exploiting. Then an office is rented in what looks like a good area, often rented in a Municipal building. To all appearances, everything looks good, trustworthy; a 'good offer' and in countries like Germany, Italy and the UK, where money can be made and earnings are high. The offer is very attractive and the victim is unaware that she/he is being trafficked because the chain of trafficking begins with TRUST.

In some of the 16 counties of Poland, there is up to 17% unemployment, especially in the North East (Lake District); North West, (Szczecin) - traditionally shipbuilding on the shores of the Baltic, or the large areas with former State farms between Szczecin and Gdańsk with high unemployment as one moves towards the west. After 1989, when these industries stopped, subsequently many were left unemployed.

256) Professor Zbigniew Lasocik, Human Rights Studies, University of Warsaw. Interview October 2014.

257) Mr Tomasz Nowak, Major of Border Guards in Poland, Interview October 2014.

Recruitment agencies for work abroad filled the void. La Strada runs 9 projects for which they applied and were given funding. One of them is for the victims of HT, in co-operation with PoMOC Association, Katowice. La Strada operates a 'hotline' for victims and when you talk to victims and ask, 'Where did you find the offer?' – Always more than half will say, 'Through the Internet!'

Another problem in Poland is the rise of 'fake' marriages. Although not very frequent, they still happen, especially among Polish marrying people from the African and Asian countries – mainly Nigeria, Cameroon and Senegal. The Government is making this practice much more difficult. It used to be easy to get a visa to Poland; most who applied were interested only in using Poland as a transit route to Germany, Italy or the UK.²⁵⁸

Role of Ministry of the Interior

Ms Aneta Suda, Ministry of the Interior – expert in the Migration Department, whose unit is within the Migration policy department, with its main focus on trafficking – explained that the National Plan of Action in Poland, 2013-2015 is a continuance of documents that set out the tasks in the area of preventing trafficking in human beings implemented from September 2003.

In her unit, there are five persons and they are responsible for the system of protection – coordinating tasks assigned by the government ministry or to NGOs with a focus on assistance of the victims, in practical as well as legal aspects. There is a Penal Code and Act on social assistance. The system of protection is given a legal basis by the ministry. As stated by Ms Aneta Suda, there are many elements of the Polish referral mechanism which are crucial and must not be ignored or overlooked when considering the response to human trafficking in Poland.

For example, there is the National Crisis and Intervention Centre for Victims of Trafficking. This is a public task assigned by the Ministry of the Interior through which many victims (both Polish and foreigners) can be assisted.

National Consulting and Intervention Centre for Victims of Trafficking (KCIK)²⁵⁹ is the core of Polish victim support system. It was established in April 2009 in order to improve the standards of assistance offered to victims and to make the assistance more available.

KCIK is fully financed from the State's budget as a public task commissioned by the Minister of the Interior to non-governmental organizations. Currently the task is carried out jointly by two NGOs – La Strada Foundation against Trafficking and Slavery and Association Po MOC. The Centre is addressed to victims identified by law enforcement agencies, but also to potential victims who have not been officially identified yet may suffer from the threat of being re-victimised. The KCIK is also dedicated to all institutions and organizations assisting victims of trafficking. The assistance offered by the Centre is unconditional and irrespective of the victims' cooperation with law enforcement agencies.

KCIK provides:

- a 24-hour helpline;
- intervention assistance such as safe accommodation, food, psychological support, medical aid,
- two shelters dedicated to female victims of trafficking;
- translation services and the presence of an interpreter if needed;
- legal consultations.

258) Ms Joanna Garnier, La Strada NGO, Warsaw. Interview with RENATE, October 2014.

259) https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/member-states/poland-3-implementation-anti-trafficking-policy_en

Total number of persons receiving support from KCIK:

Year	Victims, supported by KCIK in 2011 – 2013
2011	133 persons (81 Polish citizens, 52 foreigners)
2012	198 persons (89 Polish citizens, 109 foreigners)
2013	222 persons (103 Polish citizens, 119 foreigners)
In total	553 persons (273 Polish citizens, 280 foreigners)

The Centre offers quite a spread of assistance including crisis intervention and shelter. Yearly the Centre is able to assist around 200 persons directly. What is even more important the Centre can take care of all people who are or might be victims.

Assistance and support provided to victims

The system of support and protection for victims of trafficking in human beings in Poland came into existence at the beginning of 2006. Since that time the system has been thoroughly improved and developed both in the legal and practical fields. The main objective of the system is to identify victims and to refer them to the proper institutions for assistance and support.

Furthermore, there is the question of social assistance. Victims of human trafficking are entitled to apply and receive assistance that is required. Of course, the social system is not the best one, and still there is much to be improved. Nevertheless, many victims managed to take advantage and be assisted by social workers.

The role and commitment of NGOs, of Po-MOC Association as well as the other Catholic stakeholders is important and this work is done in conjunction with the Ministry of the Interior through the National Referral Mechanism.

National Referral Mechanism

The Ministry of the Interior (MoI) through the Unit Against Trafficking in Human Beings is responsible for monitoring and ongoing assessment of the National Referral Mechanism. The Unit steers the work of the expert group for supporting and protecting victims of trafficking that serves as a platform of exchanging up to date information about the identified/resumed victims and beneficiaries of KCIK. The expert group is comprised of experts of THB from the General Police Headquarter, the General Headquarter of Border Guard, the General Public Prosecutor's Office as well as from the non-governmental organisations conducting the National Consulting and Intervention Centre for Victims of Trafficking task (i.e. La Strada Foundation and Po-MOC Association). Since 2013 the group has been gathering systematically once per month.

The victims may be formally identified by competent Law Enforcement Agencies: the Police, Borger Guard and prosecutors.²⁶⁰

Other latest initiatives/activities

- A new Act on foreigners giving third country nationals that are THB victims a set of rights concerning assistance and legal stay in Poland was adopted in December 2013 and entered into force in May 2014. The act granted foreign THB victims with the possibility to legalise their stay for the reflection period of three months (4 in case of minors) based on a certificate issued instantly by the LEA who identified the victim.

260) ibid

- The Unit against THB of the MoI has initiated the establishment of regional teams against THB that are to serve as a platform of cooperation, exchanging information and facilitating carrying out joint preventive actions. Five regional teams have been established by the end of 2014.
- Border Guards officers were granted the right to carry out investigations of cases concerning THB and use special investigation methods/activities related to anti-trafficking policy.
- The IOM in partnership with the MoI and General Labour Inspectorate have undertaken the implementation of a second edition of the “Migrants’ rights in practice” project. The project is to be completed by mid-2015. The main actions are: an information campaign directed at migrants planning a trip to Poland or came recently, carried out in Poland, Belarus, Ukraine and Vietnam, crisis intervention in the form of legal advice and mediations with the employer, anti-discrimination trainings for labour inspectors, Border Guard officers, representatives of employers organisations and organisations providing support to migrants.
- MoI is preparing to implement a project aiming at raising awareness of human beings in Poland, co-financed from Norway Grants. The main actions of the projects are: conducting an opinion poll on trafficking in human beings, awareness raising campaign directed at vulnerable groups in chosen regions of Poland, research on demand reduction concerning all types of exploitation. The project is carried out in partnership with the Council of Europe and it is to be completed by April 2016.
- MoI has launched a second edition of the awareness raising competition for the best graduation thesis.²⁶¹

There is significant interest in victims who are minors but it is very difficult to improve the system when one encounters child victims. A number of reasons are identified:

- The best interests of the child have to be assessed and decisions made in relation to them. Even the responsible organisations, NGOs and other bodies find this difficult.
- No one wants to take responsibility for children who are unaccompanied – courts, social services, police – if there is little to offer them, what does one do?
- Traffickers offer much more to children and this is attractive to them.
- Child victims come under the influence of the traffickers and often are forced to behave and do what traffickers suggest.
- Traffickers find it so much easier to use and abuse children – when they should be in school, they are under the thumb of the traffickers – they are more compliant with the ‘orders’ of the traffickers, often through fear.
- Children from the Asian countries are used to working from a very early age and this is ‘normal’ as often they work to support the family income. This is part of their culture, to help their families. Traffickers exploit this and offer them money.
- Our system does not offer children this same kind of ‘employment’.

As in most countries, the protection of children is unsatisfactory as well as difficult. Poland would like to have a better system. At present, there is a big debate in various countries about how to organise ‘shelters’ for children.²⁶² However, there are special protective measures for children. Amendments to the Code of Penal Procedure were introduced June 2013 (came into force January 2014).²⁶³ GRETA considers that the Polish authorities should extend all special protection procedures to cover child victims of THB up to the age of 18.²⁶⁴

²⁶¹)ibid

²⁶²) Ms Aneta Suda, Ministry of the Interior, expert in Migration Department & HT. Interview October 2014.

²⁶³) https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/member-states/poland-3-implementation-anti-trafficking-policy_en

²⁶⁴) GRETA. Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings <https://www.coe.int/.../traffick->

For the implementation of tasks stipulated in the National Action Plan against Trafficking in Human Beings for 2013-2015, the Ministry of the Interior plans to earmark PLN 148,000 in the 2015 state budget for the tasks in the area in question – § 4300, and funds of PLN 1,005,000 – § 2810 and § 2820. In total, funds of PLN 1,153,000 are planned to be earmarked for that purpose in the Ministry of the Interior's budget for 2014. In total, funds of PLN 1,293,000 are planned to be earmarked for that purpose in the two Ministries' budgets for 2015. The ultimate amounts will depend on the Budget Act. Thereby, the estimated cost of implementation of the tasks under the National Action Plan assigned to the Ministry of the Interior and the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy in the years 2013–2015 is ca. PLN 3,629,000.

265

RENATE members running 'shelter' (safe houses) for victims of human trafficking

Sister Anna Bałchan, SMI, joined RENATE at its launch in Poland in 2011. Sister Barbara attended the RENATE working board, Chigwell UK, 2012. Together, they set up the PoMOC Association in Katowice, which runs a shelter for victims of trafficking. RENATE visited the shelter and spoke to the social worker employed by the sisters, Magdalena Lasota, about the work with victims of trafficking and their rehabilitation at the shelter.²⁶⁶

In the last two years, the PoMOC programme has been supported by Government – the Ministry of the Interior. But much more could be done if funds were available to the 'shelter' and they could plan strategically into the future. Typical work at the centre is with the victims, referred through the police, border guard and sometimes NGO La Strada, or personal contact via email or, rarely, by telephone. Victims are met at a separate location and assessed before being brought to the shelter.

The PoMOC shelter can accommodate 16 people, including children. There are nine rooms available – two of them for two or four people. It is important for a family to have their own room as sometimes this is a mother with children. The length of stay is usually nine months, but can be longer, depending on personal need – finding a flat, a job, professional courses – before a victim is rehabilitated. Sometimes they could be waiting for a council flat. Magda says they find that nine months is usually enough. The shelter supports them, but also recognises what they need most is to become independent. The focus is on helping victims to do that.

Typical traumas of human trafficking victims

Post-traumatic stress is very common, particularly for those sexually abused rather than exploited for labour. In the shelter, 90% are victims of sexual abuse, trafficked into sexual abuse, sometimes even by their own families. They become easy 'prey' if they are abused within their own homes. When they are abused from early childhood, they don't 'feel' that there is a limit to what they can suffer. So they accept this abuse as normal behaviour and put up with it. Many victims have 'borderline' personalities from childhood abuse and this can be difficult when trying to rehabilitate them. Often they do not recognise themselves as victims. Here, we may see the person as a 'victim' but she herself does not, says Magdalena.

Since its foundation (9 years) 100 victims have been through the shelter, from Romania, Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Russia, Ukraine and Macedonia, but Polish are the largest group. When asked how the shelter would rate its success, Magdalena replied that it becomes difficult to quantify 'success' as there may be as few as 30% 'successful' and able to return to a functional independent life. Up to 70% can be deemed 'unsuccessful' as they are too traumatised to find meaningful work so as to live independently. Most victims are touched by different experiences from the past.

ing/.../Reports/GRETA_2013_6_FGR_POL (227)

265) NATIONAL ACTION PLAN AGAINST TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS FOR 2013-2015 Poland. Page 7

266) Srs Anna , Magdalena Lasota, PoMOC Association, Katowice. www.po-moc.pl Interview 6 October 2014.

They stick to what they know rather than move to what they don't know. It is easier for them to accept violence – it's what they know and have experienced. Consequently, it is difficult for them to 'move to a new place' in terms of change. It is especially difficult to find education courses or professional training or to rent a flat for a short time, and this means they cannot live independently in Poland if they are from other countries. The culture in their countries, as indeed in Poland, can be 'male dominated', making it more difficult for women to live independently.

In a recent Polish radio programme, researchers described three forms of discrimination that occur in Poland:

- 1) Discrimination against foreigners;
- 2) Old people;
- 3) Women.

So when the woman is a victim, she has a big problem. However, by far the biggest problems are with children. No one is sure what to do with them since they are unable to make decisions for themselves.²⁶⁷

Training Programmes

Although PoMOC is caring for victims through therapy with women, there is also a strong focus on training and prevention work. Sister Anna and Magdalena conduct training days and workshops for Religious and others (open to anyone interested) on human trafficking and on how to identify victims. Training offered by PoMOC meant that 70 people attended – from all over Poland. This group met for three days, seven times, to participate in 21 sessions! In the last two years, over 100 sisters were trained from 15 different congregations. PoMOC prepared them to work with victims of human trafficking, but this training could not continue due to lack of funds. However, according to Sister Anna, only when the leadership of congregations in Poland at their Chapters commit to the decision to work in this field and support personnel to do it, will it happen.

Following the RENATE conference launch in Trzebinia in 2011, Sisters Anna and Barbara started a formal group, and established it as the Bakhita Network, so that it would be recognised nationally. Twenty-five members make up the Network, 21 sisters and 3-4 lay workers. Without funds, it's difficult to continue with the network. Sisters Anna and Barbara have the support of their congregation as well as the local Bishop for the work they are doing.

PoMOC cooperates with police, border guards, the Ministry of the Interior, La Strada, and Social Services. The sisters feel that Catholic organisations could be more proactive. At present, there is only one working in this field - the Sisters of the Immaculate Mary, with Anna and Barbara full time. Sometimes the Catholic Church gives food, but mostly it is not involved in anti-trafficking work. Sisters would like to be more involved, but finance is a big problem. Sister Anna travels throughout Poland leading training workshops, giving retreats as well as fundraising from the sales of her books and CDs – all to raise funds for the work.

Sr Anna shared her vision for the future:

Ideally, her five-year plan would include:

- Replicating PoMOC in other places in Poland;
- Building a nursery for children at PoMOC, so that mothers can go to work;
- Assisting women with jobs – women find it hard to get work when they have dependents needing care;

²⁶⁷) Magdalena Lasota, Social Worker, PoMOC Association, Katowice. Interview 6 October, 2014.

- Involvement of the victims who are able to work in the awareness and training sessions, so that the ‘authentic’ voice is heard and can be an effective prevention measure. But this is a long-term plan as it is difficult for victims to speak of their trauma, it only brings it back to them and they have to re-live it. Hence this is a highly sensitive issue;
- Conducting more training sessions – especially in schools – so that the public become more aware of human trafficking and its consequences. Without prevention, the problem only continues.

As Sister Anna said, we have lots of ideas, but need more money to help us execute them!²⁶⁸

PoMOC values the support and connection with RENATE Network as it has been a real source of support for its work and with training – both Barbara and Magda were present for training days run by RENATE. In addition, RENATE has given financial aid – 2,000EUR – in support of rehabilitation of victims.

When asked if they felt they were making a difference in relation to raising the issue of human trafficking in the country, they said, “Yes, our job and our association are the vehicle for changing the conditions in Poland. Often the only ‘voice’ of victims is through our voice. But, we would like much more by way of:

- Sharing of programmes – share this Mapping Exercise;
- Getting help with knowing how to fundraise and approach donors;
- Being able to have more projects to help victims to become independent;
- Building capacity.

Sister Anna’s work is known throughout Poland. She has monthly meetings with the Ministry of the Interior and others (Aneta Grabowska, Secretary of RENATE Network, is sometimes present on behalf of PoMOC).²⁶⁹

Reaching out to women on the streets

RENATE met with Sister Ewa Jachimek (Mother of the Good Shepherd) and Mr Jakub Zakrzewski, a lawyer working pro-bono with other sisters including Sr. Kasia. The congregation runs a house for single mothers in a village located 200 south from Warsaw. Their street mission work with Caritas Warsaw called Misja Małgorzata, Mission Margaret, for which Sr. Ewa Jachimek is responsible, is run for over 5 years and it reaches out to women in prostitution, not necessarily victims of trafficking; mostly Polish, but also Bulgarian and Ukrainian. Many come to the city looking for a job, some specifically to engage in prostitution. They cited a case with a Nigerian girl. In 2008, she explained she was involved with a sports group and she didn’t expect to be in prostitution but was forced into it by an organised group of traffickers, the mediator being a woman. This Nigerian woman came initially to Poland to play in a sports team but that story cannot be guaranteed to be true. There was also a case of a woman from Chechnya who left her country for political reasons, but she was exploited on the way by a man, but this case was under La Strada NGO.

As RENATE was conducting the interview, Sister Ewa got a call from La Strada to ask if she had a place to give shelter for six women from Sri Lanka. Jakub gave us an example of his involvement in the work when he said, “My younger sister had a friend who attended my classes at the university. A wealthy older man took her to New York, gave her nice clothes and treated her to a great ‘high life.’ She now becomes his ‘property.’ Part of the preventative activities in schools is to raise awareness about women’s servitude to men and point out the dangers of entanglement in unhealthy relationships.

268) Sister Anna, President of PoMOC Association, Katowice. Interview 6 October 2014.

269) *ibid.*

Then there is the case of abuse of boys. For example, it is well known that Warsaw is a market source of commodity (body parts), especially in the Western part of the country, where there is high unemployment. On the western border of Poland it is quite 'acceptable' for a mother and daughter to travel to Germany for a weekend and return with money from prostitution. Germans abandoned that part of the country after the War. It was German at one stage but when the Allies divided the countries, Germans left the region and were replaced by Poles, who settled there – mainly peasants who moved from the Eastern part of Poland and were not as conservative (small 'c') in terms of Catholicism as in other parts of Poland.²⁷⁰ Jakub describes his work as offering legal assistance, assisting the women with letter-writing about their housing, or unpaid remuneration. He will do the paperwork for them when they have their case heard by the court. Most cases are Polish, but there was one international case – involving a Polish woman, living outside Poland, married to an Arab man. She wanted a divorce. Jakub assisted with the case and managed to get a satisfactory solution. Foreign women are 'out of my reach' he says, but he offers consultation at the initial stage. Being more involved full time is not possible for him as he needs an income.

Sister Ewa Jachimek speaks about the trends she has seen over the six years she has been working with women on the streets. There are multiple problems, from toxic partners to drugs and alcohol, which are common. Some women appear prone to getting into trouble as they are vulnerable. She recounts a success story of one 22-year-old woman who stayed with them at the centre. She was a 'shadow' of herself, thin and had problems with her landlord. After a year, she decided to meet the sisters, accept their help with a therapy programme and leave her toxic partner. But she needed 1,000 EUR to get out of prostitution. When this was given her, she went to school, to university, and now she works in her home town helping other women to get out of prostitution or to have an income. Ms Aneta Grabowska also works alongside Sister Ewa and Jakub. They cite cases of 'success' stories since they began their work with women on the streets of Warsaw:

A woman – born in 1938 – broke her arm, was unable to do her 'work' and had mounting debt problems paying bills, in one case with an insurance company. Jakub was able to give her legal assistance. Another woman of 32 was helped to leave the street, now has a young son and a happy life. In another case a 45-year-old woman taking clients into her home during school hours quit when her teenage daughter arrived home early from school to find a client with her mother. This event triggered her mother changing her life. They were able to support her in finding alternative work.²⁷¹

Our DREAM / WISH for the future:

Sister Ewa and Jakub say that the motivation for this work is based on the fact that they themselves feel appreciation for all they have received from God. Not just many worldly goods, but also their education and skills. They want to share these gifts with others, particularly to share their time and their hearts. At the same time, they are painfully aware of how little can be changed unless and until the root causes of the problems are addressed, and factors are put in place to help women off the streets:

- Meaningful permanent work – many women on the streets are 'driven' there by poverty and if there is no other work, may have to earn money through prostitution.
- Legal assistance – which is expensive. To hire a lawyer would mean paying 25 EUR per hour. Very often if they want to exit prostitution, they don't know where to turn, so it's good to be able to give support.
- Affordable accommodation – while there may be plenty of accommodation for rent in Warsaw, it is expensive. Outside the city limits it is more affordable but that means travelling distances to work, which can add to costs.
- Support of Church authorities and institutions – first and foremost the possibility of using Caritas premises.

270) Mr Jakub Zakrzewski, lawyer and university teacher. Interview October 2014.

271) Sister Ewa Jachimek (Mother of the Good Shepherd) Interview October, 2014.

They are grateful for the support of RENATE Network, particularly from Aneta, the secretary. They were thinking of joining RENATE about 2 years ago but when it was explained that the legal instrument of RENATE is located in The Netherlands – where prostitution is legalised – the fear was that if they joined, this may have some implications for their work. In addition, not knowing the source of RENATE funding poses a problem for them.

Suggestions / Recommendations

Some of Professor Zbigniew Lasocik's recommendations:

- education as the key to anti-trafficking work if any change is to take place. RENATE and others in the field, he says, must create a vision of a society where people are equal and deserve support; selling people is totally unacceptable. This requires sensitivity to victims, awareness of the problem and not necessarily campaigning!
- advocates a return to the source – to the risky situations in countries of origin to find out the practices and strategies of recruiters. Little will change if this is not done. For example, recruitment in Poland is 'top secret,' whereas in Asian countries, recruiters are an important part of social institutions and the fabric of society. They are 'open' – a mother tries to find a job for son or daughter, goes to the recruiting agency – everything starts from here.
- suggests holding an in-depth interview with the victim and finding out the typical situation from where s/he has come. If we don't improve this, we can organise conferences, seminars and discussions but make very little progress!
- promotes education to heighten the awareness and sensitivity of the public – at a local and national level. The situation of human trafficking as presented to the public is something that happens very rarely. This needs to change to a much more heightened sensitivity about the issue – that it is taking place near you!
- Almost everyone in our society should be aware that they might have information that is useful from the point of view of identification.

He goes on to give examples:

1. A group of 14 Chinese people are brought to a village factory in Poland, transported by bus. Locals noticed this. Sometime later, the Chinese people disappear. Two of them escape after two months. They had been exploited by the owner, deprived of any rights. They came to Poland legally, recruited to work. This group spent 24 hours in the factory, were not allowed to go out, had to sleep in the factory.

One has to ask, 'Where were the neighbours, for three months, why were they not asking questions of the situation?'

2. A foreign woman went to the gynaecologist with two men who spoke good Polish. She suffered from problems of the vagina – which looked like a case of rape. She claimed she loved sex. The nurse, doctor – male gynaecologist – accepted this explanation. There were two to three indicators of human trafficking in this scenario, and not picked up. If the medical practitioners are not sensitive enough, not open to this knowledge, it is just another medical care and a service that they provide without looking deeper into the case.

The stories beg the question: do we have the tools to identify victims? Might this be the main problem in detecting or combating cases of trafficked victims?

Shift in Approach To Victims

- A victim-centred approach is important. Not the 'old' scenario of 'We will give you shelter provided you testify,' as this only creates victims a second time. One needs to understand that human trafficking is a violation of human rights and must be stressed as such. It is her/his right to benefit from our services. One 's personal and social life does not happen in a vacuum.
- Law enforcement agencies must be relied on and expected to collect information, gather evidence and find out as much detail as is possible and then share this information with NGOs, faith groups and others who are working with victims.
- If we are to change public opinion, and expectation, it is important to educate people to take responsibility for creating an unfair world in which those with means are happy to produce clothes (often made by children), buy goods, and exploit labour at the cheapest rate.
- Human trafficking is a structural 'social sin' of our civilisation. The public has to begin to accept that this issue is their obligation! Employers may ask where is the problem if they hire someone for 10 Zloty? And if this is 'under the table' and the end result is to produce cheaper goods for the consumer, is this not a good thing? Not if it is exploitation leading to labour trafficking.

The vision of the RENATE Network and its strength lies in sharing best practices – at all levels – and in creating strategies that will enable it to experiment together with its component parts in the various European countries where it has a presence. Human trafficking is a global phenomenon, but it begins as a local one. Therefore it must be tackled at the local level – the source – in order to stem the tide of its global spread.

Recommendations of TIP Report 2015

- Provide child victims of trafficking with specialised care;
- Increase training for prosecutors and judges;
- Investigate, prosecute, and convict individuals engaged in labour trafficking;
- Improve efforts to identify victims proactively among vulnerable populations, particularly unaccompanied children and irregular migrants;
- Continue to investigate and prosecute trafficking offences vigorously and take steps to ensure that trafficking offenders receive sentences commensurate with the severity of the crime;
- Facilitate victims' access to compensation by encouraging prosecutors to request compensation during criminal cases and systematically informing victims of their right to pursue civil suits against their traffickers;
- Increase the shelter system's capacity to assist victims, including men and children;
- Consider amending the criminal code to ensure that identified victims are not penalised for acts committed as a direct result of being subjected to trafficking;
- Consider establishing an independent national rapporteur to monitor the Government's anti-trafficking progress;
- Conduct additional awareness campaigns to reduce the demand for commercial sex acts.²⁷²

RENATE members are well placed to carry out many of the recommendations across its European-wide Network with the assistance of partners who may be ready to fund its operational work.

272) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report - <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243561.pdf> Accessed 14 August 2015

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS – in appreciation of:

Author: Sr Patricia Mulhall, CSB

CONTRIBUTORS

Ms Aneta Grabowska (Secretary of RENATE)

Sr Anna Bałchan, SMI, and Ms Magdalena Lasota, PoMOC Association

Professor Zbigniew Lasocik – Human Trafficking Studies Centre at Warsaw University

Ms Aneta Suda, Ministry of Interior, Expert in Migration Department, Warsaw

Ms Joanna Garnier, Vice President, La Strada, Warsaw

Major Tomasz Nowak, Border Guard Headquarters, Poland

Sr Ewa Jachimek, AMBP

Mr Jakub Zakrzewski, pro-bono Lawyer.

ROMANIA

US TIP Report, 2015 status: Tier 2

“Romania is a source, transit, and destination country for men, women, and children subjected to labour trafficking and women and children subjected to sex trafficking. Romanians represent a significant source of sex and labour trafficking victims in Western Europe (particularly the United Kingdom, Italy, Spain, and France) and Central and Southern Europe (particularly the Czech Republic, Hungary, and Greece). Romanian men, women, and children are subjected to labour trafficking in agriculture, construction, domestic service, hotels, and manufacturing, as well as forced begging and theft in Romania and other European countries. Romanian women and children are victims of sex trafficking in Romania and other European countries. Romanian victims of forced begging and forced criminal activities are often Romani children. Romania is a destination country for a limited number of foreign trafficking victims, including sex trafficking victims from Moldova and Poland and labour trafficking victims from Bangladesh and Serbia. Government officials have been convicted of human trafficking crimes, and there have been reported instances of local officials obstructing trafficking investigations.”²⁷³



It is estimated that trafficking victims comprise a 50-50 divide between forced labour and forced prostitution. There is a growing recognition of the extent of the problem in Romania but there is still little being done to really address the issue. It is difficult to have an accurate picture of exactly how many people are trafficked from Romania as the figures available are only up to 2009 and even then they seem inadequate when considering the countries in the world into which Romanians are trafficked. Map²⁷⁴ The Romanian Government does not fully comply with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking. However, it is making significant efforts to do so, according to TIP report, 2015. It demonstrates strong law enforcement efforts, but issues weak or suspended sentences that do not deter traffickers or keep victims safe when traffickers are released. While Government identifies a large number of victims, public and private institutions assist only half of them.

Government does not provide funding to NGOs offering victim assistance, and victims have difficulty obtaining medical services, psychological counselling, and restitution from traffickers. Some victims who had been returned to their homes by the Government, instead of being placed in shelters, were subjected to trafficking again by family members. Often it is NGOs who are left to ‘pick up the pieces’ when any repatriating of victims happens and since there are no funds available to them they have to spend valuable time fundraising for their work in almost 20 shelters provided for victims.

GRETA (the Council of Europe’s Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings) published its evaluation on Romania, 2012. The report found that, according to the Romanian authorities, nearly all the victims of trafficking identified to date have been Romanian nationals, the majority of them being victims of transnational trafficking. The number of identified victims was 1,780 in 2007, 1,240 in 2008, 780 in 2009 and 1,154 in 2010.

²⁷³) <http://romania.usembassy.gov/2015-tip-en.html>

²⁷⁴) https://www.google.co.uk/webhp?sourceid=chrome-instant&rlz=1C1PRFB_enGB657GB657&ion=1&espv=2&ie=UTF-8#q=map+of+romania. Accessed 21 Sep, 2015

With regard to 2010, 74% of the identified victims (849 persons) were subject to transnational trafficking, the main destination countries being Spain (234 victims), Italy (206 victims), the Czech Republic (87 victims), Cyprus (78 victims) and France (68 victims). National trafficking victims comprised 305 of the victims identified in 2010. The number of identified foreign victims of trafficking has been low: 18 in 2008 (10 male victims and eight female victims), one female victim in 2009 and two female victims in 2010.

The Romanian authorities have indicated that the number of victims of Romanian nationality identified in the first half of 2011 (488) increased by 29% compared with the same period in 2010. Six foreign nationals were identified as victims of sexual exploitation and labour exploitation in agriculture in the first half of 2011. In 2010, the main forms of exploitation were labour exploitation (503 identified victims, i.e. 43% of the total number) and sexual exploitation of trafficked persons (482 identified victims, i.e. 42%). Further, 112 victims were subjected to forced begging, 6 to forced stealing and 6 to pornography. Women have constituted the majority of identified victims (56%).

With regard to child trafficking, 307 child victims were identified in 2010, 88% of whom were female. The vast majority of minor victims (239) were sexually exploited. The other children identified had been trafficked for the purposes of labour exploitation in agriculture and construction (17 victims), forced begging (19 victims), pornography (5 victims) or theft (3 victims). Whereas adults are mostly victims of transnational trafficking, the Romanian authorities have indicated that 71% of the minor victims of trafficking (217 victims) were trafficked nationally. For the other minor victims, the destination countries were mainly European Union countries, particularly Italy (45 victims), Spain (20 victims) and Germany (9 victims).²⁷⁵

Non-Government Agencies

There is little confidence among NGOs in the National Agency in terms of provision. And yet, according to TIP, 2015 the National Agency against Trafficking in Persons coordinated implementation of the 2012-2016 counter-trafficking strategy developed in consultation with NGOs and drafted an updated 2015-2016 action plan. The agency regularly published reports and statistics on trafficking. The national agency assisted in the implementation of six NGO-led national awareness campaigns and 53 local campaigns that reportedly reached an audience of over two million people. The Government partnered with NGOs, a multinational bank, private companies, and a foreign embassy to raise awareness of trafficking in Romanian schools.²⁷⁶

On the whole, NGOs seem much better at dealing with the victims but can only assist with a fraction of those who may need support and assistance – it's the tip of the iceberg. For example, in 2008 1,240 victims of trafficking were identified, whereas in 2009, 780 victims were identified. The law in Romania provides a 90-day reflection period for foreign victims of trafficking. However, there is no record of any foreign victim availing of this time. The co-authors of this report visited different NGOs in the country – all dealing with the issue of human trafficking in various ways.²⁷⁷ The main host during the study visit for the co-authors, was Solwodi ²⁷⁸Romania. It is dedicated to raising awareness about human trafficking in an effort to pull slavery out from the shadows and into the public eye.

275) http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/Docs/Reports/GRETA_2012_2_FGR_ROU_en.pdf Implementation of Council of Europe Convention on Action against trafficking, par 10-12, June 2012

276) <http://romania.usembassy.gov/2015-tip-en.html>

277) Co-authors of the report: Sister Adina Balan, cj Congregation of the Sisters of Jesus, Romania and Sister Marie Power, hf. UK, congregation of the Holy Family of Bordeaux, January 2015

278) www.solwodi.ro Solwodi is the short form for SOLidarity with WOMen in DIstress. A Solwodi counselling centre in Romania was opened in 2009 in order to help women and children and diminish their vulnerability to abuse situations and to protect victims of domestic violence and human trafficking through a holistic psychosocial care and counselling, shelter, legal intervention and medical assistance.

Through education, Solwodi hopes that more people will become inspired to take action against this issue. The Solwodi project provides prevention education lectures locally, nationally, and internationally to address topics in human trafficking such as culture, sex tourism, 'loverboy' recruitment and victim identification.

The programmes and services at Solwodi include: protection, basic needs, medical/health care, psychological care, spiritual formation and direction, education and skills training, life skill instruction, legal assistance and protection. In Timisoara an agency visited called *Generatie Tanara*, was founded in 2001 initially as a refugee camp for Uzbek people. The main thrust of the work there is rescue and prevention. Although this continues now as a refugee camp mainly for Palestinian people, it also provides shelter for victims of trafficking who have returned to Romania. Mrs. Mariana Petersel, the director of the project acknowledges that the way forward is to educate the children so that they will not become victims themselves.

AIDRom²⁷⁹ also hosted a visit from the co-authors. This agency organises seminars – round tables with representatives of SENSE network, representatives of churches, government representatives (National Agency against Human Trafficking, Ministry of Labour, EURES platform) and unions, on preventing trafficking through labour exploitation. During the meetings information is shared on gender migration risks, vulnerable groups of people being trafficked, forced labour, social inclusion for victims of trafficking and prevention campaigns on human trafficking phenomenon.

Individual and group counselling for vulnerable persons and / or trafficked persons is also available. The counseling sessions are held at Bucharest and Timisoara with qualified and experienced personnel in the field of human trafficking. An important aspect of the project is the group of third country nationals in Bucharest and Timisoara. AIDRom Office has experience in their integration in Romania, among which were identified a high level of migrants travelling towards EU for work. These migrant foreign citizens need advice in preventing them falling victims to trafficking situations, in particular through labour exploitation.²⁸⁰

Another names Free that was visited is mainly involved in outreach programmes working on the streets with women in prostitution. It works with volunteers who work in four different areas of Bucharest. This agency does street counselling, and education groups for children to prevent them being trafficked. It supports advertising campaigns to educate the men who are the main users of those on the streets. It also produces a book of cartoons highlighting stories of people who are trafficked and in this way hopes that the power of the story will help deter and combat the practice.

ADPARE is a privately funded NGO that started initially to work in collaboration with the International Organization for Migration. It works with their embassies to enable the re-integration of women who have been trafficked. It runs a safe house shelter and helps victims of trafficking to collaborate with the various countries to prosecute the traffickers from those countries. It also assists victims who have returned to renew their identity cards, birth certificates and other documents which are often confiscated by the traffickers. This agency has 5 staff, 20 volunteers and 2 therapists. It also runs a 'buddy system' whereby former victims can help those just returning to the country and accompany them.

REACHING OUT is a shelter for minors who have been trafficked both internally and externally. This agency arose out of a project working with street children. Romania had many orphanages during the Communist era.

279) www.aidrom.ro/ 'Interchurch Aid – Department of Romania.' AIDRom started the work in a collaboration between the Orthodox Church, Calvin Reformed Church and the Lutheran Church in Romania, the work being coordinated by the World Council of Churches.

280) <http://aidrom.ro/english/index.php/about-aidrom/> Accessed 25 September, 2015

Many of the young women who left those orphanages had nowhere to go and often ended up on the street, easy prey for traffickers, especially the 'lover boys,' who tricked them into working for them as their boyfriends. The 'lover-boy' method is a common tactic used by traffickers to befriend young girls, ply them with gifts, offer prospects and promises of work and all the while 'groom' them for the sex trade, making them work in prostitution. This agency accompanies the girls to court to enable them to give evidence against the traffickers. Because of the danger they employ a security firm to protect the girls. Should the traffickers try to break into the shelter the security firms are called rather than the police! The agency also provides life skills training for the young women to help them complete their education. As per the norm in Romania, this agency is totally dependent on funds from outside the country and has to continually raise their own.

Centrul Parteneriat pentru Egalitate²⁸¹

This project supports and strengthens the fight against trafficking through the use of a gender-sensitive methodology. It works in Romania, Italy and Spain and connects several activities which need close co-operation between the three countries. The aim of the project is to provide a set of tools with a methodology that will make policy making and action planning more effective, particularly in the prevention of human trafficking.

Police

There are varying degrees of co-operation with specialised police who are formed to deal with the whole issue of trafficking, whether this is in the form of rescuing or co-operating with other police forces about prosecution. It would seem that government statistics vastly underrate the problem of trafficking. In 2009 the Government reorganised the anti-trafficking agency – the National Agency Against Trafficking in Persons (NAATIP). It was changed from an independent, national agency with the authority to administer federal funding for anti-trafficking initiatives, to a subordinate agency of the National Police under the Ministry of the Interior. NGOs and international organisations reported that this has left Romania without a national agency to provide direction to other ministries with anti-trafficking responsibilities. One group's concern is that while there are specialised police trained in working in trafficking there is still some suspicion on behalf of other European police forces and therefore co-operation is difficult with, for example, the UK police preferring to deal directly with the victims when it comes to prosecution in the UK.

European Union

There are varying degrees of co-operation with the European Union. Agencies within Romania are sceptical of how effective the work of the EU is in terms of meetings that take place in the best hotels, which are mainly 'talking shops' with little achievement to show for their efforts. NGOs feel that the money paid out to conduct these meetings could be spent more effectively on work with victims of trafficking.

All the groups visited showed the attempts made to encourage victims to co-operate with the courts, to identify traffickers, and to testify against them so that traffickers are held to account for their crimes. But this is difficult as the traffickers are known – almost always – to the victims either because they are family members or 'lover boys' in the chain of enslavement. Sometimes they are kidnapped by the trafficker. Trafficking takes place both inside Romania and to other European countries. However, despite many perceptions victims can and do return to their families, even to so-called dysfunctional ones. The main task of many of the agencies working in trafficking is prevention. This is done through education, particularly in schools, churches, youth groups and other places where young people are gathered.

281) www.cpe.ro supporting the call for sex education in schools.

One of the main problems observed was the lack of co-operation between each of the NGOs working on the ground. This may be due to a variety of reasons, not least that the founders of organisations have a different approach to the work of anti-trafficking and feel they do not have enough in common with other groups or feel they are doing the 'main' work in this field. Another reason may be the issue of funds. Since funds are scarce, it may also be that agencies are in competition with each other in their appeals for funds.

RECOMMENDATIONS from the TIP report, 2015

- Allocate public funding for NGOs providing services to victims and provide funding to staff the new government shelter for trafficking victims.
- Improve victim access to medical assistance and increase quality of psychological counselling.
- Investigate, prosecute, and convict traffickers, including complicit officials, and seek and obtain sentences that are sufficiently stringent and commensurate with the severity of the crime.
- Assess safety of home environments before releasing victims to prevent re-trafficking.
- Withhold from publication names of trafficking victims who testify in trials; consistently inform victims of their right to apply for compensation.
- Increase efforts to proactively identify potential victims among vulnerable populations, such as undocumented migrants, foreign workers, Roma, and children involved in begging.
- Operate the anti-trafficking hotline on evenings and weekends, and do not prosecute victims for crimes committed as a direct result of their being subjected to human trafficking.

RENATE has a presence in Romania. The challenges are many, resources are few. With additional assistance, it may be able to meet some of the main difficulties presented, including working in collaboration with the existing NGOs that seem to be ploughing a lone furrow.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS – in appreciation of:

Authors: Sr Marie Power, HFB
Congregation of the Sisters of the Holy Family of Bordeaux
Sr Adina Balan, CJ Congregatio Jesu

CONTRIBUTORS:

NGOs
Mrs. Mariana Petersel, Director Generatie Tanara
Solwodi Romania
AIDRom / Free / ADPARE / Reaching Out / Centrul Parteneriat pentru Egalitate

Spain

US TIP Report, 2015: Tier 1

“Spain is a source, destination, and transit country for men, women, and children subjected to forced labour and sex trafficking. Women, primarily from Romania, Ukraine, Russia, Croatia, Bulgaria, Brazil, Colombia, Ecuador, Paraguay, Venezuela, China, and Nigeria, are subjected to sex trafficking in Spain. Victims are recruited by false promises of employment in the service industry or agriculture and are subsequently subjected to sex trafficking and debt bondage upon their arrival to Spain. Nigerian women are increasingly subjected to sex trafficking in the country through debt bondage and threats. Many women in prostitution in Spain are held under the control of organised crime networks, including Chinese, Nigerian, and Albanian trafficking networks that operate out of major cities in Spain. Some undocumented migrant men and women reportedly are forced to work in domestic service, agriculture, construction, and the service industry. Unaccompanied migrant children in Spain continue to be vulnerable to sex trafficking and forced begging.”²⁸²



Human trafficking and irregular migration in Spain ²⁸³

Due to its geographical position, set with Morocco and Algeria as its most proximate southern neighbours, Spain is often described as the African gate into Europe – alongside Italy and Malta - for migrants seeking a better life in Europe, particularly, though by no means exclusively through the Mediterranean coastal access. Reports and conversations held with NGOs working with potential trafficking victims in southern Spain, reveal that stricter migration policies, and the abuse of power on the part of migration officials in some of the north African countries has resulted in many migrants turning to mafia networks in order to secure a ‘safe’ passage into Spain. As one digital newspaper put it, “the greater the control on migration, the more difficult it is for someone to cross the frontier as a regular migrant and the easier for the criminal networks to offer themselves as organisations that can guarantee a safe passage into Europe”.²⁸⁴

Reports and conversations held with NGOs working with potential trafficking victims in southern Spain reveal that stricter migration policies and the abuse of power on the part of migration officials in some of the north African countries has resulted in many migrants turning to mafia networks in order to secure a ‘safe’ passage into Spain. As one digital newspaper put it, “the greater the control on migration, the more difficult it is for someone to cross the frontier as a regular migrant and the easier for the criminal networks to offer themselves as organisations that can guarantee a safe passage into Europe.”²⁸⁵

282) US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report - <http://www.refworld.org/docid/53aab9a410.html> [accessed 12.04.2015]

283) <http://www.infoplease.com/atlas/country/spain.html>

284) “La trata de menores, una realidad invisible en España” by Nicolas Castellano on CADENA SER, 07-11-2013. (citation from the newspaper “La Razon”) Aso Helena Maleno in periodismohumano 08.11.2013

285) “La trata de menores, una realidad invisible en España” by Nicolas Castellano on CADENA SER, 07.11.2013 (citation from the newspaper “La Razon”) Aso Helena Maleno in periodismohumano 08.11.2013

As in the case of Italy and Malta, it is frequently during the process of irregular migration that recruitment for human trafficking happens. According to Elena Maleno, an expert in Spanish migration and member of the Caminando Fronteras organisation, human trafficking networks frequently present themselves as an opportunity for safe migration in the countries of origin. “Recruitment,” she says, “occurs also in the case of the so-called drug couriers, minors used by the networks to carry drugs during migration, a form of human trafficking increasingly common in North Africa”²⁸⁶. Spain is also a transit country, favoured by traffickers to introduce women from Latin America into Holland, Denmark, France and Italy – following older pathways of political colonisation, business networks and language affinities.

Main routes used by traffickers to introduce their victims into Spain

A considerable number of victims from Northern and sub-Saharan Africa enter Spain through airports, though most of them arrive irregularly by boat, mainly through Morocco, Ceuta, Melilla and the coastline of Almeria Granada and Murcia. Victims from Nigeria are brought into Spain through Senegal and Morocco or, alternatively, via Niger, Algeria to Morocco before entering Spain through Ceuta and Melilla. Another known route for victims from Nigeria is Lagos-Dakar-Paris-Madrid. Women recruited in Nigeria travel from their villages in lorries to Lagos, then by plane to Dakar and on to Paris. These are mostly women who contract a debt of €50,000 and in some cases they must subsequently pay their traffickers €500 per week, plus €200 for accommodation and €60 a week for food.²⁸⁷ Victims from East European countries, mainly Rumania, Ukraine, Russia, and Lithuania are transported by land, arriving in Spain via France, Germany or Italy. An alternative route for victims from Russia is via Belarus and Ukraine.²⁸⁸

Maps published by the Ministry of the Interior illustrating countries of origin and transit show Brazil-Spain or Italy-Spain, and Columbia-France as the main routes for victims from South America.²⁸⁹ The so-called ‘new route’ is used by Dominican, Turkish and Greek criminal gangs to transport victims from the Dominican Republic. Men destined for labour exploitation and women destined for sexual exploitation arrive in Turkey by plane and are then taken by boat across the Évros river into Greece, where they are forced into prostitution before being moved on to Spain.²⁹⁰ Within Spain itself, victims are often moved from one part of the country to another, following the seasonal flow of tourism, or the seasonal flow of farm labour in the case of labour exploitation. Moving victims around is a common strategy used by the traffickers to avoid police checks, as well as preventing clients from becoming emotionally involved with the victims. NGOs engaged in assistance of victims say that the women are sometimes moved from one club to another every two to three weeks.

The criminal gangs and their recruitment methods

Romanian, Chinese, Nigerian, Albanian and Cameroonian trafficking rings operate throughout Spain. According to the Spanish Ombudsman report 2012, these gangs operate across countries of origin, transit and destination. They are composed of “Spaniards and foreigners, mainly middle-aged males. Frequently there are female members of these criminal groups who are of the same nationality of the victims. In some cases, these females responsible for controlling the victims may be (or may previously have been) in a situation of exploitation themselves. Spaniards usually form part of the criminal group as the exploiters of the victims (namely as owners or managers of establishments where exploitation is carried out, or as other related professions).”²⁹¹

286) Elena Maleno: “La Trata en el Transito Migratorio: De la Externalizacion al Ser Humano” published in gepibaleares.files.wordpress.com

287) R. Rivera, “La ruta de las mafias africanas” in Teinteresa.es 17.12.2013

288) Press release from the Ministry of the Interior, 07.12.2014

289) www.interior.gob.es

290) Antena3.com TV 05.08.2014

291) Invisible Victims, I. 2.2. page 13

Each network has its own preferred strategy for recruiting victims. Juju is often reported in the case of sub-Saharan victims, particularly those coming from Nigeria, whilst in the case of women from Eastern Europe the use of physical violence is reported as a means of coercion. In the case of Latin American women the debt incurred undertaking the costly journey is exploited, whilst for those from Asia male domination appears to keep the women in submission.²⁹²

Furthermore, as will be recounted across the rest of the European experience, “recruitment methods vary according to the type of exploitation: in the case of sexual exploitation the form of contact is mainly through friends, acquaintances and even family members, while for labour exploitation recruitment is carried out through more structured networks such as agencies or brokers and media adverts, with no emotional attachment to the victim.”²⁹³ Increasingly, many victims from troubled areas of the world are recruited via Internet, lured by the promise of a better life in Spain. As elsewhere, victims are recruited through promises of a good job, or through travel and modelling agencies. Sham marriages have also featured as a frequent means of recruitment, whilst reports of kidnapped children used to force their mothers to work as prostitutes whilst they pay the debt incurred by the journey have been logged.²⁹⁴ In these cases the children remain in the hands of the traffickers while their mothers are under the gang’s control.

In the case of sub-Saharan women, especially those from Nigeria, superstitious beliefs are used in the form of voodoo and black magic rituals, whereby the victims commit themselves to pay a huge debt or incur the wrath of God for themselves or their families. Very often traffickers are even seen as giving security and prestige to the members of the community. Emotional and community ties are used as a means of control, “making the victims identify the network as a system of protection during transit migration.”²⁹⁵

The victims’ profile and countries of origin

According to the Ombudsman report 2012 the profile of victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation is that of a Romanian woman between the ages of 18 and 32, and a Brazilian woman between the ages of 33 and 42.²⁹⁶

The 2013 report presented by Spain to the EMN (European Migration Network) on the identification of victims shows the following classification:

- **From East European countries:**

Aged between 18 and 30, often victims do not speak the language. They normally come from villages or small towns, seldom from the capital. Family charges back at home.

- **From African countries:**

Aged between 18 and 24, low educational level and job training. Normally they do not speak the language, though many have a command of English. Family charges back at home.

- **From Latin American countries:**

Aged between 20 and 45. The majority of victims have family charges back home, with an average of three children. Low educational level and job training. Documents are taken from them.

292) Sagrario Ortega/EFE Madrid 17.08.2013 in www.publico.es/.../campana-policia-liberar-mujeres-e... See also Inma Gil in “Las redes de trata hacia España” in news.bbc.co.uk/hi/spanish/specials/.../6426429.stm

293) “Estudo Exploratorio da Trata de Persoas en Galicia” published in 2013, and various other sources

294) Memoria de la Fiscalía General del Estado 2013, Chapter III, 4.2.1 page 341. Reported also by various other sources.

295) Elena Maleno: La Trata en el Transito Migratorio: De la Externalizacion al Ser Humano, published in gepib-baleares.files.wordpress.com

296) (Ombudsman report 2012, page 111)

They mistrust the authorities, and they do not come forward to the police for fear of reprisals. The countries of origin for victims of human trafficking for sexual exploitation most often mentioned by other sources are Brazil, Colombia and Paraguay in Latin America; Nigeria and Cameroon in Africa; Romania, Ukraine and Russia in Eastern Europe, as well as China. Romania and Brazil are often reported as the two main source countries for victims of human trafficking in Spain. For labour exploitation victims are men mainly from Morocco and Senegal, Nigeria and Eastern Europe. They are trafficked into seasonal farm labour, construction and social care sectors, alongside the usual arenas of domestic servitude and forced begging, in which children are also involved.

According to information given by CICO (Intelligence Centre Against Organized Crime) the proportion of women victims by nationality in 2011 was as follows:

- 1) 47% from Central and South America;
- 2) 45% from Europe;
- 3) 7% from Africa;

However, NGO reports show various other tendencies according to the geographical location from which they are reporting. A considerable number of minors, mainly from Romania and the sub-Saharan region, were reported by NGOs in 2013. In an interview given to Europa Press, the Coordinator of APRAMP (Association for the Prevention, Reinsertion and Assistance of Women Prostitutes) referred to what she felt was a new trend, namely that in 2013, more than 10% of the victims detected by her organisation were children. She said, “previously, potential victims were women nearing their 18th year, whereas now they are 15 and 16.” She attributes this to a change in client demand: “Now the clients are asking for children’s bodies, that is why there are more and more child victims.”²⁹⁷ However, more research is required to fully understand whether this is a change in human trafficking selection, or more a matter of improved identification of minors caught in trafficking exploitation. The Spanish Network Against Trafficking in Persons also commented on this new observation, referring to a reported increase of minors being trafficked for sexual exploitation in the country, a tendency which is also visible in many other countries in Europe.²⁹⁸

Police sources indicate that most victims of human trafficking and sexual exploitation are legally in Spain.²⁹⁹ However, there is a problem with the data, as Spanish policing has only recently been recognising sexual exploitation as a form of human trafficking. According to an article published on BBC Mundo.com, “Victims of human trafficking enter Spain legally with false work contracts or tourist visas, and once there they remain as illegal residents.”³⁰⁰ It appears that victims from Africa are more likely to come in as undocumented migrants, many via the highly precarious pateras, small inflatable dinghies, which are overcrowded and many not appropriate for the challenging conditions of the Mediterranean. Those coming from Latin America exploit former diplomatic ties and tend to have legal status.

Number of victims

As with every other country surveyed, the hidden nature of human trafficking and the different approaches across agencies and first responder organisations to the criteria which would identify victims makes it difficult to measure the real magnitude of the problem. However, “it happens every day before our eyes, but we don’t see it, or we look the other way. Law enforcement authorities do the same at times: it is human trafficking for sexual or labour exploitation.”³⁰¹ CEAR (Comisión Española de Ayuda al Refugiado) estimates that at present, there are between 40,000 and 50,000 women and children victims of sexual exploitation in Spain.³⁰² Many of these would probably fall into the category of potential victims of human trafficking.

297) Taken from an article published by Publico.es 16.04.2013 “Las ONG detectan un aumento de la explotación sexual infantil en España”

298) “Las ONGs detectan un aumento de la explotación sexual infantil en España” www.publico.es/.../ong-detectan-aumento-explotacion. 16.04.2013

299) Press release from the Ministry of the Interior, Madrid, 12.07.2014

300) Inma Gil Las Redes de Trata Hacia España. BBC Mundo, November 2007

301) Article by Juan G. Bedoya in “El País” 21.01.2014

302) www.europapress.es/.../noticia-cear-cifra-50000-nume, Madrid 30.07.2014

The Ministry of the Interior suggests that there are 12,000 to 14,000 potential victims of human trafficking in Spain, with less than five per cent (4.63 %) of the victims assessed as minors. A mere 406 victims were identified in 2012, with 89 who were for labour exploitation and forced begging.³⁰³ However, some NGOs claim that they are dealing with over 1,000 victims or potential victims every year.³⁰⁴ Furthermore, due to the limited nature of the Spanish protocol on trafficking there is a big problem in Spain involving victims of trafficking for sexual purposes from Romania, and as an EU member “they don’t enter into the circuit of protection established by the protocol against trafficking,” according to Paula Mandillo, a social worker with *Mujer Emancipada*.³⁰⁵ Without this protection, she claims, this sector of victims are moved around the country and Europe as a whole, thereby exploiting the free movement of EU labour.

With regard to those being brought in from sub-Saharan Africa, another representative from the NGO *Colectivo Caminando Fronteras* asserts that she believes trafficking rings often use pregnancy and babies to assist the access of women from sub-Saharan Africa to achieve domicile in Spain or to coerce them into forced prostitution. This exploitation of rape, pregnancy and young infants in the furtherance of trafficking profits is an area which requires further examination and consideration by the authorities. Until recently, when pateras landed on the coast, babies with their alleged mothers were not formally identified by the authorities. However, since 2014 this has started to be revised, with DNA tests being undertaken on both infant and ‘mother’ at port of entry to assist the authorities in onward identification and protection of the children in situations of great vulnerability.³⁰⁶

According to CICO (Intelligence Centre Against Organised Crime), 264 victims of human trafficking and 916 victims of sexual exploitation were identified in 2013. However, since the police Action Plan currently only deals with sexual exploitation as human trafficking, and also because the Defensor del Pueblo recognises that there is a serious mismatch between those who are identified as victims and those who are identified as being ‘at risk of trafficking’, with a multiplier of up to twenty times, if the United National Office on Drugs and Crime (UNDOC) supposition is to be taken forward, there are no official statistics about the number of victims of human trafficking for labour exploitation. In 2009 law enforcement agencies detected 6,157 individuals in at-risk situations as compared with 15,075 in 2010 and 14,370 in 2011 respectively – whilst those identified as victims lingered in all years under the thousand mark.

Furthermore, the Defensor del Pueblo is particularly concerned about the failure to address issues appropriately around trafficking for labour exploitation, and has been putting efforts behind realising a new Comprehensive Plan to Combat Human Trafficking for the purposes of Labour Exploitation. Most authorities and NGOs working with this vulnerable and ‘hidden’ sector agree that there is a long way to go to reassure victims of labour exploitation that their cases will be taken seriously and that they do not have to contend with legal actions on themselves as irregular migrants, whilst seeking to escape their trafficked circumstances.³⁰⁷ Both the UNDOC report on Human Trafficking 2014 and the GRETA (Group of Experts on Action Against Trafficking) Assessment report on Spain’s compliance with the European Convention on Human Trafficking highlight the need to pay attention to other forms of human trafficking such as labour, forced begging and domestic servitude. “Some undocumented migrant men and women reportedly are forced to work in domestic service, agriculture, construction, textile industry, hotel/catering sector and the service industry. Unaccompanied migrant children in Spain continue to be vulnerable to sex trafficking and forced begging.”³⁰⁸

303) Memoria Fiscalia General del Estado 2013, III, 4.2.1 Table I.

304) Conversations held with the Inter-Ecclesial Anti-trafficking Network in Madrid, September 2014

305) An NGO in Málaga that helped over one hundred women, mainly from Nigeria and Romania, in 2012. <http://www.ipsnews.net/2013/12/assisting-rather-deporting-victims-trafficking-spain/> [accessed 12.04.2015]

306) Helena Maleno, *Colectivo Caminando Fronteras*, an NGO that defends migrant rights – in <http://www.ipsnews.net/2013/12/assisting-rather-deporting-victims-trafficking-spain/> [accessed 12.04.2015]

307) Human Trafficking in Spain: Invisible Victims www.defensordelpueblo.es

308) UNDOC United States Department of State Trafficking in Persons Report, June 2014 <https://www.unodc.org>

Main forms of human trafficking

By far the most common form of formally identified human trafficking in Spain is that of sexual exploitation. Demand for and supply of the market for commercial sex is created by numerous strip clubs, massage parlours, saunas, bars, spas, private apartments, and highway motels where sex can be purchased. In certain cities there are substantial areas given over to this market as in the Polígono Villaverde Alto, Zona Marconi in Madrid, and brothel areas such as the one in Junquera on the French border. Different nationalities are located in different environments, with Chinese typically working out of private apartments, whereas Nigerians are more frequently found in motorway/ motel establishments. Commercial sexual services are advertised freely and widely in media throughout Spain. “An analysis of trafficking in Spain reveals that it is clearly linked to prostitution. As indicated in the introduction, trafficking in women and young girls and boys exists because prostitution exists” the Spanish Government’s Plan to Combat Sexual Exploitation asserts.³⁰⁹

Forced Labour

So far no public policies aimed at combating human trafficking for the purpose of labour exploitation have been put in place in Spain. It is evident from conversations with NGOs that at present the Government’s National Plan to Combat Human Trafficking and the police National Action Plan deal exclusively with sexual exploitation. Although Article 177, introduced into the Criminal Code in 2011, established forced labour, slavery and slave-like practices, domestic servitude and forced begging into Spanish law as criminal offences, little has changed. The mechanisms to enforce this effectively or to address the corresponding responsibilities according to the EU Framework of 2003 are not yet in place. However, some positive steps were taken towards a better recognition of labour trafficking through the co-operation agreement signed between the Ministry of Employment and Social Security and the Ministry of the Interior in 2013.³¹⁰ In 2014, the Civil Guard created a special anti-trafficking unit and made labour exploitation a strategic focus.

According to the Ombudsman’s report 2012 none of the alleged victims of labour exploitation involved in official investigations were finally identified as victims of trafficking for labour exploitation. Officials and NGOs believe that victims of labour exploitation do not come forward to identify themselves – either because they are not aware they are exploited, or they fear the consequences once the police and the immigration authorities are aware of their presence.

The challenge of irregular migration, the lack of documentation and the ubiquitous insecurity of those seeking opportunities in Europe without formal qualifications for entry seriously undermine attempts by NGOs and any authorities getting involved in this area of labour exploitation to bring traffickers to light. However, prevention measures, awareness raising and a strong portfolio of support to protect victims are required to manifest forced labour, and see this sadly neglected manifestation of trafficking appropriately addressed. Training and political will is required for enforcement and to increase the appetite to take on this element of human trafficking, which appears to sit under the radar during this extended season of a seriously depressed economy in Spain, with low wages and high unemployment widespread across the country.

Child Trafficking

Since 2008 NGOs and Spain’s Ombudsman have been calling for attention to focus on Nigerian and Cameroonian networks believed to be introducing minors into the country through Ceuta and Melilla, as well as by patera along the coastline of Andalucía. In 2012, the Red Cross detected 48 children who entered the country by boat in the company of women victims of human trafficking. A further 21 cases of child victims – mainly girls aged 14 to 17 – were identified by the Ministry of the Interior the same year.³¹¹

org/documents/data-and-analysis/glotip/GLOTIP_2014_full_report.pdf

309) Plan to Combat Sexual Exploitation (English), I.4. Page 15

310) GRETA III 1. c , page 23

311) Article by N. Castellano 07-11-2013 CADENA SER Spanish Broadcasting Company December 2013

Case Study

Just a few days ago, (August 2015) in one of the last boats to reach the coast of Motril seven women arrived with seven children. They were referred to a Red Cross centre, and a few days later they had all disappeared, both the women and the children. All of them, the women and the children, had the profile typical of victims of human trafficking, but there was no time to identify them.³¹² In 2012 police started offering voluntary DNA tests to all those who arrive at the reception centres with children under their care. When they refuse, the Office of the Attorney General is notified.

The 'Niños Ancla'

Of special concern to the Spanish authorities and the NGOs in the case of Nigerian child victims is the method known as 'Niños Ancla' (anchor children), so-called because traffickers deploy them to control their women. Women testify to NGO first responders that traffickers take their children from them and give them to other women in order to enable their entry into Spain for forced prostitution.

Pregnancy is also used as a potential device. Those who are in advanced stages of pregnancy or are accompanied by young children are not placed into secure immigrant detention centres. Instead, they are referred to social organisations with humanitarian aid programmes. It appears that a staggering 25% of women entering Spain in the company of minors are 'false mothers'.³¹³ The majority of 'anchor children' are under the age of 4. When placed with their presumed mothers into appropriate 'reception' accommodation, after only a few days the 'false mother' and the child disappear. It is presumed that they are then effectively inserted into the sex industry in Spain or moved to other countries of the European Community.³¹⁴

Case Study

In 2013 police arrested three male traffickers and liberated five women from forced prostitution. Two children, who were of Nigerian nationality, had been found in the premises locked up in separate dirty and unhygienic rooms. Their mothers were not present. They were 'working' in France as trafficked prostitutes. They carried an indemnity of 40,000 and 45,000 euro against them which they needed to pay back to have their children returned.³¹⁵

Pornography and Child Sexual Exploitation

Many children born to female victims of human trafficking are considered the property of the traffickers, who decide their fate.³¹⁶ The traffickers may even sell the children for sexual exploitation for the paedophilic and the pornographic image market, and some law enforcers are now concerned that organ extraction might also be on the list of outcomes which await these unfortunate and 'unprotected' infants. According to NGO sources, Spain is frequently used by criminal gangs as a gateway to introduce African children into Europe. French-speaking children are taken from Spain to France or Belgium, whilst English-speaking are taken to Germany, Norway and Italy. Adolescent girls, frequently in groups, ages 12 to 18, are also potential victims, entering through Spanish airports usually accompanied by an adult and taken directly to strip clubs.³¹⁷ NGO sources indicate that an increasing number of very young children from Cameroon and other African countries are being brought into Spain and used for forced prostitution, street theft and begging.

312) N. Castellano in DADENA SER in Nov. 2013

313) Memoria de la Fiscalía General del Estado 2013, III. 4.2.1

314) Ibid.

315) Article published in Teinteresa.es 28/11/2013.

316) "La trata de menores, una realidad invisible en España" by Nicolas Castellano on CADENA SER, 07.11.2013.

317) Ibid.

Identification and protection of victims of human trafficking

In recent years, the Spanish Government has taken positive steps towards a more effective mechanism for the process of detection and identification of victims of human trafficking. However, NGOs often express their dissatisfaction with what is currently in place. The national Framework Protocol for the Protection of Victims of Human Trafficking, formally adopted in 2011, establishes a mechanism for the identification, referral, assistance and protection of victims of human trafficking, covering both EU nationals and third-country nationals. However, NGOs are concerned that the protocol has not yet been fully implemented, and because it has no legal status it can be easily overlooked during police procedures.

Formal identification of victims of human trafficking is presently the exclusive prerogative of police specialised in human trafficking. NGO collaboration in the process of identification, though advisable, is not obligatory, and many NGOs feel that police officers operating at airports and land frontiers often lack adequate training, and this can lead to many victims going undetected. The CETIs, reception centres for irregular immigrants, are places of great vulnerability, where potential victims often have to live side by side with their traffickers, which reduces their chances of escaping their control. The fact of having to face police in the early stages of the identification process also prevents many victims from coming forward because they do not trust the police as a result of intimidation on the part of the traffickers.³¹⁸

Challenges in Reception Centres

The GRETA report on Spain's implementation of the European Directive points to "the need to strengthen the detection of potential victims of trafficking among irregular migrants, as there is a risk that victims of trafficking may be recruited or controlled by their traffickers during detection and held in reception centres together with them." The number of irregular migrants passing through the CETIs is raising the risk of migrants falling into the hands of trafficking networks whilst being detained. This is particularly true of the centres in Ceuta and Melilla, where overcrowding and lack of efficient procedures of identification mean that many victims go undetected.

Police Protection

With regard to legal identification, NGOs often complain about some police officers' failure to understand the situation of the victims. As GRETA points out, "NGOs have highlighted the lack of capacity and expertise of law enforcement officers to identify potential victims of THB, as their priority is to control irregular migration."³¹⁹

Furthermore, in her follow-up report 2013 the Ombudsman remarks that on many occasions witness statements given by victims are not considered to be valuable by the police, because vital information which could lead to arrest or prosecution of traffickers appears at first sight to be missing.³²⁰ This leaves the victim in a situation of greater risk than they were before the investigation began. It is an issue which must be addressed with speed and determination by the authorities, to redress this situation of lost opportunities for prosecution and a failure to provide mandated protection for victims. Some victims refuse the protection they are being offered out of fear of police action against them. "What we are asking," one NGO told el Pais newspaper, is that "when a case is detected, the mandatory protocol is to automatically contact the specialized organisations, so that we can explain to the victim what support they are being offered."³²¹ In some autonomous communities, as is the situation with Madrid, this procedure is already being followed.

318) GRETA III, 3.a, page 40

319) GRETA III. 2. b, page 35

320) Ombudsman follow-up report 2013 1.3 Page 15

321) Article published in el Pais, May 2014)

This reluctance by undocumented potential victims of human trafficking to report themselves to the authorities is confirmed on many sides of the process. According to a study done by the Galicia Autonomous community, “Undocumented immigrants in situations of sexual or labour exploitation do not report to the authorities because they are not aware of being victims of a crime against human rights.”³²² Moreover, the “coercive methods used by traffickers are not only aimed at breaking the will of their victims ... but also the impunity of their own behaviour. Indeed, the ability to directly or indirectly intimidate – through relatives and family members - is of such magnitude and effectiveness that enslaved women rarely collaborate with justice in prosecuting and punishing offenders. Very few victims report and when they do, too often they withdraw, and even retract, during oral proceedings.”³²³

Another factor affecting the correct identification of victims of human trafficking is the confusion between victims of human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation and sexual exploitation as such. As the Spanish Ombudsman points out in her report *Invisible Victims* published in 2012, “It is difficult to ascertain at the time of detecting whether a person is being trafficked for sexual exploitation or, on the contrary, is being exploited without presenting the elements required to qualify as a victim of trafficking.” NGOs also highlight the need to revise the articles on the Criminal Code dealing with the criminalisation of human trafficking to establish a clear distinction between human trafficking and sexual exploitation.

NGOs are concerned to see a more victim-centred approach followed in the spirit of the Human Rights protection embedded in Spain’s Plan to Combat Human Trafficking.³²⁴ Furthermore, one NGO interviewed for this study commented that “There is a great deal of police activity with regard to the persecution of traffickers visible in the media and social networks, but most of the cases are filed and never followed up by the prosecution.” In 2013 the police arrested 345 persons for human trafficking related offences, and 408 for sexual exploitation, mostly men from Rumania, Spain and Nigeria. The number of arrests for human trafficking represents a 77% increase on the previous year.³²⁵

Recovery and Reflection Period

With regard to the recovery and reflection period, the Spanish law establishes that foreign victims of human trafficking are offered a recovery and reflection period of at least 30 days. This period should be long enough to allow the victim to decide whether he/she wants to cooperate with the authorities in the investigation.³²⁶ However, some NGOs point out that, in practice, the reflection period is insufficient to address the victim’s trauma. In the meantime, many potential victims of human trafficking fail to apply for the recovery and reflection period when it is offered by the police. Why this occurs no-one is certain. It may be due to reluctance on the part of the victims because of fear about having to testify or fear of reprisals. It could be concern about the measures that police might take due to being illegal migrants. Few victims of human trafficking are willing to report the traffickers and collaborate with the police. Some NGOs have expressed concern over the low number of victims who accept the offer of the recovery and reflection period. 763 recovery and reflection periods were offered by the authorities in 2011. Of these, between those denied and those rejected by the victims, only 98 were granted.

Some survivors are traumatised at the point of intervention. Those who arrive in small boats have witnessed the deaths of fellow travellers or their own children/relatives during their journey.³²⁷ Others, released from months or years of highly abusive situations as trafficked women within the sex industry are also clearly traumatised, and may well feel more affinity in terms of protection from their pimping traffickers than from the police. More work is required in this area to understand how to increase trust of the authorities in these situations of high victim anxiety.

322) “Estudo Exploratorio da Trata de Persoas en Galicia” 2013

323) Memoria de la Fiscalía General del Estado 2013 III. 4.2.4

324) Plan to Combat Human Trafficking I.1. page 10

325) Press release: Ministry of the Interior, Madrid, 12.07.2014

326) Ley Organica Article 59 bis 4/2000

327) *Invisible Victims* 2012

Identification and protection of child victims

According to a press release issued by the Office of the Spanish Ombudsperson on 25 March 2013, “the Directorate General of Police will take steps to identify foreign minors arriving irregularly in Spain. Their fingerprints and photographs will be recorded and the Prosecution Service and agencies in charge of child protection will be kept informed. The Police Headquarters for Foreigners and Borders has already issued instructions on this matter.”³²⁸ NGOs consider that this is a positive step forward, but it is insufficient, and has not yet been fully realised. It is important to bear in mind that when these children arrive at the border, rarely have they or their accompanying adults documents that might prove their identity or blood ties. Children thus unidentified are then open to being re-trafficked or sold into illegal adoption, once they have been registered by the State.

The national Framework Protocol makes provision for the adequate care and protection of minors and in their 2013 report to the EMN 2013 (European Migration Network),³²⁹ the Spanish authorities stated that “minor victims are given immediate assistance, support and protection. Measures are taken to ensure their safety, physical and psychosocial recovery and education, and to find a lasting solution for their case. These measures must be based on the particular vulnerability of the trafficked minor and taken after an individual assessment of the specific circumstances of the victim, taking into account his or her point of view, needs and interests.”³³⁰

Despite these affirmations, NGOs have expressed concern about the real effectiveness of the existing measures, and they are asking for quicker implementation of a new protocol on unaccompanied foreign minors, currently under development. In 2013 GRETA also called on the Spanish Government to develop efficient procedures that would “take into account the special needs and circumstances for the identification of child victims of trafficking, which includes the setting up of a specific referral mechanism for children involving child specialists, child protection services, and specialised police and prosecutors.”

Assistance/care and protection of victims

NGOs and other specialised organisations undertake the care and protection of victims, funded by different government ministries including Health, Social Services and Equality, and the Ministry of Employment and Social Security as well as by funds from the Autonomous Communities³³¹

Throughout the country there are residential and non-residential shelters, run by Religious Congregations and NGOs, which offer victims of human trafficking a wide range of services in view of their recovery from the trauma suffered and their re-integration into society. Some of these shelters also house children of the women victims of human trafficking. A complete guide to resources available for the care and protection of victims of human trafficking was compiled by the National Referral Mechanism and is updated every six months. Included in the list of services are:

- Adequate and safe accommodation;
- Psychological and medical care;
- Free specialised legal assistance;
- Social care and coverage of basic needs;
- Education and professional training;
- Support in job searching ;
- 24-hour telephone support.

328) GRETA 2013 III 3. a, page 41

329) ec.europa.eu/.../networks/european_migration_network/.../spain_en.htm

330) EMN 2013

331) EMN report 2013 1.3. page 7 GRETA 3. b, page 42

Referral to these and other specialised services available for victims of human trafficking is done directly to the different organisations which offer specialised programmes. NGO programmes for the care of victims are offered, not only to those victims who have been formally identified as such by the competent authority, but reach out to potential victims as well. Different ministerial bodies, both regional and national, designate funds for specific human trafficking projects and activities. According to GRETA, “the Government Delegation against Gender-based Violence has had an annual budget of two million euros to fund projects run by NGOs with proven experience in assisting women victims of trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation, with a view to providing them with employment, training, medical, legal, or psychological services. The budget earmarked for such projects has been reduced to 1.5 million EUR in 2013.”³³²

Among the organisations providing assistance and protection for victims are several Religious Congregations. Examples of these are: The women religious congregation of the Adoratrices, run centres in Madrid, Barcelona, Almeria, and Malaga, where projects of integrated care for trafficked women are developed. These projects offer victims a comprehensive programme of psychological, health, legal, and social assistance.³³³ As well as the projects mentioned above, the Adoratrices set up an NGO called the Amaranta Foundation,³³⁴ which works in various parts of Spain offering a programme of comprehensive care for women victims of trafficking, another programme for women victims of trafficking with children, and a third program for specialised attention to child victims of trafficking.

Another example is the Proyecto Intervención Oblatas Almeria, run by the congregation of the Oblatas in Almeria.³³⁵ The aim of this project is to assist women caught in prostitution and/or victims of human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation. The three main objectives of the project are:

- To contribute to women’s quality of life, offering safe accommodation conducive to a process of personal reflection and fostering self-determination, alternative employment and social re-integration.
- To raise public awareness and promote community intervention with regard to the reality of prostitution and its personal impacts, in the region.
- Outreach work to strip clubs, motorway motels, brothels.

The Oblatas have similar projects in several other Spanish cities. Most women attended by the Almeria project are foreign (many of them victims of human trafficking), although there is an increasing number of Spanish nationals who have turned to prostitution as a way of survival in the context of the country’s economic situation. As well as offering safe accommodation the project reaches out to places of prostitution (strip clubs, motorway motels, brothels etc.)

The response to human trafficking on the part of church institutions, Religious Congregations and other NGOs

The commitment of NGOs, Religious Congregations, and church organisations involved in the struggle against human trafficking is visible everywhere in Spain.

332) GRETA III 3. b, page 44. According to the latest US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report, funds allocated to NGOs providing shelter and services to victims increased by 2million EUR in 2014.

333) <http://www.adoratrices.com/>

334) <http://www.proyectoesperanza.org/?lang=en>

335) Proyecto Encuentro - Hermanas Oblatas - Provincia Europa
www.oblatas.com/social.php?...Proyectos...Almería

The Spanish Network Against Trafficking in Persons (SNATP)

Established in 2006, the network is composed of more than 20 NGOs and international bodies as either full or associated members. Several church organisations and members of Religious Congregations are present within the network, including the Oblatas and Adoratrices. One of the objectives of SNATP is to contribute to the development of proposals and strategies for combating human trafficking. The network also promotes the effective implementation of existing legislation and seeks to improve administrative practice within enforcement and the judiciary to prevent impunity on the part of traffickers and ensure the protection and rights of victims are upheld.

A clear example of their robust awareness raising and holding the public authorities to account is the public declaration made by them on the occasion of the European Day Against Human Trafficking in 2014. They expressed a general dissatisfaction with the Government's failure to comply fully with its international commitment re the European Directive 36/2011 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting victims, and highlighted the pending obligations which the Spanish State has with regard to the protection of victims. The group also expressed their concern regarding the lack of a suitable specific referral mechanism for child victims of trafficking, and the need for a plan to combat labour exploitation. Echoing what the different organisations have already expressed on previous occasions, the network further insists on the "necessity of adopting of a comprehensive law against human trafficking to include all forms of exploitation from a human rights, age and gender perspective."³³⁶

The Inter-Ecclesial Network

Members of this group are Caritas Spain, the White Cross Foundation, Justice and Peace, CEM, and CONFER (Conference of Religious of Spain). Among other things the group aims at making known the reality of human trafficking, its causes and consequences.

There are also three regional networks:

- The Red Cantabria Contra el Tráfico de Personas y la Explotación Sexual, with 25 member organisations.
- Antena SER Contra la Trata in the south has 17 member organisations.
- The Xarxa catalana sobre la trata de persones in Catalonia. This network includes representatives of NGOs, institutions and authorities such as the Catalan Women's Institute, the regional police and the Barcelona City Council.

All three groups play a vital role in raising public awareness and keeping alive the struggle against human trafficking. Apart from being the main providers of services and safe places where victims can be adequately cared for, NGOs and Religious Congregations also make a valuable contribution to victim identification by reporting cases of potential victims and offering valuable information gleaned from interviews and support work. Interviews with several NGOs revealed that the police value this collaboration and often ask for it.

However, greater participation of specialised NGOs in the identification process is needed. As the Ombudsman report 2012 points out, "The capacity for victim identification is impeded by the lack of regulations implementing article 59bis of Organic Act 4/2000, which guarantees NGO participation in identification procedures. In addition, the lack of definition and guidelines regarding NGO participation in the Framework Protocol for the Protection of Victims of Trafficking further hinders the effectiveness of victim identification."³³⁷ Article 10 of the EU Convention sees the role of NGO participation as vital.

336) Public Declaration of the Spanish Network Against Trafficking in Persons October, 2014

337) Ombudsman report 2012. I. 4, page 19

Identification of victims is a collaborative process between the authorities and relevant victim support organisations. The Ombudsman is clear that “the participation of these organizations is a key element to ensure procedural approach based on the rights and needs of victims of human trafficking. According to this Institution, the low number of victims identified, and the difficulties detected in the process of identifying potential victims of trafficking and persons at risk of being, could be tackled if the right formula was found to incorporate these organizations in the process of identification.”³³⁸ According to TIP report, “NGOs reported good cooperation with law enforcement in the identification and referral of victims, including NGO participation in raids on brothels and locations where victims may have been present”³³⁹

Good practices in Police-NGO collaboration

Police-NGO collaboration has greatly improved during the past few years, however. Although NGO involvement in the identification of victims is not obligatory in Spain, some Autonomous Communities have established a system of collaboration. Catalonia, for example, has a formal agreement for collaboration between NGOs and Police at the point of identification. Police and NGOs in Madrid have a verbal agreement to the same effect.

Measures to raise awareness and discourage demand

In the past few years, efforts have been made in Spain by both government and NGO bodies to reduce demand through awareness raising, information campaigns and developing resources for education and training. In 2008 SNATP produced a comprehensive Guide for the Identification, Referral and Protection of Victims of Human Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation, a resource with excellent materials on human trafficking, immigration, asylum and human rights, written for professionals working in health centres, hospitals, and government specialised agencies such as the Asylum and Refugee Office and the Reception Centres for Irregular immigrants.

Another valuable instrument for education and public information is the Guia Didactica, a teaching resource produced by the Inter-Ecclesial Network.

“Most of the awareness-raising activities are carried out by NGOs specialised in assisting victims of trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation, with funding from the central, regional or local governments.”³⁴⁰

Among the many awareness-raising initiatives undertaken by Government and NGOs are several campaigns which have greatly contributed to raise public awareness in the last few years:

- The international Blue Heart campaign, an awareness-raising campaign promoted by the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime and calling public attention to the plight of victims, was conducted in Spain by the Ministry of Health, and the Ministry of Social Services and Equality in collaboration with the Spanish Network Against Human Trafficking.
- Through ACCEM, an NGO working with migrants and refugees, Spain led the international project ‘MIRROR’ which mapped human trafficking for the purpose of labour exploitation in the participating countries, namely Italy, Romania and Spain, with a view to identifying the main sectors and circumstances where this type of human trafficking may occur.
- An awareness campaign ‘No seas Complice’ (Don’t be an Accomplice), seeking to create public awareness and discourage demand, was launched by the National Police in 2013.
- The campaign ‘Abre los Ojos’ (Open your Eyes), led by ACCEM and co-funded by the Ministry of Employment. This campaign aimed at raising public awareness of human trafficking for labour exploitation.

338) Ombudsman follow-up report 2013, 1.1. page 11

339) TIP - US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report, 2015

340) GRETA III, 2.a page 32

Spanish legislation and policies aimed at the prevention and protection of victims, and the persecution of traffickers

According to the US State Department report 2014, Spain's "current legislation covers all forms of exploitation indicated in UN Trafficking Protocol."

At the international level Spain has adopted the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime and its Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children (both of which Spain ratified in 2002). Spain has also adopted several other conventions and protocols, including the Child Prostitution and Child Pornography, the conventions established by the International Labour Organisation (ILO), and a number of Council of Europe conventions related to action against human trafficking. At national level Spain has the Framework Protocol adopted in 2011 by agreement of the Ministries of Justice, the Interior, Employment and Social Security, Health, Social Services and Equality, and the General Council of the Judiciary. This Protocol establishes a procedure for the detection, identification and referral, and provides assistance and protection for, victims of human trafficking.

In 2012 a Monitoring Committee for the implementation of the Framework Protocol was established by the inter-ministerial group. This Committee has responsibility for following up the measures adopted to implement the protocol. NGOs have expressed disappointment at the fact that they are not represented in this committee as they feel that, as organisations with experience in assisting victims of human trafficking, they could give valuable contribution to the implementation of the protocol.

Some autonomous communities have also developed, or are in the process of developing, their own regional protocols to protect victims of human trafficking, for example, Galicia, Catalonia, Basque country. However, the national protocol applies throughout Spain, irrespective of the adoption of regional protocols.

Article 177 bis, introduced into the Criminal Code in 2011, establishes as criminal offences:

- a) Forced labour, slavery or practices similar to it, domestic servitude and forced begging;
- b) Sexual exploitation, including pornography;
- c) The extraction of bodily organs.

The Royal Decree-law3/2013, adopted in 2013, aimed at improving information and assistance given to victims of human trafficking. According to the GRETA report, this law gives victims of human trafficking the right to legal aid, regardless of their resources. A Police Plan to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings for Sexual Exploitation was adopted in 2013 in order to "enhance cooperation with other relevant institutions; strengthen prevention, identification and protection of victims; intensify actions against criminal groups and increase the use of technology and databases to collect and process information, intelligence and indicators." ³⁴¹

The National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation, established in 2009, covers the areas of prevention, victim protection, awareness raising, training as well as some legislative and procedural measures. This Action Plan was intended to cover the years 2009-2011 and was subsequently extended to 2012. In 2013 the committee published its IV evaluation report with very positive results of the measures adopted by the plan. A new Action Plan is now being drafted.

The protection of victims of human trafficking is provided for in the Organic Law 4/2000 of 11 January 2000 on the rights and freedoms of foreigners in Spain.

Authorisations are available for irregular migrants who have been the victims of trafficking:

- a) Temporary stay authorisation during the recovery and reflection period granted to foreigners when there are reasonable grounds to believe that they have been trafficked.
- b) Provisional work and residence authorisation: while the application is processed, if the authority issues a favourable report.
- c) Finally, work and residence authorisation due to exceptional circumstances for foreign victims of human trafficking, valid for 5 years.

The above is not an exhaustive list of Spain's international and national legislation. For more details see GRETA's report on Spain's implementation of the European Directive 2013.

Main Achievements

Many positive initiatives and actions to combat human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation have been undertaken by both government and nongovernmental bodies in recent years. Some important achievements include:

- In September 2014 the Spanish Government notified the European Commission of the country's full transposition of the European Directive 36/2011 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting victims;
- The initiatives undertaken by the Government to raise public awareness and discourage demand;
- The criminalisation of human trafficking;
- The wide range of assistance services available to the victims;
- Improved collaboration between police and NGOs;
- Recent appointment of the National rapporteur;
- A new protocol on unaccompanied foreign minors now being developed;
- The Royal Decree-Law 3/2013, adopted in 2013, aimed at improving the information and assistance given to victims of human trafficking. This new law gives victims the right to legal aid regardless of their resources;
- The Police Plan to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings for Sexual Exploitation adopted in 2013 in order to "enhance cooperation with other relevant institutions; strengthen prevention, identification and protection of victims".

Deficiencies as highlighted by the NGOs and documents consulted for this study include:

- Full implementation of the European Directive 36/2011 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting victims;
 - Adoption of a national protocol for combating trafficking for labour exploitation;
 - A victim-centred approach instead of a crime-centred approach on the part of security forces.
 - Urgent adoption of a new Plan of Action for the effective identification, protection and assistance to child victims of trafficking;
 - Provision for assistance to women and men victims of human trafficking for labour exploitation, and for child victims of trafficking for all types of exploitation;
 - Specific programmes and resources for the care and protection of victims of trafficking for labour exploitation;
 - Shelters for victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation with dependent children.
-

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS – in appreciation of:

Author: Sr Ines Gutierrez, SUSC. Congregation of Holy Union Sisters.

CONTRIBUTORS

Sr. Pilar Casas Navarro, Adoratrices Esclavas del Santísimo

Sr. Justa del Sol, Hermanas Oblatas del Santísimo Redentor. Head of Social Action Department of CONFER (Conference of Religious of Spain).

Other organisations consulted are mentioned at the end of the report.

In compiling this report, the following were consulted either by personal conversation, telephone interviews, reports and Internet articles.

Organisations and persons consulted:

Spanish Network Against Trafficking in Persons

Red intereclesial – Madrid

Hetaira: Colectivo de defensa de los Derechos de las Trabajadoras del Sexo

Proyecto Esperanza, Madrid / Fundacion Amaranta

Medicos del Mundo, Madrid / International Organisation for Migration – Madrid

United Kingdom

US TIP Report, 2015: Tier 1

“The United Kingdom (UK) is recognised as a source, transit, and destination country for men, women, and children subjected to sex trafficking and forced labour, including domestic servitude. Most internationally sourced trafficking victims come from Africa, Asia, and Eastern Europe. The Government reported a noticeable increase in the number of identified potential victims from the UK and Eastern Europe in 2014. The top countries nominated were Albania, Nigeria, Vietnam, Romania, and Slovakia. There are also a significant number of Chinese victims who are caught within the National Referral Mechanism as potential victims of trafficking.

There were also a number of high profile raids which revealed that UK men are found to be subjected to forced labour within the UK and also ‘exported’ to other countries in Europe. Domestically, recent years have seen substantial efforts to unravel the abuse which has been visited on UK children, both from institutional environments, and from families where children are being recruited and groomed by sex trafficking networks with limited ability of parents, social services or police to intervene and create a ring of safety around the children. Focused attention on this area means that numbers of UK minors surfacing as having been subjected to trafficking for sexual exploitation, and by far the majority are female, are significantly rising in the last five years when policing and social service attention has turned to this area of previously ‘neglected’ and ‘under-reported abuse’.



Another development on the UK’s raised activity to address all forms of trafficking abuse in the UK was the identification in 2014 of two potential sex trafficking victims who were transgender. Transgendered and LGBTI victims of trafficking are now beginning to feature in the preparatory training for first responders. This level of diversity awareness and the fresh segmentation of who and what constitutes trafficking risk, does demonstrate that the UK, which with the pioneering UK-wide police-led operations of Pentameter 1 and 2 in the early 2000s, has achieved some level of maturity in the counter-trafficking pathway of intervention.”³⁴²

The United Kingdom is politically constituted by the countries of England, Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland.³⁴³ It has a long history as a substantial voice in international affairs, with a legacy of a powerful and still unravelling colonial relationship with emerging economies in Africa, the Caribbean and the dynamic economic tigers amidst former colonial interests in India, Pakistan, Bangladesh, Singapore and Chinese Hong Kong and the New Territories. At present the UK is fully incorporated into the EU, although not a part of the Eurozone. It is also a permanent member of the Security Council at the UN and a full partner of the North Atlantic Treaty Organisation (NATO).

There has been substantial devolution of political and legislative powers over the last decade, which means that counter-trafficking legislation is realised separately in Scotland and Northern Ireland, whilst the organisational management of counter trafficking has evolved separately in Wales from provision in England.

342) <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243562.pdf>, p. 350 Accessed September 2015

343) <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/uk.html>

Although the TIP report details the UK as a single entity, in the rest of this briefing some of the principal differences arising from the devolution in legislation which have arisen over the last decade of the UK's engagement with counter trafficking will be documented.

National Referral Mechanism (NRM)

This identification requires a strong level of training for those involved and operating as first responders. In previous years the trafficking of young men into sexual exploitation and those trafficked into criminal activities, such as begging and cannabis cultivation, passed under the radar, until strong and sustained lobbying on the part of NGOs and human rights trained lawyers enabled policing, immigration authorities and the criminal justice system to recognise their status as victims of human trafficking abuse. With increasing numbers of victims of human trafficking being recognised through the NRM mechanism, this recognition should be counted as a sign of the success of more counter-trafficking initiatives taking place across the UK, with an increased attention to human trafficking challenges and preparation of Senior Investigating Officers across the UK.

Legislative Change UK Government – England and Wales

In June 2014, the UK Government introduced the Modern Slavery Bill. This received Royal Assent on 26 March 2015, and so the bill, which had raised some considerable challenges across the non-governmental sector and the media, questioning the significant outlay of money and parliamentary and civil servant time in its development, is now an Act of Parliament and has passed into UK law. The key impacts of this new legislation come into force from October 2015, and it updates previous legislation layered into a number of different areas of the law. For the first time in the European world 'modern day slavery,' alongside forced labour and trafficking for sexual exploitation, are addressed, the Bill includes:

- Creation of the post of Anti-Slavery Commissioner to encourage good practice on the prevention of modern slavery offences and the identification of victims. The first appointee – Chief Superintendent Kevin Hyland – was recruited from the Metropolitan Police Unit who had particular responsibility for generating a strong and resilient programme of counter-trafficking for the London 2012 Olympic games. His work in encouraging the Roman Catholic Church and most specifically the Vatican to galvanise action on counter-trafficking initiatives in 2014 was a notable factor in his promotion to this task.
 - Addressing the issue of the supply chain –all companies doing business in the UK with a turnover of 36m GBP or more will have to deliver an annual slavery and human trafficking statement covering their manufacturers, farmers and wholesalers elsewhere in the world. If these companies have taken no steps to combat slavery, then this must also be disclosed.
 - Creation of two new civil orders to enable the courts to place restrictions on those convicted of modern slavery offences, or those involved in such offences but not yet convicted of modern slavery.
 - Provision of mechanisms for seizing traffickers' assets and channelling some of that money towards victims for compensation payments.
 - Creation of a new statutory defence for slavery or trafficking victims compelled to commit criminal offences – bringing the legislation into line with what had been emerging as a 'defence' where this mode of 'enslavement' had been deployed.
 - The provision of child trafficking advocates/ guardians.
-

Much of the capacity to deliver tough sentences against trafficking was already available in the pre-existing legislation of the Sexual Offences Act 2003 and 2008, where trafficking into Britain for the purpose of sexual exploitation had been articulated clearly for the courts, with trafficking into the UK for sexual exploitation covered by section 57; trafficking within the UK for sexual exploitation covered by section 58; and trafficking out of the UK for sexual exploitation by section 59. In this legislation the degree of coercion used and the level of control over the trafficked person's liberty were seen as clearly relevant to assessing the seriousness of the offender's behaviour. The nature of the sexual exploitation to which the victim was exposed was also relevant, as was the victim's age and vulnerability.

The 2004 Asylum and Immigration Act had furnished the UK with legislation to address the trafficking of persons for labour and other forms of exploitation. Section 4 of this act created offences of trafficking in people into, within or out of the UK for the purpose of exploitation and gave impetus to several constabularies to pursue labour exploitation cases. Amongst these, Operation Pheasant (in Cambridgeshire and Fenland) was an excellent example of multi-agency team co-operation including local authorities, voluntary agencies, NGOs and national enforcement agencies to interrupt labour exploitation.³⁴⁴ 166 cases of exploitation by illegal gang masters were uncovered between 2012 and 2014. Meantime, in Derbyshire Operation Atwood saw Houses of Multiple Occupation (HMOs), car washes and processing factories visited and exploited workers released and their 'traffickers' under charge. Atwood was a coalition of the Derbyshire police, the Gangmasters Licensing Authority, Central Criminal Investigation Service, National Crime Agency and Derby Housing Benefit Fraud. These were involved in a series of cases which were also handled under the remit of Fighting Fraud – and resulted in the arrest of four traffickers in 2014.

The new legislation represents strong political messaging from Government that forms of 'modern slavery and forced labour' are not welcome within the UK's borders – no matter the challenges in specifying precisely what 'modern slavery' looks like. This is a matter which will be contested and defined through precedence in the UK's courts in the coming year. The Home Secretary who has steered much of this new legislation into being, Mrs Teresa May, said at its promulgation:

“The presence of modern slavery in today's society is an affront to the dignity and humanity of every one of us. The Modern Slavery Act 2015 is an historic milestone. This landmark legislation sends the strongest possible signal to criminals that if you are involved in this vile trade you will be arrested, you will be prosecuted and you will be locked up. And it says to victims, you are not alone – we are here to help you. I want to pay tribute to the campaigners, organisations, and Parliamentarians of all parties for their hard work and determination to shine a light on this hidden crime and for helping to shape this law.”

344) In 2014 – 2015 considerable resources started to be deployed to pay attention to labour exploitation, with Operations Pheasant in Cambridge in 2014 instigated to tackle anti-social behaviour which could include prostitution, drinking and public nuisance to neighbours (within the at-risk migrant population itself) and labour exploitation being experienced within the migrant communities in the Fenland area. On this occasion 225 benefit offences were detected. Operation Pheasant also gave rise to Operation Endeavour, which resulted in raids which surfaced 82 potential victims and resulted in a number of arrests and the capture of significant funds. Interestingly in the report on this high-profile and highly structured raid, over 300 people were involved in the organisation and prosecution of the arrests and onward immediate support of the victims. This is recognised as a resource-intensive activity, which has to attract Central Government support to enable it to become and continue to be 'policing as usual'. The lessons here are that without significant encouragement and extra resource distribution and political urgency from Central Government these actions are extremely challenging for local constabularies to invest the time and personnel to pursue.

The rise in the interest and in the ability of the UK authorities to undertake multi-agency investigations leading to prosecutions of labour trafficking, forced labour and labour exploitation has been indicated by the reformation of the four different departments which have up until now been monitoring and reporting on 'at risk sectors'.

In 2015 there will be a Central Government level review of how the employment sectors where the minimum wage can be routinely contravened, and working and appropriate housing conditions are flaunted, can be most expeditiously addressed. Ministers have pronounced it simplifies complex laws on exploitation and increases the maximum sentence on trafficking to life. The bill also proposes to ensure victims cannot be prosecuted for most offences committed while being controlled – and receive reparations from their abusers. Labour have promised that they will seek to create a “specific offence of serious exploitation”. It says this will make prosecutions easier and prevent the “undercutting of local workers and responsible businesses by the exploitation of low-skilled workers from Europe.”³⁴⁵

For the decade pursuant to the disaster at Morecambe Bay, when at least 21 Chinese migrant workers died whilst gathering cockles off the tidal race on the North East coast, this area of tightening up the labour market (outside of the sex industry) has been managed across Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs (HMRC), the Health and Safety Executive (HSE), the Environment Service and the Gangmaster Licensing Authority.

Now a new agency will be set up, which will address the bureaucratic silos between which a great deal of labour exploitation has fallen and failed to be prosecuted and expunged. The UK Government is anxious to see the minimum wage and working conditions maintained, a central plank in addressing the working contract between the State and the population, and ensure socio-economic conditions which will over time cut the national welfare bill and hopefully raise social fluidity which lies at the heart of the idea of meritocratic neo-liberal economies. The onus on the intention is that “businesses can't bring in cheap labour that undercuts the wages of local people.”³⁴⁶

The Conservative Government announced in May 2015 that a revised Immigration Bill will shortly be brought to Parliament to continue reforms with regard to labour migration and access to the UK started by the Immigration Act 2014. The bill will critically create a new enforcement agency building on the work of GLA, HMRC, HSE and Environment Agency Service to tackle the worst cases of exploitation. There could also be revisions triggered by the recent 'asylum' crisis in Europe, in the light of people movements across the countries constituting the European Union, in numbers which were last seen in the wake of Nazi aggression and genocide in the Second World War.

Labour exploitation and interdicting this area of trafficking into traditionally 'male' work spaces was under resourced in the era of Pentameter 1 and 2 between 2005 and 2008, where attention was particularly paid to the asymmetric gendered exploitation of females within the sex industry.³⁴⁷ Currently the issue for neo-liberal governments across Europe has been to close off the opportunities for criminals to undermine the policies of minimum wages and work conditions in processing, construction, agricultural and low-skilled work environments. This is attracting extensive collaboration between government-based agencies AND forcing the provision for care and debriefing facilities to be provided within the 'Protection' brief, covered traditionally in the UK, as in many other European countries, by NGOs.

District Councils and Unitary City Authorities are increasingly joining forces with the Border Agency, the National Crime Agency, local constabularies, the HSE and the GLA to run raids on HMOs, factories, processing plants and agricultural enterprises.

345) <http://www.theguardian.com/politics/2014/sep/24/labour-plans-tackle-low-paid-workers-europe>

346) Hansard 21 May 2015 David Cameron speech to the House of Commons The GLA and the new 'labour exploitation enforcement agency' cited in Gangmasters Licensing Authority CEOs Quarterly Report April-June 2015.

347) For more on Pentameter 1 and 2 please see http://www.no-trafficking.org/reports_docs/siren/SIREN%20UK-01%20Operation%20Pentameter%20FINAL_A4.pdf

These are the areas where unregulated, debt-bonded and exploited male and female labour have been situated. How this is to sit with a wider and contested area of addressing ‘women’s labour exploitation’ within the sex industry is yet to unravel, and an area where the RENATE network might well seek to invest energy in further research, advocacy, political lobbying, collaboration and practical intervention.

The National Crime Agency update in September 2014 revealed that contrary to much popular opinion, it was people ‘within’ the European Union who were the leading cluster discovered having been trafficked into Britain for labour exploitation. This remains an outrageous undermining of the principles of ‘free movement’ of people across the EU, being ‘trafficked’ to address the fluid requirements for particularly low-skilled work, rather than being able to access such work in a protected and safeguarded manner. Poland emerged as the top source country for victims of labour exploitation in the UK.

Europeans and third country nationals are found being exploited in agriculture, construction, factories, food processing plants and car washes. Restaurants and the leisure industry are also not immune from trafficking incursions. The National Crime Agency (NCA) is an important body for RENATE to relate to through the multi-agency networks which exist, as it heads UK law enforcement’s fight to cut serious and organised crime. The NCA has national and international reach along with the mandate and powers to work in partnership with other law enforcement organisations to address serious and organised criminals working in the field of human trafficking.³⁴⁸ All the intelligence raised on trafficking in the UK is collated and its implications considered in the UK Human Trafficking Centre now embedded within NCA headquarters.

The Metropolitan Police Service (MPS) also has an important operational function in the UK as it services most of the area within the M25 outer corridors of London. London is now the sixth wealthiest city in the world and has a population of over 8.6 million – with 44% of the population of black or minority ethnic origin. Further, more than a third of Londoners are now originally foreign nationals – around 2.5 million people, with over 250 nationalities represented, with at least 300 languages being present, and no guarantee that English language mastery – even at the European scale of basic instructions – is present for interaction with the State authorities.

This presents a significant challenge for policing, and for a range of safeguarding and regulation issues for the State, through its instruments of Local Safeguarding Children Boards, Social Services, its increasingly devolved Social Housing response, the NHS, educational services, HMRC, the HSE, Local Councils and their management of licensing and regulation of businesses and HMO functions and the Crown Prosecution Services – to name but a few. London’s police force, the MPS, has a dedicated unit – the Trafficking and Kidnap Unit SCO7(1), which has developed over the course of its various transformations within the MPS over the last decade a multi-agency network reaching out into the network of NGOs providing protection and recovery services to those who have been trafficked, principally but by no means now exclusively women who have been trafficked.

Advocacy services are also represented around this table, with ECPAT, UNICEF, Barnardo’s, Stop the Traffik, and Children’s Society, along with a number of faith-based providers. RENATE collaborates with the Medaille Trust, which has a decade of experience in safe housing provision, being one of the first members of the CHASTE round housing network responding to the requirements of Pentameter. There are a small number of researchers who are present.

348) www.nationalcrimeagency.gov.uk/ The NCA’s mission is to lead the UK’s fight to cut serious and organised crime.

³⁴⁹The MPS's desire to ³⁵⁰ The MPS's desire to understand the deeper texture of socio-economic pressures, irregular migration/smuggling and trafficking pathways, diasporic and national criminal networks and map the particular ethnicities, nationalities and demographics currently at risk of being trafficked into the capital and onwards into the rest of the UK and across Europe, as well as seeking to interrupt the processes behind demand, is commendable. The majority of trafficking cases taken forward for prosecution in the UK emerge from the activities of this service and those working in collaboration with the GLA.

Case Studies

In Rotherham, a gangmaster was stripped of his licence by the GLA after demonstrating “a total disregard for ensuring compliance with legal requirements.” The company had its licence revoked after the GLA found the director “not fit and proper” to run a compliant business. P & M Groundworks had provided workers to carry out daffodil picking and vegetable harvesting UK wide.

In Derby, February 2014, two Czech brothers were jailed for 92 months in total after pleading guilty to trafficking in and within the UK. The wives of the two brothers were sentenced for eight and ten months each for fraud and theft, taking money from victims' bank accounts and stealing cash. In this instance the victims were brought directly from Slovakia and the Czech Republic, where a better life was promised to them in the UK. When the men arrived in Derby, they were put into squalid rooms with up to four sharing, with inadequate washing and kitchen facilities. They were made to work in car washes and factories and only received a fraction of their real earnings – the rest being absorbed by the brothers, who controlled the mainly cash-based revenue.³⁵¹

Child Sexual Exploitation.

RENATE members are absent from a public presence in this area of work, with the policy generation and intervention strategies dominated by three major UK agencies – Barnardo's, the NSPCC and ECPAT. The Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic (BAME) communities have representation through a number of smaller agencies, most notably AFRUCA and the Victoria Climbié Trust. The faith communities have the explicit representation of the Children's Society, which emerged from the pioneering work of the Church of England Central Home for Waifs and Strays founded in 1891. Other bespoke agencies will doubtless arise over the next few years as the wider extent of child sexual exploitation emerges across the longer-term established communities of Britain and its more recent diasporas.

How the Catholic community becomes involved in the trafficking issues pertaining to foreign nationals, and British children in the UK, is an opportunity for RENATE.

349) The Cambridge Centre for Applied Research in Human Trafficking (CCARHT) has a long association with UKHTC and with the MPS multi agency networks, having been founded by a practitioner in housing provision and victim rights protection. www.ccarht.org

350) The Cambridge Centre for Applied Research in Human Trafficking (CCARHT) has a long association with UKHTC and with the MPS multi agency networks, having been founded by a practitioner in housing provision and victim rights protection. www.ccarht.org

351) In a joint operation between Norfolk and Suffolk police in Spring 2014 Operation Badsworth saw three people charged with labour exploitation through acting as a gangmaster without a licence (s12 Gangmasters (Licensing) Act 2004); holding a person in slavery or servitude or requiring a person to perform forced/compulsory labour (s71 Coroners and Justice Act 2009); trafficking people for exploitation (s4 Asylum and Immigration (Treatment of Claimants, etc) Act 2004) and money laundering (s327 Proceeds of Crime Act 2002). The utilisation of this range of legislation for effective prosecution does show that the movement against labour exploitation and forced labour in the UK is a matter of political will and the allocation of resources in training, awareness raising, multi-agency co-operation and leadership against this form of trafficking abuse.

There is a critical need to develop resilient safeguarding and child protection strategies across the various elements of Roman Catholic presence, in churches and educational establishments. The A10 plus 2³⁵² communities in particular have boosted congregation sizes across Britain, and with this boost has come other responsibilities to be a conduit for safeguarding

Across the various categories of trafficking, there was a jump overall of 22% in the number of identified suspected victims of trafficking between 2012 and 2013, which was a total of 2,744 suspected victims, including 602 children. Amongst this number were 55 children making false benefit claims who originated from Slovakia, with the NCA showing that victims were being trafficked from Eastern Europe on the expectation of legitimate work, which never materialised.

Provision for children in the UK is delivered within the Social Services through a supported fostering programme. In the late nineties and early 2000s there was a response which placed child trafficking protection into an institutional frame. However, there were a number of challenges with this, not least a high level of loss of children, assumed to be reconnecting with their traffickers, once the border had been breached and the children had been located into an institution within the UK.³⁵³

Due to the successful lobbying undertaken by ECPAT, Barnardo's, the NSPCC and Children's Society – the four leading charities working on specifically tackling issues pertinent to trafficking and children's protection from sexual and other forms of exploitation – there are now new roles of children's advocates being trialled across 23 authorities³⁵⁴ across the UK.

This is a 12-month trial commenced in September 2014, to see whether this form of gathering resources and focusing attention on trafficking issues with regard to children is assisted by this intervention. For the first time, each child has been allocated an advocate supported by a dedicated contact with the capacity and expertise to promote their welfare and guide them through the social care, immigration and criminal justice systems.

Barnardo's has provided the advocacy service. It is hoped that the presence of advocates will help to reduce the risk of these vulnerable children going missing and being re-trafficked – previously experienced – and will help ensure that they receive the support and protection they need. Assisting in this work of advocacy and awareness-raising around child sexual exploitation and the patterns of grooming which are now increasingly widely understood and mapped could be an area for RENATE.

352) In a joint operation between Norfolk and Suffolk police in Spring 2014 Operation Badsworth saw three people charged with labour exploitation through acting as a gangmaster without a licence (s12 Gangmasters (Licensing) Act 2004); holding a person in slavery or servitude or requiring a person to perform forced/compulsory labour (s71 Coroners and Justice Act 2009); trafficking people for exploitation (s4 Asylum and Immigration (Treatment of Claimants, etc) Act 2004) and money laundering (s327 Proceeds of Crime Act 2002). The utilisation of this range of legislation for effective prosecution does show that the movement against labour exploitation and forced labour in the UK is a matter of political will and the allocation of resources in training, awareness raising, multi-agency co-operation and leadership against this form of trafficking abuse.

353) Lynne Chitty, 53, helped to set up Britain's first safe house for trafficked children in 2000 while working for West Sussex Council. It closed in 2004 and she is now a consultant and trainer. "I had been working as a social worker for West Sussex for 26 years and with trafficked children since 1992 when we set up the safe house. When the council said it was going to close it down, I resigned. It was needed, and I was so angry." Lynne now works as a consultant with the Barnardo's trafficking service.

354) Croydon, Derbyshire, Manchester City, Stockport, Tameside, Oldham, Rochdale, Bury, Bolton, Wigan, Salford and Trafford, Kent, Lancashire, Oxfordshire, Birmingham, Coventry, Dudley, Sandwell, Solihull, Walsall, Wolverhampton, and West Sussex.

ECPAT UK

ECPAT UK³⁵⁵ is one of the leading organisations that produced groundbreaking research on the trafficking of children into the UK in 2004. Currently the British Association for Adoption and Fostering (BAAF) and ECPAT UK are concerned that more than 10,000 children may be at risk because carers and members of the public don't know they need to notify their local authority about private fostering arrangements. An ongoing programme of research, training and advocacy informs their campaigning efforts. ECPAT UK has been strongly instrumental in raising awareness with Government of children trafficked for sexual exploitation and for exploitative labour. They collaborate with others to achieve the best outcomes for children. Chloe Setter, Head of Advocacy, Policy & Campaigns, ECPAT UK, points out that:

"The TIP report acknowledges important progress on tackling human trafficking in the UK but highlights the inadequate response to child victims, who are arguably the most vulnerable of all those affected by this horrific crime.

"It is not acceptable that authorities fail to identify those children who have been trafficked or are at risk of trafficking. And it is unforgivable that we continue to see children going missing from care only to be re-trafficked elsewhere. The Government must ensure it provides sufficient training and resources to local authorities in order to protect children and ensure they have access to the specialist support required to rebuild their young lives."³⁵⁶

Statistics

During the period Jan to March 2015, there were 731 referrals to the NRM, comprising individuals from 64 countries of origin.

As of 1 July 2015, 161 of 731 referred to the NRM during this quarter were deemed to be trafficked. 17 of the 731 were awaiting a reasonable decision. 332 of the 731 were still awaiting a conclusive decision. 3 were referred from Northern Ireland, 20 from Scotland and 20 from Wales. The remaining 688 arrived in England.³⁵⁷

It was thought that the multiplier of those not disclosed as victims was to the power of five – although the way in which any of these multipliers is estimated is highly contested. If the number of victims identified to those who are kept beneath the radar of law enforcement runs at 10%, that would imply a potential number of 27,000 victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation, forced labour, domestic servitude, criminal exploitation and modern day slavery across the UK. This number would easily double the proposed 'numbers at risk' of trafficking emerging from Home Office reports. However, given the contemporary climate of liberalisation in migratory movement within the EU, and the ongoing commercialisation and growth of the sex industry, the figures for trafficking in sexual exploitation, and in labour trafficking, as yet undetected could easily be sitting in the lower tens of thousands for the UK.

The Rotherham Factor – Domestic Trafficking

No one knows the true scale of child sexual exploitation (CSE) in Rotherham over the years, but in 2014 a report was commissioned by the Government in order to clarify what had been occurring over the last dozen years in this Northern town in England.

355) www.ecpat.org.uk/ A poll commissioned by the British Association for Adoption and Fostering (BAAF) has revealed that 91% of the UK adult population don't know about private fostering.

356) <http://www.ecpat.org.uk/frontpage>

357) <http://www.nationalcrimeagency.gov.uk/publications/national-referral-mechanism-statistics/599-human-trafficking-national-referral-mechanism-statistics-january-to-march-2015/file>

Here British and Asian girls had been systematically recruited and sexually exploited, building to a 'conservative estimate' of approximately 1400 children sexually exploited over the full inquiry period, from 1997 to 2013.³⁵⁸

In just over a third of cases, children affected by sexual exploitation were previously known to services because of child protection and neglect. The report's author Alexis Jay found it hard to describe or absorb the terrible and appalling abuse that child victims suffered over this period.

"They were raped by multiple perpetrators, trafficked to other towns and cities in the north of England, abducted, beaten, and intimidated. There were examples of children who had been doused in petrol and threatened with being set alight, threatened with guns, made to witness brutally violent rapes and threatened they would be next if they told anyone. Girls as young as 11 were raped by large numbers of male perpetrators."³⁵⁹

This instance of mainly Asian male 'pimping' and abuse networks, exploiting and raping Caucasian and Asian girls in such considerable numbers, without adequate intervention and safeguarding being triggered by those publicly charged with protection and prosecution roles, shocked Britain. It has raised this form of domestic child trafficking abuse to the forefront of attention for those working in children's services and in local safeguarding networks. It also raised the numbers of those identified as child victims of 'trafficking' over the course of the 2013 – 2014 figures, as they were revamped to take account of the recalibration of this form of exploitation to be nominated as 'trafficking' in some instances.

National Referral Mechanism

Between its inception in 2009 and September 2014 approximately 6,800 people were referred to the National Referral Mechanism (NRM) – a complex mechanism, involving a wide group of professionals, statutory and voluntary organisations. In the autumn of 2014 a review of the NRM was commissioned by the Home Office, with a five-year longitudinal review of some of the potential learning raised by the mechanism. The review detailed six critical areas for consideration:

1. Identification of victims;
2. How they access support;
3. The level of support that victims receive;
4. Decision making;
5. Governance of the NRM;
6. Collection and sharing of data.

The Review discovered that there was something of a post code lottery in terms of the awareness of key professionals and protection organisations as to what constituted trafficking, and some of the key markers which would alert protection and monitoring bodies to the presence of a trafficking network and the emergence of victims. This was seen to be a challenge across the sectors of sex trafficking, labour exploitation and forced labour, as well as child trafficking for various ends – criminal and social service exploitation.

The Review recommended that there should be developed "with key partners, a comprehensive awareness strategy leading to increased recognition of human trafficking by the public and professionals" across the UK.³⁶⁰ The Review also recommended that 'first responders' – those who are charged with identifying those perceived to have been trafficked – should be further empowered and trained.

358) www.rotherham.gov.uk/.../independent_inquiry_cse_in_rotherham.pdf Alexis Jay, OBE 2014 Independent Inquiry into Child Sexual Exploitation in Rotherham 1997 – 2013

359) Ibid.

360) [socialwelfare.bl.uk/.../168761Review_of_the_National_Referral_Mechanism..\[pdf\]](http://socialwelfare.bl.uk/.../168761Review_of_the_National_Referral_Mechanism..[pdf])

The Salvation Army

The Salvation Army holds the UK Government's Victim Care Contract through which support for victims of human trafficking is managed in England and Wales. The contract was first awarded to the Salvation Army in July 2011. This had previously been undertaken by the Poppy Project, which had been the flagship scheme assisting trafficked women since 2003. Its radical feminist pioneer and Chief Executive Officer Denise Williams passed away in 2015. She had been a vehement and effective champion of the cause of addressing violence against women, providing safe housing and meaningful protection for women at risk of violence and trafficking for decades, and had been an unwavering voice seeking to focus the attention of legislators and policy makers on addressing the role of male demand for sexual services for cash, the customer base which the business of pimping, violent sexual abuse, and the systematic exploitation in trafficking of women for sexual exploitation, serves.³⁶¹ Her voice in this arena is missed.

More than 2,500 victims had been supported by the Salvation Army and partner organisations, including the Medaille Trust, between July 2011 and June 2014. During the third year (up until June 2014), 889 were supported for an average of 58 days in safe house accommodation or for over 87 days for those receiving outreach – who were not accommodated by the scheme but receiving support in either psychological, educational, or legal support intervention. This meant, on average, a person was supported for just under 70 days. The recommended minimum set out by the Home Office is 45 days.

Of those supported in 2014, 540 were female, 347 male and 2 were transgendered individuals.

This represents an increase of 62% on the number of people supported in Year 2 of the Salvation Army contract (2012) and an increase of 135% on the number supported in Year 1 (2011). 38% (yr 1, 43%; yr 2 42%) of those referred had been trafficked for sexual exploitation. 42% (40%; 44%) were referred for labour exploitation. It is not clear whether the reason for this was because of changed priorities in policing, with joint police operations along with the GLA becoming more prevalent. In 2013 - 2014 for the first time since the NRM came into being, the live cases being investigated for labour exploitation outnumbered those of sexual exploitation. In the same year there were 10% (12.4%; 9.8% for the previous years) referrals for domestic servitude. The international reach of London as a hub, with a distribution network for traffickers into the counties and regions of the UK, is underlined through the nationalities of those involved as either victims or traffickers in these three years, with 74 (63; 43 in previous years) different countries being referenced as source countries for those trafficked and accommodated through the Salvation Army network. However, other transport networks are utilised, with access through the sea ports, the regional airports and the rail network able to access Kent from Calais before the London hub is reached. Nevertheless, the significant role of London as a population hub, and a 'distribution' centre is clear.

The Medaille Trust

When the Medaille Trust was formed in 2006, out of the work undertaken by its founder, Sister Ann-Teresa, Sisters of Saint Joseph of Annecy (a congregation that came into being to provide material and educational assistance to the most marginalised), and their co-operation with Churches Alert to Sex Trafficking Across Europe (2004 – 2008), two houses were created for trafficked victims. It is generally accepted that such work is organised under the three 'P's: PROTECTION – PROSECUTION – PREVENTION.

The latest figures from Medaille are somewhat dated, however they tell a story of a significant contribution to the overall effort currently being co-ordinated through the Salvation Army contract – but under the administration of the Medaille Trust.

361) <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/sep/02/denise-marshall>

“Since its set-up in 2006, Medaille Trust has supported over 650 victims from over 40 countries. Currently, the Trust has 7 houses (2015), with a total of 61 beds. The first ‘safe’ (shelter) house opened in October 2006 and began taking women in November 2006. The second house formally opened in January 2007. 362 In total since opening in November (2006 – Sept 2009) seventy-four women were supported from 25 different countries.”³⁶³

The protection work of the Trust is largely concerned with victim support. From 2006-2011 the Trust concentrated its efforts on supporting female victims. This participation boosted the provision of available safe housing nationally, and critically enabled the launching of raids and pro-active interventions by the National Police forces around sex trafficking in the UK, under the banner of Pentameter 1 and 2.

From 2011 the Trust began to support male victims and from 2014 began to support families. In 2013 the Trust explored supporting unaccompanied children but took a decision not to provide these services with the current national requirements of best practice in safeguarding and recovery. There are particular challenges around working with safeguarding issues for unaccompanied children, with the lead organisation in this area being taken forward through Social Services, and a clear preference for support being offered through supervised fostering, seeking to keep the emotional support strong for the children, and sustained within the system designed for UK nationals.

Prosecution is an area the Trust is currently examining to explore what its contribution might be. Should resources allow, the Trust is looking to recruit a ‘Liaison Officer’ to undertake a part-time post in 2016 to develop this aspect of work, in conjunction with law enforcement agencies across the UK.

In terms of prevention work the Trust has developed its awareness-raising and schools work in the UK through a growing network of Diocesan Representatives. However, after discussion it was felt that the Trust could have greater impact by looking at preventative work in source countries abroad and this is an area the Trust is now looking into developing. In terms of the partnerships and initiatives undertaken Medaille has been working with some of the countries covered in this report – as well as in the following countries:

- Albania – the Medaille Trust supports the preventative work of Mary Ward women in Albania through some donations and staff exchanges. As a result of this relationship we have also become close to Different and Equal and SHJEK and met with members of the Albanian police force and representatives of the Ministry of the Interior.
- Kenya – Medaille Trust supports the preventative work of the Salesian Sisters in the Dagoretti slum on the outskirts of Nairobi. This support has been around developing and advising on their employment schemes for women who would otherwise be recruited into exploitation in brothels.
- Vietnam – this partnership is with Hagar International and is still developing. Co-operating with police and full term on returns and reintegration of survivors of trafficking has been a feature to date.
- Slovenia – starting in 2014 the Trust has begun a series of annual training events held at Lake Bled for staff, partner NGOs and police.
- Germany – after a visit to SOLWODI in Berlin the Trust has been asked to arrange a formal visit and presentations to the Bundestag on the UK experience of the NRM and other matters.³⁶⁴

362) However, it did take one woman as an overnight emergency stay in December 2006.

363) <http://www.medaille.co.uk/MedailleNews09.pdf> September issue, 2009

364) Notes from Mr Mike Emberson, director of Medaille Trust Project. June 2015

TRAC UK

The education, advocacy and campaigning group, TRAC UK,³⁶⁵ was formed originally in 2006 by representatives of some of the founding-member congregations of Medaille Trust. Some sisters wished to educate, raise awareness and campaign on the issue of Human Trafficking. TRAC became an independent organisation in 2011. Some members of TRAC volunteer their time with PACE(formerly CROP)³⁶⁶

The Mercy Sisters and the WELL project

Women@thewell is an initiative by the Mercy sisters to provide a uniquely holistic and multifaceted range of services to vulnerable women who are caught in multiple cycles of abuse and social exclusion. Based on gospel values, it provides a creative and supportive space for vulnerable women, develops a holistic response to their needs and enables them to make choices which will improve the quality of their lives and enable them to take their full place in society. Women@thewell builds on 10 years' experience of Sister Lynda Dearlove, who has worked for the last decade with women in the East-end of London, most of whom have been caught in the cycle of street-based commercial sex work.³⁶⁷ The charity built strategic alliances with the Metropolitan Police and the Mayor of London's strategy to reduce the negative impacts of increased prostitution in London during the 2012 Olympics.³⁶⁸ The work of Women@thewell makes for a strong understanding, based in praxis, of many of the drivers which bring women and young females into the nexus of street sex.

Victim Care Standards

In 2014 the Care Standards Expert Working Group was formed. Prior work had already been developed in 2005, under the leadership of the CHASTE roundtable in Housing provision group, with the initial membership of the Medaille Trust, the Salvation Army, and Housing for Women, working with expertise in the field brought in from the Poppy project, and generating the first attempts at Kitemarked standards in victim care in the UK, reporting to the Home Office in 2006.³⁶⁹

In June 2015 the second edition of the Care Standards book was developed, and the Religious Congregations were represented through the Medaille Trust. The Expert Group which was drawn together for this renewed effort to bring co-ordination and baselining of standards in victim care included the following: Ashiana (Sheffield), BAWSO (Wales), City Hearts (Northern England), Counter Human Trafficking Bureau (London), Helen Bamber Foundation (London), Hestia (London), Housing for Women (London), Human Trafficking Foundation (UK), Medaille Trust (UK), Eaves Poppy Project (London), The Salvation Army (UK), Community Safety Glasgow – TARA Service (Scotland), Unseen (Bristol).³⁷⁰ This work is important for RENATE members to work with, in the development of best standards of care across their European and International network.

The New Churches Together in England Hub

Churches Combating Modern Slavery – Human Trafficking (CCMS-HT) is an awareness-raising and capacity-building programme among CTE's Pentecostal member Churches.

365) www.traconline.org.uk a network of 16 Religious Congregations from across the UK with links to RENATE, UNANIMA_international, Talitha Kum, APT (Ireland), PACE.

366) <http://www.paceuk.info/> parents against child exploitation. TRAC member-Volunteers Sr Isabel Kelly FMST; Sr Pat Kenny, RSC

367) For more of the work of the Women@thewell initiative see <http://www.ourladyofmercy.org.uk/ourstory/dsp-default.cfm?loadref=216>

368) Human Trafficking, Sporting Mega-Events, and the London Olympics of 2012. (CCARHT Trafficking Files) Pemberton Ford 2012. Kindle Edition.

369) CCARHT trafficking files 2 – 2000 – 2010 the first decade of counter-trafficking impact post Palermo. www.ccarht.org

370) The booklet can be obtained through contacting the Human Trafficking Foundation <http://www.humantraffickingfoundation.org/trafficking-survivor-care-standards#sthash.eyrGooNz.dpuf>

It seeks to highlight the gravity of this issue and promote action by Pentecostal Churches together with other members of Churches Together in England (with 43 member churches whose details can be found on the main website) as well as other collaborating organisations.³⁷¹ There have been some initial meetings involving the Home Secretary, the Antislavery Commissioner of UK and a commendable number of participants from Pentecostal member Churches. The latest Round Table Conference was held on 10 March 2015.

Led by Pentecostal Churches, CCMS-HT is seeking collaboration to undertake some groundbreaking and innovative steps to combat modern slavery, especially in relation to human trafficking, in partnership with churches, other Christian ecumenical bodies, and secular organisations that strive towards combating human trafficking. Its initiating conference will take place on 1 December 2015. CCARHT's director, Dr Carrie Pemberton Ford, will be working closely with this initiative, taking forward research and policy development work confronting the impact of violence against women, and exploring ways in which onward empowerment of women in this sphere can be supported through the collaborating churches.

Significantly, the early meetings of Churches Alert to Sex Trafficking across Europe were based out of the office of the Churches Together in Britain and Ireland. Some members of the CTE were early-day adopters of the Not for Sale Sunday initiative in 2006 and 2007, deploying the resources of Not for Sale: Raising Awareness, Ending Exploitation, and the Real Scandal of Sex Trafficking.³⁷² Now the next phase of incorporating a wide network of Protestant and Orthodox churches in its membership, along with a large number of Roman Catholic Congregations, seems to be underway a decade after the initial launch of this initiative, which is heartening.

Advocacy

There are a substantial number of organisations in the UK set up to forward awareness raising in local communities, including TRAC. These address the potential ubiquity of trafficking in its main forms of adult and child sexual exploitation, fostering, labour exploitation, and domestic servitude. Two key organisations worth noting in this arena are 'Unseen' and 'Stop the Traffik,' both involved in the arena of advocacy and policy influencing. Unseen has been involved in raising the challenge of cleansing supply chains, of goods which have the risk of involving trafficked or 'forced or child labour' in their production within and outside of the UK.³⁷³ Meanwhile, Stop the Traffik, an advocacy group, indicate practical ways in which community-based and online networks can become agents of change in the arena of trafficking. Both focus on the insertion of child labour in the supply chain; have run campaigns on challenges in the fashion industry, global textile production, and chocolate production in West Africa; and raise awareness and share information on the tell-tale signs of trafficking with their broad membership across the UK.³⁷⁴

371) http://www.cte.org.uk/Groups/234690/Home/About/Member_Churches_of/Member_Churches_of.aspx

372) <http://web.archive.org/web/20070305051203/http://www.notforsalesunday.org/>

Not for Sale: Raising Awareness Ending Exploitation, Inspire Press 2006 ed: Berry and Pemberton; The Real Scandal of Sex Trafficking Kevin Mayhew 2007 ed: Berry and Pemberton

373) <http://www.unseenuk.org/> Unseens Managing Director Kate Garbers took a paper on the Challenges and Successes of Victims of Trafficking Resettling in the UK, and presented it as part of the Vatican's Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences 5-day plenary session on human trafficking in March 2015.

Kate said: "We need to address resettlement of survivors both in UK and also in source countries. If their situation hasn't changed - if they have not recovered or been given the appropriate support to recover within the UK - we are setting them up for further exploitation. Unseen's mission is to help people become resilient, empowered and independent, but it takes time and resources. By going to the Vatican, hopefully we have shown that this issue needs addressing, not just in the UK but across the globe." www.unseen.org/ accessed August 2015.

374) www.stophetraffik.org

Scotland

In Scotland Section 22 of the Criminal Justice (Scotland) Act 2003 created the offence of engaging in trafficking people into, within or out of the UK for the purpose of exploitation by way of control over an individual for prostitution or involvement in the making or the production of obscene or indecent material, with a maximum penalty of 14 years of imprisonment. This Act is still in force.

The Equality and Human Rights Commission undertook an inquiry into human trafficking in Scotland in 2010 and published the findings and recommendations of its inquiry, which had some damning evidence of neglect.³⁷⁵ The findings led to a series of ten recommendations aimed at those with responsibilities to prevent and tackle human trafficking in Scotland. The Commission published the Follow-on Report to the Inquiry into Human Trafficking in Scotland in March 2013.

The Human Trafficking and Exploitation (Scotland) Bill consultation was published in December 2013. The consultation proposes a raft of measures to improve Scotland's anti-trafficking response, based on EU law that came into force in April 2013 and recommendations of the EHRC's Inquiry into Human Trafficking in Scotland. This is now before the Scottish Government and completed Stage 2 on 16 June 2015.

ECPAT UK has reached into Scotland on this matter and in partnership with the faith-based charity CARE³⁷⁶ called on the Scottish Government in 2015 to provide vital support for trafficked children in new anti-trafficking legislation. The Trafficking in Persons Report, 2014 found that children had been trafficked to Scotland and exploited in domestic servitude, forced labour and sexual exploitation, with some disappearing from care and re-trafficked to a life of further abuse.

CARE undertook a wide-reaching public campaign that sought to put pressure on the Scottish Government to strengthen the Human Trafficking and Exploitation (Scotland) Bill in order to protect all children at risk of trafficking and to bring their abusers to justice. The outcome of this campaigning will become manifest as the legislation beds down, and protection services move forward to address this challenging information on the situation of children at risk of trafficking in Scotland.

Police Scotland has a dedicated unit, 'the National Human Trafficking Unit', which works co-operatively with key agencies. There are two key Scottish-based agencies involved in developing trafficking protection, they are the Trafficking Awareness Raising Alliance (TARA), embedded since 2005 in community safety work in Glasgow and now advising the Scottish Parliament on counter-trafficking issues, and Migrant Help. These agencies will be significant organisations to assist moving forward the implications and capabilities for counter-trafficking work set out in the new Act when it is realised. Sister Isabel Kelly, FMSJ, TRAC UK, was able to interview persons working with both agencies.

Scotland and England may well be witnessing some rolling back of political and even some policing attention away from sexual exploitation, notwithstanding the powerful creative force behind TARA which was formed to address the rise in trafficked women and children into Scotland for commercial sexual exploitation. The lobbying and service provision work of TARA encompasses all aspects of the sex industry, including lap and table dancing, strip clubs, prostitution, escort services, internet sex sites and pornography. Furthermore, there are a number of powerful NGOs working in Scotland to raise attention on violence against women, and the requirement to keep politicians, legislators and policing attuned to its policy implications. ZERO Tolerance is a Scottish charity working to end men's violence against women by promoting gender equality and by challenging attitudes which normalise violence and abuse.³⁷⁷ Its work began in 1992 with a series of iconic poster campaigns designed to raise awareness and challenge attitudes about violence against women. The focus today is on primary prevention.

375) Inquiry into human trafficking in Scotland: Equality and Human Rights Commission 2010

376) www.care.org.uk/

377) www.zerotolerance.org.uk/ViolenceAgainstWomen Zero Tolerance is a charity working to tackle the causes of men's violence against women.

It now works on a raft of issues, all addressing explicitly violence against women issues, and could prove a powerful force to add with TARA's work on trafficking, in addressing issues around trafficking into sexual exploitation, as Scotland takes forward its counter-trafficking brief through the Scottish Parliament.

Fifty five potential victims of human trafficking were identified in Scotland last year. Almost a third (30%) of them experienced sexual exploitation followed by labour exploitation (14%) and criminal exploitation (9%). Romania was the most common country of origin, with nine cases in Scotland. The National Crime Agency (NCA) said victims came from 18 countries including Poland, Slovakia, Thailand, Vietnam, Ghana and Nigeria and more recently, Latvia. TARA and Migrant Help Scotland offer safe housing to victims. TARA, for women over 18 who have been trafficked specifically for sexual exploitation. Both agencies are based in Glasgow and are active in prevention work.³⁷⁸

Addressing Demand

With the new legislation and its mandate on slavery has also come the recent international furore which has accompanied the decision by Amnesty International to decriminalise all aspects of consensual adult sex. This appears to bring into a zone of Amnesty International approval many of the processes of latent pimping in the running of brothels, massage parlours and lap-dancing clubs following a consultation aimed laudably to protect the human rights of sex workers. In August 2015 the match hit the tinder box as Amnesty International announced that its onward international policy on prostitution would be for all, "sex work that does not involve coercion, exploitation or abuse."

Amnesty International is clear that "Sex workers are one of the most marginalized groups in the world, who in most instances face constant risk of discrimination, violence and abuse," and in a number of interviews given after the vote which split many of its constituencies across the world, and brought out celebrities and feminist groups concerned with the euro-billions generated by the sex industry and its intimate connection with violence against women and trafficking, stated that:

*Its policy is not about protecting 'pimps.' (Rather) Amnesty International firmly believes that those who exploit or abuse sex workers must be criminalized. But the reality is laws which criminalize 'brothel-keeping' and 'promotion' often lead to sex workers being arrested and prosecuted themselves. In Norway evidence shows that sex workers were routinely evicted from their homes under so-called 'pimping laws.' In many countries of the world, two sex workers working together for safety is considered a 'brothel.'*³⁷⁸

There is a growing broad consensus among a variety of international human rights defenders and anti-slavery campaigners working on this area to realise the full decriminalisation of sex work – including the World Health Organization, UNAIDS, International Labour Organization, the Global Alliance Against Trafficking in Women, the Global Network of Sex Work Projects, the Global Commission on HIV and the Law, Human Rights Watch, the Open Society Foundations and Anti-Slavery International. However, the linkages with the sex industry and the perceived alliance between Amnesty International and this global business which drives substantial amounts of trafficking for sexual exploitation was not taken quietly by the Coalition for the Abolition of Prostitution. In the week after the vote was taken the coalition's executive director, Grégoire Théry, said, "Amnesty chooses impunity for pimps and johns and not protection from sexual abuse for all women," and vowed that it would no longer work with Amnesty International.³⁷⁹

378) Report from Sr Isabel Kelly, FMSJ – interviews with Police Scotland and TARA

378) http://www.nytimes.com/2015/08/12/world/europe/amnesty-international-votes-for-policy-calling-for-decriminalization-of-prostitution.html?_r=0

379) Ibid.

There will be a need to keep this debate live, informed and resilient about women's 'enslavement' and forced exploitation across prostitution. A significant role for RENATE may be to work with the neo-liberal discourse which results in the commodification of everything – including the products of the body (as in surrogacy, breast milk extraction and organ trafficking) – and the seepage of 'rights' for women to participate in 'sex work' and its infiltration to all the accoutrements of that trade. There is the well-positioned lobby with considerable vested interest to keep the multi-billion global industry of sex work buoyant and 'legitimated.'

The challenging, nuanced, and complex pathways of how the sex industry works; how grooming and recruiting into the trade is posited significantly on access to children's bodies; the longer-term apprenticeship into the adult market; how poor women are recruited into markets for cash-richer men to access their 'commoditised' flesh, is something which will occupy at least the next decade of counter-trafficking work, debate and policy intervention in the nexus of sex trafficking. The forum of the Not for Sale Sunday campaign, Freedom Sunday and St Bakhita international day of prayer (8 February) should be used to assist detailed, persistent, measured and robust presentation of the reality of the global business of sexual exploitation and its lack of sustainability when viewed through the lens of taking appropriate care of the resources – that of the precious gift of life of each human being – none of which is for sale in any aspect of their lives.³⁸⁰

The challenge for RENATE is to build strong alliances across Europe with other leaders in resistance to a German and Dutch model which is extended to legitimate brothels, if this is where the RENATE network sees policy development and effective interdiction of violence against women in this sphere. Currently the virtual legitimization of pimping is occurring, in the slipstream of 'defending' quite appropriately the well-being and 'rights' of those caught within sex work. As Sweden's foreign minister, Margot Wallstrom, said at the point of Amnesty International's decision, "they mixed all these arguments, and that worries me. It is a myth about the happy prostitute who does this as a free choice."³⁸¹

There may be options of reaching across to radical feminist groups in the UK at a time when the Government does not manifest the desire to pursue the 'Nordic model'³⁸² approach to rectify systemic abuses within the sex trade. Such a movement requires continuous cultural and political engagement, alongside further research on the nature of exploitation in sex work, and its overlap with 'trafficking abuses.' The work will require energy, continued alliance building with Scandinavia, support in research into this area, nerve, and structured advocacy, with few of the large NGOs in the UK currently openly advocating for the Nordic model, excepting the Poppy project. Some new alliances in Europe and in the UK are open to being made, including TRAC, which strongly advocates for the introduction of the Nordic model into the UK, seeing demand as the engine driving trafficking and creating a never-ending supply.

The Women@thewell is a good model of how a Nordic model of radical hospitality and empowerment for prostituted women is being practiced in London. The European Women's Lobby has been advocating for a Nordic model to be adopted across Europe as the most strategic way of addressing violence against women and children in the sex trade. What is learnt in this suggested process of serious and applied engagement could be usefully cascaded across the Religious Congregations and all RC and ecumenical co-travellers. There will be the requirement for nerve and active listening to the experience of others who have been working for decades in this arena, and the ability to establish new alliances. However, the goal of a paradigm shift in approach to this millennia-old challenge would be worth the organisational effort involved.

380) Not for Sale Sunday originated under the aegis of Churches Alert to Sex Trafficking across Europe in 2006 and now is an independently funded initiative managed through 'GenderWise' www.genderwise.com

381) http://www.nytimes.com/2015/08/12/world/europe/amnesty-international-votes-for-policy-calling-for-decriminalization-of-prostitution.html?_r=0

382) www.equalitynow.org/sites/default/files/Nordic_Model_EN.pdf Accessed Sept 2015

Devolved Governance and Trafficking in the UK – Northern Ireland

Counter-trafficking legislation in Northern Ireland has recently changed with the Human Trafficking and Exploitation (Criminal Justice and Support for Victims) Act (Northern Ireland) 2015, bringing counter-trafficking legislation all under one statutory instrument. The Act received Royal Assent on 13 January 2015. Significantly, the Act refers to “Human trafficking and slavery offences,” a different ordering than that which went through Westminster to define the English legislative response. It does not use the terminology or definition ‘modern slavery.’ The new legislation followed a period of consultation by the Department of Justice, under the process ‘Human Trafficking and Slavery: Strengthening Northern Ireland’s response.’ This consultation followed the review of the legislative response in Northern Ireland and took particular account of the publication of the Home Secretary’s Modern Slavery Bill on 16 December 2013.

The Act incorporated a clause which criminalises the purchasing of sex, making Northern Ireland the first of the four nations of the UK to make the buying of sex illegal. This follows the model in Sweden, Norway and Iceland. Currently buying and selling sex is not illegal elsewhere in the UK but soliciting, pimping, brothel-keeping and kerb-crawling are all criminal activities. The movement in the Northern Ireland political domain has put renewed energy into the hands of some Westminster politicians who have been campaigning over the last decade to see the Nordic model adopted into English and Welsh legislation. The Northern Irish championing of this particular aspect of addressing demand will be watched with interest by the rest of the kingdom, and offers some areas for new alliances to be made for RENATE within Northern Ireland from across the Republic.

Wales

Wales is bound by the same legislation and National Referral Mechanism structure as England. For many in the anti-trafficking sector, they have represented a far more progressive country, with the lead provided by a Cross Party Group on Human Trafficking in Wales within the National Assembly of Wales. Wales has an Anti-Human Trafficking Co-ordinator since March 2011, who also has responsibility for publishing an Annual Report, which can be utilised by campaigners and practitioners to understand where the challenges sit for counter-trafficking work in Wales.

To tackle slavery in Wales the Welsh Government has established the Wales Anti-slavery Leadership Group, made up of key strategic decision makers from devolved and non-devolved organisations, and from other organisations including the voluntary sector. The Welsh Anti-Trafficking Network comprises the Welsh National Anti-Trafficking Network, the Wales Anti-Slavery Leadership Group, which provides oversight and direction for tackling slavery in Wales, and the North Wales and South Wales Regional Anti-Trafficking Network. These are regional fora responsible for delivering local awareness-raising training, promoting initiatives to tackle slavery and supporting survivors. They also have an active information and intelligence sharing function.³⁸³

Most cases of slavery are complex, both to investigate and prosecute. Wales has, according to its own politicians, had a disappointing number of cases pursued over the last few years, despite a raised understanding of the challenge of trafficking in its different forms, particularly raising attention on labour trafficking in the region. However, the level of training and commitment to multi agency working has been impressive; the Anti-slavery Co-ordinator has worked with the Police, the Crown Prosecution Service Wales and other partner organisations, including NGOs, to develop a specialist joint training programme for Senior Investigating Officers and Prosecutors. This is seen as a strong demonstration of best practice in this area.

383) The five anti-trafficking hubs for this activity are located in Cardiff, Dyfed Powys, Gwent, North Wales, and Western Bay.

Currently a three-day programme is delivered once every six weeks in South Wales, and also delivered in North and West Wales across 2015. This will doubtless be evaluated by police forces across the rest of the UK, and where it is deemed to add to impact and value, will doubtless find itself being adopted for improved performance.

Next Steps

Whether the next couple of years sees a rise in referrals, and whether the attention to forced labour and labour exploitation which sees a higher percentage of men being referred through whilst their cases are managed forward adjusts, will be of interest. It will be interesting to see whether the consistently steady volume of women being referred as victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation, over the last decade, holds in the face of some changing priorities in policing and terminology in legislation. Whether labour trafficking, child trafficking or trafficking for sexual exploitation, all investigations demand extensive deployment of financial resources alongside extensive logistical and trained personnel support. The commitment by Central Government to ensure the resources are in place to pursue proactive policing in this arena is essential.

There will undoubtedly be a political challenge for Policing and Crime Commissioners and the Chief Constables whom they hold to account, to focus on where attention is given to root out trafficking criminality. However, it is important that the full range of trafficking offences is kept in mind. This is a space where clarity from RENATE members and their affiliated networks is important, for there is an asymmetry, a differentiated space occupied by women who are trafficked for sexual exploitation rather than men and women brought over to fill the gap in labour supply in low-skilled occupations where cash is king. There are key differences between the gendered abuse which occurs in these spaces, and concerns that a non-unionised 'trafficked' labour force is working for remuneration below the minimum wage; thus destroying the vision of the State for ensuring a sustainable revenue across its legitimate workforce. In turn this is different from the multiple challenges taking place across the arena of purchasing, violence and long-term impacts of abuse in the sex trade. Furthermore, the wider reasons for why people are caught in trafficking processes in the first place will have to be continually raised, so that the arena is not 'over-policed' and under-resourced in terms of concerns around global fairness, equity, justice, and the ability of communities worldwide to pursue their self-determination with the basics we take for granted across the 'developed' Western economies.

Overseas Territories.

It is not often that the remaining Overseas Territories of the UK are mentioned in reports, but they significantly show up in the United States TIP report as a powerful reminder that these three island clusters in the Caribbean are still directly associated with the UK. They are places where trafficking in men, women and children occurs.

Bermuda is seen as a limited destination country for women and men subjected to forced labour. Some foreign migrant workers from Asia and Latin America are vulnerable to domestic servitude and abuse or to forced labour in the construction and agricultural industries in Bermuda. Several cases of suspected forced labour were reported to and investigated by the Department of Immigration but were ultimately determined not to be trafficking cases. The Government did not report investigations, prosecutions, or convictions of trafficking offences in 2014.

Turks and Caicos Islands are a destination country for men, women, and children subjected to sex trafficking and forced labour. According to local experts, the large population of migrants from Haiti, the Dominican Republic, and Jamaica are vulnerable to sex trafficking and forced labour, with stateless children and adolescents especially at risk.

Local stakeholders, including law enforcement officials, have reported specific knowledge of sex trafficking occurring in bars and brothels and noted trafficking-related complicity by some local government officials was a problem. Anti-trafficking legislation introduced in 2012 remained pending. The absence of specific legislation prohibiting trafficking as defined by the 2000 UN TIP Protocol; the absence of victim identification, screening, and protection procedures; and limited awareness of human trafficking on the part of officials and the public continued to hinder anti-trafficking efforts.

Recommendations of TIP report for the UK

- Increase funding for and access to specialized services for trafficking victims, regardless of their immigration status;
- Allow potential victims to access services from care providers before having to engage with law enforcement and consider extending the reflection and recovery period;
- Increase efforts to prosecute, convict, and sentence traffickers to strong sentences; provide a trafficking-specific long-term alternative to deportation or repatriation to foreign victims;
- Improve multi-stakeholder oversight and specialized services for child victims; increase training to officials and front-line responders, including in UK overseas territories;
- Increase training for public defenders, prosecutors, and judges to ensure trafficking victims are not prosecuted for crimes committed as a result of being subjected to trafficking;
- Increase investigations in high-risk labour sectors, including by expanding the jurisdiction of and increasing funds for the Gangmasters Licensing Authority;
- Address the vulnerability of foreign domestic workers under the current visa system;
- Continue efforts to document anti-trafficking efforts through enhanced data collection.

RENATE NETWORK

This report highlights challenges for RENATE Network, including an enhanced educational awareness about the merits of the 'Nordic' model in relation to sexual exploitation and its impact on wider society. Europe is currently divided about how to address the sex industry and the various forms of exploitation which are manifest within it, ranging from child abuse, child exploitation through its grooming activities, violence against women through direct physical and psychological abuse of pimps and clients, and the longer-term negative health impacts on those who find themselves embroiled in its activities as women and young men prostituted to mainly male clients. This division means that some governments in Europe may be more inclined to task their enforcement agencies to address labour trafficking where there is a greater political consensus and clear economic benefit to the state. This is an area in which RENATE members need to be alert, and become increasingly politically educated in order to read the 'signs of the times' in an ethically informed manner.

Furthermore, a focus – alongside existing work of protection and services – exploring further collaboration between source and destination countries for rehabilitation of survivors, using the strength of RENATE across its member-European countries would be valuable in assisting the reintegration of victims.

Working with ECPAT UK for developing a programme of intervention in relation to child trafficking might also be a consideration for RENATE, to bring its voice into the work of advocacy on rights and protection of children. The changes in terminology which have emerged in this year around modern day slavery, with 'slave like practices' dominating some of the discourse, where previously human trafficking and 'sexual exploitation' prevailed, has yet to disclose its meaning and impact.

This is an area where RENATE members need to stay alert to the way in which language in legislation signposts potential changes in direction of political will and enforcement priorities.

With the Bakhita initiative of the Catholic church in England and Wales, The Medaille Trust, TRAC and Women@thewell, such an alliance provides a platform for further engagement to explore the reasons lying behind human trafficking, its connections with global poverty and injustice, gender inequalities and endemic violence against women in all countries.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS – in appreciation of:

Author:

Dr Carrie Pemberton-Ford, Director of the Cambridge Centre for Applied Research in Human Trafficking

Contributors:

Sr Isabel Kelly, FMSJ, Franciscan Missionaries of St Joseph (TRAC UK volunteer for CROP, renamed PACE (Parents Against Child Exploitation); and those whom she interviewed in Scotland:

Police Scotland

Superintendent Louise Raphael, rape crisis/human trafficking unit

Carolann Nesbitt, TARA (Trafficking Awareness Raising Alliance)

Zero Tolerance charity.

Mr Mike Emberson, Director of Medaille Project, UK www.medaille.co.uk;

Sr Patricia Mulhall, CSB Brigidine Sisters;

PERSONAL REFLECTIONS FROM RENATE MEMBERS

RENATE members were invited to share their motivation for anti-trafficking work.

Croatia - Sr. Viktorija Simic

“Just to know that at the very moment so many really innocent people are suffering so much, to know that God calls us to do whatever we can in order to help some of His least brothers and sisters, for me this is enough to go on with the work against trafficking in people.”

France - Sr. Marie Hélène Halligon, Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd

“A child of God, sold as a goat on the market, I will never accept that.”

“This was our Foundress’ declaration when she heard about slavery in the 1850s. So, she began working to save the enslaved girls. We as a Congregation are trying to do that since our foundation, up to today. This is a long time objective, and I am happy to enlarge networking, on European and global levels. Pope Francis is a wonderful ‘supporter’ of our work. We all know so many people are caught up in this vile trade.

May Our Shepherd God help all those who fight against Trafficking and Exploitation so that we all may live *“the freedom of children of God.”*

Hungary - Sr Légrádi Gabriella, SCSC

“My motivation is an experience in my junior-practice in Switzerland. (2007-2008)

I lived there with women and children, who were in a difficult situation.

I thought, can we do similar work in Hungary?

So I began to do that.

We have a little group in Hungary and we have an open heart and ear, to do what we can.

We can pray for people who are in difficulty with human-trafficking.

I have a text from the Gospel: John 5:7

‘Sir, I have no one to put me into the pool when the water is stirred up, but while I’m coming, another steps down before me.’

We can help.”

Ireland – Ms Anne Kelleher, RENATE Communications Person.

In response to your prompt question as to what motivates or keeps one going/doing anti-trafficking work, I would like to share the following as it is a guiding principle which motivates my work, especially the more challenging aspects of work-life!

“God grant that we may always have our eyes open to recognise God’s presence in all of our life experiences.”

“Regardless of how awful the circumstances or the people, we can find God’s presence, I believe. I once read a book entitled “The Faces of Christ; A Life story” by Frederick Buechner which left me with the belief that each person we meet is actually a reflection of the face of Christ. Thus, we meet Him in the pain & suffering of those who are trafficked or exploited or treated unjustly. How can we turn a blind eye to our brothers & sisters then, for to do so is to turn away from Christ Himself.”

Malta - Sr Margaret Gonzi, Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd

"In the Maltese language we say,
 'Tajjeb jien, tajjeb kulhadd' ... 'I'm ok, everyone's ok'
 But I do know, somewhere out there, in the world, not all is ok!
 Do I hear the cries?
 Do I feel with who is beaten, in chains, controlled, enslaved, unable to breathe, no more able to cry?
 And I kneel before the Lord to pray."

Every Girl's nightmare

*My body isn't mine
 My bones are bruised, my wrists are raw, but really, it is my mind that hurts the most.
 I am sold and bought.
 And somewhere my voice has been lost in a tangled mess.*

*I watch from a distance,
 This window is the only thing I have.
 People passing by, they're all just like me
 Except they are happy;
 And they belong to themselves.*

*Where's their humanity?
 They lost it in the tangled mess as well, I guess.
 My freedom is taken for granted.
 I look again at those people passing by
 They are not for sale.*

Poland - Ms Aneta Grabowska – Secretary and Web Manager, RENATE Network

"My motivation comes from this poem:

*'Let us love people now they leave us so fast
 and the ones who don't leave won't always return
 and you never know while speaking of love
 if the first one is last or the last one first.'*

Last verse from the poem 'Love now' by Jan Twardowski, Polish priest and poet.
 I typed you the official translation of his poem from a bilingual edition (Polish-English).
 You can read more about Jan Twardowski." https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Jan_Twardowski

Poland – Sr Joanna Lipowska, FMM

"There are days that you cannot forget, they remain deep within you and shape your present. There are meetings, after which nothing remains the same as before; the new is unknown and unmanageable, filled with tension and stretched between giving and receiving, losing and gaining. When leaving my mission in Osnabruck (Germany), where I had worked among victims of human trafficking and run a shelter for them, I did not understand why God was arranging things in such a strange way. I could not grasp it and it seemed to be illogical; my feelings were telling me that I did not want to leave that mission. But in the perspective of faith, to say AMEN appeared to be the only possible thing to do. I did not understand ... and yet, even then, somewhere deep inside, I sensed that this was not the end. And so it wasn't. So it isn't!

I worked for Solwodi, the international organization “Solidarity with Women in Distress”, where I met young women seduced, deceived, sold and forced into prostitution. Their longing for love, happiness and better life was badly misused; they were dragged into hell on earth. Constant fear, threats, psychological and physical abuse, rape... all that was only a part of a nightmare they had to undergo. When our paths crossed, those I met had been already freed from the hands of the oppressors; they were safe in our house, but their hearts’ pain and hurt continued. At that time, their struggle was to rebuild faith and hope that their lives can be regained. I accompanied them through those difficult moments in their feeling of being lost, towards a beginning of a new life. I journeyed with them and witnessed their tears, their joys and success, both great and small. I tried to tell them in many different ways that God in his love has the power to make all things new. For me, it was a challenging and yet a beautiful mission... I do not mention it only with sentiment, as now I know more... it was really thanks to the women (I wish I could name their names here) that God let me find my mission in life. Their broken lives and their effort to look with hope to the future sank into my heart and played an important role. It was those real people and their tragedies that opened my heart to see the pain and suffering of so many modern slaves, robbed of dignity and treated as a commodity, as an object of one’s desires and fancies, as a source of profit, where the fact what they feel and go through is utterly disregarded. There where money and consumerism rules, some do not hesitate to go further than we can imagine

I do not know how God, who is still surprising me, will lead me on, but I can say with St. Francis, ‘The Lord Himself led me among them.’ Or perhaps it might be better to say, ‘The Lord Himself led them into me.’ And He still shows me that there are many possibilities to be close to them and serve them. In God’s perspective, there are so many different ways of being and doing. I am searching... and God shows me... I trust.”

Romania - Sr Adina Balan, CJ Congregatio Jesu

Here you have my motivation and strength to go on in this work.

“The kingdom is not only beyond our efforts, it is even beyond our vision. We accomplish in our lifetime only a tiny fraction of the magnificent enterprise that is God’s work. We water the seeds already planted knowing that they hold future promise.” (Bishop Ken Untener of Saginaw)

Slovakia - Sr Andrea Bezáková, CJ Congregatio Jesu

My motivation is this prayer:

“God of freedom, beauty and truth, we believe that your deepest desire, your most powerful energy, is that all creation might know abundant life.

We raise our voices in anguished prayer for our sisters and brothers, women and girls, men and boys, who are modern day slaves. They are your beloved daughters and sons, exploited sexually or forced to work because of human violence and greed.

Fill us with your holy anger and your sacred passion that those who are trafficked might know healing and justice; that traffickers will come to repentance and conversion; that all of us might live in such a way that others are not made to pay the price for our comfort and convenience.

Hasten the coming of the day when all people and our precious Earth itself will be treated, not as a commodity, but as radiant images of your freedom, beauty and truth.”

Amen. May it be so.

Spain - Sr Justa de Sol Hernando,

“My motivation to work in anti-trafficking (or trade in human beings): is to beautify the dignity of the humankind; to help defend the human rights; fight for justice; work for a world and society more humane; cooperate with the divine plan to give life in all its fullness to each person.”

Las nuevas esclavitudes humanas en nuestra Europa, y en el siglo XXI, desafían hoy nuestro Profetismo Evangélico. No podemos “pasar de largo” ante un fenómeno tan cruel que pisotea los derechos fundamentales y la dignidad del ser humano. ¡Basta ya! ¡Ninguna persona puede ser objeto de negocio y de mercado! Configuremos una Red de Humanización contra las redes de esclavitud.

“Modern day slavery in Europe in the 21st century challenges us to be Gospel prophets. We cannot ignore this cruel reality that tramples on the basic human rights and human dignity. Enough is enough! We cannot allow human beings to be used as commodities! Let us create a Human Network to against the enslaving networks.”

Spain – Sr Pilar Casas [Fundación Amaranta]

“Our mission as ADORATRICES, is to defend the human rights of women who are in situations of prostitution and human trafficking.

The Congregation of the RELIGIOUS ADORATRICES ESCLAVAS DEL SANTÍSIMO SACRAMENTO Y DE LA CARIDAD, founded by Vizcondesa de Jorbalán Micaela Desmaieres y López de Dicastillo in 1856, stems from the initiatives initiated by her in Saint John of God’s hospital, Madrid. Her contact with women in prostitution led her to commit herself to caring for such women, and in 1845 she opened for them a shelter where those who had nowhere to go after leaving hospital could stay for a time. The Religious Congregation was founded in the year 1856 in response to an urgent need at the time to free and promote women in situations of prostitution and/or human trafficking.

For myself, I feel this is very much part of me, and I am united to these women victims of human trafficking, being fully committed to the defence of their rights. This forms part of the essence of my congregation and of my own option of following Jesus Christ.”

United Kingdom - Sr Pat Kenny, RSC Religious Sisters of Charity

“The anti-trafficking work is at the heart of our (Religious Sisters of Charity) charism of Service of the Poor. The collaborative work of TRAC (Trafficking Awareness & Campaigning) is the way forward for Religious today as we age and our numbers grow fewer. I benefit personally from the TRAC group spirit.”

United Kingdom - Sr Isabel Kelly, FMSJ Franciscan Missionaries of St Joseph

“Why I keep raising awareness about human trafficking for sexual exploitation. I heard about human trafficking at the end of 2005 and learnt something about it in the Spring of 2006 as the new JPIC of our Congregation – Franciscan Missionaries of St Joseph. From that time, I have been raising awareness until as late as the 15th May 2015. It is amazing that people are still not really aware of what it entails – even professional people. Their eyes are opened time after time. That is one reason why I keep going. As long as people keep asking me to give a talk on human trafficking I shall keep on doing it. My first follow-up talk is this year and no doubt more will follow.

Another reason I keep going is that I have young nieces and nephews and the thought of anything like that happening to them fills me with a rage which makes me feel I could be capable of murder! I have met a young woman who had been trafficked for six years and had no idea where she had been all that time.

Another young woman was soon to have her baby and wept because she had always dreamt of having her mother by her side. I have heard the stories of mothers whose daughters have been groomed for sex in the UK and the heartbreak, even leading to the breakup of the family unit plus younger children feeling left out because the mother's energy is channelled into rescuing her daughter who is trapped in sexual exploitation.

I also feel that I can be objective about this issue because I have never experienced any of this myself and I think this fact helps me to be energised and committed to this cause. I have written two poems. In one I tried to get into the shoes of a globally trafficked woman and in the other I did the same for a girl in the UK who had been groomed for sex and trafficked within the UK to service all sorts of men under the control of their groomer and his gang.

The fact that a mother was sent a video call of her daughter being gang-raped and could do very little about it made me even more passionate about spreading the word so that as many people as possible, men and women, young and old, know the dangers around them and tell others about it."

Katie's poem – *(Written by an internally trafficked girl in England):*

*"There were lots of secrets
between me and my mates.
It all turned out
we shared the same fates.
We were all part
of his stupid little game!
We all got hurt
we were all the same.
But then we were given a choice
and along came photo voice.
Now I feel free,
and I am the person
I always wanted to be."*

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are others who contributed to the completion of this document and whose names do not appear at the end of the country reports. Their comments, insights and contributions are much appreciated and were valuable for the completion of the document.

Thanks in particular to the authors of country reports, but also to members of the RENATE Core and Working Group who supported and encouraged the Mapping Exercise.

Ms Ivonne van de Kar, (Netherlands) Core Group
Sr Gabriela Korn (Germany) Core Group
Sr Mary Mangan (Ireland, former member of RENATE Core Group)
Sr. Bohdana Bezáková (Slovakia)
Ms Anne Kelleher, RENATE Communications Person

Thanks to the following:

Ms Emma Sherry, www.capitalletters.ie - for painstaking care and time doing the final edit/proof-read on the document.

Manushaqe Cypi (MWL Albania) for type-setting and preparing the document for printing;

Dr Mary Grey, for kindly agreeing to write the Foreword

Dr Carrie Pemberton-Ford for the Executive summary and drawing the threads of the documents together.

Sr Marie Power, HFB, for assistance with the compilation of the document.

Sr Imelda Poole, IBVM, for her support and endorsement of the Mapping Exercise.

RENATE claims your indulgence for any 'loose threads' or the omission of any person who has contributed to this document in any way and whose name has not been recorded.

Sr Patricia Mulhall, CSB

DISCLAIMER

RENATE Network has provided information that is, to the best of its knowledge, up-to-date, objective and reliable within the context and confines of the Mapping Exercise. This information may not provide a complete description of the countries mapped, nor represent the entirety of any one country or its official policy on trafficking in human persons.

RENATE Network accepts no responsibility or liability whatsoever with regard to the use made of the information contained in this Mapping Exercise.



Ending Trafficking Begins with YOU

RENAE

St. Janssingel 92
5211 DA Den Bosch
The Netherlands

IBAN: NL31ABNA0587386703
SWIFT (BIC): ABNANL2A

www.renate-europe.net
www.facebook.com/renateurope
renatenetwork@gmail.com